

INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Rules of procedural fairness — Victims Compensation Tribunal — Reliance on COPS report — Failure by Tribunal to provide applicant with report — Breach of procedural fairness rules.

Von Borstel v Victims Compensation Fund Corporation 1.227

Statutory appeal from Victims Compensation Tribunal to District Court — Ground of appeal — Error of law — Decision of Tribunal to reduce compensation — Failure to give any reason for reduction — Constitutes error of law — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), ss 30, 38.

Kitt v Victims Compensation Fund Corporation 1.236

ANIMALS

Dog — Keeping of dog on premises of apartment in building — Prohibition of this through by-law — Statutory exemption for hearing dog — Attributes of hearing dog — Whether necessary for such dog to meet some standard of hygiene and behaviour in public place — Whether necessary for such dog to receive training to enable it to assist profoundly deaf person — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 49(4).

Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261

Liability for injury — Dog — Liability of local council — Council's power to declare dog dangerous — Statutory definition of "dangerous" — Elements of definition — Scope of "provocation" — Whether "vermin" included wild pigs — Whether declaration to be made by council or council's delegate — Companion Animals Act 1998 (NSW), ss 3A, 33, 34.

Kuehne v Warren Shire Council (2011) 12.212

Liability for injury — Dog — Liability of owners — Statutory cause of action against owner for owner's dog wounding person — Not applicable if occurrence of wounding on owner's property when person attacked trespassing upon it — Whether such circumstances applicable when mere technical trespass upon owner's property — Defence of necessity — Whether available to person when necessity due to person's own negligence — Proof of statutory cause of action — Requirements of proof — Person's statutory ability to lawfully seize dog — Effect — Companion Animals Act 1998 (NSW), ss 12A, 22, 25.

Simon v Condran (2013) 16.230

Liability for injury — Dog — Statutory liability of owners for attack on person by dog — Defences — Whether person bitten lawfully on dog owner's property — Relevant circumstances — Whether liability imposed only for directly inflicted injury — Companion Animals Act 1998 (NSW), ss 25(1), 25(2).

Penfold v Betteridge and Another (2011) 13.168

Liability for injury — Dogs — Statutory liability on owner of dog — Relevance

ANIMALS — continued

of dog's registration years after dog's attack — Whether "attack" inclusive of dog running around and attempting to jump on a person — Relevance of size and appearance of dog — Person's response to dog's behaviour — Whether issue of liability or contributory negligence — Whether such response negligent — Relevant circumstances — Companion Animals Act 1998 (NSW), ss 7, 25.

Meimaropoulos v Cheum and Others (2014) 18.119

APPEAL AND NEW TRIAL

Points and objections not taken in court below — Failure to raise issue before decision-maker — Failure to decide such issue not error of law capable of appeal — Whether jurisdictional error — Whether remedy available in District Court.

Ferella and Others v Stomo (2017) 24.215

Practice and procedure — Appeal from decision of judge sitting without jury — Relevant principles.

Lim v The Queen (2017) 25.253

Practice and procedure — Appeal to District Court against conviction decision of Local Court — Whether finding of error in conviction decision of magistrate necessary for setting aside of conviction — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 18, 20.

Lavender and Another v Department of Industry (NSW) (2017) 25.389

Statutory appeals — When appeal lies — Appeal from Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — No appeal on factual finding — Failure by Tribunal to articulate reasons for factual finding — Effect — Long delay between hearing and Tribunal's judgment — Scant factual reasoning in judgment — Whether procedural unfairness demonstrated thereby — Membership of Tribunal — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 9, 28(3), 36(2), 49, 65.

Killick v McPherson (2009) 9.298

Statutory appeals — When appeal lies — Error of law — Appeal from Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Appeal limited to question of law which necessarily had to be decided — Circumstances when appeal futile — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 67, 68.

Owners of Strata Plan 41100 v Pender & Sons Pty Ltd (2009) 8.282

When appeal lies — Error of law — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Hearing in absence of opposing party — Findings adverse to other party — Findings on matter where no ventilation or raising of issues — Proper procedure for Tribunal in hearing where opposing party absent.

McCann and Another v Nationwide Consultants Pty Ltd (2013) 17.209

When appeal lies — Error of law — Decision in relation to entitlements from finding of fact — Whether "question with respect to a matter of law" — Tribunal's failure to consider matter — No appeal from such failure — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), s 67(1).

Grace v Pepe and Another (2014) 19.260

When appeal lies — Error of law — Denial of procedural fairness — Failure of court to take into account and apply authority relied by one party — Effect where different result had authority been taken into account — Local Court Act 2007 (NSW), s 39.

APPEAL AND NEW TRIAL — continued

- Jolly v Houston (2009)* 10.110
- When appeal lies — Error of law — Relevant circumstances — Allegation of denial of procedural fairness — Whether question of law or mixed law and fact.
- Viselle v Grieve (2014)* 18.75
- When appeal lies — Question of law — Finding as to identities of contracting parties — Whether finding one of fact or law — Concept of “practical injustice” — Application of concept — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 384.
- Albarouki v Prime Lawyers Pty Ltd (2013)* 16.385
- When appeal lies — Question of law — Issue over satisfaction of terms of statutory provision — Whether question “with respect to a matter of law” — Relevant factors — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), s 67(1).
- Boele v Rinbac Pty Ltd (2014)* 18.309
- When appeal lies — Statutory jurisdiction — Appeal by person aggrieved — Whether person “aggrieved” by omission in decision when no application for omitted matter — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), ss 10(1D), 21(1).
- Daley v SAS Trustee Corporation (2015)* 20.362

ASSESSMENT

- Costs — Costs of senior counsel — Counsel’s fee — Circumstances when reasonable for plaintiff to engage senior counsel.
- MD v Sydney South West Area Health Service (No 4) (2009)* 9.28

AVIATION

- Carriage by air — Carriage of passengers — Carrier’s liability for injury to passenger caused by accident — Passenger fell while disembarking from aircraft — Whether circumstances of fall constituted an “accident” — Civil Aviation (Carriers’ Liability) Act 1959 (Cth), s 28.
- Paterson v Air Link Pty Ltd (2008)* 7.373
- Carriage by air — Carriage of passengers — Conditions of liability for injury — Whether “checking in” amounted to “embarking” on aeroplane — Carrier’s liability for damage caused by accident — Scope of “accident” — Warsaw Convention 1929, Art 17.
- Hanna v Singapore Airlines Ltd (2007)* 6.214
- Carriage by air — Carriage of passengers — Injury of passenger on international flight — Jurisdiction imposed by international convention adopted as part of Australian law — Proper approach to interpretation — Formation of contract of carriage — Not constituted by issue of ticket — Flight from Beirut to Bahrain to Sydney and return — Injury between Bahrain and Sydney — Court of “place of destination” had jurisdiction — Whether Beirut or Sydney was “place of destination” — Civil Aviation (Carriers’ Liability) Act 1959 (Cth), s 25K, Sch 5, Art 28.
- Fattouh v Gulf Air Company GSC* 5.234

AVIATION — continued

Statutory liability — Damage caused by aircraft while in flight — Aerial spraying of herbicide — Whether herbicide “thing” dropped from aircraft — Damage by Aircraft Act 1999 (Cth), s 10(1)(c), 10(1)(d).

Barclay and Another v Bootle and Others (2012) 14.287

BAILMENTS

Liability of bailee — Particular bailments — Chattels — Whether onus of disproof of liability on bailee under gratuitous bailment.

Normoyle (t/as Liverpool Auto Sales) v Ducin Pty Ltd (2005) 19.98

BANKRUPTCY

Actions against bankrupt — Debts provable in bankruptcy — Unliquidated damages not provable — Claim under Travel Agents Act 1986 (NSW) — Not provable in bankruptcy — Bankruptcy Act 1966 (NSW), s 82(2).

King and Others v Kehl 1.95

Effect of bankruptcy — Actions against bankrupt — Claim for unliquidated damages — Claims under s 82 of Trade Practices Act and for fraudulent misrepresentation — Not provable debts in bankruptcy — Claims against bankrupt not precluded — Bankruptcy Act 1966 (Cth), s 58(2) — Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s 82.

BB Motor Sport Pty Ltd v Dibella 1.118

Effect of bankruptcy on proceedings — Proceedings in respect of claim provable in bankruptcy — Only maintainable under Bankruptcy Act 1966 (Cth) procedures — Whether such proceedings in District Court maintainable — Locus standi of bankrupt debtor — Necessity for court to follow bankruptcy law — Bankruptcy Act 1966 (Cth), ss 5, 58(1), 58(3), 60(2).

Black v Anstee and Others (2017) 24.137

BUILDING AND ENGINEERING CONTRACTS

Building contracts — Remedies — For bad workmanship — Building Services Corporation Comprehensive Insurance Scheme — Owner’s claim under Scheme — Decision to approve claim — Statutory deeming provision not applicable to such decision — Whether final decision made — Relative factors — Functus officio doctrine — Not applicable to decision to approve claim in principle subject to receipt of acceptable quotation — Application of doctrine to appeal proceedings against decision — Building Services Corporation Act 1989 (NSW), ss 85(d), 86(2).

Fair Trading Administration Corporation v Meriton Apartments Pty Limited (2010) 10.118

Building contracts — Remedies — For bad workmanship — Building Services Corporation Comprehensive Insurance Scheme — Owner’s claim under Scheme — Payment of owner — Recovery of claim against builder — Validity of claim — Requirement of notification of building defects within six months of owner’s

BUILDING AND ENGINEERING CONTRACTS — continued

awareness of defects — Degree of awareness required — Degree of identification required — Whether notification of subsequent defects required — Building Services Corporation Regulation 1990 (NSW), Sch 1, Form 4, cl 7(1)(b), 7(1)(c).

Fair Trading Administration Corporation v Meriton Apartments Pty Limited (2010) 10.118

Building contracts — Remedies — For bad workmanship — Building Services Corporation Comprehensive Insurance Scheme — Owner's claim under Scheme — Requirement that defects be notified — Whether complaint satisfied requirement — Time by which complaint to be made — Time limit not applicable to insurance scheme — Recovery of payment of claim — Proceedings against builder — Pleading — Distinction between defect and failure to complete — Interest on payment made under scheme — Time from which interest allowable — Building Services Corporation Act 1989 (NSW), ss 56(1), 57, 98.

Fair Trading Administration Corporation v Meriton Apartments Pty Limited (2010) 10.118

Construction and interpretation — Owner's right of retention of specified amount — Effect of retention of greater amount — Whether term of contract void by statute — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), ss 18B, 18G.

Childs and Another v Bassett (t/as Bassett Built Constructions) (2016) 23.294

Enforceability — Remedies — Contractual terms in contravention of statute — Statutory provision not prescribed by legislation or regulation — Builder not prohibited from enforcing contract — Quantum meruit claim by builder — Profit margin part of claim — Distinction between estimate and quote — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), ss 7(2)(g), 10(1)(c).

Hayward v Timilty (2009) 9.95

Enforceability — Unlicensed contractors — Statutory offence of entry into contract with unlicensed contractor to do residential building work — Effect of contravention of statute on validity and enforceability of contract — Creation of offence not prescribed — Statutory warranties — No creation of separate causes of action by such warranties — Whether defence to statutory offence — Relevant factors — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), ss 10, 18B, 32AA.

Kanatlarovski v Vasilkov (2013) 17.314

Remuneration progress payments — Claims for payment — Whether valid payment claim made — Whether claim for damages for breach of contract rather than for construction work or related goods or services — Defence of non-authorisation of work not raised in payment schedule — Not available as defence in court proceedings to recover amount claimed — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 5, 6, 15(4)(b).

Calsun Materials Handling Pty Ltd v Lovton Pty Ltd (2008) 6.399

Remuneration — Progress payments — Remedies — For bad workmanship — Owners' suspension of works — Whether breach of contract — Alternate remedies — Effect of delay in termination of contract and issue of rectification notice — Builder's unjustified claim for payment — Whether fundamental breach or repudiation of contract.

Grace v Pepe and Another (2014) 19.260

Remuneration — Remedies against proprietor — Recovery by builder on

BUILDING AND ENGINEERING CONTRACTS — continued

quantum merit — Relevance of contract price.

Darin v Olzomer (2011) 12.319

Remuneration — Statutory scheme for recovery by builder — Application of scheme — Whether tripartite arrangement between occupants, builder and insurer constituted “arrangement” under Act — Whether alleged “arrangement” exempt from scheme — “Construction contract” — Elements — Whether exempt construction contract precluded existence of another construction contract attracting statutory scheme — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payments Act 1999 (NSW), ss 4(b), 7(1), 7(2)(b), 13, 15(2)(a)(i).

DJE Building Services Pty Ltd v Insurance Australia Ltd (2011) 13.30

Remuneration — Subcontractors — Statutory payment claim — Claim undisputed — Consequently no adjudication — Contractual term that superintendent should certify amount due to contractor — Certificate issued that no moneys due — Defence that certificate negated statutory claim — Statute prohibited such defence — Statutory claim also not negated where no adjudication of claim — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 14, 15, 32.

Lifese Pty Ltd v Adelaide Brighton Cement Ltd (2008) 6.333

Remuneration — Whether valid payment claim made — Inadequate or deficient identification of construction work in claim — Proper remedy of person against whom claim made — Response by way of service on claimant of payment schedule — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 13(2)(b), 14.

J Hutchinson Pty Ltd v Auslat Properties Pty Ltd 3.315

Subcontractors — Payment for work carried out — Judgments against contractor pursuant to statutory regime for interim payment of subcontractor’s claims — Contractor’s court action against subcontractor — Contractor’s application for stay of judgments — Exercise of court’s discretion to grant stay — Relevant factors — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3, 15, 32.

Silver Star Construction Pty Ltd v Denham Constructions Pty Ltd (2011) 16.100

Subcontractors — Payment for work carried out — Statutory claim — Existence of payment claim — Relevant matters for consideration — Statutory entitlement to payment — Additional condition of production of subcontractor invoices — Whether invalid requisite — Breach of warranty over form and content of progress claim in contract — Whether relevant where claim otherwise compliant with statutory requirements for claim — Legal effect of concluded state of affairs — Multiple payment claims — Whether permissible — Relevant factor — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 4, 8, 13, 14, 34.

SMLXL Projects Pty Ltd v RIIS Retail A/S (2017) 25.157

CARRIERS

Carriage of passengers — Carriage by air — Duties and liabilities of carrier — Injury to passenger — Liability governed by international Convention — Interpretation — Relevant principles — US Supreme Court’s interpretation of

CARRIERS — continued

relevant Article — Should be followed by District Court — Deep vein thrombosis suffered during flight — Not enough itself to make airline liable — Acts or omissions of aircraft crew — May amount to accident — Failure by crew to advise passenger to regularly move around cabin and drink extra fluid — Not an accident — Meaning of “accident” — Civil Aviation (Carriers’ Liability) Act 1959 (Cth), ss 10, 11 — Warsaw Convention as amended at The Hague.

