

JUNE 2024

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

LAWBOOK CO.'s
DISTRICT COURT
LAW REPORTS
(NSW)

2023

EDITOR

DR RJ DESIATNIK

CONSULTING EDITOR

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M

Judge of the District Court of NSW

REPORTER

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:
40 DCLR(NSW)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 4 — Pages 348-463

Adobe Construction Group Pty Ltd; Infinity Formwork Group Pty Ltd v	418
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd; Hackett v	1
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd; Smith v	1
Astute Earth Works Pty Ltd; SafeWork NSW v	59
Babb; Burton v	97
Bartley; Condon v	1
Bodley (No 2); Scott v	27
Bodley; Scott v	14
British Airways PLC v Roller Truck Australia Pty Ltd	106
Burge v Lake Macquarie City Council	306
Burton v Babb	97
Cappello v Homebuilding Pty Ltd (No 2)	140
Cappello v Transport for New South Wales	40
Carnavalesca Pty Ltd (t/as Paragalli Haulage) v Jenkins	389
Condon v Bartley	1
Donaldson Coal Pty Ltd; Johnston v	269
Duffin; SafeWork NSW v	450
Dunn v The Trustee of the Lazic Family Trust	343
Fletcher International Exports Pty Ltd; Lee v	179
Frity; Ibrahim v	274
Gee v Jamieson	234
Georges v B Georges	335
Georges v G Georges	335
Georges, B; Georges v	335
Georges, G; Georges v	335
Giunta v Giunta	407
Giunta; Giunta v	407
GRC Project Pty Ltd (t/as GRC Property Management) v Lai	364

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2024 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Hackett v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd	1
Hayes v RACQ Insurance Ltd	1
Hinchley v The King	66
Homebuilding Pty Ltd (No 2); Cappello v	140
Ibrahim v Frity	274
Infinity Formwork Group Pty Ltd v Adobe Construction Group Pty Ltd	418
Jafarigolrokh (aka Goldwin) v The Queen	229
Jamieson; Gee v	234
JBS Australia Pty Ltd (No 2); SafeWork NSW v	213
JBS Australia Pty Ltd; SafeWork NSW v	201
Jenkins; Carnavalesca Pty Ltd (t/as Paragalli Haulage) v	389
Johnston v Donaldson Coal Pty Ltd	269
King, The; Hinchley v	66
Knell; R v	90
Kopacz; R v	256
Lachlan Shire Council; Stanley v	442
Lai; GRC Project Pty Ltd (t/as GRC Property Management) v	364
Lake Macquarie City Council; Burge v	306
Lee v Fletcher International Exports Pty Ltd	179
Marshall v O’Flaherty (Costs)	151
Masic v Western Sydney Local Health District (t/as Westmead Hospital)	326
McCabe v Riechelmann (No 2)	280
McCabe v Riechelmann (No 3)	437
McCullough (t/as The Green Side Up) v New Start Australia Pty Ltd	53
Mehajer (No 2); R v	378
Mo v Director of Public Prosecutions	76
Musgrave v SRM Lawyers Pty Ltd	321
New South Wales (No 3), State of; Reeves v	429
New Start Australia Pty Ltd; McCullough (t/as The Green Side Up) v	53
O’Flaherty (Costs); Marshall v	151
Oxborough; Whitehall v	264
Patel v Director of Public Prosecutions	189
Public Prosecutions, Director of; Mo v	76
Public Prosecutions, Director of; Patel v	189
Qantas Ground Services Ltd (No 2); SafeWork NSW v	246
QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd; Ward v	1
Queen, The; Jafarigolrokh (aka Goldwin) v	229
R v Knell	90
R v Kopacz	256
R v Mehajer (No 2)	378
R v RJ (No 4)	118
R v SE	124
R v SGH	161
R v Smith	348
RACQ Insurance Ltd; Hayes v	1

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Reeves v State of New South Wales (No 3)	429
Riechelmann (No 2); McCabe v	280
Riechelmann (No 3); McCabe v	437
RJ (No 4); R v	118
Roller Truck Australia Pty Ltd; British Airways PLC v	106
SafeWork NSW v Astute Earth Works Pty Ltd	59
SafeWork NSW v Duffin	450
SafeWork NSW v JBS Australia Pty Ltd (No 2)	213
SafeWork NSW v JBS Australia Pty Ltd	201
SafeWork NSW v Qantas Ground Services Ltd (No 2)	246
Scott v Bodley (No 2)	27
Scott v Bodley	14
SE; R v	124
SGH; R v	161
Smith v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd	1
Smith; R v	348
SRM Lawyers Pty Ltd; Musgrave v	321
Stanley v Lachlan Shire Council	442
Transport for New South Wales; Cappello v	40
Trustee of the Lazic Family Trust, The; Dunn v	343
Ward v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd	1
Western Sydney Local Health District (t/as Westmead Hospital); Masic v	326
Whitehall v Oxborough	264

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 4 — Pages 348-463

BUILDING AND ENGINEERING CONTRACTS

- Remuneration — Progress payments — Claims for payment — Claim made under Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW) — No payment schedule served in response — Claim part of court proceedings to recover moneys allegedly due under construction contract — Whether claim a nullity — Limit of one invoice per named month — Claim only for one invoice issued in August — Validity — Whether judgment on claim precluded final determination of dispute between parties — Whether judgment merged with entire cause of claimant's action — Whether equitable set-off could be raised as defence to application for summary judgment on claim — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 8, 13, 14, 15, 16, 32 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 13.1, 13.3, 19.1.
Infinity Formwork Group Pty Ltd v Adobe Construction Group Pty Ltd 418

