

MARCH 2013

Reports of decisions of the Victorian Civil and
Administrative Tribunal and the Supreme
Court of Victoria

VICTORIAN ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS

2009

EDITOR
T V HURLEY
Barrister-at-Law

PRODUCTION EDITOR
HELLA OCHOCKI

VOL 31 — PART 2

PAGES 127-250

The mode of citation of this part will be:
31 VAR

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 2 — Pages 127-250

Bevno! Constructions & Developments Pty Ltd; De Simone v	84
BR v Victims of Crime Assistance Tribunal	127
Consumer Affairs Victoria, Director of v Glenvill Pty Ltd	64
Cooney; Jasky v	20
De Simone v Bevno! Constructions & Developments Pty Ltd	84
Dura (Australia) Construction Pty Ltd v Victorian Managed Insurance Authority	193
Environment Protection Authority; Thirteenth Beach Coast Watch Inc v	1
Gadens Lawyers v Virgtel Ltd	223
Gallichio; Western Health v	115
Geddes and Australian Labor Party (Victorian Branch), Re	42
Glenvill Pty Ltd; Director of Consumer Affairs Victoria v	64
H J Heinz Company Australia Pty Ltd v Kotzman	206
Jasky v Cooney	20
Justice, Secretary Department of v Osland (No 2)	98
Justice, Secretary to the Department of v Western Suburbs Legal Service Inc	26
Kotzman; H J Heinz Company Australia Pty Ltd v	206
Koutroumanis v Transport Accident Commission	162
Lal (No 2); Medical Practitioners Board of Victoria v	140
Lewenberg & Lewenberg v Victoria Legal Aid	168
Lloyd; Melbourne Health v	243
Medical Practitioners Board of Victoria v Lal (No 2)	140
Melbourne Health v Lloyd	243
Mental Health Review Board; MH6 v	226
MH6 v Mental Health Review Board	226
Milwain v Sim	53
Osland (No 2); Secretary Department of Justice v	98

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2013 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1031-2617

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Sim; Milwain v	53
Tarasinski v Wyndham City Council	77
Thirteenth Beach Coast Watch Inc v Environment Protection Authority	1
Transport Accident Commission; Koutroumanis v	162
Victims of Crime Assistance Tribunal; BR v	127
Victoria Legal Aid; Lewenberg & Lewenberg v	168
Victorian Managed Insurance Authority; Dura (Australia) Construction Pty Ltd v	193
Virgtel Ltd; Gadens Lawyers v	223
Western Health v Gallichio	115
Western Suburbs Legal Service Inc; Secretary to the Department of Justice v	26
Wyndham City Council; Tarasinski v	77

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 2 — Pages 127-250

ACCIDENT COMPENSATION

- Medical panels — Assessment of incapacity to be “in accordance with” the AMA Guides — When assessment is “in accordance with” AMA Guides — Assessment of injury requiring ankle replacement — Provision in AMA Guides for replacement of hips and knees only — Panel assessing impairment of ankle by reference to total replacement of hip and knees — Whether jurisdictional error — Accident Compensation Act 1985 (Vic), s 91 — American Medical Association Guides to the Evaluation of Permanent Impairment, 4th ed, Chapter 3, “The musculoskeletal system”.
H J Heinz Company Australia Pty Ltd and Another v Kotzman and Another 206

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

- Error of law — Medical panel — Wrongs Act — Need for referral to panel to identify “significant injury” — Failure of referral to identify compensable injury — Wrongs Act 1958 (Vic), s 28LF(1)(b).
Melbourne Health and Others v Lloyd and Others 243
- Natural justice — Request for expressions of interest — Time-limits — Whether arbitrary — Representation that late submitted expression of interest would be considered on its merits — Departure from representation — Whether a breach of natural justice.
Lewenberg & Lewenberg v Victoria Legal Aid 168

APPEAL

- New point raised on appeal — Whether interests of justice require point to be raised — No effect on course of evidence.
Medical Practitioners Board of Victoria v Lal (No 2) 140

LEGAL AID

- Panels — Establishment — Notice — Whether procedure of giving notice for establishment of panels limited to creation of new panel — Re-appointment of member of panel — Legal Aid Act 1978 (Vic), s 29A(2), (5).
Lewenberg & Lewenberg v Victoria Legal Aid 168

LEGAL PRACTICE ACT

- Costs agreement — Application to VCAT to cancel costs agreement — Jurisdiction of VCAT to order practitioner make response and identify documents — Legal Practice Act 1996 (Vic), s 103.
Gadens Lawyers v Virgtel Ltd and Another 223

INDEX

MEDICAL PRACTITIONERS

- Registration — Character of applicant — Applicant found guilty of sexual offences — Whether assessment of “culpability” of applicant in offending relevant — Registration subject to conditions — Whether conditions so severe as to contradict finding that registration should be granted — Health Professions Registration Act 2005 (Vic), s 6(1), (2)(a), (c), (d).
Medical Practitioners Board of Victoria v Lal (No 2) 140

MENTAL HEALTH

- Admission of patients — Involuntary treatment orders — Review by VCAT — Natural justice — Hearing — Whether breach of rules of natural justice where VCAT requires applicant to give evidence first — Whether right to complain waived by conduct of legal representatives — Appeal from VCAT — Mental Health Act 1986 (Vic), s 29(2).
MH6 v Mental Health Review Board 226

VICTORIAN CIVIL AND ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

- Appeal — Leave to appeal — Leave to appeal refused by Trial Division — Whether leave of Court of Appeal required to appeal to that court — Supreme Court Act 1986 (Vic), s 17A(4)(b) — Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998 (Vic), s 148(1)(b).
Dura (Australia) Construction Pty Ltd v Victorian Managed Insurance Authority and Another 193
- Appeal — Question of law — Failure of VCAT to give adequate reasons — Whether question of law — Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998 (Vic), ss 117(1), 148.
BR v Victims of Crime Assistance Tribunal 127
- General procedure — Hearings — Adjournment — Exercise of discretion — Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998 (Vic), ss 97(1), 102(1)(b).
Koutroumanis v Transport Accident Commission 162
- Procedure — Joinder of parties — Whether party to be joined must be given opportunity to be heard before joinder order made — Whether VCAT Domestic Building List Practice Note required party be given notice — Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998 (Vic), s 60.
Dura (Australia) Construction Pty Ltd v Victorian Managed Insurance Authority and Another 193
- Procedure — Reasons — Entitlement for reasons — Whether entitlement to reasons for order joining a party to VCAT proceeding — Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998 (Vic), s 117.
Dura (Australia) Construction Pty Ltd v Victorian Managed Insurance Authority and Another 193

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “In accordance with”.
H J Heinz Company Australia Pty Ltd and Another v Kotzman and Another 206

INDEX

WRONGS ACT

Thresholds for recovery of non-economic loss — Assessment of impairment — Medical panels — Referral of questions — Need for referral to identify compensable injury — Referral outlining hereditary condition that proposed plaintiff suffered from — Failure to describe actionable injury caused by proposed defendants — Wrongs Act 1958 (Vic), ss 28LE, 28LF, 28LWE, 28LZA.	
<i>Melbourne Health and Others v Lloyd and Others</i>	243