

SEPTEMBER 2024

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

LAWBOOK CO.'s
DISTRICT COURT
LAW REPORTS
(NSW)

2023

EDITOR

DR RJ DESIATNIK

CONSULTING EDITOR

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M

Acting Judge of the District Court of NSW

REPORTER

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:
41 DCLR(NSW)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 3 — Pages 239-356

Andersen v Nationwide News Pty Ltd	147
Andersen v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd	147
Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2); Sydney Trains v	174
Barai (No 7); Robust Builders Pty Ltd v	207
Barai; Robust Builders Pty Ltd v	96
Bevchain Pty Ltd; Youssef v	257
Boland v SAS Trustee Corporation	349
Brandt; Woolf v	300
Bullen; Mangano v	85
Capitalink Pty Ltd v Withnall	231
Chitts v Hamied	239
Cossey; Raad v	1
Dillon v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	167
E Pty Ltd v E2	213
E1 v E2	213
E2; E Pty Ltd v	213
E2; E1 v	213
EB (No 2); GB v	60
Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3); SafeWork NSW v	137
Fagundez (No 1); R v	331
Fagundez (No 2); R v	337
GB v EB (No 2)	60
Hamied; Chitts v	239
Hashimi v The King	202
Hemphill v The King	111
Itani v New South Wales	89
Kibby (No 3); R v	284
King, The; Hashimi v	202
King, The; Hemphill v	111

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2021 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

King, The; Narouz v	69
King, The; Preston v	99
Mangano v Bullen	85
Marszalek; R v	318
MC; R v	45
McIver (No 2); R v	121
ME; R v	45
MT; R v	45
Narouz v The King	69
Nationwide News Pty Ltd; Andersen v	147
New South Wales, The State of; Nowland as Executor of the Estate of Nowland v	290
New South Wales; Itani v	89
Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd; Andersen v	147
Nowland as Executor of the Estate of Nowland v The State of New South Wales	290
Palackalody v St Vincent's Hospital Sydney Ltd	251
Police (NSW), Commissioner of; Dillon v	167
Preston v The King	99
R v Fagundez (No 1)	331
R v Fagundez (No 2)	337
R v Kibby (No 3)	284
R v Marszalek	318
R v MC	45
R v McIver (No 2)	121
R v ME	45
R v MT	45
R v Tatola (No 3)	106
R v TH	45
Raad v Cossey	1
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai (No 7)	207
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai	96
SafeWork NSW v Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3)	137
SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 1)	77
SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2)	323
SAS Trustee Corporation; Boland v	349
St Vincent's Hospital Sydney Ltd; Palackalody v	251
Sydney Trains v Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2)	174
Tatola (No 3); R v	106
TH; R v	45
Western Sydney Local Health District (No 1); SafeWork NSW v	77
Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2); SafeWork NSW v	323
Withnall; Capitalink Pty Ltd v	231
Woolf v Brandt	300
Youssef v Bevchain Pty Ltd	257

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 3 — Pages 239-356

COURTS AND JUDGES

- Judges — Application for disqualification of judge hearing proceedings — Ground of bias — Relevant principles — Relevance of applicant's lawyer's personal views of judge's approach to lawyer's clients — Judge having view of law — Whether disqualification — Judge's use of shorthand expressions — Whether sign of bias — Anecdotes about judge indicating to lawyer prejudice against lawyer's clients other than applicant — Whether indicative of attempt at forum shopping.
Boland v SAS Trustee Corporation 349

CRIMINAL LAW

- Costs — Certificate under Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) — Application for — Whether certificate should be granted — Relevant factors — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), s 3.
R v Fagundez (No 2) 337
- Evidence — Admissibility — Discretion to include improperly or illegally obtained evidence — Relevant principle — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 138.
R v Fagundez (No 1) 331
- Particular offences — Possession of child abuse material on a mobile phone — Access to such material denied to accused — Unlikely accused even aware of material — Whether offence one of strict liability — Whether person who could not gain access to image stored in mobile phone “possessed” such image — Statutory definition of possession of data — Purpose of provision — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 91H, 308F.
R v Fagundez (No 2) 337
- Practice and procedure — Stay of sentencing proceedings — Application for permanent stay — Relevant principles — Application on ground that applicant suffering terminal illness with less than 12 months to live — Relevance — Evidence required for stay to obtain grant in situation where applicant had terminal illness.
R v Marszalek 318
- Sexual offence — Summing up — Direction to jury — Direction that there was no typical response to sexual assault — Whether direction required — Accused's evidence in earlier trial put before jury — Whether direction to jury as to accused's right to remain silent required amendment — Direction to jury as to “different pathways” to accused's knowledge of victim's lack of consent — Requirements of jury as to compliance with such direction.
R v Kibby (No 3) 284
- Sexual offence — Summing up — Directions to jury — As to exception to definition of “sexual intercourse” of “proper medical purpose” — Onus of proof regarding issue of “proper medical purpose” — Whether alleged act of intercourse could be described as conduct for “proper medical purpose” — Whether Court should give direction as to that issue — Relevant factors — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 61HA.
R v Kibby (No 3) 284

