

NOVEMBER 2024

---

The Authorised Reports of Decisions of  
the Federal Court of Australia

---

THE  
FEDERAL COURT  
REPORTS  
2024

EDITOR  
VICTOR KLINE

CONSULTING EDITORS  
DR OREN BIGOS KC  
DAVID ASH

REPORTER IN THIS PART  
SAMUEL CUMMINGS

PRODUCTION EDITOR  
MYUNG COLE

VOL 304 — PART 4

PAGES 471-625

2024

THE

FEDERAL COURT

REPORTS

THE AUTHORISED REPORTS OF DECISIONS OF  
THE FEDERAL COURT OF AUSTRALIA

EDITOR  
VICTOR KLINE

CONSULTING EDITORS  
DR OREN BIGOS KC  
DAVID ASH

VOLUME 304

LAWBOOK CO.

2024

**SENIOR REPORTERS**

SAMUEL CUMMINGS

VICTOR KLINE

RAFFAELE PICCOLO

**REPORTERS**

MITCHELL BRUNKER

FRANCIS CARDELL-OLIVER

**PRODUCTION EDITOR**

MYUNG COLE



© 2024 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

ABN 64 058 914 668

Lawbook Co.

Published in Sydney

Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW

ISSN 0813-7803

FEDERAL COURT OF AUSTRALIA

CHIEF JUSTICE

THE HONOURABLE DEBRA SUE MORTIMER

JUDGES

THE HONOURABLE BERNA COLLIER

THE HONOURABLE JOHN ALEXANDER LOGAN, RFD

THE HONOURABLE NYE PERRAM

THE HONOURABLE JOHN VICTOR NICHOLAS

THE HONOURABLE DAVID MARKEY YATES

THE HONOURABLE MORDECAI BROMBERG

THE HONOURABLE ANNA JUDITH KATZMANN

THE HONOURABLE BERNARD MURPHY

THE HONOURABLE DARRYL RANGIAH

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL WIGNEY

THE HONOURABLE MELISSA PERRY

THE HONOURABLE JONATHAN BARRY RASHLEIGH BEACH

THE HONOURABLE BRIGITTE SANDRA MARKOVIC

THE HONOURABLE MARK KRANZ MOSHINSKY

THE HONOURABLE ROBERT BROMWICH

THE HONOURABLE NATALIE CHARLESWORTH

THE HONOURABLE STEPHEN BURLEY

THE HONOURABLE DAVID JOHN O'CALLAGHAN

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL BRYAN JOSHUA LEE

THE HONOURABLE ROGER MARC DERRINGTON

THE HONOURABLE SARAH CATHERINE DERRINGTON AM

THE HONOURABLE KATRINA FRANCES BANKS-SMITH

THE HONOURABLE CRAIG GRIERSON COLVIN

THE HONOURABLE THOMAS MICHAEL THAWLEY

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL FRANCIS WHEELAHAN

THE HONOURABLE ANGUS MORKEL STEWART

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL HUGH O'BRYAN

THE HONOURABLE DARREN JOHN JACKSON

THE HONOURABLE JOHN LESLIE SNADEN  
THE HONOURABLE STEWART MAXWELL ANDERSON  
THE HONOURABLE WENDY JANE ABRAHAM  
THE HONOURABLE JOHN HALLEY  
THE HONOURABLE ELIZABETH CHEESEMAN  
THE HONOURABLE HELEN MARY JOAN ROFE  
THE HONOURABLE KYLIE ELIZABETH DOWNES  
THE HONOURABLE SCOTT ANTHONY GOODMAN  
THE HONOURABLE PATRICK O'SULLIVAN  
THE HONOURABLE SHAUN BRENDAN McELWAIN  
THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL JAMES FEUTRILL  
THE HONOURABLE FIONA MEAGHER  
THE HONOURABLE TIMOTHY McEVOY  
THE HONOURABLE LISA HESPE  
THE HONOURABLE ELIZABETH RAPER  
THE HONOURABLE GEOFFREY ROSS KENNETT  
THE HONOURABLE CATHERINE GAIL BUTTON  
THE HONOURABLE IAN McNEIL JACKMAN  
THE HONOURABLE ADAM HATCHER  
THE HONOURABLE EMILIOS KYROU AO  
THE HONOURABLE CHRISTOPHER HORAN  
THE HONOURABLE YASEEN SHARIFF  
THE HONOURABLE PENELOPE ANNA NESKOVICIN  
THE HONOURABLE CRAIG WILLIAM DOWLING  
THE HONOURABLE JANE ANNABEL DARLING NEEDHAM  
THE HONOURABLE STEPHEN ANDREW McDONALD

