

APRIL 2025

The Authorised Reports of Decisions of
the Federal Court of Australia

THE
FEDERAL COURT
REPORTS
2024

EDITOR
VICTOR KLINE

CONSULTING EDITORS
DR OREN BIGOS KC
DAVID ASH

REPORTERS IN THIS PART
FRANCIS CARDELL-OLIVER
SAMUEL CUMMINGS
VICTOR KLINE

PRODUCTION EDITOR
MYUNG COLE

VOL 306 — PART 4

PAGES 461-616

2024

THE

FEDERAL COURT

REPORTS

THE AUTHORISED REPORTS OF DECISIONS OF
THE FEDERAL COURT OF AUSTRALIA

EDITOR
VICTOR KLINE

CONSULTING EDITORS
DR OREN BIGOS KC
DAVID ASH

VOLUME 306

LAWBOOK CO.

2025

SENIOR REPORTERS

SAMUEL CUMMINGS
VICTOR KLINE

REPORTERS

MITCHELL BRUNKER
FRANCIS CARDELL-OLIVER

PRODUCTION EDITOR

MYUNG COLE



© 2025 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

ABN 64 058 914 668

Lawbook Co.

Published in Sydney

Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW

ISSN 0813-7803

FEDERAL COURT OF AUSTRALIA

CHIEF JUSTICE

THE HONOURABLE DEBRA SUE MORTIMER

JUDGES

THE HONOURABLE BERNA COLLIER

THE HONOURABLE JOHN ALEXANDER LOGAN, RFD

THE HONOURABLE NYE PERRAM

THE HONOURABLE JOHN VICTOR NICHOLAS

THE HONOURABLE MORDECAI BROMBERG

THE HONOURABLE ANNA JUDITH KATZMANN

THE HONOURABLE BERNARD MURPHY

THE HONOURABLE DARRYL RANGIAH

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL WIGNEY

THE HONOURABLE MELISSA PERRY

THE HONOURABLE JONATHAN BARRY RASHLEIGH BEACH

THE HONOURABLE BRIGITTE SANDRA MARKOVIC

THE HONOURABLE MARK KRANZ MOSHINSKY

THE HONOURABLE ROBERT BROMWICH

THE HONOURABLE NATALIE CHARLESWORTH

THE HONOURABLE STEPHEN BURLEY

THE HONOURABLE DAVID JOHN O'CALLAGHAN

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL BRYAN JOSHUA LEE

THE HONOURABLE ROGER MARC DERRINGTON

THE HONOURABLE SARAH CATHERINE DERRINGTON AM

THE HONOURABLE KATRINA FRANCES BANKS-SMITH

THE HONOURABLE CRAIG GRIERSON COLVIN

THE HONOURABLE THOMAS MICHAEL THAWLEY

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL FRANCIS WHEELAHAN

THE HONOURABLE ANGUS MORKEL STEWART

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL HUGH O'BRYAN

THE HONOURABLE DARREN JOHN JACKSON

THE HONOURABLE JOHN LESLIE SNADEN
THE HONOURABLE STEWART MAXWELL ANDERSON
THE HONOURABLE WENDY JANE ABRAHAM
THE HONOURABLE JOHN HALLEY
THE HONOURABLE ELIZABETH CHEESEMAN
THE HONOURABLE HELEN MARY JOAN ROFE
THE HONOURABLE KYLIE ELIZABETH DOWNES
THE HONOURABLE SCOTT ANTHONY GOODMAN
THE HONOURABLE PATRICK O’SULLIVAN
THE HONOURABLE SHAUN BRENDAN McELWAIN
THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL JAMES FEUTRILL
THE HONOURABLE FIONA MEAGHER
THE HONOURABLE TIMOTHY McEVOY
THE HONOURABLE LISA HESPE
THE HONOURABLE ELIZABETH RAPER
THE HONOURABLE GEOFFREY ROSS KENNETT
THE HONOURABLE CATHERINE GAIL BUTTON
THE HONOURABLE IAN McNEIL JACKMAN
THE HONOURABLE ADAM HATCHER
THE HONOURABLE EMILIOS KYROU AO
THE HONOURABLE CHRISTOPHER HORAN
THE HONOURABLE YASEEN SHARIFF
THE HONOURABLE PENELOPE ANNA NESKOVICIN
THE HONOURABLE CRAIG WILLIAM DOWLING
THE HONOURABLE JANE ANNABEL DARLING NEEDHAM
THE HONOURABLE STEPHEN ANDREW McDONALD
THE HONOURABLE SAMUEL ALEXANDER VANDONGEN
THE HONOURABLE CAMERON ANDREW MOORE
THE HONOURABLE NICHOLAS JAMES OWENS
THE HONOURABLE JAMES STEPHEN STELLIOS
THE HONOURABLE HOUDA YOUNAN
THE HONOURABLE ELIZABETH BENNETT
THE HONOURABLE ERIN JANE LONGBOTTOM
THE HONOURABLE AMELIA WHEATLEY
THE HONOURABLE GRAEME HILL (appointed 2 April 2025)

