

DECEMBER 2011

---

Reports of the Administrative Appeals Tribunal and  
Administrative Appeals Tribunal decisions on appeal  
in the Federal Court and High Court

---

# ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS REPORTS

2011

**EDITOR**  
KIM ROSS

**SENIOR REPORTER**  
DR RJ DESIATNIK

**REPORTERS**  
SHARON HANSTEIN  
MELISSA PURDY

**PRODUCTION EDITOR**  
JACQUELINE DE LACY

**VOL 55 — PART 5**

**PAGES 378-474**

The mode of citation of this part will be:  
55 AAR

---

---

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 5 — Pages 378-474

Australian Maritime Safety Authority, Re Duarte and (Cth AAT) .....	180
Australian Postal Corporation, Re Neenan (Cth AAT) .....	282
Australian Securities and Investments Commission, Re Nguyen and (Cth AAT) .....	85
<b>Bankruptcy, Inspector-General in; Re Phillips and (Cth AAT)</b> .....	378
Bicycle Victoria Inc and Commissioner of Taxation, Re (Cth AAT) .....	203
<b>Brown and Comcare, Re (Cth AAT)</b> .....	465
Civil Aviation Safety Authority v Ovens (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	288
<b>Comcare, Re Brown and (Cth AAT)</b> .....	465
Comcare, Re Flanagan and (Cth AAT) .....	276
Comcare; Goodricke v (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	188
Defence Force Retirement and Death Benefits Authority; House v (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	138
Duarte and Australian Maritime Safety Authority, Re (Cth AAT) .....	180
Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs, Department of; Secretary; Re Pek and (Cth AAT) .....	369
<b>Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs, Secretary, Department of; Singh v (Fed Ct of Aust)</b> .....	410
Flanagan and Comcare, Re (Cth AAT) .....	276
Goodricke v Comcare (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	188
Grass and Minister for Immigration and Citizenship, Re (Cth AAT) .....	328
Griffith and Commissioner of Taxation, Re (Cth AAT) .....	175
House v Defence Force Retirement and Death Benefits Authority (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	138
<b>Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v Mordechai (Fed Ct of Aust)</b> .....	450
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v Zheng (Cth AAT) .....	94
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for; Re Grass and (Cth AAT) .....	328

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

---

---



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2011 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0813-779X

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for; Re RCLN and (Cth AAT) .....	308
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for; Re LLSY and (Cth AAT) .....	57
Kaluza v Repatriation Commission (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	349
Karhani and Linfox Australia Pty Ltd (Cth AAT) .....	333
Linfox Australia Pty Ltd, Re Karhani (Cth AAT) .....	333
LLSY and Minister for Immigration and Citizenship, Re (Cth AAT) .....	57
Military Rehabilitation and Compensation Commission; Rana v (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	300
<b>Mordechai v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (Fed Ct of Aust)</b> .....	450
Neenan and Australian Postal Corporation, Re (Cth AAT) .....	282
Nguyen and Australian Securities and Investments Commission, Re (Cth AAT) .....	85
Ovens; Civil Aviation Safety Authority v (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	288
<b>Panagiotou and TNT Australia Pty Ltd, Re (Administrative Tribunal of Australia)</b> .....	436
Pek and Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Cth AAT) .....	369
<b>Phillips and Inspector-General in Bankruptcy, Re (Cth AAT)</b> .....	378
Rana v Military Rehabilitation and Compensation Commission (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	300
Rayson and Repatriation Commission, Re (Cth AAT) .....	1
RCLN and Minister for Immigration and Citizenship, Re (Cth AAT) .....	308
Repatriation Commission, Re Rayson and (Cth AAT) .....	1
Repatriation Commission, Re Sleep and (Cth AAT) .....	75
Repatriation Commission; Kaluza v (Fed Ct of Aust) .....	349
<b>Singh v Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Fed Ct of Aust)</b> .....	410
Sleep and Repatriation Commission, Re (Cth AAT) .....	75
Taxation, Commissioner of; Re Bicycle Victoria Inc and (Cth AAT) .....	203
Taxation, Commissioner of; Re Griffith and (Cth AAT) .....	175
<b>TNT Australia Pty Ltd, Re Panagiotou and (Administrative Tribunal of Australia)</b> .....	436
Zheng; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v (Cth AAT) .....	94

---

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

# INDEX

Part 5 — Pages 378-474

## ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS TRIBUNAL

- Practice — Issue of summons — Whether issue of subpoena an abuse of process — Extension of relevant principles — Principles applicable to issue of summons where issue allegedly oppressive — Party’s purpose collateral to proceedings — Effect — Party’s purpose to confirm possession of documents by party summonsed — Effect — Confidentiality of documents sought in summons — Whether basis for setting summons aside — Relevance of confidentiality — Application to set aside summons — Relevant principles.  
*Re Phillips and Inspector-General in Bankruptcy (Cth AAT)* ..... 378
- Practice — Review of decision to refuse visa — Character grounds — Written statement required at least two business days before hearing — Meaning of “at least two business days before” — Whether statement required to be signed — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), ss 500(6H), (6J), 501.  
*Mordechai v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (Fed Ct of Aust)* ..... 450
- Practice — Summons to produce applicant’s medical records — Relevance of applicant’s privacy — Registry’s letter to applicant advising of issue of summons and its addressee — Adequacy of letter — Defects in letter — Issue of summons — Relevant factor — Registry’s notice to party requesting summons — Adequacy of notice — Extent of Tribunal’s obligations — Administrative Appeals Tribunal Act 1975 (Cth), s 40(1A).  
*Re Panagiotou and TNT Australia Pty Ltd (Administrative Tribunal of Australia)* ..... 436

## ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

- Judicial review — Vexatious applicant — Leave to institute proceedings — Whether decision induced or affected by fraud — Administrative Decisions (Judicial Review) Act 1977 (Cth), s 5(1)(g).  
*Singh v Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Fed Ct of Aust)* ..... 410

## COMMONWEALTH EMPLOYEES COMPENSATION

- Costs before Tribunal — Tribunal’s power to award costs — Conduct of parties — Whether applicant unreasonable in refusing offers of settlement — Calderbank principles — Whether conduct of Comcare had been exemplary — Safety, Rehabilitation and Compensation Act 1988 (Cth), s 67.  
*Re Brown and Comcare (Cth AAT)* ..... 465

## FEDERAL COURT

- Practice — Vexatious litigant — Whether requirements to make order satisfied — Whether proceedings “utterly hopeless” — Whether appropriate to exercise discretion to make order — Federal Court Rules, O 21, r 1.  
*Singh v Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Fed Ct of Aust)* ..... 410

## INDEX

### IMMIGRATION

- Visa — Refused on character grounds — Review by Administrative Appeals Tribunal — Written statement required at least two business days before Tribunal hearing — Meaning of “at least two business days before” — Whether statement required to be signed — Whether Tribunal failed to take international obligations into account — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), ss 500(6H), (6J), 501.  
*Mordechai v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (Fed Ct of Aust)* ..... 450

### WORDS AND PHRASES

- “At least two business days before”.  
*Mordechai v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (Fed Ct of Aust)* ..... 450
- “Vexatious”.  
*Singh v Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Fed Ct of Aust)* ..... 410