

AUGUST 2022

The Authorised Reports of the Decisions of the
Supreme Court of Tasmania

THE
TASMANIAN
REPORTS
2020-2021

EDITOR
L W MAHER

REPORTERS
BENEDICT BARTL ANTON HUGHES
CHRISTOPHER GROVES JENNIFER O'FARRELL

VOL 33 — PART 2

PAGES 127-243

**PUBLISHED FOR THE COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING
OF TASMANIA BY THOMSON REUTERS (PROFESSIONAL) AUSTRALIA LTD.**

The mode of citation of this part will be:
33 Tas R

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Part 2 — Pages 127-243

AB and CD; Tasmania v	1
Ashrafi v Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth)	234
Barnes; Hefny v	88
Barnes; Johnston v	194
Bell v Tasmania	95
Burrows; TT Line Company Pty Ltd v	163
Churchman; Motor Accidents Insurance Board v	127
Elnami v Tasmania	60
Gamble v Kingborough Council	43
Gutwein v Tasmanian Industrial Commission	107
Hefny v Barnes	88
Hopkinson v Wilkie	153
Horan; Turner v	213
Johnston v Barnes	194
Jordan v Rutland	81
Judges; Mrgic v	203
Kingborough Council; Gamble v	43
McTaggart; Triffitt v	220
MFC; State of Tasmania v	12
MFC; State of Tasmania v	21
Motor Accidents Insurance Board v Churchman	127
Mrgic v Judges	203
Public Prosecutions (Cth), Director of; Ashrafi v	234
Rattigan; State of Tasmania v	224

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)



THOMSON REUTERS

© 2022 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

Lawbook Co.

ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0085-7106

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Rutland; Jordan v	81
Tasmania v AB and CD	1
Tasmania, State of v MFC	12
Tasmania, State of v MFC	21
Tasmania, State of v Rattigan	224
Tasmania; Bell v	95
Tasmania; Elnami v	60
Tasmanian Industrial Commission; Gutwein v	107
Triffitt v McTaggart	220
TT Line Company Pty Ltd v Burrows	163
Turner v Horan	213
Wilkie; Hopkinson v	153

(Cases in **bold** reported in this part)

INDEX

Part 2 — Pages 127-243

CRIMINAL LAW

- Animals — Infliction of pain and suffering — Transport of group of horses from Melbourne to Devonport by Bass Strait ferry — Inappropriate management of horses — Horses travelling in the same truck trailer — Failure to place horses in individual stalls — Animal Welfare Act 1993 (Tas), ss 7, 8.
TT Line Company Pty Ltd v Burrows 163
- Indictable Commonwealth offences — Possessing a slave — Trafficking in persons — Procedure — Costs — Power to award — Two defendants charged on separate complaints — Commonwealth deciding not to file indictment — Charges dismissed — Defendants applying for costs orders — Applications refused — Criminal Code (Cth), s 270.3(1)(a) — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1976 (Tas), s 4(1)(b).
Ashrafi v Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) 234
- Offences against the person — Common assault — Definition — Exclusions — Any act reasonably necessary for common intercourse of life — If act done only for purpose of such intercourse and not disproportionate to the occasion — Domestic couple — Female partner deciding to leave — Male partner seeking to prevent departure — Grabbing partner — Male partner's claim that his physical contact was no more than acceptable hugging as part of attempt to dissuade his partner — Finding that hugging not an ordinary incident of social intercourse upheld — Criminal Code (Tas), s 182(3).
Turner v Horan 213
- Particular offences — Assault — Consent — Applicability — Assault in domestic setting — Argument between domestic partners — Evidence of use of violence by parties — Magistrate expressed the view that consent was not a defence to assaults upon victims of family violence — Open on evidence for magistrate to find that no consent was given by the complainant — Police Offences Act 1935, (Tas), s 35 — Criminal Code (Tas), s 182(4).
Hopkinson v Wilkie 153
- Procedure — Information, indictment or presentment — Averments — Uncertainty, duplicity and ambiguity — Duplicity — Management of animals — Offence to manage animals by method reasonably likely to result in unreasonable and unjustifiable pain or suffering — Transport of horses in truck trailer unit on Bass Strait ferry — Particulars — Alleged deficiencies in inspection of horses before and during voyage and failures in relation to the manner, positioning or circumstances of transportation — Further particulars alleged non-compliance with regulations — Essence of offence was using a method of management reasonably likely to bring about the prohibited result — Method of management almost inevitably comprised of a number of aspects — Charge related to a single course of conduct and not duplicitous — Animal Welfare (Land Transport of Livestock) Regulations 2013 (Tas), r 34(6) — Animal Welfare Act 1993 (Tas), ss 3A, 4, 6.
TT Line Company Pty Ltd v Burrows 163

INDEX

CRIMINAL LAW — *continued*

- Sentence — Sentencing procedure — Approach to sentencing process —
Procedural fairness — Obligation of court to raise important possibility of actual
term of imprisonment — Obligation did not arise in this case.
Mrgic v Judges 203

