

MARCH 2024

Decisions of the District Court of New South Wales

LAWBOOK CO.'s
DISTRICT COURT
LAW REPORTS
(NSW)

2022-2023

EDITOR

DR RJ DESIATNIK

CONSULTING EDITOR

A M BLACKMORE SC, B LEG, LL.M

Judge of the District Court of NSW

REPORTER

DR RJ DESIATNIK

The mode of citation of this part will be:
40 DCLR(NSW)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 1 — Pages 1-123

Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd; Hackett v	1
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd; Smith v	1
Astute Earth Works Pty Ltd; SafeWork NSW v	59
Babb; Burton v	97
Bartley; Condon v	1
Bodley (No 2); Scott v	27
Bodley; Scott v	14
British Airways PLC v Roller Truck Australia Pty Ltd	106
Burton v Babb	97
Cappello v Transport for New South Wales	40
Condon v Bartley	1
Hackett v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd	1
Hayes v RACQ Insurance Ltd	1
Hinchley v The King	66
King, The; Hinchley v	66
Knell; R v	90
McCullough (t/as The Green Side Up) v New Start Australia Pty Ltd	53
Mo v Director of Public Prosecutions	76
New Start Australia Pty Ltd; McCullough (t/as The Green Side Up) v	53
Public Prosecutions, Director of; Mo v	76
QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd; Ward v	1
R v Knell	90
R v RJ (No 4)	118
RACQ Insurance Ltd; Hayes v	1
RJ (No 4); R v	118
Roller Truck Australia Pty Ltd; British Airways PLC v	106
SafeWork NSW v Astute Earth Works Pty Ltd	59
Scott v Bodley (No 2)	27
Scott v Bodley	14

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2021 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 1832-3235

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Smith v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd	1
Transport for New South Wales; Cappello v	40
Ward v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd	1

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 1 — Pages 1-123

BUILDING AND ENGINEERING CONTRACTS

- Enforceability — Statutory scheme to increase interim flow of funds — Adjudication of claim — Issue and registration of adjudication — Consequent judgment — Issue of garnishee order — Stay of judgment and order — Application to discharge judgment and order — Exercise of Court's discretion — Relevant principles — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), s 25.
McCullough (t/as The Green Side Up) v New Start Australia Pty Ltd 53

COSTS

- Appeal as to costs to District Court — Appeal out of time — Application for leave to appeal — Exercise of discretion whether to grant leave — Relevant principles — Relevant factors — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), s 89.
Cappello and Another v Transport for New South Wales 40
- Award of costs in favour of government authority — Statutory disclosure obligations on solicitors — Whether applicable to solicitors representing government authority — Whether Roads and Maritime Services was government authority — Relevant factors — Whether Crown Solicitor akin to in-house lawyer of government department so that department was self-represented and unable to claim costs — Relevant principle — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), ss 6, 170, 173, 174, 178.
Cappello and Another v Transport for New South Wales 40

CRIMINAL LAW

- Appeal against conviction — Relevant principle — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 18.
Hinchley v The King 66
- Particular offences — Causing a person to take intoxicating substance with intent to commit indictable crime — Attempt to commit such offence — Meaning of “cause to take” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 38(b), 344A(1).
R v Knell 90
- Particular offences — Charge under s 93R of Crimes Act 1900 (NSW) — Criminal liability — Whether order under mental health legislation appropriate — Relevant factors — Assessment of seriousness of offence — Elements of that factor — Significance of that factor — Competing public interests in decision whether to apply mental health legislation — Whether criminal justice system facilitated general deterrence when applied to mentally ill offender — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 93R — Mental Health and Cognitive Impairment Forensic Provisions Act 2020 (NSW), ss 14, 15.
Mo v Director of Public Prosecutions 76

INDEX

CRIMINAL LAW — *continued*

- Particular offences — Sexual offences — Sentence — Statutory obligation for registrable person to report each year — Whether obligation complied with — Whether reasonable excuse existed for non-compliance with obligation — Two statutory obligations regarding reporting — Whether compliance with one counted as compliance with other — Child Protection (Offenders Registration) Act 2000 (NSW), ss 2A, 3A, 9, 9A, 10, 11, 17(1).
Hinchley v The King 66

