

FEBRUARY 2023

---

The Authorised Reports of the Decisions of the  
Supreme Court of Tasmania

---

THE  
TASMANIAN  
REPORTS  
2020-2021

EDITOR  
L W MAHER

REPORTERS  
BENEDICT BARTL  
NINA HUDSON  
LEWIS RINGWALDT

**VOL 34 — PART 1**

**PAGES 1-119**

**PUBLISHED FOR THE COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING  
OF TASMANIA BY THOMSON REUTERS (PROFESSIONAL) AUSTRALIA LTD.**

The mode of citation of this part will be:  
34 Tas R

---

---

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 1 — Pages 1-119

<b>Anti-Discrimination Tribunal (No 2); Von Stalheim v</b> .....	25
<b>Brown v Jones</b> .....	87
<b>Casimaty v Hazell Bros Group Pty Ltd</b> .....	43
<b>Girmay v Green</b> .....	64
<b>Green; Girmay v</b> .....	64
<b>Greenham Tasmania Pty Ltd v Director of Public</b>	
<b>Prosecutions</b> .....	49
<b>Hazell Bros Group Pty Ltd; Casimaty v</b> .....	43
<b>Johnson &amp; Johnson; State of Washington v</b> .....	110
<b>Jones; Brown v</b> .....	87
<b>Liu; Tasmania v</b> .....	1
<b>Milligan (No 2); Tasmania v</b> .....	106
<b>Milligan; Tasmania v</b> .....	101
<b>Prosser; Roman Catholic Church Trust v</b> .....	75
<b>Public Prosecutions, Director of; Greenham Tasmania Pty</b>	
<b>Ltd v</b> .....	49
<b>Roman Catholic Church Trust v Prosser</b> .....	75
<b>Tasmania v Liu</b> .....	1
<b>Tasmania v Milligan (No 2)</b> .....	106
<b>Tasmania v Milligan</b> .....	101
<b>Tasmania v Whitton-Lowe</b> .....	15
<b>Von Stalheim v Anti-Discrimination Tribunal (No 2)</b> .....	25
<b>Washington, State of v Johnson &amp; Johnson</b> .....	110
<b>Whitton-Lowe; Tasmania v</b> .....	15

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

---

---



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2023 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0085-7106

# INDEX

Part 1 — Pages 1-119

## COURTS AND JUDGES

- Judges — Disqualification for interest or bias — Particular grounds — Apprehension of prejudgment — Town planning — Construction of interchange on Tasman Highway near the Hobart International Airport — Objector — Plaintiff seeking equitable relief asserting non-compliance with statute requiring scrutiny of expenditure on roadworks project by parliamentary committee — Strike-out application asserting no justiciable issue and parliamentary privilege — Judge took into account evidence as to expenditure on project when refusing extension of time for appeal from planning decision — Public Works Committee Act 1914 (Tas).  
*Casimaty v Hazell Bros Group Pty Ltd* ..... 43

## CRIMINAL LAW

- Appeal and new trial — Appeal against sentence — Sentence manifestly excessive — Family violence offence — Assault by pulling hair and punching to legs — Choking of victim — Risk of death or serious injury — Distress of very young children witnessing assault on their mother — Prior conviction for assault but no history of family violence — Mitigation — Offender's intoxication of limited weight — Victim expressing forgiveness of and support for offender of little weight — Overriding public interest in denunciation of crime — Community entitlement to retribution — General deterrence — Family hardship arising from punishment of little weight — Sentence of three months' imprisonment with two months suspended not manifestly excessive — Family Violence Act 2004 (Tas), s 13A — Police Offences Act 1935 (Tas).  
*Brown v Jones* ..... 87
- Evidence — Admissibility — Discretion to admit or exclude evidence — Fairness — Whether evidence improperly obtained — Particular cases — Police investigation of suspected trafficking in fish — Recording of telephone conversation with police officer — Caution given to person of Chinese origin with imperfect English — Whether person able to communicate in English with reasonable fluency — Whether unfair to admit evidence of admissions made during conversation — Evidence Act 2001 (Tas), ss 90, 138(1)(a), 139.  
*Tasmania v Liu* ..... 1
- Evidence — Confessions and admissions — Statements — Records of interview — Electronic recording — Recording of telephone conversation when police officer questioned accused — No audio-visual recording made — Admissions not later confirmed by accused — Reasonable explanation as to why audio-visual record could not be made — Evidence Act 2001 (Tas), s 85A(1), 90, 139(1)-(3).  
*Tasmania v Liu* ..... 1