Van Luin v KLM Airlines (trading as KLM Royal Dutch Airlines) 1.25

Carriage of passengers — Duties and liabilities — Statutory limitation period for recovery of damages for personal injury in course of disembarkation — Applicable to injury during transport by bus from aircraft to terminal — Whether bus company a carrier under such statute — Relevance of terms of airline ticket — Whether bus company carrier’s agent — Defective bus — Whether transport within scope of agency — Civil Aviation (Carriers’ Liability) Act 1959 (Cth), ss 28, 33.

Yeomans v Carbridge Pty Ltd (No 2) (2012) 14.81

Carriage of passengers — Duties and liabilities — Statutory limitation period for recovery of damages for personal injury where injury in course of disembarkation — Whether applicable to injury during transport from aircraft to terminal — Civil Aviation (Carriers’ Liability) Act 1959 (Cth), s 28.

Yeomans v Carbridge Pty Ltd (2011) 14.1

CHILD WELFARE

Care and protection of children — Care and protection orders — Statutory requirement that order be least intrusive in life of child and family — Purpose of requirement — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), s 9(2)(c).

Director-General Department of Human Services and Community

Services v LX (2010) 11.308

Care and protection of children — Care orders — Allegation child at risk of being sexually assaulted — Standard of proof required — Court’s acceptance of highly improbable but neither unreal nor fanciful cause of contraction of sexually transmitted disease — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 71(1)(c), 91 — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 140.

DW and Another v Department of Community Services (2008) 7.144

Care and protection of children — Children’s Court — Appeal from — Statutory requirement for making of care order — Whether applicable to appeal — Statutory principle — Whether focus of principle on child within environment of family or child and its family — Allegation by child of sexual abuse by its parent — Relevance where allegation not found to be true — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 9(2)(c), 79(3).

White v Director-General, Department of Human Services and

Others (2011) 13.192

Care and protection of children — Children’s Court — Appeal to District Court against care orders — Admission of fresh evidence other than updating material — Requirement of explanation for lack of such evidence in Children’s Court

CHILD WELFARE — continued

proceedings — Lack of such explanation — Effect — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), s 91(1).

A v Department of Family and Community Services and Others
(2015) 20.353

Care and protection of children — Children's Court — Appeal to District Court against care orders — Admission of fresh evidence — Relevant principles.

A v Department of Family and Community Services and Others (No 2) (2015) 20.358

Care and protection of children — Children's Court — Care and protection orders — Rescission and variation of such orders — Application for leave to apply for such orders — Relevant factors — Whether applicant's case arguable — Scope of inquiry — Scope of domestic violence — Consideration of the nature of the application — Scope of consideration — Parents' evidence of child's wishes — Weight of such evidence — Articles of United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child — Relevance — Grant of application for leave — Effect — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 8, 9, 90, 91.

TR v Director-General, Department of Family and Community Services and Others (2013) 17.338

Care and protection of children — Children's Court — Finding by Court that child in need of care and protection — Whether such finding constituted order of Court — Lodgement of Appeal Summons against finding — Jurisdiction of District Court to hear summons — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 71D, 72, 92.

GA v Director General, Department of Human Services and Others
(2011) 12.324

Care and protection of children — Children's Court — Power to grant leave for application to rescind or vary care order — Exercise of power — Requirement that significant change in relevant circumstances be shown — Scope of requirement — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), s 90(2).

Alleyne v Director General of Community Services (2009) 9.74

Care and protection of children — Prohibition of publication of indentifying information about children involved in Children's Court proceedings — Whether child identified — Relevant factors — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 9, 104C, 105.

XX v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2010) 11.123

Child care appeal — Statutory discretionary power to exclude media from hearing — Common law principle of open justice — Whether principle modified — Exercise of jurisdiction — Relevant Factors — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 9(a), 104C, 105.

AM v Department of Community Services; ex parte Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2008) 6.329

Children's Court — Care and protection orders — Application for leave to vary or rescind such orders — Central consideration — Order for removal of child from care of mother — Application for leave to vary or rescind such order — Specific consideration — Whether mere future possibility of restoration sufficient — Whether application arguable — Relevant factors — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 9, 90, 91.

CHILD WELFARE — continued

B v Secretary, Department of Family and Community Services
(2015) 21.182

Children's Court — Powers — Grant of leave to appear in proceedings with respect to children — Jurisdiction of District Court to hear appeals against orders of Children's Court — Extent of jurisdiction — Exercise of power to grant leave to appear — Relevant factors — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 91, 98.

EL & WL v Director-General of the Department of Human Services
(2010) 11.258

Children's Court — Powers — Non-publication orders — Jurisdiction of Children's Court to make such orders — Costs orders — Orders made only in exceptional circumstances — Appeal against Children's Court's decision — Conduct occurring after decision — Whether such conduct relevant in appeal — Whether exceptional circumstances existed — Relevant factors — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 15, 88.

XX v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2010) 11.123

COMPANIES

Actions by and against — Liquidators — Power to bring proceedings — Inferior to receiver's power to bring proceedings — Receiver's power to take over conduct of proceedings instituted by liquidator — Factors relevant to exercise of power — Circumstances where liquidator able to resume conduct of proceedings — Receiver's duties to company — Scope of duties.

Wallis Commercial Interiors Pty Ltd (in liq) v Truecash Pty Ltd
(2008) 7.243

Administration — Effect on court proceedings against company — Statutory prohibition on continuing with such proceedings without administrator's consent — No application of prohibition to delivery of reserved judgment — Whether applicable to enforcement of judgment and costs order against company — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), ss 440D, 444E(3), 471B — Acts Interpretation Act 1901 (Cth), s 2C — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.3(3).

Unilever Australia Ltd v Rosella Foods Pty Ltd (2012) 15.185

Directors — Discretionary power of court to relieve directors from liability — Power to be interpreted liberally — Applicable to breach of obligation imposed under Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth) — Exercise of discretion — Relevant principles — Relevant factors — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), s 1318 — Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), s 222AOB(1).

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Dick 3.244

Form and constitution — Constitution and legal capacity — Action against company by its manager — Whether company's liability distinct from any liability for manager's conduct.

Normoyle (t/as Liverpool Auto Sales) v Ducin Pty Ltd (2005) 19.98

Winding up — Effect of winding up on other transactions — Avoidance of transactions — Unfair preferences — Application for order for repayment of avoided transactions — Whether payments part of running account — Relevant factors — Whether company or creditor bears onus of proving payments part of such account — Defence of receiving preferential payment in good faith —

COMPANIES — continued

Determination of such defence — Relevant principles — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), ss 588FA(3), 588FF, 588FG.

Modern Master Pty Ltd (in liq) v Canon Australia Pty Ltd (2007) 6.82

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

Commonwealth Constitution — Operation and effect — Freedom of speech — Freedom of political communication — Federal statutory prohibition against using postal service in harassing or offensive manner — Meaning of “offensive” — Meaning of “harassing” — Capability of political debate to offend or harass — Whether Federal provision contravened constitutional freedom — Relevant tests — Relevant factors — Provision valid — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), Criminal Code, s 471.12.

R v Monis; R v Droudis (2011) 12.266

Commonwealth powers — Taxation — Provisions relating to notices of assessment of income tax — No challenge to provisions in party’s pleading — Whether challenge still maintainable — Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), ss 175, 177.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Liu (2012) 15.57

Operation and effect — External affairs power — Express incidental power — Scope of powers — Whether either power validates Commonwealth law over possession of document purporting to be passport issued by fictitious government of a foreign country — Commonwealth Constitution 1900 (Cth), ss 51(xxix), 51(xxxix).

Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) v Riddell 4.368

CONSUMER, TRADER AND TENANCY TRIBUNAL

Failure to exercise jurisdiction — Decision with respect to matter of law — Refusal to grant adjournment — Denial of procedural fairness — Failure thereby to ensure disclosure of all relevant material — Failure thereby to act according to equity, good conscience and substantial merits of case — Decision involved failure to exercise jurisdiction — Manifestation of error of law — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 28(3), 28(5)(b), 67(1), 67(8).

Patel v Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal (NSW) and Malaysian Airlines Australia (2010) 10.304

Jurisdiction and powers — Claim by owners corporation for termination of caretaker agreement — Decision ultra vires — Basis of decision not part of case of either party — Denial of procedural fairness by Tribunal in its reliance on statutory provision — Provision purely directory — Whether termination of contract resulting from breach of provision appropriate — Relevance of breach to exercise of Tribunal’s jurisdiction in respect of caretaker agreements — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), ss 80B, 183A.

Corporate Property Maintenance NSW Pty Ltd v Owners of Strata Plan No 81647 (2014) 18.107

CONTRACTS

Action for breach — Failure to follow procedures laid down in contract — Money lent on justified assumption procedures followed — Loan moneys lost through security having been forged — Cause of loss — No loan but for breach of contract — Loss due to breach.

ING Bank (Australia) Ltd v Australia City Finance Pty Ltd 2.336

Action for breach — Recovery of moneys advanced through use of credit card — Proceedings for — Records of each charge made when card used — Production by credit provider not required — Scope of Contracts Review Act 1980 (NSW).

American Express International Inc v Rich 1.216

Agency agreement — Indemnity clause — Proper construction — Relevant principles — Whether agent indemnified under clause for legal costs it incurred in defending damages claim relating to premises it managed — Consent judgment in its favour — Negligence by agent thereby excluded — Proviso to clause therefore inapplicable — Agent indemnified under agreement.

Jovanovic v Proprietors Strata Plan 13212 and Elite Property Network Pty Ltd 3.120

Breach — Remedies — Claim by Australian party to contract governed by New South Wales law to amount of American dollars — Whether award of equivalent amount in Australian currency appropriate.

Who Ya Gonna Call Bark Busters Pty Ltd v Brooke (2013) 16.366

Consideration — Uncertainty — Implication of terms — Commercial efficacy — Principle of co-operation.

RCM Constructions Pty Ltd v S & Y Painting and Decoration Pty Ltd (2008) 8.112

Construction and interpretation — Clause for calculating part of fee for services — Fee to be equal to percentage of “value of transaction” — Replacement of existing loan with reduced credit facility — Value of loan transaction — Not value of loan — Circumstances when new loan facility not a “transaction” — Meaning of “transaction”.

Peter Breese and Associates Pty Ltd v CCI Holdings Ltd 1.187

Construction and interpretation — Commercial and business transactions — Contract of hire — Whether reading down of clause necessary — Relevant circumstances.

Foley & Bear Pty Ltd v Boral Ltd (2015) 21.13

Construction and interpretation — Term that unsigned delivery dockets prima facie evidence of delivery — Whether such dockets evidence of non-delivery — Relevance of post-contractual practice to construction of contractual term.

Ringwood & Ply Pty Ltd v Conform Australia Pty Ltd (2014) 20.1

Construction and interpretation — Terms of contract — Entitlement to amount of American currency conditional on payment under promissory note — Relinquishment of rights under note in exchange for shares — Whether such relinquishment “payment”.

Who Ya Gonna Call Bark Busters Pty Ltd v Brooke (2013) 16.366

Construction and interpretation — Terms of contract — Incentive reward if

CONTRACTS — continued

party's performance increased other party's revenue and capital value — Whether temporal or causal connection required between performance and such increases.

Yellow Ant Pty Ltd v Computer Frameworks Pty Ltd (2008) 8.102

Contract to provide services — Meaning of "services", "service difficulty".

Macquarie Corporate Telecommunications Pty Ltd v Oakford

Australia Pty Ltd 1.301

Deposit bond — Construction — Contra proferentem principle — Application to deposit bond.

Meriton Apartments Pty Ltd v GNC Access Pty Ltd 1.207

Implied terms — Warranty that services rendered with due care and skill — Exemption clauses — Inconsistency between State and Commonwealth laws permitting exemption clauses — Effectiveness of clauses — Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), ss 68(1)(c), 68B, 74(1), 74(2A) — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5N.

Young v Insight Vacations Pty Ltd (2009) 8.369

Repudiation — Effects of non-communication of repudiation — Whether productive of any legal rights.

Haddad v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd (No 2) (2014) 19.314

CONVEYANCING

Deposit bond — Payment under bond — Conditions of contract for sale — Not incorporated in bond — Construction of bond — Vendor's recourse to bond — Not conditional on proof of entitlement to terminate or rescind contract for sale — Distinction between description of character of document and character of circumstances leading to issue of document.

Meriton Apartments Pty Ltd v GNC Access Pty Ltd 1.207

Vendor and purchaser — Matter ensuing between contract and conveyance — Removal of fixture — Statutory right of compensation — Doctrine of merger — Applicability — Claim for compensation not defeated by doctrine — Conveyancing Act 1919 (NSW), s 66M.

Blazai Pty Ltd v Robert Pryke Investments Pty Ltd 2.290

COSTS

Action against two defendants — Defendants represented by same counsel and solicitors — One defendant successful — No evidence of costs arrangement between defendants — No evidence of plaintiff's knowledge of any such costs arrangement — Rule of thumb — Plaintiff to pay half successful defendant's costs.

Abrahams v Roads and Traffic Authority (NSW) 3.263

Action against two defendants — One defendant successful — Plaintiff's application for Bullock or Sanderson order — Relevant principles — Application refused.

Sheldrick v Beveridge 4.281

COSTS — continued

Agreement as to — “No win no fee” costs agreement — Whether costs still assessable — Stay of recovery proceedings in respect of assessed costs — No implication of term regarding cessation of agreement upon rejection by client of reasonable settlement offer against advice.

Viselle v Grieve (2014) **18.75**

Agreement to pay indemnity costs in defined circumstances — Court’s discretion to award such costs — Exercise of discretion should be in accordance with contractual term.

Medfin Australia Pty Ltd v Rafter **4.272**

Appeal as to costs — Appeal to District Court — Claim for expenses of keeping a corporate defendant in existence solely because of litigation — Whether claim for costs or compensation.

Demlakian v Vilkev Pty Ltd (2012) **15.253**

Appeal as to costs — Application for leave to appeal determination of Costs Review Panel — Whether grant of leave appropriate — Relevant principle — Relevant factors — Objection to claim of lawyers for their costs because of alleged negligence of lawyers resulting in their work being unwarranted and futile — Whether valid ground of appeal — Whether determination of such issue within scope of cost assessor’s task — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 385.