DEFAMATION

- Action for — Separate trial of whether defamatory publication had caused or was likely to cause “serious harm” — Online postings on Internet — Whether evidence of serious harm deficient — Whether mere posting on Internet evidence that material had been downloaded — Whether caution needed in reading Google review — Whether “serious” harm equivalent of substantial harm — Beneficial effect of s 10A procedure — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 10A.
Scott v Bodley (No 2) 27
- Practice — Interlocutory matters — Whether serious harm suffered by person allegedly defamed — Application by person sued for hearing to determine that issue prior to final hearing as to liability and damages — When such interlocutory hearing appropriate — Purpose of prior determination of element of serious harm — Statutory intention for such determination to take place early — Whether clear and severable question must first be formulated before determination made — Whether prospect of inconsistent findings on evidence of witness at interlocutory and final hearing illusory — Whether special circumstances existed to prevent interlocutory hearing as to existence of serious harm — Filing of defence prior to such hearing — Whether preferable course — Exercise of Court’s power to grant application for hearing of “serious harm” issue — Relevant factors — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 10A.
Scott v Bodley 14

EVIDENCE

- Witnesses — Application by Crown to recall accused’s witness to put questions in cross-examination inadvertently not asked when witness gave evidence earlier in trial — Whether leave should be granted — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 46, 192.
R v RJ (No 4) 118
- Witnesses — Demeanour of — Significance — Assessment by jury where evidence of witness given by audio visual link — Whether such evidence less assessable — Whether demeanour even assessable if evidence given by audio visual link.
SafeWork NSW v Astute Earth Works Pty Ltd 59

INDEX

INSURANCE

- Compulsory motor vehicle third-party insurance — Jurisdiction of Personal Injury Commission — Claim against licensed compulsory third-party (CTP) insurers and interstate non-government owned CTP insurers — Whether claims against State or resident — Whether claims brought before Commission were against driver or owner of vehicle or insurer — Whether driver or owner had to be heard in dispute over claim — Constitution, s 75(iv) — Motor Accident Injuries Act 2017 (NSW) — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW) — Motor Accident Insurance Act 1994 (Qld).
Condon v Bartley 1

PRACTICE

- Discovery and inspection of documents — Application for order for preliminary discovery under r 5.2 of court's rules — Requirements — Change in circumstances after order made — Effect — Exercise of discretion to make order — Relevant factor — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 5.2, 5.3.
British Airways PLC v Roller Truck Australia Pty Ltd and Another 106
- Evidence — Taking of — Video conferencing facility — Extent of functionality of Microsoft Teams application — Whether fairer to defendant than not having witness available to give evidence — Courts' experience with medium — Whether trial unfair as distinct from some unfairness to defendant — Whether direction should be made — Relevant factors — Evidence (Audio and Audio Visual Links) Act 1998 (NSW), s 5B — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 65.
SafeWork NSW v Astute Earth Works Pty Ltd 59

PUBLIC TRANSPORT

- Government departments — Transition from Roads and Maritime Services department to Transport for New South Wales department — Relevant process to effect transition — Transport Administration Act 1988 (NSW), ss 46, Sch 7, cl 218 — Transport Administration Amendment (RMS Dissolution) Act 2019 (NSW), item 35.
Cappello and Another v Transport for New South Wales 40

STATUTES

- Construction — Relevant principle.
Hinchley v The King 66

TORTS

- Particular torts — Malicious prosecution — Elements — Lack of proof that parties sued had played active part in prosecution — Whether party's role in operation of Act under which prosecution brought meant party actively involved in prosecution — Failure to take proceedings against third party — Whether such failure meant prosecution of plaintiffs was malicious — Failure of prosecution on point of law — Whether such proceedings thereby lacked reasonable and probable cause — Court Suppression and Non-publication Orders Act 2010 (NSW), s 57(1)(a) — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW).
Burton and Another v Babb and Another 97

INDEX

WORDS AND PHRASES

“Cause to take” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 38(b).	
<i>R v Knell</i>	90
“Each year” — Child Protection (Offenders Registration) Act 2000 (NSW), s 10(1).	
<i>Hinchley v The King</i>	66
“Government authority” — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), s 6.	
<i>Cappello and Another v Transport for New South Wales</i>	40
“Serious harm” — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 10A.	
<i>Scott v Bodley (No 2)</i>	27
“Seriousness” — Mental Health and Cognitive Impairment Forensic Provisions Act 2020 (NSW), s 15(b).	
<i>Mo v Director of Public Prosecutions</i>	76
“Special circumstances” — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 10A(5).	
<i>Scott v Bodley</i>	14