

FEBRUARY 2025

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

LAWBOOK CO.'s
DISTRICT COURT
LAW REPORTS
(NSW)

2023-2024

EDITOR

DR RJ DESIATNIK

CONSULTING EDITOR

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M

Acting Judge of the District Court of NSW

REPORTER

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:
42 DCLR(NSW)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 2 — Pages 109-222

Able Business Pty Ltd; Delt Constructions Pty Ltd v	149
ACN 627 087 030 Pty Ltd as trustee for the YBL Trust (t/as Yates Beaggi Lawyers) v Price	175
ACN 627 087 030 Pty Ltd as trustee for the YBL Trust (t/as Yates Beaggi Lawyers) v Theodore	175
Advantage Taxation & Accounting Solutions: Your Business Growth & Tax Experts Pty Ltd; Aung v	195
Advantage Taxation & Accounting Solutions: Your Business Growth & Tax Experts Pty Ltd; Nyi Nyi Medical Pty Ltd v	195
Aung v Advantage Taxation & Accounting Solutions: Your Business Growth & Tax Experts Pty Ltd	195
Beno Excavations Pty Ltd (t/as Benex Pipeline); Harlech Enterprises Pty Ltd v	155
Bird v Redman	67
Chopra v NSW Health Service – South Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2)	99
Delt Constructions Pty Ltd v Able Business Pty Ltd	149
Diaspora Holdings Pty Ltd v The Owners Strata Plan No 68608	118
Elassaad (No 2); R v	168
Harlech Enterprises Pty Ltd v Beno Excavations Pty Ltd (t/as Benex Pipeline)	155
Hino Group Pty Ltd v Singh	184
Horan v Schieb	46
JH (No 2); R v	57
Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v Total Construction Pty Ltd (No 2)	109
Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v Total Construction Pty Ltd	11
King, The; McGee v	92
Kucukakyuz; R v	1
Mamou (t/as De Novo Conveyancing) (No 2); Patterson v	78

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2025 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

McGee v The King	92
NB; R v	218
NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd (No 2); Weng v	144
NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd; Weng v	135
NSW Health Service – South Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2); Chopra v	99
Nyi Nyi Medical Pty Ltd v Advantage Taxation & Accounting Solutions: Your Business Growth & Tax Experts Pty Ltd	195
Owners Strata Plan No 68608, The; Diaspora Holdings Pty Ltd v	118
Patterson v Mamou (t/as De Novo Conveyancing) (No 2)	78
Price; ACN 627 087 030 Pty Ltd as trustee for the YBL Trust (t/as Yates Beaggi Lawyers) v	175
R v Elassaad (No 2)	168
R v JH (No 2)	57
R v Kucukakyuz	1
R v NB	218
R v Thornton	83
R v Xrizantemo	212
Redman; Bird v	67
Schieb; Horan v	46
Schieb; Sommerville v	46
Singh; Hino Group Pty Ltd v	184
Sommerville v Schieb	46
Theodore; ACN 627 087 030 Pty Ltd as trustee for the YBL Trust (t/as Yates Beaggi Lawyers) v	175
Thornton; R v	83
Total Construction Pty Ltd (No 2); Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v	109
Total Construction Pty Ltd; Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v	11
Weng v NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd (No 2)	144
Weng v NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd	135
Xrizantemo; R v	212

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 2 — Pages 109-222

COMPANIES

- Contracts — Formalities — Execution of contract without use of company seal — Statutory methods — Whether one director who was also company secretary could sign contract on behalf of company in multi-director company — Whether signing in keeping with company's Constitution — Validity of oral agreement between directors to change signing methods set under company's Constitution — Whether company ratified way contract signed if such method unauthorised — Relevant principles — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), s 127(1).
Hino Group Pty Ltd v Singh and Another 184

COSTS

- Assessment — Appeal to District Court — Application for leave to rely on affidavit of expert on costs — Deponent lacked operational legal practice management skills — Affidavit inadmissible as opinion evidence — Whether Court needed evidence to set appropriate hourly rate for solicitor — Assessor's reasons for assessment — Required standard — Appropriate method of presenting fresh evidence on appeal — History of cost assessment process in New South Wales — Role of assessors — Nature of costs assessment — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), s 89(4).
ACN 627 087 030 Pty Ltd as trustee for the YBL Trust (t/as Yates Beaggi Lawyers) v Price 175
- Departing from general rule — Plaintiff succeeded in recovering 60% of its claim on alternate basis to basis initially relied on and then abandoned — Whether it should pay defendants' costs in such circumstances — Relevant principles — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), ss 92, 94(1A) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.1.
Delt Constructions Pty Ltd v Able Business Pty Ltd and Another 149
- General rule — Costs follow event — Indemnity costs — Successful party's rules-based offer of compromise — Whether judgment no less favourable than offer — Proper method of making comparison — Undertaking obtained by other party — Effect on comparison — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 14.14, 42.14.
Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v Total Construction Pty Ltd (No 2) 109
- Gross sum costs order — Application for — Whether such order inappropriate — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(4).
Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v Total Construction Pty Ltd (No 2) 109
- Indemnity costs — Application for — Relevant grounds for such order to be made.
Weng and Another v NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd (No 2) 144