## INDEX

### CRIMINAL LAW — *continued*

- General matters — Criminal liability and capacity — Recklessly discharging a firearm — Criminal Code — Defences — Generally — Defence of persons or property — Defence of dwelling-house — Threat of forcible breaking and entry — Trespassers — Self-defence — Use of force — Whether defences available — Criminal Code (Tas), ss 40, 41, 46.  
*Tasmania v Milligan* ..... 101
- Offences against peace and public order — Offensive weapons — Firearms — Possession — Generally — Prohibited firearm — Item capable of propelling projectile by means of compressed air or gas — Air rifle — Gel blaster — Whether a firearm in respect of which a licence may not be issued — Firearms Act 1996 (Tas), ss 3, 9(1A)(b), Sch 1.  
*Tasmania v Milligan (No 2)* ..... 106
- Procedure — Indictable offences — Assaults — Pleas — General pleas — Admissibility — Unrepresented defendant — Plea of guilty in Magistrates Court — Committal to Supreme Court for sentence — Defendant seeking legal advice and represented by counsel on committal — Withdrawal and restoration of plea — After — Criminal Code (Tas), ss 7, 331B, 331C, 345, 356, 420, 421A — Justices Act 1959 (Tas), ss 27, 32, 47, 48, 55(3), 56, 58-60.  
*Tasmania v Whitton-Lowe* ..... 15

### EVIDENCE

- Adducing Evidence — Course of evidence — Evidence before trial — Letter of Request by foreign court — Proceeding pending in State court in the United States of America — US State seeking damages against pharmaceutical company — Alleged understatement of side effects of opioids produced from genetically engineered poppies grown in Tasmania — Request on behalf of plaintiff for oral depositions during pre-trial discovery — Ex parte order made on the papers in response to Letter of Request allowing taking of evidence — Jurisdiction disputed by defendant in US proceeding — Application to set aside ex parte order granted — Relevant considerations — US-style discovery through pre-trial depositions taken from witnesses not a step recognised in Australian or English Courts — Evidence on Commission Act 2001 (Tas), ss 4, 5(4) — Supreme Court Rules 2000 (Tas), r 972 — Hague Convention on the Taking of Evidence Abroad in Civil or Commercial Matters 1970 (INT).  
*State of Washington v Johnson & Johnson* ..... 110

### HUMAN RIGHTS

- Tribunals, commissions and other authorities — Tasmania — Anti-Discrimination Tribunal — Reviewing, rejection and dismissal of complaints — Judicial review of tribunal decisions — Whether complaint was in relation to the same matter as an earlier complaint that had lapsed — Anti-Discrimination Act 1998 (Tas), ss 65(4), 71(4), 72(1), 73.  
*Von Stalheim v Anti-Discrimination Tribunal (No 2)* ..... 25

## INDEX

### INDUSTRIAL LAW

- Work health and safety — Duties and liabilities — Duties owed to workers —  
Other matters and particular cases — Management and control of workplace —  
Charge of failure to comply with health and safety duties exposing an individual  
to risk of death or serious injury — Elements of offence — Work Health and  
Safety Act 2012 (Tas), ss 18, 19, 32.  
*Greenham Tasmania Pty Ltd v Director of Public*  
*Prosecutions* ..... 49

### MAGISTRATES

- Generally — Powers and duties — Reasons for decision — Inadequate reasons for  
finding of breach of health and safety duty.  
*Greenham Tasmania Pty Ltd v Director of Public*  
*Prosecutions* ..... 49

### TORTS

- Negligence — Duty of care — Other particular claimants, defendants and  
circumstances — Road accidents — Pedestrian accidents — Children —  
Driver's duty to have regard to all relevant circumstances — Locality and road  
conditions — Time of day — Schools hours — Reasonable expectation of risk  
of children being in vicinity of driving.  
*Girmay v Green* ..... 64
- Negligence — Standard of care — Motor vehicle drivers — Obligation to have  
regard to what was or might reasonably be known including possibility of  
careless behaviour by pedestrians — Higher standard in case of young children  
— No general obligation to drive at speed according to limits of visibility or to  
react whatever ventured into path of driver's vehicle — Long straight section of  
busy highway — Child apparently 12 years old suddenly running across road  
into path of moving car — Collision occurring near retail shop and child's home  
— Driver travelling slowly but unable to avoid collision — Driver not negligent  
— Civil Liability Act 2002 (Tas), s 11.  
*Girmay v Green* ..... 64

### WORDS AND PHRASES

- “Another complaint in relation to the same matter”.  
*Von Stalheim v Anti-Discrimination Tribunal (No 2)* ..... 25
- “Gel blaster”.  
*Tasmania v Milligan (No 2)* ..... 106
- “Isolation procedures”.  
*Greenham Tasmania Pty Ltd v Director of Public*  
*Prosecutions* ..... 49

## INDEX

### WORDS AND PHRASES — *continued*

“Prohibited firearm”.

*Tasmania v Milligan (No 2)* ..... 106

### WORKERS COMPENSATION

Proceedings to obtain compensation — Weekly payments — Causation —  
Determination of claims — Procedure — Disputed liability for weekly payments  
and other benefits — Preliminary procedure before hearing — Whether  
reasonably arguable case exist — Onus on employer — Employer relying on  
specialist psychiatric report — Commissioner concluding that assumptions  
underlying expert opinion not based on proper evidentiary foundation —  
Tribunal finding reasonably arguable case did not exist — Tribunal not shown to  
be wrong — Workers Rehabilitation and Compensation Act 1988 (Tas), ss 3,  
81A.

*Roman Catholic Church Trust v Prosser* ..... 75