The mode of citation of this part will be:
306 FCR

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 4 — Pages 462-616

Alumina & Bauxite Company Ltd v Queensland Alumina Ltd	86
Australian Competition and Consumer Commission; Master	
Wealth Control Pty Ltd v	462
Badenoch Integrated Logging Pty Ltd v Bryant	529
Boehringer Ingelheim Animal Health USA Inc; Zoetis Services LLC v	19
Bryant; Badenoch Integrated Logging Pty Ltd v	529
Campbell-Smith v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs	1
Caporaso Pty Ltd v Mercato Centrale Australia Pty Ltd	549
Climate Change and Energy, Minister for; Seadragon Offshore Wind Pty Ltd v	69
Coal Mining Industry (Long Service Leave Funding) Corporation;	
Hitachi Construction Machinery (Australia) Pty Ltd v	486
Communications, Minister for; Gaynor v	145
Dan-Bunkering (Singapore) Pte Ltd v Ship Yangtze Fortune (Priorities)	431
Energy, Environment and Climate Action, Secretary to the Department of; Save Our Strathbogie Forest Inc v	331
Energy, Environment and Climate Action, Secretary to the, Department of; Save Our Strathbogie Forest Inc v	316
Eso Australia Resources Pty Ltd; Federal Commissioner of	
Taxation v	586
Galuk v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs	271
Gaynor v Minister for Communications	145
Hitachi Construction Machinery (Australia) Pty Ltd v Coal	
Mining Industry (Long Service Leave Funding) Corporation	486
Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for; Campbell-Smith v	1

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



© 2025 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0813-7803

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for; Nguyen v	372
Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for; Palmer v	156
Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for; Galuak v	271
Killer Queen LLC v Taylor	199
Master Wealth Control Pty Ltd v Australian Competition and Consumer Commission	462
Mercato Centrale Australia Pty Ltd; Caporaso Pty Ltd v	549
Nguyen v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs	372
Palmer v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs	156
Patrix Prestige Pty Ltd; Federal Commissioner of Taxation v	56
Queensland Alumina Ltd; Alumina & Bauxite Company Ltd v	86
Resolution Life Australasia Ltd v Teagle	405
Sam Pos Pty Ltd (in liq), Re	387
SARB Management Group Pty Ltd (Costs); Vehicle Monitoring Systems Pty Ltd v	13
Save Our Strathbogie Forest Inc v Secretary to the Department of Energy, Environment and Climate Action	316
Save Our Strathbogie Forest Inc v Secretary to the Department of Energy, Environment and Climate Action	331
Seadragon Offshore Wind Pty Ltd v Minister for Climate Change and Energy	69
Ship Yangtze Fortune (Priorities); Dan-Bunkering (Singapore) Pte Ltd v	431
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Esso Australia Resources Pty Ltd	586
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Patrix Prestige Pty Ltd	56
Taylor; Killer Queen LLC v	199
Teagle; Resolution Life Australasia Ltd v	405
Vehicle Monitoring Systems Pty Ltd v SARB Management Group Pty Ltd (Costs)	13
Zoetis Services LLC v Boehringer Ingelheim Animal Health USA Inc	19

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 4 — Pages 462-616

COMPETITION AND CONSUMER LAW

- Jones v Dunkel inference — Whether available in civil penalty proceedings under the Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 2 (Australian Consumer Law) — Whether inference can only be drawn if all other rational inferences excluded — Whether requisite standard of proof is civil standard enunciated in Briginshaw v Briginshaw — Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 2 (Australian Consumer Law), ss 18, 29(1)(b), 29(1)(g), 29(1)(m), 34, 224(1), 232, 239, 240, 241, 248 — Evidence Act 1995 (Cth), s 140(2).
Master Wealth Control Pty Ltd and Another v Australian Competition and Consumer Commission 462

CORPORATIONS

- Winding up in insolvency — Application for — Period within which to be determined prescribed — Power to order extension of period — Whether extension order needed to specify a period which was definite and could not be fixed by reference to the occurrence of a future event — Whether only the winding up in insolvency component of respondent's application was dismissed by reason of application not having been determined within the relevant period — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), ss 459A, 459P, 459R, 459R(1), 459R(2), 459R(3).
Badenoch Integrated Logging Pty Ltd v Bryant and Others 529

EVIDENCE

- Jones v Dunkel inference — Whether available in civil penalty proceedings under the Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 2 (Australian Consumer Law) — Whether inference can only be drawn if all other rational inferences excluded — Whether requisite standard of proof is civil standard enunciated in Briginshaw v Briginshaw — Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 2 (Australian Consumer Law), ss 18, 29(1)(b), 29(1)(g), 29(1)(m), 34, 224(1), 232, 239, 240, 241, 248 — Evidence Act 1995 (Cth), s 140(2).
Master Wealth Control Pty Ltd and Another v Australian Competition and Consumer Commission 462

INDUSTRIAL LAW

- Employment — Terms and conditions of — Long service leave — Entitlement to — Whether primary judge was wrong to conclude that the determination of whether employees were eligible employees for the purposes of the relevant long service leave scheme was not confined to a consideration of the employees' contracted terms — Whether levies owed under the relevant long service leave scheme could not be recovered due to operation of State limitation of actions legislation — Coal Mining Industry (Long Service Leave) Administration Act 1992 (Cth), s 4(1) — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 14, 14(1)(d) — Judiciary Act 1903 (Cth), ss 64, 79.
Hitachi Construction Machinery (Australia) Pty Ltd v Coal Mining Industry (Long Service Leave Funding) Corporation 486

INDEX

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

- Trade marks — Objections — Grounds for — Representation false in a material particular — Meaning of material — Infringement — Deceptive similarity — Standard of appellate review — Whether necessary to show specific error in trial judge's reasoning — Whether sufficient that appellate court takes different view on conclusion — Trade Marks Act 1995 (Cth), ss 62(b), 120.
Caporaso Pty Ltd v Mercato Centrale Australia Pty Ltd 549

TAXATION

- Petroleum resource rent tax — Whether primary judge erred by concluding that amounts paid to respondent were not assessable tolling receipts — Consideration of when the relevant amounts were derived — Petroleum Resource Rent Tax Assessment Act 1987 (Cth), s 24A.
Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Esso Australia Resources Pty Ltd 586