

OCTOBER 2024

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

LAWBOOK CO.'s
DISTRICT COURT
LAW REPORTS
(NSW)

2023-2024

EDITOR

DR RJ DESIATNIK

CONSULTING EDITOR

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M

Acting Judge of the District Court of NSW

REPORTER

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:
41 DCLR(NSW)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 4 — Pages 357-466

Andersen v Nationwide News Pty Ltd	147
Andersen v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd	147
Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2); Sydney Trains v	174
Barai (No 7); Robust Builders Pty Ltd v	207
Barai; Robust Builders Pty Ltd v	96
Bevchain Pty Ltd; Youssef v	257
Boland v SAS Trustee Corporation	349
Brandt; Woolf v	300
Bullen; Mangano v	85
Capitalink Pty Ltd v Withnall (No 3)	395
Capitalink Pty Ltd v Withnall	231
Chetty v Queanbeyan-Palerang Regional Council	400
Chitts v Hamied	239
Communities and Justice, Secretary, Department of v M & J (Pseudonyms)	428
Cossey; Raad v	1
Davis (Pre-trial ruling); R v	383
Dillon v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	167
E Pty Ltd v E2	213
E1 v E2	213
E2; E Pty Ltd v	213
E2; E1 v	213
EB (No 2); GB v	60
Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3); SafeWork NSW v	137
Fagundez (No 1); R v	331
Fagundez (No 2); R v	337
Foster; R v	357
GB v EB (No 2)	60
Goodman; Najjarin v	431

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2024 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Hamied; Chitts v	239
Hashimi v The King	202
Hemphill v The King	111
Itani v New South Wales	89
Jeske v The King	369
Kibby (No 3); R v	284
King, The; Hashimi v	202
King, The; Hemphill v	111
King, The; Jeske v	369
King, The; Narouz v	69
King, The; Preston v	99
M & J (Pseudonyms); Secretary, Department of Communities and Justice v	428
Mangano v Bullen	85
Marszalek; R v	318
MC; R v	45
McIver (No 2); R v	121
ME; R v	45
Mikhaylova; R v	438
Mitrovic; Zepinic v	458
Mortley (t/as inspira nutritional) v National Disability Insurance Agency	412
MT; R v	45
Munro v Wheeler	419
Najjarin v Goodman	431
Narouz v The King	69
National Disability Insurance Agency; Mortley (t/as inspira nutritional) v	412
Nationwide News Pty Ltd; Andersen v	147
New South Wales, The State of; Nowland as Executor of the Estate of Nowland v	290
New South Wales; Itani v	89
Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd; Andersen v	147
Nowland as Executor of the Estate of Nowland v The State of New South Wales	290
Palackalody v St Vincent's Hospital Sydney Ltd	251
Police (NSW), Commissioner of; Dillon v	167
Preston v The King	99
Queanbeyan-Palerang Regional Council; Chetty v	400
R v Davis (Pre-trial ruling)	383
R v Fagundez (No 1)	331
R v Fagundez (No 2)	337
R v Foster	357
R v Kibby (No 3)	284
R v Marszalek	318
R v MC	45
R v McIver (No 2)	121

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

R v ME	45
R v Mikhaylova	438
R v MT	45
R v Regan	357
R v RT (No 1)	444
R v Tatola (No 3)	106
R v TH	45
Raad v Cossey	1
Regan; R v	357
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai (No 7)	207
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai	96
RT (No 1); R v	444
SafeWork NSW v Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3)	137
SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 1)	77
SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2)	323
SAS Trustee Corporation; Boland v	349
St Vincent's Hospital Sydney Ltd; Palackalody v	251
Sydney Trains v Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2)	174
Tatola (No 3); R v	106
TH; R v	45
Western Sydney Local Health District (No 1); SafeWork NSW v	77
Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2); SafeWork NSW v	323
Wheeler; Munro v	419
Withnall (No 3); Capitalink Pty Ltd v	395
Withnall; Capitalink Pty Ltd v	231
Woolf v Brandt	300
Youssef v Bevchain Pty Ltd	257
Zepinic v Mitrovic	458

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 4 — Pages 357-466

CHILD WELFARE

- Children's Court — Jurisdiction — Protective orders made by Court — Whether Court lacked jurisdiction to then make prohibition order — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 76, 90A.
Secretary, Department of Communities and Justice v M & J
(Pseudonyms) 428

COSTS

- Application for lump sum order for costs — Whether grant of application should result in discount applied to costs payable to successful party — Whether such order appropriate — Relevant principles — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(4)(c).
Mortley (t/as inspira nutritionals) v National Disability Insurance
Agency 412
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Calderbank offer — Commentary by offeror showing weakness in offeree's case — Offer rejected — Offer better than result obtained in court by offeree — Poor result solely due to issue not raised in offeror's commentary — Whether reasonable for offeree not to be persuaded by commentary and reject offer — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 42.2, 42.5.
Capitalink Pty Ltd v Withnall (No 3) 395

