

AUGUST 2024

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

LAWBOOK CO.'s
DISTRICT COURT
LAW REPORTS
(NSW)

2022-2023

EDITOR

DR RJ DESIATNIK

CONSULTING EDITOR

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M

Acting Judge of the District Court of NSW

REPORTER

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:
41 DCLR(NSW)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 2 — Pages 121-238

Andersen v Nationwide News Pty Ltd	147
Andersen v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd	147
Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2); Sydney Trains v	174
Barai (No 7); Robust Builders Pty Ltd v	207
Barai; Robust Builders Pty Ltd v	96
Bullen; Mangano v	85
Capitalink Pty Ltd v Withnall	231
Cossey; Raad v	1
Dillon v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	167
E Pty Ltd v E2	213
E1 v E2	213
E2; E Pty Ltd v	213
E2; E1 v	213
EB (No 2); GB v	60
Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3); SafeWork NSW v	137
GB v EB (No 2)	60
Hashimi v The King	202
Hemphill v The King	111
Itani v New South Wales	89
King, The; Hashimi v	202
King, The; Hemphill v	111
King, The; Narouz v	69
King, The; Preston v	99
Mangano v Bullen	85
MC; R v	45
McIver (No 2); R v	121
ME; R v	45
MT; R v	45
Narouz v The King	69
Nationwide News Pty Ltd; Andersen v	147

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2021 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

New South Wales; Itani v	89
Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd; Andersen v	147
Police (NSW), Commissioner of; Dillon v	167
Preston v The King	99
R v MC	45
R v McIver (No 2)	121
R v ME	45
R v MT	45
R v Tatola (No 3)	106
R v TH	45
Raad v Cossey	1
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai (No 7)	207
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai	96
SafeWork NSW v Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3)	137
SafeWork NSW v Western Sydney Local Health District (No 1)	77
Sydney Trains v Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2)	174
Tatola (No 3); R v	106
TH; R v	45
Western Sydney Local Health District (No 1); SafeWork NSW v	77
Withnall; Capitalink Pty Ltd v	231

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 2 — Pages 121-238

CONTRACTS

- Breach — Whether loss due to breach — Whether chain of causation broken.
Sydney Trains v Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2) 174

COSTS

- Application for certificate under Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) —
Relevant principles — Acquittal of accused in Judge alone trial — Grant of
certificate for costs of that trial appropriate — Whether Court had power to
extend certificate to include costs of proceedings before other District Court
judges on same charges against accused and costs of appeals to Court of
Criminal Appeal — Whether District Court judge could grant certificate in
proceedings heard by other District Court judge who was no longer available to
make such order — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), ss 2, 3, 3A, 4 —
District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 11, 166.
R v McIver (No 2) 121
- Counsel engaged to act pro bono — No court ordered appointment — Agreement
between barrister acting pro bono and litigant for barrister to be paid only if
litigant successful — Litigant successful — Whether barrister could be paid for
work — Relevant principles — Legal Profession Uniform Law (NSW), ss 174,
175, 178, 181, 185 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 7.18,
7.33-7.42, 42.1.
E1 v E2 213
- General rule — Departure from general rule — Litigant's impecuniosity —
Whether ground for such departure — Whether different findings were "events"
— When costs should be sought in interlocutory proceedings — Civil Procedure
Act 2005 (NSW), s 98 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.1.
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai and Another (No 7) 207
- Lack of written costs agreement — Need to have costs assessed — Whether
necessary when gross sum costs order sought.
E1 v E2 213

COURTS AND JUDGES

- Judges — Disqualification for alleged bias — Application for — Earlier rulings
against applicant in interlocutory proceedings — Whether proper basis for
judge's recusal from hearing application for costs proceedings — Arguments
over "reasonableness" of final judgment and interlocutory judgments as well as
court's alleged disregard of applicant's ill-health or poor representation — Effect
on judge's ability to hear costs application.
Robust Builders Pty Ltd v Barai and Another (No 7) 207

INDEX

CRIMINAL LAW

- Appeal against conviction in Local Court for indictable offence — Offence against Federal law — Requirement that accused consent to hearing in Local Court — Whether implied consent sufficient — Factors relevant to finding implied consent given — Good practice to obtain express consent — Failure to follow good practice — Whether necessarily legal error — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), s 4J. *Hashimi v The King* 202
- Particular offences — Sexual offences — Orders sought in Local Court against registrable person under Child Protection (Offenders Prohibition Orders) Act 2004 (NSW) — Orders made by consent without hearing without consideration of whether in interests of justice to conduct hearing — Appeal to District Court — Whether jurisdictional error — Whether District Court bound to remit matter to Local Court — Whether District Court ought to do so in any event — Relevant factors — Child Protection (Offenders Prohibition Orders) Act 2004 (NSW), ss 4, 5, 10 — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 11A, 12, 18, 20 — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 84. *Dillon v Commissioner of Police (NSW)* 167

DEFAMATION

- Practice — Separate determination of questions of law — Whether appropriate when jury hearing already set — Relevant principles — Whether unfairness to plaintiff if separate hearing ordered — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 28.2. *Andersen v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd* 147
- Publication — Identification — Plaintiff not named in impugned publications — Onus of proof of identification on plaintiff — Required proof — Sole identifying fact of de facto relationship with resultant children with criminal named in impugned publication — Whether sufficient to identify plaintiff — Relevant principles — Principle in *Morgan v Odhams Press Ltd* [1971] 1 WLR 1239 — Whether accepted in Australia. *Andersen v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd* 147

EVIDENCE

- Witnesses — Evidence by audio-visual link technology — Whether court should permit evidence to be given that way — Relevant factors — Evidence (Audio and Audio Visual Links) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 3(1), 7(1), 7(2) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 58 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 31.2(2), 31.3(3). *Capitalink Pty Ltd v Withnall* 231
- Witnesses — Prohibition on publication — Identification of persons — Application by witness for suppression and non-publication orders — “Open justice” principle — Orders sought available where necessary to protect safety of any person — Scope of “safety” — Whether risk of interference with proper administration of justice — Whether use of pseudonym appropriate — Relevant factors — Court Suppression and Non-publication Orders Act 2010 (NSW), ss 3, 6, 7, 8. *SafeWork NSW v Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3)* 137

INDEX

INSURANCE

- Losses and claims — Whether policy responded to loss — Scope of “liability for injury” — Exclusion for “performance warranty” — Whether applicable — Whether exclusion for “professional activities” applicable — Scope of “professional activities” — Characteristics of “profession”.
Sydney Trains v Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2) 174

JUDGMENTS AND ORDERS

- For irregularity — Order made nunc pro tunc — Court’s power to make such order — Limit on power.
E1 v E2 213

PRACTICE

- Subpoenas — Documents produced to court under subpoena — Harmon undertaking — Application to be relieved from undertaking — Relevant principles.
Sydney Trains v Argo Syndicate AMA 1200 (No 2) 174

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “Consent” — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), s 4J.
Hashimi v The King 202
“Proceedings” — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), 3(1).
R v McIver (No 2) 121
“Safety” — Court Suppression and Non-publication Orders Act 2010 (NSW), s 8(1)(c).
SafeWork NSW v Edstein Creative Pty Ltd (No 3) 137