INDEX

DAMAGES

- Measure of damages — Negligence — Past and future out-of-pocket expenses — Payments made under National Disability Insurance Scheme — Whether recoverable from verdict monies — Need to particularise out-of-pocket payments in NDIS assistance plan for plaintiff — Gratuitous domestic services provided by plaintiff's wife — Extent of services — Whether under six-hour per week threshold — Need for reform or clarification to NDIS legislation — National Disability Insurance Scheme Act 2013 (Cth), ss 104, 105, 105B, 106, 107.
- Youssef v Bevchain Pty Ltd* 257

DEFAMATION

- Practice and procedure — Action for defamation brought out of time — Previous action for defamation against same party for publication of same material struck out on technical ground — No application for extension of time for current application or for leave to bring it — Eight months delay constituted long period of delay in defamation case — Application for leave where earlier action struck out for technical reason would be viewed sympathetically — Comparison of new test for extension of time with old test — Continuing relevance of length of delay under new test — Whether party's solicitor's conduct good reason to grant extension of time to bring defamation action — Past and current limitation statutory provisions — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), ss 12A, 12B, 23(2) — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A.
- Woolf v Brandt* 300

DISTRICT COURT

- Decision of Registrar to refuse access to subpoenaed material — Application for review by Court of Registrar's decision — Whether *House v The King* error had to be shown — Relevant principle — Whether relevant matters had not been considered and irrelevant matters had been considered — Whether access should be limited — Relevant factor — Review of Registrar's decision — Relevant principles — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 49.19, 49.20.
- Nowland as Executor of the Estate of Nowland v The State of New South Wales* 290

INDUSTRIAL LAW

- Industrial safety — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW) — Offence — Elements of offence of breach of statutory duty to eliminate or minimise risks to health and safety — Additional pleading of named victims of alleged breach of duty — Whether extra element of offence thereby added — Whether offence could be pleaded as alternative breaches of two types of duty set out in statutory provision — Whether election by prosecutor required as to which breach to prosecute — Whether particulars of statutory provision could be pleaded in the alternative — Use of expression "and/or" in pleading — Pleading of multiple breaches of Act — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW), ss 17, 19, 33, 233.
- SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2)* 323

INDEX

POLICE

- Powers and duties — Powers of search and seizure — Scope of powers — Whether applicable — Relevant factors — Consequence of failures to prove requirements for exercise of powers — Failure to warn arrested person of his or her right not to say or do anything at the request of police — Consequence — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), ss 21, 27, 28A.
R v Fagundez (No 1) 331

PRACTICE

- Pleadings — Use of expression “and/or” — Appropriate manner of pleading multiple breaches of a statutory safety provision — Amendment of indictment — Different enabling statutory provisions — When leave should be granted — Relevant principle — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 20, 21.
SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 2) 323
- Time — Extension of time to serve medical reports — Application for — Requirement that special circumstance warranted extension — Whether requirement satisfied — Relevant factors — Whether costs of successful application payable by applicant — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 57, 58, 59 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.28.
Chitts v Hamied 239

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “Possesses” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 91H(2).
R v Fagundez (No 2) 337
- “Proper medical purpose” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 61HA(2).
R v Kibby (No 3) 284

WORKERS COMPENSATION

- Claim for work injury damages — Claim brought out of time — Application for leave to bring claim out of time — Relevant principles — Explanation for delay — Requirement that explanation need only to be adequate — Whether delay caused direct or presumptive prejudice to defendant — Concerns of pleading — Whether relevant to application that discussion between parties or Notice of Motion offered means to resolve concerns — Costs of successful application for leave — No unreasonable opposition to application by defendant — Whether applicant should pay costs — Relevant factors — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D.
Palackalody v St Vincent’s Hospital Sydney Ltd 251