Sanossian v Parisi & Associates, Lawyers (2016) **23.62**

Appeal on costs — Application for leave — Jurisdiction to entertain — Statutory restriction as to appropriate court — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 385.

Ferella and Others v Stomo (2017) **24.215**

Appeal to District Court — Jurisdiction — Application for leave to appeal against Children’s Court decision in care proceedings — Statutory prohibition against making of costs order unless exceptional circumstances — Unprofessional and unsatisfactory conduct by applicant’s solicitor — Whether costs order against solicitor appropriate — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 88, 90, 91(4).

In Re a Solicitor to the Law Society of NSW; EL v DE and Another (2015) **20.119**

Assessment — Action for personal injury damages — Statutory limit on legal costs of plaintiff — Plaintiff’s successful action for personal injury damages arising from sexual assault and/or false imprisonment — Plaintiff’s costs payable by defendant — Whether such costs subject to statutory limit — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 337, 338(1)(a) — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3B, 11A.

Koh v Ku (2009) **9.387**

Assessment — Appeal against assessment to District Court — Conditional on requirement of grant of leave if amount in dispute less than \$25,000 — Whether combination of assessments permissible to pass threshold — Whether grant of leave proper — Relevant factors — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW), s 89(1)(a).

Ferella and Others v Stomo (2017) **24.215**

Assessment — Appeal against review panel’s certification decision — Appeal to District Court — Application for leave to appeal — Costs order made by

COSTS — continued

Industrial Court — Whether leave application to be made to that court or District Court — Appeal as of right as to matter of law — Whether fresh or further evidence receivable — Reference to District Court rules in statutory grant of appeal as of right — Effect as to presentation of fresh or further evidence in appeal as of right — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 384, 385 — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 4(5), 5(2) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 50.1, 50.16.

McCausland v Surfing Hardware International Holdings Pty Ltd
(2010) 11.294

Assessment — Appeal as to costs — Appeal against decision of Costs Review Panel — Requirement for provision of reasons for decision — Scope of requirement.

Enterprise Finance Solutions Pty Ltd v Ciszek (2014) 20.19

Assessment — Appeal as to costs — Review Panel — Adequacy of global approach — Conditional on some exposure of Panel's reasoning — Public interest in assessment of legal costs in personal injury cases — Relevance — Award of compensation inclusive of costs in personal injuries cases — Aspiration for preservation for as much of award as possible.

Han v Firth trading as Firth The Compensation Lawyers (2014) 18.365

Assessment — Appeal as to costs — Review Panel — Appeal to District Court — Panel's failure to give adequate reasons for decision — Whether matter of law — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 380, 384, 385 — Legal Profession Regulation 2005 (NSW), reg 134.

Han v Firth trading as Firth The Compensation Lawyers (2014) 18.365

Assessment — Appeal as to costs to District Court — Requirement of identified alleged error of law — Alternative procedure to application for prerogative relief — When appropriate — Amendment of party/party bill of costs — Relevance of increase in bill of costs — Propriety of deferral of premature application for assessment — Indemnity principle — Whether requirement of payment of costs — Methods of assessment — Propriety of item-by-item review — Locality of legal firm — Significance for assessment of costs — Whether work by paralegal or skilled clerk chargeable — Nature of assessment of costs system — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 384.

Vumbaca v Sultana (2012) 15.375

Assessment — Appeal — Costs order by Court of Appeal — Application for leave to appeal against costs assessment — Appeal not on matter of law — Application for leave to District Court — Lack of jurisdiction — Grant of leave — Relevant principles — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 384, 385.

Altaranesi v Sydney Local Health District (2012) 17.300

Assessment — Appeal from cost assessor's determinations — Substantial dispute over terms of contract under which costs payable — Such dispute not matter for costs assessor to decide — Proper forum for appeals against costs assessments of small amounts.

Nikolaidis v Chippindall (No 2) (2012) 15.156

Assessment — Appeal — Statutory appeal regime — Costs of appeal — Statutory provision that legal practice providing assessed legal services pay costs where assessment reduced by 15% or more — Application of provision — Whether assessor's decision as to payment of costs of assessment matter of law

COSTS — continued

— Dispute as to costs of assessment — Appropriate practice — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 369, 369(3)(c), 384..

Bellevarde Constructions Pty Ltd v CPC Energy Pty Ltd (2011) 12.304

Assessment — Appeal to District Court — Costs orders under repealed Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW) — Whether recoverable under Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW) — Recovery of costs incurred by party using in-house lawyers — Authority of Commonwealth Bank of Australia v Hattersley — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 382, 384, 566, Sch 9.

Portale v Law Society of New South Wales (No 1) (2010) 10.194

Assessment — Assessment of successful party's costs where no costs agreement — Whether possible — Whether prior solicitor/client assessment necessary — Assessor's ability to reduce costs because of lack of costs agreement — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 317(4).

Enterprise Finance Solutions Pty Ltd v Ciszek (2014) 20.19

Assessment — Assessors — Standard of proof of matters of fact — Determination of assessor — Extent of reasons to be given for assessment — Self represented litigant — Whether compensation recoverable for time and effort spent on disputing claim.

Mohareb v Horowitz & Bilinsky Solicitors (2011) 13.245

Assessment — Costs Assessor — Power to re-determine assessment — Scope of power — Whether assessor functus officio after issue of initial determination — Difference between costs assessment and judicial process — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 371, 384 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.17.

Albarouki v Prime Lawyers Pty Ltd (2013) 16.385

Assessment — Costs assessors — Powers — Access to solicitor's files — Assessor's decision not to seek such access — Not a matter of law entitling appeal to District Court — Party and party costs — Rate chargeable by organisation employing solicitors to act on its behalf — Inspection of documents by assessor — Decision whether or not to inspect — Matter for assessor — Decision not to inspect practising certificates — Not appealable decision — Review panellists' membership of Law Society — Whether such membership appropriate — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 354(2), 384.

Portale v Law Society of New South Wales (No 2) (2010) 10.207

Assessment — Costs Assessors — Powers — Matters for consideration — Obligation to consider parties' written submissions — Extent of obligation — Costs order in respect of separate proceedings — Form of order — Allowance of disbursements — Whether production of invoice necessary — Review Panel's adoption of Assessor's reasons — Challenge to Panel's decision — Requirements for challenge — Statutory obligation to pay costs of assessment when reduction of costs by 15 per cent or more — Scope of obligation — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 359, 369(3)(c) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 46.

Wende and Others v Horwath (NSW) Pty Ltd (2013) 16.52

Assessment — Costs assessors — Powers — Matters for consideration — Plaintiff's discontinuance of Supreme Court proceedings — Institution of virtually identical proceedings in Federal Court — Plaintiff ordered to pay defendant's costs of proceedings — No power of costs assessor to limit such

COSTS — continued

costs to costs thrown away by Supreme Court proceedings having been brought — Costs assessor not to consider possible outcome of other proceedings between parties or whether work done for proceedings could be used in other proceedings — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(1)(b) — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 364(1)(c), 364(2)(f).

Village Life Ltd v Hanne (2008) 8.179

Assessment — Counsel's fees — Appeal against assessment — Whether quantum of assessed costs challengeable — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 384, 385.

Viselle v Grieve (2014) 18.75

Assessment — Counsel's fees — Cancellation fee — Whether "work" of counsel reasonable — Scope of "work" — Whether cancellation fee recoverable as party/party costs — Relevant factors — Relevance of counsel's increased opportunity for doing chamber work through cancelled hearing date — End of counsel cancellation fee charges — Effect on administration of justice — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 364(1).

Commissioner of Police v Hoffman (2014) 18.320

Assessment — Court's power to order gross sum specified in costs order — Principles — When applicable — Charges of solicitor unfamiliar with area of law relevant to matter — Recoverability of solicitor's travel expenses — Costs assessor's power to increase and decrease solicitor's charges — Exercise of power — Relevant circumstances — Assessment of gross sum — Relevant principles — Exercise of court's power to make gross sum order for costs — Appropriate circumstances — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(4)(c).

Vumbaca v Sultana (No 2) (2013) 17.381

Assessment — Jurisdiction — Remitter of proceedings to District Court following successful appeal to Court of Appeal — Meaning of "after deciding the question the subject of the appeal" — Whether enlivenment of District Court's jurisdiction when decision by Court of Appeal — Whether issue of certificate of assessment necessary when determination of quantum of costs by District Court — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 384(2).

Wende v Horwath (NSW) Pty Ltd (No 2) (2014) 19.182

Assessment — Legally assisted person — Costs awarded against — Statutory protection — Whether protection inclusive of co-litigants of legally protected person — Effect of monies paid by Legal Aid Commission on total of assessed costs — Relevance of statutory protection to assessment of costs — Scope of statutory protection — Legal Aid Commission Act 1979 (NSW), s 47.

Wende and Others v Horwath (NSW) Pty Ltd (2013) 16.52

Assessment — Manager, Costs Assessment — Powers — Issue as to whether assessment applicant "third party payer" — Whether determination of such issue within powers of Manager, Costs Assessment or Costs Assessor — Parties' entitlement to have reasonable opportunity to make written submissions — Assessment of "reasonable opportunity" — Relevance of parties' conduct — Erroneous reasoning of Costs Assessor not necessarily productive of erroneous decision — Scope of powers of Manager, Costs Assessment — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 302A, 357, 358, 359(1)(a), 384(2)(a).

Coshott v Spencer (2016) 22.115

Assessment — Power to order gross sum specified in costs order — Relevant principles — Incapacity of party to pay such costs — Relevance — Savings of

COSTS — continued

costs of assessment — Relevance — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(4)(c).

Elzahed and Others v Commonwealth and Another (2017) 25.229

Assessment — Powers — Order for gross sum — Relevant factors — Evidence for court's assessment provided by solicitor for party awarded costs — Value of evidence — Proceedings neither lengthy nor complex — Grounds for making lump sum costs order — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 94(4)(c).

Fairfax Radio Network Pty Ltd v Printlane Pty Ltd (No 2) (2011) 13.64

Assessment — Practice matters — Inability of person to pay costs — Efficacy of proceeding with assessment.

A v Department of Family and Community Services and Others (No 2) (2015) 20.358

Assessment — Principles of — Indemnity principle — Whether principle offended — Proof of each item of work unnecessary — Liability for costs not dependent on rendering of invoices — Failure of assessor to have regard to invoices rendered — Circumstances when indemnity principle thereby misapplied — Costs assessor's power to require production of documents — Exercise of power — Relevant circumstances — Whether decision to use power question of law — Basis on which costs ordered to be paid — Effect on onus of proof — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 384.

Bellevarde Constructions Pty Ltd v CPC Energy Pty Ltd (2011) 12.304

Assessment — Recovery of costs — Whether costs of legal secretary or paralegal recoverable.

Chilvers v Snowdon (2012) 14.147

Care proceedings — Unsuccessful appeal by Department — Application for costs of appeal by respondent parents — Statutory prohibition on making costs order unless exceptional circumstances existed justifying such order — What constituted such circumstances — Respondent parents having to pay their legal costs a relevant factor in determining if such circumstances existed — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), s 88.

Department of Community Services v SM and MM (2008) 6.384

Costs against prosecution in criminal proceedings in Local Court — Successful appeal against conviction — Limitation on award of costs — Requirement that there was no reasonable cause to initiate proceedings — Relevant circumstances — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 70(1)(b).

Leota v The Queen 5.173

Court's discretionary power to award costs — Exercise of discretion — Relevant principles — Rejection of Offer of Compromise and *Calderbank* letter by losing party — Whether indemnity costs appropriate — Relevant principles.

Chawla v FAL Healthy Beverages Pty Ltd (No 2) (2017) 25.301

Defamation action — Application to extend limitation period — Applicant taken by surprise by defendant's submissions — No authority cited for submissions — Court's own research finds authority — Submission successful — No order for costs appropriate — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56D — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98.

Dehsabzi v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd (2007) 6.68

Departing from general rule — Conduct of parties — Claim by Deputy

COSTS — continued

Commissioner of Taxation for interest and costs — Enactment of retrospective legislation by Commonwealth potentially preventing failure of such claim — Whether costs and interest recoverable.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Zammitt (2012) 15.104

Departing from general rule — Conduct of parties — Non-compliance with District Court Civil Practice Note 6 — Effect.

Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another (No 2) (2015) 21.140

Departing from general rule — Costs on indemnity basis — Circumstances when awarded — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(1)(c).

Managed Growth Solutions Pty Limited v L H Williams Pty Limited (2012) 14.237

Departing from general rule — Costs on indemnity basis — Offer of compromise — Rejection of offer — Whether rejection unreasonable — Relevant circumstances — Terms of offer inclusive of entry into deed — Content of proposed deed uncertain — Whether offer capable of acceptance.

Cardno ITC Pty Ltd v 33 York Street Pty Ltd (No 2) (2013) 18.55

Departing from general rule — Costs on indemnity basis — Offer of compromise — Whether judgment “no less favourable” than offer — Not possible where offer made to two defendants but judgment against only one — Not possible where acceptance required by two defendants but judgment against only one defendant — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14.

93 GSP Pty Ltd v Advent 8 Pty Ltd and Another (No 2) (2013) 17.58

Departing from general rule — Discretion — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Reliance of neither party on issue determinative of proceedings.

Khan v Mohammed (2013) 18.16

Departing from general rule — Discussion of principles — Differential costs order — When appropriate — Relevant factors.

Swiegers v Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (No 3) (2016) 22.388

Departing from general rule — Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Form of offer — Term that costs to be agreed or assessed — Requirement that offer be exclusive of costs — Whether offer complied with rule — Term mirrored rule — Effect — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26(2), 42.13A, 42.14.

Smart Distribution Services Pty Ltd v General Wholesale Pty Ltd (No 3) (2010) 11.38

Departing from general rule — Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Offeror’s verdict greater than offer — Requirement that offer be left open for a reasonable period to attract indemnity costs — Circumstances where such period not reasonable — Failure of offeree to seek extension of time for acceptance of offer — Relevance to issue of reasonableness of offer — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 20.26(7)(a), 42.14(2)(b)(i).

Craft Printing Pty Ltd v Dwyer (Costs) (2009) 9.199

Departing from general rule — Offer of compromise — Whether time for acceptance reasonable — Relevance of psychiatric state of offerees — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 20.26(5).

COSTS — continued

Morgan and Another v Legal Personal Representative of Willard
(2015) 20.255

Departing from general rule — Plaintiff's success in one claim but not in others
— Whether proportionate costs order appropriate — Relevant factors.

Raad v New South Wales (No 2) (2017) 25.105

Departing from general rule — Powers of court — Statutory restriction on award of costs to successful appellant against imposition of apprehended personal violence order — Scope of restriction — Whether applicable — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 99A.