INDEX

CRIMINAL LAW

- Practice and procedure — Prosecution — Commonwealth Director of Public Prosecutions declined to proceed further with jury proceedings — Effect — Whether Court could require Crown to close its case so that Court could direct jury to find accused not guilty — Director of Public Prosecutions Act 1983 (Cth), s 9(4) — Director of Public Prosecutions Act 1986 (NSW), s 7(2).
R v Xrizantemo 212
- Tendency evidence — Crown's omission to serve tendency notice within prescribed time — Failure to provide explanation for delay — Application for Court to exercise its dispensing power — Whether failure to provide explanation was determinative — Whether relevant — Two main considerations for exercise of dispensing power — Subsequent consideration of other factors — Presumed probative value of tendency evidence — Accused's failure to take issue with operation of presumption — Failure to exercise dispensation power simply to punish Crown — Whether justified — Exercise of power — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 97, 100, 192 .
R v NB 218

JUDGMENTS AND ORDERS

- Setting aside — Application to set aside default judgment — Obvious typographical error over dates in affidavit in support of application for default judgment — Whether defect of trivial nature — Affidavit accepted by Court's registry — Effect of allowing application — Proposed defence only going to quantum — Whether defences on merits — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 16.3, 36.15, 36.16.
Weng and Another v NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd 135

LOCAL COURTS

- Small Claims Division — Appeal to District Court against Assessor's decision — Grounds of appeal limited by statute to two — Doubt whether fresh evidence could be introduced at hearing of appeal since it was appeal by way of rehearing — Whether "miscarriage of justice" could be utilised as ground of appeal — Whether conduct properly described as denial of procedural fairness — Relevant principles — Local Court Act 2007 (NSW), s 39.
Aung and Another v Advantage Taxation & Accounting Solutions: Your Business Growth & Tax Experts Pty Ltd 195

PRACTICE

- Construction claim — Determination following adjudication in favour of plaintiff — Consequent court judgment after filing certificate of adjudication — Issue of garnishee order resulting in payment of judgment debt — Subsequent quashing of Determination — Whether judgment and garnishee order could be set aside and garnisheed money returned to defendant — Relevant principles — Effect of prior failed application for restitution of garnisheed money — Building and Construction Industry (Security of Payment) Act 2009 (ACT), s 27.
Harlech Enterprises Pty Ltd v Beno Excavations Pty Ltd (t/as Benex Pipeline) 155

INDEX

PRACTICE — *continued*

- Default judgment — Setting aside — Application to set aside such judgment — Application hopeless — Application based on trivial ground — Risk that application be considered abuse of process — Consequential risk of costs being awarded on indemnity basis — Use to be made of power to set aside judgment — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 36.15, 36.16.
Weng and Another v NSW Demo & Exca Services Pty Ltd (No 2) 144
- Stated case — Application to District Court to state case to Court of Criminal Appeal — Application made after final orders made in District Court proceedings — Whether court had power to then state case — Court asked to state case on matter that had not been clearly raised in proceedings and not addressed by court — Whether application appropriate — Delay in requesting stated case — Effect — Criminal Appeal Act 1912 (NSW), s 5B.
R v Elassaad (No 2) 168

TORTS

- Particular torts — Nuisance — Elements of tort — Cutting off non-essential electricity to property — No interference thereby with lawful use of property — Unauthorised modification to electricity supply to strata lot by owner — Occupational and safety risk created thereby — Owners corporation cutting off of electricity supply to lot — Whether interference with property unreasonable — Relevant factor.
Diaspora Holdings Pty Ltd and Another v The Owners Strata Plan No 68608 118
- Particular torts — Tort of unlawful interference with trade — Whether part of common law of Australia — Persons using car parking area in strata building for payment — Whether “occupants” of building — Use of area to conduct car parking business — Whether illegal — Whether any loss caused by interfering with illegal business.
Diaspora Holdings Pty Ltd and Another v The Owners Strata Plan No 68608 118

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “No less favourable” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14(1).
Kennedy Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Subject to a Deed of Company Arrangement) v Total Construction Pty Ltd (No 2) 109