

MAY 2014

---

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

---

LAWBOOK CO.'s  
DISTRICT COURT  
LAW REPORTS  
(NSW)

2013-2014

**EDITOR**

DR RJ DESIATNIK  
*Barrister-at-Law*

**CONSULTING EDITOR**

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M  
*Judge of the District Court of NSW*

**REPORTER**

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:  
17 DCLR(NSW)

---

---

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 2 — Pages 97-196

93 GSP Pty Ltd v Advent 8 Pty Ltd (No 2) .....	58
Advent 8 Pty Ltd (No 2); 93 GSP Pty Ltd v .....	58
Births Deaths and Marriages, Registrar of; LU v .....	26
Births, Deaths and Marriages and Another (No 2), Registrar of; LU v .....	61
Blackney v Clark .....	36
Brasnovic; Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer v .....	75
<b>Brewster v El-Sayed</b> .....	115
<b>Carey v New South Wales</b> .....	146
Clark; Blackney v .....	36
<b>Cornell; R v</b> .....	165
<b>de Barros (No 2); Messiah v</b> .....	99
<b>El-Sayed; Brewster v</b> .....	115
<b>Feltham v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer</b> .....	121
<b>GFE38; R v</b> .....	161
<b>Insurance Australia Ltd (No 2); Kenwright v</b> .....	169
<b>Kenwright v Insurance Australia Ltd (No 2)</b> .....	169
LU v Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages and Another (No 2) .....	61
LU v Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages .....	26
Mahmoud v Sutherland .....	49
<b>McParland (No 2); R v</b> .....	97
<b>Messiah v de Barros (No 2)</b> .....	99
<b>New South Wales; Carey v</b> .....	146
<b>New South Wales; Tilse v</b> .....	177
Police, Commissioner of; Wilson v .....	1
<b>Pony (NSW) Pty Ltd (No 2); Remedial Building Services Australia Pty Limited v</b> .....	107
<b>R v Cornell</b> .....	165
<b>R v GFE38</b> .....	161
<b>R v McParland; R v Wingate (No 2)</b> .....	97
R v Russell .....	17

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

---

---



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2014 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

<b>Remedial Building Services Australia Pty Limited v Pony (NSW) Pty Ltd (No 2)</b> .....	107
<b>Rooney v Workers' Compensation Dust Diseases Board of NSW</b> .....	171
Russell; R v .....	17
Sutherland; Mahmoud v .....	49
<b>Tilse v New South Wales</b> .....	177
Wilson v Commissioner of Police .....	1
<b>Wingate (No 2); R v</b> .....	97
Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer v Brasnovic .....	75
<b>Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer; Feltham v</b> .....	121
<b>Workers' Compensation Dust Diseases Board of NSW; Rooney v</b> .....	171

---

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

# INDEX

Part 2 — Pages 97-196

## COSTS

- Indemnity costs — Circumstances when awarded — Conduct of parties — Misconduct — Breach of statutory duty to inform court of financial position — Effect — Breach of statutory duty to assist court — Effect — Effect of costs order against party on recovery of assets from such party — Determination of time of commencement of indemnity costs order — Relevant factors — Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 57. *Messias v de Barros (No 2)* ..... 99
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether necessary element of compromise present — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 42, Div 3. *Carey v New South Wales* ..... 146
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether offer no less favourable than judgment — Proper approach for determination of question — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14. *Kenwright v Insurance Australia Ltd (No 2)* ..... 169

## COURTS AND JUDGES

- Judges — Disqualification for interest or bias — Reasonable apprehension of bias — On ground of associate's prior non-personal connection with complainant in criminal trial — Application for judge's disqualification — Associate's duties and role — Perception of influence with judge — Relevant principles — Resolution of application by change of associate for trial. *R v GFE38* ..... 161

## CRIMINAL LAW

- Practice and procedure — Powers of court — Power to order separate trials of accused persons — Exercise of power — Relevant principles — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 21. *R v McParland; R v Wingate (No 2)* ..... 97
- Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Mitigating circumstances — Hardship to family member by imprisonment of offender — Relevant factor due to exceptional circumstances. *R v Cornell* ..... 165

## DUST DISEASES

- Dust diseases legislation — Asbestos-related diseases — Rate of compensation — Dependent on time of occurrence of injury — Disease of gradual onset — Deemed time of occurrence — Dependent on nature of occupation to which contraction of disease due — Focus on habitual employment rather than actual processes involved in person's employment — Workers' Compensation (Dust Diseases) Act 1942 (NSW), s 8(3A). *Rooney and Others v Workers' Compensation Dust Diseases Board of NSW* ..... 171

## INDEX

### LANDLORD AND TENANT

- Termination of tenancy — Rights of lessor — Rights apart from covenant in lease — Statutory procedure for exercise of right to re-enter — Whether procedure applicable to exclusion of common law — Conveyancing Act 1919 (NSW), s 129.  
*Remedial Building Services Australia Pty Limited v Pony (NSW) Pty Ltd and Another (No 2)* ..... 107

### PRACTICE

- Judgments and orders — Amending, varying and setting aside — Orders made in absence of party — Ability of court to exercise power to vary or set aside such orders of own motion — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.16(2)(b).  
*Remedial Building Services Australia Pty Limited v Pony (NSW) Pty Ltd and Another (No 2)* ..... 107

### PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

- Medical examinations — Discretionary power of court to order plaintiff to undergo such examinations — Refusal to exercise power — Relevant principles — Whether nerve conduction test or neuropsychological testing medical examination or medical procedure — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 23.4 — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 86(1).  
*Brewster v El-Sayed* ..... 115

### TORTS

- Particular torts — False imprisonment — Lawfulness of person's arrest — Whether arrest necessary to prevent harassment of or interference with witness — No requirement for arrest in good faith — Meaning of "necessary" — Whether obtaining interim apprehended personal violence order equivalent alternative to arrest — Grant of bail — Whether arrest of person requirement of grant of bail — Relevant circumstances — Holding of person lawfully in custody for excessive period — Whether commission of tort of false imprisonment for period in excess of reasonable period — Consequences of breach of bail conditions and breach of interim apprehended personal violence order — Statutory powers for grant of bail — Differences in such powers — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 99(3)(d) — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), ss 1, 19, 25, 26, 27 — Bail Act 1978 (NSW), ss 7, 15, 17, 18.  
*Tilse v New South Wales* ..... 177
- Particular torts — False imprisonment — Whether arrest by police necessary precondition for grant of bail — Possible existence of defence of consent to arrest — Whether proper basis for consent — Bail Act 1978 (NSW), ss 15, 18.  
*Carey v New South Wales* ..... 146

### WORDS AND PHRASES

- "Medical examination".  
*Brewster v El-Sayed* ..... 115

## INDEX

### WORDS AND PHRASES — *continued*

“Medical procedure”.	
<i>Brewster v El-Sayed</i> .....	115
“Nature and conditions of employment”.	
<i>Feltham v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer</i> .....	121
“Necessary”.	
<i>Tilse v New South Wales</i> .....	177
“Occupation”.	
<i>Rooney and Others v Workers’ Compensation Dust Diseases Board     of NSW</i> .....	171

### WORKERS COMPENSATION

Alternative rights — Damages at common law — Limitation of time for action — Commencement of limitation period — Whether commencement from date of injury or accrual of cause of action — Leave to extend limitation period — Application for — Whether failure to act or errors of judgement of applicant’s lawyer reason for extension — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D.	
<i>Feltham v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer</i> .....	121