Christopher v Fowler (2017) 24.363

Departing from general rule — Powers of court — Statutory restriction on award of costs to successful appellant in appeal against conviction — Whether conduct of investigation into alleged offence unreasonable — Whether unreasonable failure by prosecution to investigate any relevant matter — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 70(1)(a), 70(1)(c).

Sidgreaves v The Queen (2017) 24.360

Departing from general rule — Relevant factors — Cost orders cancelling each other out — Discussion of principles — Order that each party pay own costs — Appropriateness of order — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 59, 60, 98 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 42.1, 42.2.

Khouri v Nicholas and Another (Costs) (2010) 11.162

Discontinuance of proceedings by plaintiff — Rule that plaintiff is to then pay defendant's costs unless court orders otherwise — No presumption that plaintiff must pay costs — Discontinuance per se does not justify adverse order for costs against discontinuing party — Circumstances where each party ordered to pay own costs where proceedings discontinued by plaintiff — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 42, r 42.19(2).

Hiron v New South Wales 5.314

General rule — Application for leave to extend limitation period — Applicant to pay costs where limitation period allowed to elapse, unless respondent's opposition to application unreasonable — Whether mere opposition to application unreasonable — Whether limitation period "allowed" to elapse where no entitlement to take action within limitation period.

Afarin v Excelior Pty Ltd (2013) 16.279

General rule — Costs follow event — Discretion — Costs of issues — Whether apportionment of successful party's costs appropriate — Relevant factor — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.1.

Chawla v FAL Healthy Beverages Pty Ltd (No 2) (2017) 25.301

General rule — Costs follow the event — Order against non-party — Whether company director liable for costs of company's failed proceedings — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98.

Time for Monkeys Enterprises Pty Ltd v Southern Cross Austereo Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 19.402

General rule — Costs of action — Co-defendants — Sanderson order — Justification — Dismissal of cross-claim — Whether cross-defendants liable for cross-claimant's costs.

COSTS — continued

- Briffa v Rail Corporation New South Wales (No 2) (2014)* 19.170
- General rule — Costs of action — Engagement of senior counsel — Whether certification of senior counsel appropriate — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW).
- McLennan v Antonios (No 2) (2014)* 18.85
- General rule — Departing from general rule — Conduct of parties — Term of contract between parties for resolution of dispute by expert arbitrator — Unsuccessful institution of court proceedings against party in breach of contractual term — Effect — Whether party able to unilaterally proceed with contractual dispute resolution procedure — Effect of conduct of successful party in refusing alternate dispute resolution procedure — Whether deprivation of entitlement to costs — Relevant factors.
- Haniotis v The Owners Corporation Strata Plan 64915 (No 2) (2014)* 18.151
- General rule — Departing from general rule — Whether action statute-barred — Proof by plaintiff of entitlement to sue — Discretionary judgment not involved — Application of general rule appropriate — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 60C, 60D.
- Tolmie v Stockland Trust Management Ltd (2009)* 10.45
- General rule — Discretion — Each party's success on issues in case — Appropriate costs order — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(1).
- Morgan and Another v Legal Personal Representative of Willard (2015)* 20.255
- Gross sum costs order — Application for — Relevant principles — Assessment of gross sum — Relevant principles.
- M v Public Guardian (2017)* 25.398
- Hearing of criminal trial vacated on Crown's application — Costs of accused thereby thrown away — Application for reimbursement of such costs — Circumstances when such reimbursement appropriate — Test for determining when costs "thrown away" — Assessment of such costs — Relevance of costs agreement to such assessment.
- Hufnagl v Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth)* 5.159
- Indemnity costs — Application for — Offer of compromise — Offer by defendant for verdict in its favour with no order as to costs — Whether equivalent to order that each party "bear its own costs" — Whether offer true compromise — Relevant factors — Calderbank offer — Necessity of proof that rejection of such offer unreasonable for success in application for indemnity costs — Whether rejection unreasonable — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 20.26(3).
- Egan v Woy Woy & District Rugby League Football Club Ltd (2014)* 20.209
- Indemnity costs — Circumstances when awarded — Conduct of parties — Misconduct — Breach of statutory duty to inform court of financial position — Effect — Breach of statutory duty to assist court — Effect — Effect of costs order against party on recovery of assets from such party — Determination of time of commencement of indemnity costs order — Relevant factors — Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 57.
- Messias v de Barros (No 2) (2013)* 17.99

COSTS — continued

Indemnity costs — Circumstances when awarded — Contractual term — Award in accordance with term.

Commonwealth Bank of Australia v James (2015) 20.59

Indemnity costs — Circumstances when awarded — Hopelessness of losing party's case — Distinction between loss due to such hopelessness and loss due to insufficiency of evidence — Failure by party to obtain leave to amend pleadings — Whether basis for award of indemnity costs against such party — Failure by party to make offer of compromise — Whether ground for such award against such party — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW) r 20.26.

Adams v Groegor (No 2) (2012) 14.92

Indemnity costs — Failure of motion — Whether sufficient basis for indemnity costs order.

Ringwood & Ply Pty Ltd v Conform Australia Pty Ltd (2014) 20.1

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Calderbank offer — Effectiveness — Relevant principles — Relevance of credibility of witness at hearing — Whether rejection of offer unreasonable — Relevant factors.

Svitzer Salvage Australasia Pty Ltd v Trident Australasia Pty Ltd (No 2) (2012) 15.128

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Calderbank offer — Justification for indemnity costs order by such offer — Relevant circumstances — Removal of costs cap in personal injuries cases — Distinction between forensic tactics and sharp practice — Relevant factors — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 341.

Barrett v Lets Go Adventures Pty Ltd (No 2) (2016) 23.384

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Compliance with court rules — Requirements — Validity of offer containing requirement of discontinuance of proceedings on unknown terms — Work injury damages defendant — Requirement of consistency of offer with applicable statutory costs regime — Estoppel by convention — Applicability to offer of compromise — Enlightenment of award of indemnity costs — Whether through comparison of offer of compromise to judgment or to net sum payable under judgment — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), ss 346, 347 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 42.15.

Kemble v Gate Gourmet Services Pty Ltd (No 2) (2012) 14.340

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Defamation proceedings — Whether conflict between two legislative directives as to making costs orders — Plaintiff's partial success in proceedings — Degree of success to be reflected in costs order — Order that plaintiff awarded damages should pay own costs and part of defendant's costs — Effect of such order — Statutory provision on costs in defamation cases — History and purpose of provision — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 48A — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pts 20.26, 42.

Hennesy v Lynch (No 4) (2008) 7.24

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Distinction between such offer and option to settle — Whether offer reasonable — Relevant factors — Provision in contract between parties over payment of indemnity costs — Relevance to making of costs order — Indemnity costs order — Whether reasonableness of costs still requirement for allowance of such costs on assessment — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.5(b).

COSTS — continued

- WK Marble & Granite Pty Ltd v JKE Holdings Pty Ltd and Others*
(No 2) (2013) 18.32
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Exercise of discretion — On ground of conduct — Refusal of offeror to extend time for acceptance by one and a half hours — Whether such refusal constituted failure to comply with statutory obligations — Failure by offerees to make counter offer — Effect — Failure to provide and to ask reason for request for extension — Effect — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26(7)(b), 42.15A(2)(b)(i).
- Chen v New South Wales* (2012) 15.165
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise for claim and cross-claim — Whether offer severable.
- Adams v Groeger* (No 2) (2012) 14.92
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Notification of offer shortly after commencement of proceedings — Effect — Absence of covering letter to offer with explanation of basis of offer — Effect — Action for liquidated amount — Offer only slightly less than such amount — Whether real compromise — Rejection of small but genuine offer of compromise — Assessment of reasonableness of rejection of settlement offer — Relevant factors — Assessment of genuineness of compromise offer — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 42.14.
- Jurisich v Ralston* (No 2) (2016) 23.99
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Offer in respect of whole of proceedings — Consequent indemnity costs order following rejection of offer — Whether vacating of interim costs order then possible.
- Elzahed and Others v Commonwealth and Another* (2017) 25.229
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Offer less than verdict in favour of offeror — Offer “without prejudice save as to costs and interest” — Whether compliance with Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 42.14.
- Kragic v Hallak* (No 2) (2013) 16.361
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Offer pursuant to rules of court — Offer of money plus costs — Whether such offer permissible under court rules — Whether costs rules in conformity with professional practice — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 20.26.
- McGlen-McLeod v Galloway* (No 2) (2012) 13.359
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Offer “without any prejudice save as to costs and interest” — Offer incapable of acceptance — Offer invalid — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 42.14.
- ZD by his tutor LD v Fast Lane Karting Centre Pty Ltd* (2013) 16.311
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Plaintiff’s verdict greater than plaintiff’s offer rejected by defendant — Plaintiff’s case strengthened by unexpected evidence of witness — Not a reason for court to refrain from ordering indemnity costs — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14.
- Peak v Dunleavy* (No 2) (2008) 8.74
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Reasonableness of rejection of offer

COSTS — continued

— Offer made by one of two defendants — Relevance — Whether “no order as to costs” equivalent to “each party to pay its own costs” — Whether genuine offer of compromise — Relevant factor — Multiple claims — Offer of compromise concerning only one claim — Relevance to reasonableness of rejection of offer — Existence of cross-claims against offeror — Relevance to reasonableness of rejection of offer — Calculation of period of time for currency of offer — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26(3)(a)(i), 20.26(5), 42.15A.

Stambolzievski v Nestorovic and Others (No 3) (2014) **20.226**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Requirement for reference in offer to any interim payment to offeree — Payment by offeror of offeree’s share of mediator’s fees — Whether “interim payment” — Requirement for reference in offer of time for acceptance — Omission of such reference in offer — Whether statement of time for acceptance of offer in letter accompanying offer compliance with requirement — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26(2)(e), 20.26(2)(f).

Harris v Sydney Local Health District (No 2) (2014) **18.91**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Validity of offer — Failure to strictly comply with relevant regulation — Whether offer thereby invalid — Relevant principles — Whether order for indemnity costs appropriate — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 42.14.

Khan v Rathjen (No 2) (2016) **23.182**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Verdict in favour of offeror greater than amount of offer — Entitlement to indemnity costs “unless court orders otherwise” — Exercise of discretion — Relevant principle — Efficacy of order for indemnity costs where offeror only partially successful — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14.

Rook v New South Wales (No 4) (2015) **21.256**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Walk-away offer — Whether capable of justifying indemnity costs order — Conduct of party — Whether justification for order for payment by such party of costs on indemnity basis — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 98, 99.

Amor-Smith v Ching (No 2) (2016) **23.41**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether genuine offer of compromise by defendant — Relevant principles — Whether plaintiff’s rejection of offer reasonable — Relevant test — Whether time for acceptance reasonable — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26(3)(a), 42.1, 42.15A.

Livsey v Australian National Car Parks Pty Ltd (No 2) (2015) **20.329**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether necessary element of compromise present — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 42, Div 3.

Carey v New South Wales (2013) **17.146**

Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether offer available for acceptance for a reasonable period — Relevant factor — Failure of only cause of action raised during period available for acceptance of offer — Relevance to discretion available to court to refuse order for indemnity costs — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26(5), 42.13A(2), 42.14(2)(b).

COSTS — continued

- Dowdeit v Nominal Defendant (No 2) (2015)* 23.19
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether offer no less favourable than judgment — Proper approach for determination of question — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14.
- Kenwright v Insurance Australia Ltd (No 2) (2013)* 17.169
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether quantification of costs forgone requirement of offer — Whether provision of reasons as to genuineness of offer requirement of offer — Whether precondition of offer that any reasons given ultimately prove to be correct — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 20.26, 42.15A.
- Swiegers v Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (No 3) (2016)* 22.388
- Indemnity costs — Offer of compromise — Whether refusal of offer unreasonable — Relevance of fact that liability still in issue — Relevance of detailed evidence of offeror's medical condition and loss of earning capacity at hearing when both matters fully particularised prior to provision of offer of compromise — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98(2) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.14.
- Talwar v Ox Two Pty Ltd t/as Ocean Extreme and Another (No 2) (2017)* 25.152
- Indemnity costs — Offer to contribute by one co-defendant to other co-defendants — Effect of offer on issue of costs between co-defendants — Benefit of offer — Relevance of alternative costs provisions — Virtue of utilisation of offer to contribute — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW) r 42.18.
- Briffa v Rail Corporation New South Wales (No 2) (2014)* 19.170
- Indemnity costs — Relevant factors — Utility of application for leave to bring private prosecution for perjury — Alternate avenues for such application — Consequential need for revisitation by court of evidence because of such application — Justification for such measure rare.
- Mohareb v Palmer and Another (No 3) (2016)* 22.41
- Indemnity costs — Scope and objects of — Whether indemnity costs order appropriate — Relevant factors.
- Wallace and Another v GWH Build Pty Ltd; GWH Build Pty Ltd and Another v Wallace and Others (No 2) (2016)* 23.44
- Jurisdiction — Order against non-party — Costs orders against legal practitioners — Statutory power under Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW) — Whether conduct of practitioners involved serious incompetence or serious neglect or serious misconduct — Relevant circumstances — Preparation for litigation by practitioner — Relevant obligations — Whether instructions to expert inappropriate — Assessment of costs — Relevant factors — Method of assessment — Making of allegations of impropriety by legal practitioner without evidence — Consequence — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 99.
- De Costi Seafoods (Franchises) Pty Ltd and Others v Wachtenheim and Others (No 6) (2016)* 24.111
- Jurisdiction — Order against non-party — Costs orders against legal practitioners — Statutory power under Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW) — Limitation to exercise of power — Whether limitation as to which party's costs

COSTS — continued

payable by legal practitioners — Whether precondition that party so indemnified paid costs — Assessment of costs — Method — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 345(2), 348(1)(b), 349.

De Costi Seafoods (Franchises) Pty Ltd and Others v Wachtenheim and Others (No 6) (2016) **24.111**

Jurisdiction — Order against non-party — Solicitor and barrister of losing party — Statutory provisions relating to such order — Application — Relevant principles — Legal Practitioners Act 2004 (NSW), ss 345, 347, 348, 349.

De Costi Seafoods (Franchises) Pty Ltd and Others v Wachtenheim and Another (No 5) (2015) **19.390**

Jurisdiction — Powers — Under statutory rules — Proceedings in District Court rather than Local Court — Costs subject to disallowance — Whether costs allowable where award of low verdict — Relevant factors — Whether exclusion of statutory rule authorising such disallowance where proceeding for motor accident claim — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 44(1)(d) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.35.