CRIMINAL LAW

- Appeal and new trial — Appeal against conviction in Local Court — Appeal to District Court — Relevant principles.
Jeske v The King 369
- Application for costs by successful defendant in Local Court prosecution — Refusal by Magistrate to make such order — Appeal by defendant to District Court against that refusal — Whether District Court had jurisdiction to hear appeal — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 211, 213, 214 — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 166 — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 11, 12, 23, 28, 70.
R v Mikhaylova 438
- Particular offences — Affray — Relevance of victim's identity — Victim wrongly named in charge — Whether material error — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 93C.
Jeske v The King 369
- Particular offences — Firearms — Possession of unauthorised pistol — Whether possession of firearm authorised — Onus of proof — Possession of ammunition for firearm — Whether knowing possession — Onus on Crown to negative possibility accused did not know of presence of ammunition in his rented premises — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 93A, 93C — Firearms Act 1996 (NSW), ss 4A(1), 7(1), 65(3).
Jeske v The King 369

INDEX

CRIMINAL LAW — *continued*

- Particular offences — Offences relating to dealing with proceeds of crime or property reasonably suspected to be proceeds of crime — Whether accused had to be proven to have had actual knowledge that what was dealt with were proceeds of crime or could be reasonably suspected of being proceeds of crime — Relevant principle — Appropriate directions to jury as to accused's state of knowledge — Differences between two offences accused charged with — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 193A, 193B(3), 193C(1), 193E(2A).
R v Davis (Pre-trial ruling) 383
- Practice and procedure — Application by Crown to amend counts in indictment — Application made at close of Crown's case — Application made under s 80AF of Crimes Act 1900 (NSW) — Whether permissible — Alternative application to file ex officio amended counts — Whether permissible — Relevant factors — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 80AF — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 20.
R v Foster 357
- Sexual offences — Evidence — Subpoenas — Statutory exclusion of sexual experience or lack thereof — Subpoenaed material concerned such evidence — Requirement of leave to issue subpoena — Whether court empowered to order production of subpoenaed material to itself — Purpose of such order — Whether exceptions to statutory exclusion could be used to establish propensity of complainant to make false allegations — Relevant principle — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), Ch 6, Pt 5, Div 2, ss 294CB, 298, 299B, 299D.
R v RT (No 1) 444

JUDGMENTS AND ORDERS

- Distinguishing between ratio, obiter dicta and seriously considered dicta — Relevant principles.
R v Foster 357

PRACTICE

- Dismissal of appeal against decision of Local Court — Application to District Court to set aside dismissal decision — Discretionary nature of power to do so — Exercise of power — Relevant factors — Limits to exercise of District Court's power to set aside Court's own judgment — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56-60 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 6.30, 36.16(3A).
Zepinic v Mitrovic 458
- Failure to obtain leave to serve medical report — Whether failure mere technicality — Apparent conflict between two rules of court — Resolution of conflict — Refusal of leave — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 31.19, 31.28(1)(c).
Munro and Another v Wheeler and Another 419
- Medical examinations — Application for order that plaintiff attend medical examination — Primary reason for making of order — Lawyer's opinion as to need for medico-legal examination — Relevance — Evidentiary material from examination having more than one use at trial — Effect — Appropriateness of requested examination — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 23, r 4.
Najjarin v Goodman 431

INDEX

PRACTICE — *continued*

- Summary dismissal — Prerequisite for such order — Whether prerequisite met —
Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 13.4.
*Mortley (t/as inspira nutritionals) v National Disability Insurance
Agency* 412

SOCIAL WELFARE

- National Disability Insurance Scheme — Whether service provider had cause of
action against National Disability Insurance Agency for payment for services
provided to recipient of funding — National Disability Insurance Scheme Act
2013 (Cth), ss 46A, 47, 47B — Australian Securities and Investments
Commission Act 2001 (Cth), s 12BEA.
*Mortley (t/as inspira nutritionals) v National Disability Insurance
Agency* 412

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “Deals with” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 193B(3), 193C(1)(a).
R v Davis (Pre-trial ruling) 383
“Promptly” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.19(1).
Munro and Another v Wheeler and Another 419

WORKERS COMPENSATION

- Personal Injury Commission — Jurisdiction — Claim for compensation between
State and resident of another State — Causation only issue for determination by
Commission — Question of fact — Whether Federal jurisdiction involved in
determination of that issue — Statutory remedy if federal jurisdiction involved
— Purpose and object of remedy — Operation of remedy — Relevant principles
— Constitution, ss 75, 76 — Personal Injury Commission Act 2020 (NSW), s 26
— Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 4(b)(i), 11A(1).
Chetty v Queanbeyan-Palerang Regional Council 400