The mode of citation of this part will be:  
304 FCR

---

---

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 4 — Pages 471-625

<b>AJN23 v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs</b> .....	586
Australian Financial Complaints Authority Ltd; Connor v .....	425
Australian Financial Complaints Authority Ltd; Nguyen v .....	286
Australian Information Commissioner; Patrick v .....	1
Blue Sky Alternative Investments Ltd (in liq); R&B Investments Pty Ltd v .....	395
Bullmore v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs .....	370
Cannon; Euro Car Parts Pty Ltd v .....	349
Coleman; Veale v .....	182
Commonwealth v Palmanova Pty Ltd .....	163
Connor v Australian Financial Complaints Authority Ltd .....	425
<b>DST18 v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs</b> .....	505
<b>Electoral Commissioner of the Australian Electoral Commission v Laming</b> .....	561
Environment and Water, Minister for; Environment Council of Central Queensland Inc v .....	91
Environment Council of Central Queensland Inc v Minister for Environment and Water .....	91
Euro Car Parts Pty Ltd v Cannon .....	349
<b>Federal Court of Australia, Registrar of the; Mensink v</b> .....	471
Fire Rescue Victoria; United Firefighters' Union of Australia v .....	219
Health and Aged Care, Secretary, Department of v M House Pty Ltd .....	297
Health and Aged Care, Secretary, Department of; Softmed Manufacturing Pty Ltd v .....	448
Home Affairs, Minister for; Save the Children Australia v .....	262

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

---

---



© 2024 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0813-7803

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Hot Wok Food Makers Pty Ltd v United Workers Union (No 3) .....	136
<b>Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for;</b>	
<b>AJN23 v</b> .....	586
<b>Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for;</b>	
<b>DST18 v</b> .....	505
Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for; TPTN	
v .....	244
Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs,	
Minister for; Bullmore v .....	370
<b>Laming; Electoral Commissioner of the Australian Electoral</b>	
<b>Commission v</b> .....	561
M House Pty Ltd; Secretary, Department of Health and Aged Care v .....	297
<b>Mensink v Registrar of the Federal Court of Australia</b> .....	471
National Tertiary Education Industry Union; University of Sydney v .....	18
Nguyen v Australian Financial Complaints Authority Ltd .....	286
Palmanova Pty Ltd; Commonwealth v .....	163
Parkyn; Storry v .....	318
Patrick v Australian Information Commissioner .....	1
<b>Professional Services Review, Director of; Raiz v</b> .....	600
R&B Investments Pty Ltd v Blue Sky Alternative Investments Ltd (in	
liq) .....	395
<b>Raiz v Director of Professional Services Review</b> .....	600
Save the Children Australia v Minister for Home Affairs .....	262
<b>Sladden v Federal Commissioner of Taxation</b> .....	492
Softmed Manufacturing Pty Ltd v Secretary, Department of Health and	
Aged Care .....	448
Storry v Parkyn .....	318
<b>Taxation, Federal Commissioner of; Sladden v</b> .....	492
TPTN v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural	
Affairs .....	244
United Firefighters' Union of Australia v Fire Rescue Victoria .....	219
United Workers Union (No 3); Hot Wok Food Makers Pty Ltd v .....	136
University of Sydney v National Tertiary Education Industry Union .....	18
Veale v Coleman .....	182

---

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

# INDEX

Part 4 — Pages 471-625

## COURTS AND JUDGES

Contempt — Whether alleged contemnor could validly submit to the jurisdiction of the Court in contempt proceedings — Whether primary judge erred by considering the strength of the case against appellant to be a neutral consideration when determining whether the trial of the contempt charge should proceed in appellant's absence.

*Mensink v Registrar of the Federal Court of Australia* ..... 471

## ELECTIONS

Electoral matters — Communication of — Whether the singular act of publication of a post on a Facebook page which resulted in an electoral matter being communicated to more than one person constituted a single breach of a statutory prohibition on the publication of certain electoral matters, irrespective of how many times the post was in fact viewed — Commonwealth Electoral Act 1918 (Cth), s 321D(5).

*Electoral Commissioner of the Australian Electoral Commission v Laming* ..... 561

## HEALTH LAW

Professional Services Review Scheme — Where respondent was requested to review provision of services by applicant — Where respondent referred the review to a committee — Where the committee chairperson was absent for three days of the hearing the committee conducted in relation to the review — Whether the committee had statutory authority to conduct the hearing in the chairperson's absence — Health Insurance Act 1973 (Cth), Pt VAA, ss 95(1), 101(2).

*Raiz v Director of Professional Services Review and Another* ..... 600

## IMMIGRATION

Refugees — Safe haven enterprise visa — Refusal to grant — Fast track review process before Immigration Assessment Authority — Where Minister was required to refer fast track reviewable decision to Authority for review — Where Secretary of Minister's Department was required to give Authority any material that was in Secretary's possession or control and was considered by Secretary (at the time the decision was referred to Authority) to be relevant to the review — Whether Minister was required to re-refer a matter to the Authority following remittal by a court — Whether re-referral of matter by Minister to Authority resulted in Secretary having to re-perform their duty to provide relevant material to Authority — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), Pt 7AA, ss 473CA, 473CB, 473CB(1)(c), 473DB.

*DST18 v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs and Another* ..... 505



## INDEX

### IMMIGRATION — *continued*

- Visas — Refusal to grant — Where Minister refused to grant visa to appellant on the understanding that appellant would thereafter be detained indefinitely until he was removed to another country — Whether Minister acted on an erroneous understanding of the law — Whether Minister's error was material — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), ss 501(1), 501A(2), 501A(2)(e).  
*AJN23 v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs* ..... 586

### TAXATION

- Income tax — Assessable income — Where settlement sum received by taxpayer under a deed of release between taxpayer and taxpayer's insurer was included in taxpayer's assessable income as ordinary income — Whether Tribunal ought to have confined itself to the deed of release when determining the character of the settlement sum — Income Tax Assessment Act 1997 (Cth), s 6-5.  
*Sladden v Federal Commissioner of Taxation* ..... 492