McLennan v Antonios (No 2) (2014) **18.85**

Jurisdiction — Statutory provision relating to costs — Award of costs against party bringing proceedings “lacking in substance” — Claim arguable on merits and legal basis — Whether claim “lacking in substance” — Community Land Management Act 1989 (NSW), s 104.

The Owners Strata Plan No 58146 v Faeghi (2012) **14.38**

Jurisdiction — Statutory provision relating to costs — Provision of legal services not reasonably necessary for advancement of party’s case — Costs for response to action by other party not reasonably necessary for advancement of that party’s case — Whether settlement of proceedings by disabled party achievable without court’s approval by discontinuance of proceedings — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 75-77 — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 341.

ZD by his tutor LD v Fast Lane Karting Centre Pty Ltd (2013) **16.311**

Jurisdiction — Statutory provision relating to costs — Withdrawal of claim under Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW) — Statutory restriction on court’s power to award costs — Scope of restriction — Interaction between statutory regimes relating to costs — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), s 21 — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 142H, 142I, 142J, 142K.

Wilson v Commissioner of Police (2013) **17.1**

Non-party costs order — Jurisdiction — Application made years after proceedings finalised — Jurisdiction not temporally limited — Relevant factors — Party’s post-hearing insolvency or impecuniosity not relevant — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 148B.

Peter Breese & Associates Pty Ltd v CCI Holdings Ltd **2.157**

Party and party costs — Litigant in person — Costs of preparation and presentation of case — Self-represented non-lawyer — Whether entitlement to such costs.

Sidgreaves v The Queen (2017) **24.360**

Party and party costs — Litigant in person — Costs of preparation of case — Barrister doing such work herself whilst represented by solicitors and counsel —

COSTS — continued

Whether her costs recoverable — Scope of Chorley exception — Relevant legislation — Scope of court's power to award costs — Supreme Court Act 1970 (NSW), ss 75A(4), 75A(10) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 3, 98, 99.

Pentelov v Bell Lawyers Pty Ltd trading as Bell Lawyers (2016) 23.134

Personal injuries action — Statutory limit on costs — Application to exclude limit — Unsuccessful plea of fraud — Initial hearing date vacated — Circumstances warranting special order for costs — Plaintiff's failure to recover almost all of damages claimed — Threshold for non-economic loss not met — No justification for refusing to order defendant to pay costs, including special costs order — No justification for defendant to allege fraud and seek to prove that in novel and time-consuming way — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), Pt 3.2, Div 9, ss 338, 341 — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98.

Hurcum v Domino's Pizza Australia Pty Ltd (No 2) 4.194

Principles in awarding costs — Discretion — Defendant partially successful — Severable causes of action — Appropriate costs order.

Moses v State of New South Wales (No 4) (2010) 12.69

Proceedings for defamation and other causes of action — Conduct of unsuccessful defendant in relation to the defamation count resulting in whole case being part-heard and delayed — Whether order for indemnity costs of hearing all causes of action appropriate — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 48A.

Photi v Target Australia Pty Ltd (No 3) (2008) 6.340

Recovery of costs — Agreement as to costs — Contractual entitlement for recovery of "reasonable" costs — Whether entitlement thereby to indemnity costs.

Who Ya Gonna Call Bark Busters Pty Ltd v Brooke (2013) 16.366

Recovery of costs — Assessment — Court of Appeal's order for payment of self-represented appellant's disbursements — No agreement on or assessment of such disbursements — Proceedings for recovery — No disclosure of reasonable cause of action — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 13.4(1)(b).

Preston v Commissioner for Fair Trading (2012) 14.242

Recovery of costs — By solicitor — Assessment — Enforcement of deemed judgment for costs — Effect of debtor's bankruptcy — Remedial action by removal of bankrupt as party — Whether infringement of bankruptcy legislation — Whether mere filing of assessor's certificate sufficient to obtain judgment — Scope of such judgment — Effect on judgment against two debtors of bankruptcy of one — Powers of costs assessors — Whether inclusive of power to award interest — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), ss 190, 208J — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 133(1) — Bankruptcy Act 1966 (Cth), s 58(3) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 6.29, Form 45.

Barry and Another v Coshott and Another (2014) 18.60

Recovery of costs — By solicitor — Interest on costs — Statutory requirements for recovery — Satisfaction of requirements — Methods — Statutory prohibition on award of interest on interest — Scope of prohibition — Effect of delay on claim for interest — Requirement for specific claim for interest — Satisfaction of requirements — Methods — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), s 190 — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 100 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 6.12(6).

Barry and Another v Coshott (No 2) (2014) 18.247

COSTS — continued

Recovery of costs — Taxation — Assessment — Appeal against Review Panel's determination of costs ordered to be paid by Local Court — Distinct from assessment of "bill" — District Court's lack of jurisdiction to hear appeal — Subrogation principle — Independent from contract — Costs payable to real, not nominal party to action — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 385(1), 385(2).

Legal Employment Consulting and Training Pty Ltd v Patterson
(2009) 11.101

Sanctions — Costs orders against practitioners — Unsuccessful personal injury claim — Defendant's claim against plaintiff's lawyer for indemnity for costs payable in proceedings — Whether legal practitioner provided services to plaintiff without reasonable prospects of proceedings' success — Relevant principles — Not solicitor's task to make final judgment on quality of witnesses — Difference between failing to obtain or adduce evidence and calling witnesses whose evidence court rejects — Dangers of canvassing complex questions of law in satellite litigation — Proper approach to exercise of discretionary power to grant claim — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 345, 348.

Aldag v Eistis (2008) 7.253

Scales of costs — Discretion to vary scale — Whether variation appropriate only because of party's failure to make settlement offer or pressing an arguable defence — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 338, 341.

Awad v ISPT Pty Ltd and Others (No 3) (2015) 21.272

Security for costs — Application for — Plaintiff company in liquidation — Relevant factors — Liquidators and their lawyers only persons to benefit from plaintiff's success — Failure by company to obtain litigation funding — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), s 1335 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 42, r 21.

Canterbury Heating and Cooling Pty Limited
(*In Liquidation*) v *Denham Constructions Pty Limited* (2010) 11.111

Successful motion seeking dispensation from procedural irregularities — Costs of motion and of unsuccessful motion opposing it, sought by the applicant — Whether presumption that costs follow event, or "indulgence principle", applicable — Scope of presumption — Circumstances when presumption may be departed from — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.1 — District Court Rules 1973, Pt 39A, r 32.

Judd v Warwick (Costs) (2007) 6.243

Taxation of costs — Assessment — Review by Review Panel of costs assessor's determination — Appeal against Panel's decision and adequacy of reasons — Appeal on matters of law — Statutory requirement that review be a two stage process — Scope of first stage of review — Review not limited by applicant's complaints — Test of adequacy of Review Panel's reasons — Content of reasons — Failure of Review Panel to go to second stage of review — Failure constituted error of law — Failure to give adequate reasons — Such failure constituted matter of law — Directions for Review Panels — Nature and extent of reasons required from costs assessor — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 375, 382, 384, 385.

Randall Pty Ltd v Willoughby City Council (2009) 9.31

COURTS AND JUDGES

Courts — Duty to apply existing law — Expectation party would bring current

COURTS AND JUDGES — continued

authority to court's attention — Expectation consistent with party's right to argue authority wrong.

Johnstone v Broad Group Holdings Pty Ltd (2011) 13.222

Courts — Jurisdiction — Apprehended violence order — Local Court's exclusive jurisdiction at first instance — Peripheral jurisdiction of District Court — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 61.

Ghosh v Miller and Others (No 3) (2015) 20.246

Courts — Jurisdiction — Commencement of proceedings in either District Court or Local Court — Relevant factors.

Makri v New South Wales (2015) 20.276

Courts — Proceedings in open court — Application by media for documents tendered in sentencing proceedings — Relevant Bill not yet enacted — Determination of application under common law principles — Presentation of evidence in documentary form for administrative efficiency and convenience — No reason to withhold documents from public where same evidence able to be presented orally in open court — Substance of material in court's judgment — No answer to application — Analysis of Bill — Court Information Bill 2010 (NSW).

R v Grace (2012) 13.350

Courts — Proceedings in open court — Prohibition of publication of evidence — Application for — Whether distress of accused's family sufficient ground — Relevant factors — Relevance of United Nations Convention on Rights of the Child.

R v Schiff (2010) 12.166

Judges — Bias — Application for disqualification for apprehended bias — Whether application appropriate — Relevant factors — Delay in making application — Effect.

R v CUR24 (2011) 13.281

Judges — Disqualification for interest or bias — Reasonable apprehension of bias — On ground of associate's prior non-personal connection with complainant in criminal trial — Application for judge's disqualification — Associate's duties and role — Perception of influence with judge — Relevant principles — Resolution of application by change of associate for trial.

R v GFE38 (2013) 17.161

Judges — Judicial powers — Point of law concerning legal practice — Whether court able to form opinion on such issue without or different to expert opinion.

Takla v Nasr (2011) 13.258

Judgments and orders — Judicial powers after verdict announced — Costs order made against party — Non-party costs order sought years later — Judge not functus officio.

Peter Breese & Associates Pty Ltd v CCI Holdings Ltd 2.157

System of precedent — Judgment of single judge of Supreme Court — Not binding on District Court.

Keramaniakis v Wagstaff 3.1

CRIMINAL LAW

Appeal against conviction — Appeal to District Court — Practice and procedure — Omission of essential element of offence — Imperfect exercise of Local Court's jurisdiction to hear and determine charge — District Court's ability to exercise Local Court's power to allow amendment of charge — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 3, 18, 20, 28 — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 5, 6, 11, 12, 15, 16, 17, 20, 21, 40, 175.

Larobina v The Queen (2009) 8.327

Appeal against sentence — Appeal by convicted person — Relevant factors — Offender's prior good character — Whether such factor of limited effect — Hardship due to loss of licence in location where lack of public transport — Whether special circumstance in respect of an imposition of licence disqualification — Loss of income due to licence disqualification — Whether reason for avoidance of conviction — Whether avoidance of conviction of relevance to person's continuance of work with children — Avoidance of hardship to third parties — Relevance to imposition of sentence on offender — Statutory power to lessen sentence — Scope of power where offence objectively serious — Seduction of sentencing court by factors subjective to offender — Danger from such process — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 10 — Child Protection (Working with Children) Act 2012 (NSW).

Babineau v The Queen (2016) 23.375

Appeal and new trial — Appeal to District Court from Local Court — Costs order against prosecutor — Prosecutor's statutory right of appeal — Grounds of appeal — Appeal against quantum of costs — Requirements for successful appeal — Nature of appeal — Limitation of use of such appeal — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 213 — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 23(2).

Andrews v Ardler and Another (2013) 16.339

Appeal to District Court — Criminal liability — Particular offences — Unlawful disclosure of personal information — Exclusion of information in publicly available publication — Whether transcript of court proceedings "publicly available publication" — Relevant test — Whether "publicly available publication" included birth certificate — Whether revelation of fact already known constituted disclosure of fact — Oral representations — Whether such representations "contained" in some publication — Privacy and Personal Information Protection Act 1998 (NSW), ss 4(3), 62(1).

R v Ritson; R v Stacey (2010) 11.88

Application for annulment of conviction — Appeal against refusal of application — Grounds for application — Statutory liberalisation of circumstances warranting annulment — Strength of Crown's case — Relevance — Applicant genuinely mistaken over hearing date — Failure to telephone a court to confirm belief — Effect — Failure by accused to attend court for hearing — Whether conviction should result as matter of course — Applicant's genuine error over hearing date — Whether applicant "hindered by misadventure" from attending hearing — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 4, 8, 11A, 14, 16A.

Rukavina v Director of Public Prosecutions (2008) 7.309

Arrest — Aboriginal juveniles — Legislative scheme for the interviewing of children by police — Procedures not followed — Statutory requirement that representative of Aboriginal Service organisation be notified of detention of

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Aboriginal person — Not satisfied by notification of organisation — Categories of persons who must be present for child's communication to police to be admissible — Categories not hierarchical — Records of interview — Admission of records unfair — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), Pt 10A, reg 28 [See now Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Regulation 2005 (NSW), cl 33] — Children (Criminal Proceedings) Act 1987 (NSW), s 13 — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 90.

R v APCR 3.336

Arrest — Arrest without warrant — Methods of arrest — Whether arrest lawful — Relevant principles — Inappropriateness of arrest for alleged minor offence by identifiable person — Summary Offences Act 1988 (NSW).

Bennett v The Queen (2015) 19.378

Arrest — Arrest without warrant — Powers of — Statutory provision for issue of warning by police prior to issue of direction, requirement or request — Exception where previous compliance with direction, requirement or request by police — Whether exception applicable where prior compliance in relation to earlier arrest and release from arrest — Effect of noncompliance with statutory provision — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), ss 21, 203(1), 203(2) — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 546C.

Addouj v The Queen (2016) 22.142

Arrest — Warrants for arrest and detention — Statutory basis — Issue of bench warrant — Part of incidental common law powers of court — Uses of arrest warrants — Endorsement on arrest warrant — Legal effect of endorsement — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), Pt 4, ss 229, 312.

R v Biasi (2017) 25.98

Attempted armed robbery — Plea of guilty — Factors relevant to assessment of criminality — Sentence — Guidelines — Court's discretion in sentencing not extinguished — Sentencing young first offender — Relevant factors — Restorative justice — Prospects for facilitating in District Court — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 97.

R v Seet 2.192

Bail — After conviction — Application to District Court after refusal of bail by Local Court — Whether such application permissible — Bail Act 1978 (NSW), s 22A.

R v Petrovski (2008) 7.140

Bail — After conviction — Detention application by Crown against offender free on bail after conviction pending sentence hearing — Application following refusal of prior detention application by Crown — Relevant principle — Bail Act 2013 (NSW), s 50.

R v YY (No 2) (2016) 24.46

Common assault — Transit officer forcefully removing person from railway station — Statutory power to remove person who has refused direction to leave station — Force used to do so must be reasonable option — Only reasonable force can be used — Onus of proving such matters — Extent of direction to be given — Common law power of arrest — Relevant principles — Statutory power of arrest without warrant — Scope of power — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 352(1)(a) — Rail Safety (General) Regulation 2003 (NSW), cl 18, 39, 58.

Appeal of Schofield 3.318

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Compensation — Eligibility of primary victim of crime — Eligibility extends to person injured through helping victim of violence who did not witness the violence — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), ss 5(1), 6, 7.