EVIDENCE

- Relevance — Test — Limited value of transcript of ex tempore remarks made in
busy magistrates court — Identification evidence — Evidence Act 2001 (Tas),
ss 55(1), 165(1)(a).
Johnston v Barnes 194

HIGH COURT AND FEDERAL COURT

- The federal judicature — Application of State laws — Generally — Tasmanian
legislation allowing an award of costs in criminal cases — State legislation
inapplicable to federal offences — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1976 (Tas),
s 4(1)(b).
Ashrafi v Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) 234

MAGISTRATES

- Appeal and review — Tasmania — Jurisdiction — Motion to review — Availability
— Summary criminal charges — Determination and adjudication — Complaint
alleging two charges — Duplicity — First charge relating to single event —
Second charge alleging multiple instances of criminal conduct arising from
single event — Magistrate ruling against duplicity submission — Defendant
aggrieved by ruling — Magistrate's ruling upheld on review by Supreme Court
— Whether decision on judicial review amenable to appeal — Justices Act 1959
(Tas), ss 31, 107, 116.
TT Line Company Pty Ltd v Burrows 163

- Appeal and review — Tasmania — Motion to review — Other matters — Appeal
against finding of guilt on one count of common assault which was also a breach
of a family violence order — Finding of guilt reasonably open to the magistrate.
Turner v Horan 213

- Appeal and review — Tasmania — Motion to review — Other matters — Plea of
guilty to three counts of common assault — Serious public violence against
strangers — Applicant with no prior convictions for violence — Sentence of
imprisonment for 12 weeks with half suspended not manifestly excessive.
Mrgic v Judges 203

INDEX

MAGISTRATES — *continued*

- Appeal and review — Tasmania — Motion to review — When remedy available —
Driving charges — Operating or controlling a motor vehicle in unnecessary
execution of sustained loss of traction (“burn-out”) — Evading police —
Identification of driver of vehicle — Alibi defence — Charges found proved —
Whether error in finding — Whether inadequate reasons for rejecting alibi
defence — Police Offences Act 1935 (Tas), s 37J(1) — Police Powers (Vehicle
Interception) Act 2000 (Tas), s 11A(1).
Johnston v Barnes 194
- Coroners — Powers — Autopsy or post mortem — Power to order autopsy if
coroner believes it was reasonably necessary — Statutory requirement that
unexpected or accidental deaths be reported — Coroner ordering that autopsy be
performed — Body of elderly woman found near river close to her home —
Apparent drowning — Application by daughter that autopsy not be performed
on mother’s body — Balancing of competing interests — Strongly held religious
beliefs of the deceased and her daughter in opposition to autopsy as a medical
procedure — Opposing public interest in excluding foul play — Risk of foul
play highly unlikely — Risk that any offender might reoffend — Balance of
interests in favour of autopsy — Daughter’s application dismissed — Coroners
Act 1995 (Tas), ss 19, 28, 36, 37.
Triffitt v McTaggart 220

STATUTORY INTERPRETATION

- Basic principles — Literal approach — Beneficial approach — Ascertainment —
Competing legislative purposes — Time limits — Time as reference to moment
or instant of an event rather merely a date — General rule that law takes no
account of fractions of a day — Contextual considerations — Exceptions —
Creation of criminal offence — Statute providing for expiry of motor vehicle
registration at midnight — Properly interpreted as reference to date of expiry.
Motor Accidents Insurance Board v Churchman 127
- Text, context and purpose — General provision concerning defence to specific
criminal offence — Consent — No warrant for introducing words by reason of
Family Violence Act 2004 (Tas).
Hopkinson v Wilkie 153

TRAFFIC LAW

- Statutory restrictions on compensation in respect of motor vehicle accidents —
Tasmania — Generally — Motor Accidents Insurance Board — Board
exercising discretion to pursue recovery of scheduled benefits arising from motor
accident — Insurance premium paid and vehicle registration renewed after
accident but on same day — Whether premium paid “at the time of accident” —
Whether payment retrospectively effective — Effect of subordinate regulations
and related legislation — Motor Accidents (Liabilities and Compensation) Act
1973 (Tas), ss 15, 28B(2)(b), 33.
Motor Accidents Insurance Board v Churchman 127

INDEX

WORDS AND PHRASES

“At the time of the motor accident”.	
<i>Motor Accidents Insurance Board v Churchman</i>	127
“Burn-out” — Vernacular.	
<i>Johnston v Barnes</i>	194
“Consent”.	
<i>Hopkinson v Wilkie</i>	153
“Grab”.	
<i>Turner v Horan</i>	213
“Order”.	
<i>TT Line Company Pty Ltd v Burrows</i>	163
“Recurrence, aggravation, acceleration, exacerbation or deterioration”.	
<i>State of Tasmania v Rattigan</i>	224

WORKERS COMPENSATION

Proceedings to obtain compensation — Preliminary requirements — Liability of employer to pay compensation — Interim payments — Reasonably arguable case for employer — Referral of claim to Workers Compensation and Rehabilitation Tribunal — Error in point of law to find arguable case not established — Appeal by employer allowed — Workers Rehabilitation and Compensation Act 1988 (Tas), ss 3(1), 81A.	
<i>State of Tasmania v Rattigan</i>	224