

MARCH 2025

Industrial Reports from the High Court, Federal Court, the State and Territory
Supreme Courts, and Federal and State Industrial Courts and Tribunals

Incorporating the Authorised Reports of the Fair Work
Commission, the Industrial Relations Commission of NSW,
the Industrial Court of Queensland and the
Queensland Industrial Relations Commission

INDUSTRIAL REPORTS

2024

CONSULTANTS

The Honourable JUSTICE ADAM HATCHER
President of the Fair Work Commission

The Honourable JUSTICE INGMAR TAYLOR
*President of the
Industrial Relations Commission of New South Wales*

The Honourable LANCE WRIGHT KC
*former President of the
Industrial Relations Commission of New South Wales*

ALICIA ASH BA LLB (Hons)

MANAGING EDITOR

MAHREEN HASAN BCom (Hons) LLB, MPP

VOL 335 — PART 1

PAGES 1-100

The mode of citation of this part will be:
335 IR

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 1 — Pages 1-100

Ma v Yan Massage Wynnum West Pty Ltd (Fair Work Commission)	57
Qube Ports Pty Ltd v Construction, Forestry and Maritime Employees Union (Fed Ct of Aust)	73
Sydney Trains v Goodsell (Fair Work Commission)	1

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



INDEX

Part 1 — Pages 1-100

APPEAL

- Application for permission to appeal — Appeal against decision that dismissal was unfair — Where appellant employer had drug and alcohol policy — Where respondent employee found to have cocaine metabolites in his system after period of leave — Whether Deputy President erred in finding that appellant required to establish there was risk that respondent was impaired at work — Erroneous principle stated — Erroneous principle not applied in consideration of matters in ss 387(a) or 387(h) of Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) — Whether Deputy President erred in finding no proper basis in finding risk that respondent attended for work under any impairment arising from one-off cocaine consumption — Deputy President's consideration of drug and alcohol policy breach valid reason for dismissal under s 387(a) of Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) — Deputy President's consideration of impairment risk relevant under s 387(h) of Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) — Whether Deputy President erred in finding he could not be satisfied there was any risk that respondent impaired at work — Whether Deputy President erred in finding there was no evidence that anyone involved in process fairly considered respondent's response — Respondent's mitigating factors not considered against conclusion that respondent would not repeat conduct — Whether mitigating factors Deputy President relied on irrelevant and did not explain respondent's conduct in breach of drug and alcohol policy — Deficiencies in appellant's training about implications of testing for use under drug and alcohol policy — Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth), s 387.
Sydney Trains v Goodsell (Fair Work Commission) 1
- Application for permission to appeal — Whether in public interest — Where appellant alleged Deputy President erred in finding he was independent contractor rather than employee — Public interest to explain proper approach to be adopted in circumstances in which there was no comprehensive written contract and to consider whether outcome arrived at by Deputy President was correct — Permission to appeal granted — Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth), ss 400(1), 604.
Ma v Yan Massage Wynnum West Pty Ltd (Fair Work Commission) 57

EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE

- Where respondent employed by appellant for 26 years as rail safety worker — Where appellant employer had drug and alcohol policy — Where drug and alcohol policy provided for random testing — Where respondent had "one-off" cocaine consumption four days before returning from leave — Where urine sample returned positive result for cocaine metabolites over drug and alcohol policy cut-off limit — Where testing indicative of usage rather than impairment — Where respondent suspended from work and participated in investigation process — Where respondent dismissed following show cause and review process — Appeal raises issues of general application within public interest — Permission to appeal granted — Appeal dismissed.
Sydney Trains v Goodsell (Fair Work Commission) 1

INDEX

EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE — *continued*

- Whether person employee or independent contractor — Where no written contract — Where person made unfair dismissal application upon termination — Jurisdictional objection that person was not employee — Deputy President of Fair Work Commission found person was independent contractor — Appeal — Characterisation of relationship between parties depends on their contractual rights — Deputy President erred by concentrating on conduct of parties without drawing conclusions as to legal rights and obligations thereby created — Combined effects that person was paid by reference to percentage of client fees and was not subject to control as to days and times to attend work favoured conclusion that person was independent contractor — Same conclusion reached in appeal for different reasons — Appeal dismissed — Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth), s 382(1)(a).
Ma v Yan Massage Wynnum West Pty Ltd (Fair Work Commission) 57

JUDICIAL REVIEW

- Application by employer to vary enterprise agreement to remove ambiguity or uncertainty — Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth), s 217.
Qube Ports Pty Ltd v Construction, Forestry and Maritime Employees Union (Fed Ct of Aust) 73

STATUTES

- Interpretation — Proper construction of s 217(1)(a) of Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) — Standing to bring application — Where employer required to be “covered by” enterprise agreement — Where enterprise agreement had ceased to operate — Employer argued “covered by” encompassed coverage by agreement at time relevant to variation sought — Union argued “covered by” referred to coverage at time of making application — Employer’s construction rejected and union’s preferred — Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth), ss 53, 54, 217, 218A.
Qube Ports Pty Ltd v Construction, Forestry and Maritime Employees Union (Fed Ct of Aust) 73

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “Covered by the agreement” — Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth), s 217(1)(a).
Qube Ports Pty Ltd v Construction, Forestry and Maritime Employees Union (Fed Ct of Aust) 73