James v Victims Compensation Fund 3.66

Compensation — Victims Compensation Tribunal — Appeal to District Court — Extent of court's powers — Report of authorised report writer — Part of statutory scheme for compensation for certain injuries — In general should be admitted into evidence — Such reports necessary for claim for certain injuries to succeed — Other reports not therefore to be excluded by Tribunal — Admission by Tribunal of evidence not presented to assessor — Admissible if special grounds exist — Circumstances constituting “special grounds” — Procedural errors made in Tribunal Proceedings — Proper approach by Tribunal — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), ss 38(3), 39(5)(b), Sch 1, cl 5(1A).

T v Victims Compensation Fund 3.31

Compensation — Victims Compensation Tribunal — Procedure — Application for victims compensation — Credit of applicant doubted — Applicant entitled to oral hearing before Tribunal — Discretion to reduce compensation — Nature and extent of discretion — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 30.

Kitt v Victims Compensation Fund Corporation 1.236

Confiscation orders — Application for — Statutory power of court to consider transcript of proceedings against offender for offence for which convicted — Whether “transcript” inclusive of tendered document — Scope of power — Whether applicable to transcript of sentencing proceedings — Confiscation of Proceeds of Crime Act 1989 (NSW), s 17.

R v Staas (No 2) (2013) 17.232

Costs — Application for apprehended domestic violence order — Statutory prohibition against award of costs against applicant unless application frivolous or vexatious — Whether same prohibition for application for apprehended personal violence order — Whether application frivolous or vexatious — Relevant factors — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 99(3).

Mahmoud v Sutherland (2013) 17.49

Costs — Application for by defendant — Applicant never arraigned — Consequent finding that proceedings had not commenced — No jurisdiction to make order — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), s 2 — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 130.

R v Karout 1.365

Criminal liability and capacity — Defence matters — Insanity — Disease of the mind — Appropriate verdict if defence successful — Voluntariness — Automatism — State of dissociative fugue — Voluntary action not excluded thereby — Judicial Commission's Bench Book — Misleading entry on automatism — Meaning of “voluntary action”.

R v Joyce 1.290

Criminal liability and capacity — Defence of mental illness — Availability — Distinction between having an underlying disease of the mind causing psychosis triggered by drugs or alcohol, and inability to control actions because of drugs or alcohol — Former situation attracts defence — Concepts of mens rea,

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

voluntariness and criminal responsibility of mentally ill person — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 428D, 428G.

R v McMahon 3.398

Criminal liability — Bizarre conduct — Involvement of children — Harm greater because of nature of conduct.

R v Whitby (2010) 11.139

Criminal liability — Charge of driving with above prescribed concentration of alcohol in blood — Defence of honest and reasonable mistake — Whether available to charge — Possibility of defence being made out — Onus of negating defence than on prosecution.

Appeal of Mendolicchiu (2008) 7.304

Criminal liability — Charge of malicious infliction of grievous bodily harm on baby — Baby injured during attack on father — Existence of baby not known to attackers — Common law doctrine of general or transferred malice — Whether applicable to charge — Meaning of “maliciously” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 5, 35.

R v McKenna; R v Benischke 2.100

Criminal liability — Charge of malicious infliction of grievous bodily harm — Victim injured during intentional attack on another person — Presence of victim not known to attackers — Charge still maintainable — Definition of “malice” — Does not require accused to know of, or foresee possible harm to, victim — Doctrine of transferred malice — Applicable in New South Wales — Applicable to charge — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 5, 35.

R v ENM 3.59

Criminal liability — Children and young persons — Defence of doli incapax — Rebuttal of presumption under such defence — Proof of prior findings of guilt — Methods of proof — Call for statutory abrogation or changes to such defence or means of rebutting presumption.

GW v The Queen (2015) 20.236

Criminal liability — Defence matters — Conduct for which person convicted or acquitted in overseas country — Statutory defence to charge in respect of such conduct — Scope of conduct relevant to defence — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), s 50FC.

R v Prigge (2009) 10.58

Criminal liability — Defences — Duress — Statutory defence — Rationale — Proper approach to defence — Elements — Relevant matters — Whether conduct under duress reasonable response to threat — Meaning of “conduct” — Criminal Code (Cth), s 10.2.

R v Le (No 3) (2010) 10.184

Criminal liability — Evidence — Burden of proof — Reasonable doubt — Existence of such doubt — Relevant circumstances.

R v Taleb (2012) 16.130

Criminal liability — Mens rea — Defence of honest and reasonable mistake — Charge of having sexual intercourse with person over 10 years and under 14 years of age — Whether such defence available to such charge — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 66C(1).

R v Zayat (2016) 23.38

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Criminal liability — Mens rea — Drug offences — Particular offences — Importing prohibited imports — Accused's intention to import narcotic drugs must be proved — Customs Act 1901 (Cth), s 233B(1)(b) — Customs Code Act 1995 (Cth), s 5.6.

R v Ismail 1.89

Criminal liability — Mens rea — Relationship to mental illness defence — Basis of mental illness defence.

R v Sandoval (2010) 11.385

Criminal liability — Mens rea — Statutory offence — Contravention of apprehended domestic violence order — Extent of necessary mens rea — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 562ZG(1).

R v Gibbon (2008) 7.321

Criminal liability — Mental illness — Whether accused fit to stand trial — Inability of accused, because of mental illness, to appreciate he or she was mentally ill at time of allegedly committing crime — Not by that reason unfit to stand trial — Comprehension by accused of all aspects of criminal trial — Accused thereby fit to stand trial — Strength of Crown Case — Relevance to issue of fitness to be tried.

R v Holt (2009) 9.87

Criminal liability — Offence of aiding and abetting — Provision creating reverse onus presumption — Available to prove commission of primary offence — Whether presumption available to prove crime of aiding and abetting that offence — Provision not a “special liability provision” — Presumption not available to prove aiding and abetting offence — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), ss 11.2, 307.11, 307.14.

R v Campbell and Baka (No 2) 5.181

Criminal liability — Offence of failure to bring information to attention of police — Elements of offence — Requirement of knowledge or belief, not suspicion, of commission of crime by particular person — Allegation that information withheld may have led to apprehension of such offender — Allegation not made out when police knew that person's whereabouts — Murder or assault occasioning grievous bodily harm allegedly committed — Not made out simply by proof someone died — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 316.

Leota v The Queen 5.173

Criminal liability — Offence of kidnapping — Element of detaining a person without his or her consent — Whether conduct constituted detaining a person — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 86.

Kyriakopoulos v Victims Compensation Fund (2007) 6.314

Criminal liability — Particular offences — Detaining person with intent to hold person for advantage — Accused detained persons with intent to advantage another person — Offences not made out — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 86.

R v He; R v Li (2010) 11.149

Criminal liability — Particular offences — Engaging in conduct to obtain financial advantage from the Commonwealth — Conduct by omission — No duty or obligation to act imposed by law relevant to offence — No administrative action taken requiring action — No crime committed — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), s 135.2.

Pride v The Queen (2010) 11.154

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Criminal liability — Self defence — Whether person's actions reasonable response for protection of property — Whether greater value in integrity of person than integrity of property — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 418.

Aslan v R (2015) 21.101

Driving offence — Sentence — Home detention order — Prohibited where offender previously convicted of sexual assault — Whether carnal knowledge constituted sexual assault — Inappropriateness of full-time custody for traffic offence — Assessment of offender's suitability for home detention order — Assessment by departmental officer — Legislative change required — Failure of Criminal Records Act 1991 (NSW) to refer to carnal knowledge as sexual offence — Legislative change required — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 77, 78(4) — Criminal Records Act 1991 (NSW), s 7 — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 71.

Appeal of VPS (2007) 8.197

Evidence — Admissibility — Confessions and admissions — Children and young persons — Admissions by school-child to teacher — Whether teacher "investigating official" — Court's discretionary power to refuse to admit evidence of admission if unfair — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Fundamental issue in exercise of power — Admission made by child — Significance — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 85, 90.

R v D (2011) 13.7

Evidence — Admissibility — Hypnotically induced evidence — Guidelines for admission of such evidence — Application of guidelines — Whether evidence hypnotically induced — Mere act of undergoing hypnosis — Whether hypnotically induced evidence thereby produced.

R v KSC (No 3) (2008) 7.234

Evidence — Admissibility — Identification evidence — Not relevant where jury in as good a position as witness in relation to identification — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 55.

R v Sterling; R v McCook (2014) 19.74

Evidence — Admissibility — Judicial discretion to admit or exclude — Evidence unfair to admit or improperly obtained — Record of interview of suspected co-offender with accused — Conduct of interview — Relevant principles — Use of expression "mate" by police during interview with reference to suspect — Effect on admissibility of record of interview — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 137, 138.

R v Heleta; R v Osuji (2014) 18.189

Evidence — Admissibility — Prejudicial evidence — Discretion to exclude — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 137.

R v Sterling; R v McCook (2014) 19.74

Evidence — Admissibility — Sexual offences — Cross-examination of complainant over prior sexual activity — Circumstances when permitted — Extent of such circumstances — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 293(3), 293(4)(c).

R v Scorrige (2009) 9.196

Evidence — Admissibility — Use of surveillance device pursuant to warrant — Use of such device with knowledge of exercise by accused of right to silence — Secret recording by device of conversation between accused and complainant —

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Complainant agent of State — Whether obtaining of evidence of such conversation unfair to accused — Surveillance Devices Act 2007 (NSW), s 3 — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 90.

R v DF (2014) 19.30

Evidence — Defences — Alibi — Statutory requirements as to notification of Crown — Application for leave to adduce alibi evidence despite non-compliance with requirements — Relevant principles — Distinction between particulars of alibi and evidence in support of alibi — Particulars to be given even though evidence in support of alibi not yet assessed — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 150.

R v Maunder (2008) 7.82

Evidence — Identification evidence — DNA profile matching and supporting statistics — Sole evidence of commission of crime by accused — Whether sufficient evidence of guilt — Whether finding of innocence necessary consequence — Potential issues arising from evidence of DNA profile matching — Whether evaluation by jury necessary — Approach to evidence of DNA profile matching in other jurisdictions — Proper direction to juries over statistical evidence on interpretation of DNA match.

R v Borg and Others (No 2) (2015) 21.121

Evidence — Judicial discretion to admit or exclude — Prejudicial evidence — Evidence of flight — Probative value — Whether such evidence admissible — Mere fact that response prejudicial to accused no ground to reject evidence — Circumstances where probative value of evidence outweighed by risk of unfair prejudice to accused.

R v Schneider (No 3) (2010) 10.160

Evidence — Privilege — Sexual assault communications privilege — Meaning of “treats” — Application of privilege — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 296(1), 296(5).

R v Firebrace (No 3) (2014) 19.226

Evidence — Proof of identity of person — Voice identification — Honest view not necessarily accurate view — Factors impeding accuracy of voice identification — Conflict between transcript and recording — Resolution of conflict.

R v Dunn (2012) 15.144

Evidence — Sexual assault communication privilege — Not applicable to communications made by complainant to ambulance officer — Not available to communications made to triage nurse in emergency department of hospital over purely physical complaint — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 296(2), 296(4), 296(5), 298, 299D(1), 299D(2), 299D(3).

R v Russell (2013) 17.17

Evidence — Sexual assault communications privilege — Claim for privilege over entire hospital files — Whether appropriate — Medical officer or nurse in psychiatric hospital — Whether “counsellors” — Assessment officers or triage nurses in rehabilitation hospital — Whether “counsellors” — Application of privilege — Relevant factors — Relevance of ongoing counselling of person claiming privilege — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 296(4), 296(5), 299D.

R v Guerrero (2014) 20.315

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Evidence — Sexual assault communications privilege — Grant of privilege — Relevant factors — Seriousness of criminal charge — Materiality of standard non-parole period — Reasonable expectation of privacy — Whether such expectation preventative of grant of leave for access to privileged material — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 296, 299B, 299D.

R v Veitch (2012) 15.170

Federal offence — Charge of conducting a business involving sexual servitude of others, knowing of that sexual servitude — Requirement that conduct constituting offence to some extent occur outside Australia — Scope of definition of “conduct” — Application of definition of “sexual servitude” — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), ss 4.1(1)(c), 4.1(2), 270.4(1), 270.5, 270.6(2).

R v Sieders 4.255

Federal offence — Sentencing — Relevant principles — Factors to be taken into account — Factor of hardship to third parties resulting from sentence — Can now be taken into account even if hardship not exceptional — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), s 16A(1)(p).

R v Nguyen 3.216

Federal offence — Statutory offence of avoiding reporting of cash transactions — Elements of offence — Required element of accused knowing of consequences of transacting cash deposits over \$10,000 — Evidence of prior, uncharged similar transactions — Admissibility — Evidence relevant to element of knowledge — Evidence admissible — No exclusion of evidence as being prejudicial — Financial Transaction Reports Act 1988 (Cth), s 31 — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), ss 5.6, 13.2 — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 55, 137.

R v Lee 2.360

Indictment containing five counts — Guilty plea to three counts — Appropriate to sever those counts — Video evidence — Admissibility where challenged on ground of being prejudicial to accused — Relevant factors — Overseas witnesses — Application to have evidence given by video link — Relevant factors — Evidence (Audio and Audio Visual Links) Act 1998 (NSW), s 5B.

R v Kafovalu 3.22

Indictments — Ex officio indictment brought by Commonwealth Director of Public Prosecutions — Such indictment can be brought in District Court — Director of Public Prosecutions Act 1983 (Cth), s 6(2)(d).

R v Ansari 4.1

Mens rea — Common law defence of reasonable and honest mistaken belief — Repeal of s 77(2) of Crimes Act 1900 (NSW) — Effect of repeal on common law defence — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 77 (2).

R v Al-Abodi 2.351

Offence against the person — Sexual assault — Evidence — Admissibility — Relevance — Evidence explaining absence of complaint — Relevant to assessment of complainant’s honesty.

R v KSC (2008) 7.200

Offence of possessing child pornography — Sentence — Relevant principles — Practice of offender writing letter to sentencing judge — Judge entitled to be sceptical over such letters — Whether circumstance that offence caused no substantial harm a mitigating factor — Effect on sentence of Form 1 offences — Sentencing guidelines in foreign or different Australian state jurisdictions —

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Relevance — Advances in capacity to store images on one disk — Whether multiple charges for possession still appropriate — Cumulative sentences — When appropriate — Maximum penalty for offence — Whether adequate — Restating evils of child pornography — Whether important — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 21A.

R v Saddler (2008) 6.372

Offence under Crimes Act 1900 (NSW) of making false statement under oath — Person convicted of offence committed when giving evidence at examination held under Corporations Act 2001 (Cth) — Whether offence inconsistent with offence created under Corporations Act — Whether Corporations Act covers field — Elements of each offence different — Commonwealth Constitution 1900 (Cth), s 109 — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), ss 5E, 596A, 597(7), 1311 — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 327, 330.