COSTS

- Assessment — Statutory cap on costs in personal injury damages claim — Whether claim based on false imprisonment within application of cap — Whether mere deprivation of liberty or hurt feelings or being scared or being very anxious within statutory definition of “injury” — Whether “issue by issue” approach should be taken in making costs order — Relevant factors — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 11 — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), s 61, Sch 1, cl 2(1)(a).
Reeves v State of New South Wales (No 3) 429
- Concept of “legal services” — Whether inclusive of legal services provided by barrister — Reference in costs order to payment of fees for such services — Whether necessary.
McCabe v Riechermann (No 3) 437
- Jurisdiction — Court's power to order payment of court hearing fees by party — Civil Procedure Regulation 2017 (NSW), reg 10(2)(a).
McCabe v Riechermann (No 3) 437
- Order for costs — Wording of order — Whether usual to order disbursements to be paid separately from order that costs be paid.
McCabe v Riechermann (No 3) 437
- Order for indemnity costs — Assessment of costs — Assessment affirmed by Costs Review Panel — Appeal against Panel's decision — Assessment to be made in accordance with court's order — Court's order made in error — Ultra vires order — Whether assessment thereby erroneous — Appropriate way to deal with erroneous court order — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), ss 75, 76 — Local Court Rules 2009 (NSW), r 2.9 — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Regulation 2015 (NSW), reg 38.
Carnavalesca Pty Ltd (t/as Paragalli Haulage) v Jenkins and Another 389

INDEX

COSTS — *continued*

- Order for payment of costs — Whether GST separate from charge for legal services
— Whether GST recoverable in addition to costs where legislative cap on charges.
McCabe v Riechelmann (No 3) 437

CRIMINAL LAW

- Practice and procedure — Trial before judge without jury — Conduct of trial —
Relevant principles.
R v Smith 348

DEFAMATION

- Action for — Serious harm element — Determination — Application for pre-trial
determination — Whether special circumstances demonstrated so as to avoid
such determination — Burden of proof of such circumstances — Relevant
factors — Court's own power to order pre-trial hearing as to serious harm
element — Effect — Relevance of case management factors — Prospect of
overlap of evidence of imputations at early serious harm hearing with evidence
of imputations at trial — Effect — Whether filing of defence necessary for
decision on holding pre-trial hearing — English decisions on grant or refusal of
pre-trial hearing — Significance for Australia law — Defamation Act 2005
(NSW), s 10A.
*GRC Project Pty Ltd (t/as GRC Property Management) and
Another v Lai* 364

ESTOPPEL

- Issue estoppel — Anshun estoppel — Whether applicable — Relevant principles —
Whether claim for tortious compensation available where findings made on that
issue by Family Court in earlier judgment between parties.
Giunta v Giunta 407

FIREARMS

- Offences — Determination whether item was body armour vest — Relevance of
professionalism of manufacturer — Whether gel blaster within statutory
definition of “air gun” — Use of item — Relevance to determining whether it
was children's toy — Need for Parliament to legislate further on legality of
possession of gel blaster — Weapons Prohibition Act 1998 (NSW), s 7(1), Sch 1
cll 2(18A), 4(1) — Firearms Act 1996 (NSW), ss 3, 4(1), 4D, 7(1), 51D(2).
R v Smith 348

INDEX

INDUSTRIAL LAW

- Prosecution of offence under Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW) — Practice — Services of Notices by prosecutor and defendant — Whether prosecutor could then serve further expert report — Power of court to make ruling — Whether contents of new report exceeded boundaries of Summons — Whether prosecutor prevented from relying on supplemental report — Whether defendant prevented from raising objections based on rules of evidence if report permitted to be relied on — Notice of Defence Case — Accuracy of title — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 247G, 247I, 247K — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 192A.
- SafeWork NSW v Duffin* 450

PRACTICE

- Application to strike out action — Whether action brought outside limitation period — Whether deciding question at interlocutory hearing desirable.
- Giunta v Giunta* 407
- Conviction of offender after jury trial in District Court — Application by offender for related offences to be heard by Local Court — Whether in “interests of justice” to remit matter to Local Court — Burden of proof on offender to satisfy District Court the remitter in interests of justice — Relevance of efficiency, costs and convenience to remitter decision — Relevancy of offender’s appeal rights or lack of such rights if remitter refused — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 166, 167, 168, 169 — Criminal Appeal Act 1912 (NSW), s 5AD.
- R v Mehajer (No 2)* 378

TORTS

- Unlawful conduct intended to cause emotional distress — Whether such tort existed — Analogous torts — Whether existence of reasonably arguable cause of action in tort.
- Giunta v Giunta* 407

WORDS AND PHRASES

- “Air gun” — Firearms Act 1996 (NSW), s 4.
- R v Smith* 348
- “Impairment of a person’s physical or mental condition” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 11(b).
- Reeves v State of New South Wales (No 3)* 429
- “Residents of different States” — Constitution, s 75(iv).
- Stanley v Lachlan Shire Council* 442
- “Under the construction contract” — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), s 15(4)(b)(ii).
- Infinity Formwork Group Pty Ltd v Adobe Construction Group Pty Ltd* 418

INDEX

WORKERS COMPENSATION

- Proceedings for compensation — Personal Injury Commission — Lack of jurisdiction over issue of possible Federal jurisdiction — Proceedings between resident of Queensland and New South Wales local council — Whether matter involved residents of different States or State and resident of another State — Whether council natural person — Whether council emanation of State — Constitution, s 75 — Judiciary Act 1903 (Cth), s 39(2) — Personal Injury Commission Act 2020 (NSW), ss 26(3), 27 — Local Government Act 1993 (NSW), ss 220, 266(1)(b) — Constitution Act 1902 (NSW), s 51 — Interpretation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 21, 112.
- Stanley v Lachlan Shire Council* 442