Larkin v Director of Public Prosecutions (NSW) 4.216

Offences against Customs Act 1901 (Cth) — No conviction ordered — Appeal against leniency of sentence imposed by Local Court — Appeal under Customs Act to District Court by informant/prosecutor — Whether District Court had jurisdiction — Statutory right of appeal against sentence imposed by Local Court — Not applicable to CEO of Customs — District Court lacked jurisdiction — Customs Act 1901 (Cth), s 248 — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 23.

CEO of Customs v Delacour 5.1

Offences against the person — Sexual offences — Alternative verdict — Statutory code — Interpretation — Charge of aggravated act of indecency — Acquittal of charge — Charge of indecent assault — Such offence carried greater term of imprisonment — Whether alternative verdict of indecent assault permissible — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 61I, 61J, 61L, 61M, 61N, 61O(1A), 61Q.

Palazzo v Director of Public Prosecutions (2008) 7.274

Offences — Offences relating to administration of justice — Escape from lawful custody — Criminal liability — Self-defence — Violence used solely to avoid lawful arrest — Not self-defence.

R v Murray (2008) 7.353

Particular offences — Alleged offences against Fisheries Management Act 1991 (Cth) — Boarding and seizure of ship on high seas — Application for permanent stay of proceedings — Boarding and seizure of ship alleged to have been illegal — No international agreement to justify boarding and seizure — Statutory authority to seize and board ship if it had been pursued — Unavailable as no pursuit — Ship forfeit to Commonwealth if offences proven — Boarding and seizure not therefore acts of piracy — Ordering permanent stay not warranted — Fisheries Management Act 1991 (Cth), ss 100, 100A, 101, 101A, 106A.

R v Amoedo 4.305

Particular offences — Causing grievous bodily harm by driving dangerously to escape pursuit by police — Elements of offence — Whether proof necessary that driver aware of police in pursuit — Offence of causing grievous bodily harm by driving dangerously — Defence of mental illness — Whether such defence available — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 52A.

R v Sandoval (2010) 11.385

Particular offences — Customs offence — Practice known as “piggybacking”.

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

- R v Elomar (2016)* 23.225
- Particular offences — Customs offences — Importation of child pornography or child abuse material — Device containing many items of prohibited material — Whether only one offence — Groups of prohibited material in different formats — Appropriate form of indictment — Customs Act 1901 (Cth), ss 4, 233BAB — Acts Interpretation Act 1901 (Cth), s 25.
- R v Cargnello (2009)* 10.8
- Particular offences — Dealing with money intended to become instrument of crime — Whether satisfaction of “intention” element by intentional use of money in commission of another federal offence — Principles relevant to establishment of relevant intent — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), ss 400.1, 400.2, 400.3 — Anti-Money Laundering and Counter-Terrorism Financing Act 2006 (Cth), s 140.
- Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) v Cheng (2015)* 21.318
- Particular offences — Detaining person with intent to hold that person for ransom or other advantage — Whether necessary for proof of offence for “advantage” to be illegal — Direct advantage of detention to third party — Whether charge still maintainable — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 86(1), 86(3).
- R v X (2011)* 22.94
- Particular offences — Driving offences — Dangerous driving causing grievous bodily harm — Collision between truck and tractor — Ability of persons in charge of use of tractor in cutting grass verge to take more steps to avoid accident to tractor driver — Whether failure to take such steps necessarily meant person accused of offence did not drive dangerously — Importance of risk of harm rather than result of driving in assessment of whether person drove dangerously.
- R v Read (2017)* 25.328
- Particular offences — Driving offences — Dangerous driving — Criminal liability — “Fall asleep” collision — Defence of honest and reasonable belief — Offender suffering from sleep apnoea — Whether defence made out.
- R v Adamczyk (2010)* 10.215
- Particular offences — Driving offences — Statutory offence of wanton or furious driving of carriage or other vehicle causing bodily harm to any person — Whether offence of strict liability — Whether “vehicle” included automobile — Whether driving car with persons on its bonnet furious or wanton driving — Defence of necessity — Whether available where actions to avoid towing away of car — Defence of duress — Whether available where actions due to threat to property — Defences of duress, provocation and self-defence — Common elements — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 53.
- Aslan v R (2015)* 21.101
- Particular offences — Facilitating entry to Australia of non-citizens having no lawful right to enter — When right of entry determined — Right of entrants to apply for asylum — Whether such right provided lawful right of entry to Australia — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), ss 42, 233C.
- R v Ambo (2011)* 13.229
- Particular offences — Falsely nominating another person as person in charge of vehicle involved in offence in document supplied to authorised officer — Commission of offence — Whether time of commission of offence on receipt of

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

- document or completion of document — Road Transport (General) Act 2005 (NSW), ss 179(4), 179(7), 181.
R v Taleb (2012) 16.130
- Particular offences — Manslaughter — By unlawful and dangerous act — By neglect — Deceased's death from self-administered drug at premises of person who supplied drug — Whether direction by judge to jury to acquit appropriate — Duty of care of supplier of drug — Circumstances attracting such duty — Extent of such duty.
R v Burns (2009) 9.317
- Particular offences — Manslaughter — Whether act or omission of accused caused victim's death — Issue of fact for jury — Determination of causation — Relevant principles — Proper direction to jury.
R v Wright (2009) 10.28
- Particular offences — Offence of serious animal cruelty — Elements of offence — Omission of essential element from charge — Effect — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 530(1).
Larobina v The Queen (2009) 8.327
- Particular offences — Offences against public order — Apprehended Personal Violence Orders — Application for — Ground of harassment — Degree of harassment required to justify Order — Proper use of legislation — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), ss 7, 8, 10.
P E v M U (2010) 11.107
- Particular offences — Offences against the person — Alleged breaches of apprehended personal violence order by glance at protected person while passing by her house — Whether intimidation of that person — Whether breach of prohibition against loitering about those premises — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), ss 7, 9(3)(d), 10, 13(1), 14(1).
Dowling v R (2015) 21.200
- Particular offences — Offences against the person — Offence of recklessly causing grievous bodily harm — Whether such offence one of specific intent — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 35, 428B.
R v Brady (2012) 15.182
- Particular offences — Offensive conduct — Offensive language used in public place — No less offensive if in films or books public choose to see or read.
Jolly v R (2009) 9.225
- Particular offences — Offensive conduct — Whether use of particular word offensive — Relevant factors — Whether conduct offensive — Relevant tests — Defence of merely using offensive language — Scope of term "using" — Summary Offences Act 1988 (NSW), ss 4, 4A.
Lim v The Queen (2017) 25.253
- Particular offences — People smuggling — Elements of offence — Whether non-citizen lacking entry visa had lawful right to come to Australia — Statutory right of non-citizen in Australia to apply for protection visa — No right thereby to enter Australia — Statutory right of non-citizen in Australia to seek refugee status — No conferral thereby of right to enter Australia — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), ss 4, 42, 232A.
R v Ladoke, R v La Lau and R v La Said (2011) 13.252

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Particular offences — Perjury — Application for leave to prosecute — Elements of offence and its prosecution — Relevant principles — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 327, 338(1)(c).

Mohareb v Palmer and Another (No 4) (2017) 25.60

Particular offences — Perjury — Application for leave to prosecute — Requirement of precise identification of alleged perjury — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 338(1)(c).

Mohareb v Palmer and Another (No 3) (2016) 22.41

Particular offences — Possession of child pornography — Elements of offence — Material depicting persons “in a sexual context” — Objective test — Relevance of methodology and motives of person producing material — Depiction of persons dressing and undressing normally — Such depiction not “in a sexual context” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 91H(3).

Annetts v Director of Public Prosecutions (2008) 9.1

Particular offences — Possession of child pornography — Elements — Whether material depicted children “in a sexual context” — Relevance of how material came into being — Depiction of children dressing and undressing in change room — Whether material could be characterised as causing offence to reasonable persons — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 91H(1).

Annetts v Director of Public Prosecutions (No 2) (2009) 9.311

Particular offences — Prescribed sexual act — Evidence — Entitlement of complainant to give evidence via closed-circuit television — Application that complainant give evidence in court — Whether advantages for jury in having complainant give evidence in court — Whether “special reasons in interests of justice” existed — Relevant circumstances — Complainant not having to give evidence of particular sexual acts — Relevance — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 294B.

R v Day (No 1) (2009) 10.1

Particular offences — Prohibition against publication of name of child witness in criminal proceedings — Whether prohibition restricted to first publisher — Whether prohibition offended constitutional freedom of communication over government and political matters — Children (Criminal Proceedings) Act 1987 (NSW), s 11(1)(a).

Jones v R (2008) 6.293

Particular offences — Recruiting children to engage in criminal activity — Target of statutory offence — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 351A.

R v Day (No 3) (2010) 11.118

Particular offences — Sexual offences — Act of indecency with girl under 16 years — Sentence — Need for sentence to reflect general deterrence — Justification.

R v B (2016) 24.342

Particular offences — Sexual offences — Expansion of scope of such offences by use of internet.

R v Nguyen (2016) 24.50

Particular offences — Sexual offences — Fellatio — Comparable degree of seriousness with other acts of sexual intercourse.

R v DS (2017) 25.208

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Particular offences — Sexual offences — Non publication order in respect of complainant — Application for revocation of order — Relevant factors — Public interest in revocation of order — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 292 — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 578A.

R v Ali (2008) 8.35

Particular offences — Sexual offences — Prescribed sexual offences — Evidence of complainant — Complainant's entitlement to give evidence by means of closed circuit television facilities — Court's power to order exercise of entitlement be negated — Circumstances where such order not justified — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 294B(3), 294B(6).

R v Kurdi (2009) 10.115

Particular offences — Sexual offences — Use of internet for purpose of grooming person under 16 years of age — Sentence — Relevant factors — Offender's prior good character — Whether of less weight in respect of sentencing for such offence.

R v Nguyen (2016) 24.50

Particular offences — State offence of possessing child abuse material — Commonwealth offence of using a carriage service to access child pornography — Whether overlap between offences — Whether sentences therefore should be entirely concurrent.

R v Miao (2016) 23.89

Particular offences — Statutory offence of possessing document purporting to be passport issued by government of foreign country — Point of time when offence occurred — Whether provision applied to document purporting to be passport issued by non-existing foreign government — Whether, if so, provision constitutionally valid — Passports Act 1938 (Cth), ss 9A(1)(f)(ii), 9B(b) — Commonwealth Constitution 1900 (Cth), ss 51(xxix), 51(xxxix).

Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) v Riddell 4.368

Particular offences — Use of carriage service to access child pornography — Viewing child pornography on internet — Whether internet "carriage service" — Criminal Code Act 1995 (Cth), s 474.19.

Hale v The Queen (2011) 13.1

Particular offences — Whether offence of conspiracy to aid and abet another to commit an offence exists under New South Wales law.

R v Kucukeren (2008) 8.6

Power of Customs officer to question person — Extent of power — Effect of administration of caution — Circumstances where power ceases — Person's status of "protected suspect" — Status not lost because frisk search is to be carried out on such person — Obligation on Customs officer not to question "protected suspect" before advising such person of right to communicate with lawyer — Effect of failure to so advise on admissibility into evidence of subsequent interview with such person — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), ss 23B, 23G — Customs Act 1901 (Cth), s 195.

R v Bangura 3.179

Practice and procedure — Annulment of conviction in Local Court — Application for — Whether person hindered from taking action in relation to court proceedings through misadventure — Scope of "taking action" — Relevance of subsequent events — Whether not hearing matter called when in

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

court precincts within meaning of “misadventure” — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 4, 8(2)(b).

R v Parker (2012) **16.1**

Practice and procedure — Appeal — Against dismissal of application for annulment of conviction in absentia — Statutory grounds for annulment — Whether grounds applicable — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 8(2), 16(1).

Willis v The Queen (2014) **20.104**

Practice and procedure — Bail — After conviction — Grant of continuation of bail after conviction prior to sentence hearing — No objection taken to application for such grant — Subsequent Detention Application by Crown — Effect on prospect of full-time custodial sentence by grant of application — Opinions of media commentators — Relevance to grant of bail — Factors relevant to grant or refusal of bail — Whether process involved in determining bail applications different depending on whether such application before or after applicant’s conviction.

R v Stuart (2016) **22.218**

Practice and procedure — Bail — Jurisdiction — Application for bail detention order after dispensation of bail — Whether permissible — Such application not review of order dispensing with bail — Bail Act 2013 (NSW), ss 7(1), 8, 10(3), 50.

R v Tierney (2014) **18.362**

Practice and procedure — Basha inquiry — Application for by accused — Inquiry not lightly granted — Onus of proving inquiry appropriate — Relevant test.

R v Day (No 2) (2009) **10.5**

Practice and procedure — Compensation orders — Statutory provisions — Assessment of amount — Where several offences part of general course of conduct — Whether “loss” inclusive of economic loss — Standard of proof applicable to claims for orders — Relevance of effect of order on offender’s potential for rehabilitation — Relevance of financial capacity of claimant — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), ss 77B, 77C.

R v Wills: Application by Woolworths Ltd (2013) **16.4**

Practice and procedure — Confessions and admissions — Records of interview — Admissibility — Difficulties with caution given by police to detained person — Difficulties created by Caution and Summary document — Whether document accurate — Arrest — Whether arrest lawful — Relevant factors — Police interview of suspect — Use of the term “mate” by police — Use inappropriate — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), Pt 9, ss 99, 109, 110, 112, 113, 114, 122 and 123 — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Regulations 2005 (NSW), regs 24, 27, 28, 33 and 34.

R v Powell (2010) **11.218**

Practice and procedure — Costs against Crown — Grounds for order — Scope of such grounds — Determination of unreasonableness of prosecution’s failure to investigate relevant matters — Whether determination supportable — Initial test — Whether circumstances exceptional — Relevant factors — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 213, 214(1).

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

- Andrews v Ardler and Another* (2013) 16.339
- Practice and procedure — Costs — Appeal as to costs — Jurisdiction to entertain — Local Court's refusal to make costs order — Whether appeal lay to District Court against refusal — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 3, 11(1).
- Appeal of Waller* (2007) 8.1
- Practice and procedure — Costs — Certificate under Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) — Application for — Certificate awardable when certain direction by Director of Public Prosecutions given after "commencement of a trial" — Whether trial commenced — Relevant circumstances — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), s 2 — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 130.
- R v Roberts* (2013) 16.288
- Practice and procedure — Costs — Certificate under Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) — Relevant considerations — Policies adopted by Director of Public Prosecutions — Obligation of Director — Not diminished by policies — Victims of serious crimes — Accounts of persons claiming to have been such victims — Prosecution's obligation to subject such accounts to rigour — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), ss 2, 3, 3A.
- R v CPR* (2009) 9.362
- Practice and procedure — Costs — Costs against Crown — Application for — Relevant test — Police officer as informant in application for apprehended domestic violence order — Consequences — Obligations of police prosecutor to court and to opponent — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 70.
- Hatzopoulos v The Queen* (2016) 23.193
- Practice and procedure — Costs — Costs against the Crown — Stay of proceedings until costs paid — Application for — Relevant principles — Costs order, if made, payable by Director of Public Prosecutions — Relevance of blamelessness of Director — Nature of fault of Crown justifying order.
- R v Kaddour and Zreika* (2012) 14.110
- Practice and procedure — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) — Application of Act — Appropriate inquiry — Assessment of reasonableness of institution of or continuation with prosecution — Relevant considerations — Crown's decision to institute or continue with prosecution — Relevant factors — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), ss 2, 3, 3A.
- Bowman v R* (2015) 22.1
- Practice and procedure — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) — Application of — Grant of certificate — Relevant factors — Reasonableness of institution of proceedings — Time at which assessment of such reasonableness made — Principal Crown witness substantially lacking in credit — Institution of proceedings not reasonable — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), ss 2, 3.
- Field v Director of Public Prosecutions* (2010) 11.74
- Practice and procedure — Costs in Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW) — Application of — Relevant factors — Accuseds' costs partly funded by Legal Aid — Relevance — Refusal of grant of certificate — Relevant circumstances — Prosecution's incurring of additional wasted costs where institution of proceedings reasonable — Significance — Statutory jurisdiction to make proportionate order — Exercise of jurisdiction — Relevant factors — Costs in

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Criminal Cases Act 1967 (NSW), s 3 — Legal Aid Commission Act 1979 (NSW), s 42.

R v Henderson and Another (2013) 16.11

Practice and procedure — Direction by judge to jury to acquit — Application for — Ground of inappropriate prosecutorial choice of charge — Not germane to application.

Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) v Cheng (2015) 21.318

Practice and procedure — Disclosure by prosecution — Stay of proceedings — Proceedings stayed until Crown disclosed documents relevant to sentencing of offender — Crown's obligation to disclose such documents — Obligation not delegable to police — Claim of public interest immunity over documents — Crown's practice of leaving such claim to police — Practice wrong — No such immunity between police and Crown — Crown's obligation to obtain and inspect material and decide if claim for public interest immunity maintainable.

R v Lipton (No 2) (2010) 12.20

Practice and procedure — Fitness to plead — Whether accused fit to plead — Relevant factors.

R v Chanthasaeng (2008) 7.158

Practice and procedure — Hearing in presence of accused — Accused taken ill just before delivery of jury verdict — Whether verdict should be delivered — Relevant factors.

R v Leonard (No 2) (2008) 7.278

Practice and procedure — Indictment — Delay in presenting — No arraignment of accused — Whether District Court lacked jurisdiction to conduct proceedings on indictment presented out of time — Plea bargaining — Circumstances where permissible for Crown to proceed against accused irrespective of plea bargain — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 129, 130.

R v M (2010) 12.279

Practice and procedure — Informations and indictments — Statutory requirement for application by prosecuting inspector — Validity of institution of proceedings by solicitor as representative of inspector — Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW), s 106(1) — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 246 — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 53, r 26.

Inspector Walsh v Built (NSW) Pty Ltd (2012) 19.206

Practice and procedure — Juries — Application by accused for trial by judge alone — Application opposed by Crown — New statutory discretionary power of court to grant application if “in the interests of justice” to do so — Malignant pre-trial publicity against accused — Significant factor in decision to grant application — Retention of information on internet — Information accessible after cooling off period — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 132.

R v GSR (No 1) (2011) 12.186

Practice and procedure — Juries — Application by accused for trial by judge alone — Application opposed by Crown — New statutory discretionary power of court to grant application if “in the interests of justice” to do so — Proper approach to exercise of power — Factors relevant to “interests of justice” — Determination of application not decision on comparison between trial by jury or judge alone — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 132, 132A.

R v GSR (No 3) (2011) 12.193

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Practice and procedure — Juries — Application by accused for trial by judge alone — Opposition to application by Crown — Statutory power of court to grant application if “in the interests of justice” to do so — Whether onus on applicant to establish judge alone trial in interests of justice — Exercise of power — Relevant factors — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 131, 132.

R v FH (2012) 16.108

Practice and procedure — Juries — Application by accused for trial by judge alone — Trial involved one factual issue — Whether “in the interests of justice” for such order — Relevant factors.

R v Markou (2011) 12.263

Practice and procedure — Juries — Application for discharge of juror — Relevant factors — Discharge of whole jury result of successful application — Alternative method of removing effect of juror’s emotional disturbance during trial — Application refused.

R v James (2011) 13.180

Practice and procedure — Juries — Separation of jurors without court’s order — Statutory power of court to order separation of jury without jurors’ presence — Scope of provision — Whether separation of jurors without permission fundamental procedural irregularity such that trial unfair — Relevant factors — Jury Act 1977 (NSW), ss 54(1)(b), 54(2).

R v Jenkins; R v Clayton (2013) 17.226

Practice and procedure — Pleas — Plea of guilty — Acceptance of plea — Discharge of jury — Application to withdraw plea — Court’s lack of jurisdiction to hear application — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 157.

R v Ezegbe (2012) 16.205

Practice and procedure — Powers of court — Power to order separate trials of accused persons — Exercise of power — Relevant principles — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 21.

R v McParland; R v Wingate (No 2) (2011) 17.97

Practice and procedure — Statutory power of Director of Public Prosecutions — Extent of power — Entry of nolle prosequi — Entry during jury trial — Application by Crown for discharge of jury — Whether abuse of court’s process — Relevant principles — Director of Public Prosecutions Act 1986 (NSW), s 7(2).

R v RP (2016) 21.356

Practice and procedure — Stay of proceedings — Abuse of process — Applicability of estoppel doctrine — Acquittal in trial involving contest of evidence between two witnesses — Effect on later trial where similar contest of credibility between those witnesses.

R v Lou Tasich (2012) 14.261

Practice and procedure — Stay of proceedings — Grounds for — Proceeding with trial in absence of evidence — Whether abuse of process.

R v He; R v Li (2010) 11.149

Practice and procedure — Stay of proceedings — Issue of whether Crown case fundamentally flawed — Whether application for stay appropriate response.

R v Wright (2009) 10.28

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Practice and procedure — Stay of proceedings — Permanent stay — Grounds for — Accused suffering from life-threatening medical condition — Risk that trial process would contribute to endangerment of accused's life — Exceptional remedy — Relevant factors — Methods available to minimise risk.

R v Payne (2010) 11.241

Practice and procedure — Stay of proceedings — Whether trial oppressive — Second trial after failure of jury to agree in earlier trial after two prior “not reached” hearings — Accused put to great expense — Whether such past and future expenditure oppressive.

R v Read (2017) 25.328

Practice and procedure — Subpoenas — Access to subpoenaed documents — Privilege — Protected confidence privilege — Claim for — Scope of privilege — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 296, 298, 299D.

R v Veitch (2013) 16.181

Practice and procedure — Trial before judge without jury — Election for — Relevant factors — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 132(4).

R v Lou Tasich (2012) 14.261

Practice and procedure — Trial by judge without jury — Application for — Accused's previous convictions — Risk of discovery thereof by juror — Near certainty of knowledge thereof by judge — Effect on fairness of trial of accused — Effect of community's acceptance of justice of result in trial of accused — Relevance to finding whether trial by jury in interests of justice — Assessment of whether conduct indecent — Statutory recognition that such assessment better made by jury than single judge — Issue of credibility of complainants' evidence and evidence of accused — Whether jury or judge better at determining credibility — Relevant factors — Risk of juror's non-compliance with judge's direction to not engage in research during course of trial — Whether sufficient to mandate trial by judge alone — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 132.

R v Spillane (2016) 23.233

Practice and procedure — Verdicts — Direction by judge to jury to acquit — Exercise of power to give such direction — Relevant circumstances.

R v Borg and Others (No 2) (2015) 21.121

Prosecution required to prove person is a party or becomes a party to proceedings — Standard of proof — Criminal standard of proof required.

R v Doe 3.127

Publication orders — Application for consent to publication of name of child under 16 — Documentary naming child did not identify child with criminal proceedings — Statutory prohibition against publication of child's name not contravened — Whether exceptions to statutory prohibition conflicted with each other — Children (Criminal Proceedings) Act 1987 (NSW), s 11.

Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Gillon 4.267

Search warrants — Execution — Disposal of goods seized by police — By direction of magistrate — Jurisdiction of magistrate — Direction creates no issue estoppel as to title to goods — Search Warrants Act 1985 (NSW), s 7(3).

Vassallo v Haddad Import & Export Pty Ltd 2.123

Sentence — Application of Mental Health (Forensic Provisions) Act 1990 (NSW) — Relevant factors — Non-availability of suitable community service

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

work — Relevance — Mental Health (Forensic Provisions) Act 1990 (NSW), s 32.

RM v The Queen (2015) 21.308

Sentence — Commonwealth and State offences — Whether offence such that registration of offender under Child Protection (Offenders Registration) Act 2000 (NSW) appropriate — Whether offender's conduct "act of indecency" — Whether "act of indecency" necessary element of registrable offence — Child Protection (Offenders Registration) Act 2000 (NSW), s 3A.

R v Moss (2013) 17.197

Sentence — Deterrent effect — Factors to be taken into account — Contribution of both intoxication and mental disorder to commission of offence — Whether general deterrence still appropriate factor in sentencing — Aggravating factor of victim's vulnerability — Victim's occupation as security guard — Whether victim thereby vulnerable person — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 21A(5AA), 21A(2)(l).

R v Longworth (2016) 23.26

Sentence — Deterrent effect — Factors to be taken into account — Need for balance of objects of sentencing — Danger of emphasis of general deterrence effect of sentence — Need for greater flexibility in options available to sentencing judge — Present need for appropriate reforms — Whether rehabilitation best protection of community — Forms of punishment alternative to prison recommendable.

R v Zolfonoon (2015) 21.336

Sentence — Deterrent effect — Principle of general deterrence — Application of principle.

R v Beckett (2017) 24.345

Sentence — Dispensation with recording of conviction — Relevant factors — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 10.

JG v The Queen (2015) 21.306

Sentence — Dispositive power — Driving offences — Effect of exercise of power on purported disqualification order — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 10 — Road Transport (Driver Licensing) Act 1998 (NSW), s 25A.

Chan v R (2009) 9.336

Sentence — Drug offences — Driving offences — Person driving with illicit drug in his or her blood — Different offence to driving under influence of drug — Presence of drug in person's system detectable days after ingestion — Need for awareness by drug users of such attribute — Driver licences of such users at risk through lack of such awareness — Road Transport Act 2013 (NSW), s 111(1)(a).

Bugden v The Queen (2015) 21.302

Sentence — Drug offences — Guideline for sentencing — Full-time imprisonment for those guilty of substantial trafficking unless limited exceptional circumstances — Present availability of option of intensive corrections order — Whether need for reconsideration of rule.

R v Jackson (2016) 22.323

Sentence — Drug offences — Relevant considerations — Whether

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

methamphetamine mid-range drug — Offender's remorse — Assessment.

R v Campbell (2010) 11.267

Sentence — Drug offences — Relevant factors — No evidence of trafficking or participation in sophisticated commercial arrangement — Whether full-time custodial sentence necessary.

R v Barden (2015) 22.201

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Aboriginal offenders — Reduction of offender's moral culpability — Relevant circumstances — Offender's rehabilitation — Effect on community's need for protection and advancement — Sentencing of Aboriginal offenders — Relevant principles.

R v Sharpley (2014) 19.156

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Assistance given by offender to law enforcement authorities — Discount for provision of such assistance — Relevant principles.

R v Day (No 3) (2010) 11.118

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Deterrent effect — Necessity for deterrence — Relevant circumstances.

Usmanov v The Queen (2012) 16.305

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Extra-curial punishment — Inability to practise as solicitor or probable inability to continue to practise as tax agent — Whether examples of such punishment.

R v Beckett (2017) 24.345

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Hardship — Construction of statutory provision relating to type of hardship requiring mandatory consideration — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), s 16A(2)(p).

R v Megaloudis (2013) 19.1

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Mitigating circumstances — Extra curial punishment — Loss of employment, career prospects, income, superannuation benefits and choice of employment as consequences of offence — Offender to blame for losses — Whether losses relevant to reduction in sentence.

Wade v The Queen (2011) 13.185

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Mitigating circumstances — Hardship to family member by imprisonment of offender — Relevant factor due to exceptional circumstances.

R v Cornell (2013) 17.165

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Parramatta sittings — Excessive workload of Court — Court's limited resources — Consequential effect on hearings — Need for encouragement of early guilty pleas.

R v Winters (2017) 25.142

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Previous convictions — Previous offence proven but no conviction recorded — Relevance — Possibility of deportation because of sentence — Whether such possibility amounts to "special circumstances" — Offender's difficulty with English language and English speaking culture — Whether relevant factor in sentencing — Similar conduct involving adjacent parts of human body — Paradox that two separate

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

offences can arise — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 10, 21A(2)(d).

R v Qin (2008) 7.108

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Relevance of imprisonment being offender's first time in custody.

R v B (2016) 24.342

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Requirement of consideration of actual circumstances rather than capacity for certain offences to have consequences unconnected with circumstances of individual case — No warrant for necessarily giving predominance to one or other objects of sentencing — General statements suggestive of necessary particular sentencing outcome for general type of offending — Whether fetter on exercise of sentencing discretion — Delay between charge and sentence — Whether conducive to reduction in sentence — Relevant factors.

R v Raines (2017) 25.239

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Victim's attitude towards offender — Extent of court's duties in sentencing.

R v Perry (2011) 13.17

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Voluntary surrender of firearms, parts of weapons and ammunition — Surrender motivated by self-interest — Whether reduction in sentence justified — Relevant factors.

R v Moradian (2011) 13.209

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Whether offence isolated act — Relevance of uncharged acts and unproven offences.

R v DS (2017) 25.208

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Whether registration under Child Protection (Offenders Registration) Act 2000 (NSW) extra-curial punishment — Relevance to sentencing — State of offender's mental health — Effect on imposition of sentence.

R v Moss (2013) 17.197

Sentence — Factors to be taken into account — Whether sentences for three offences cumulative or concurrent — Effects on offender of delay between commission of offences and sentences — Effect of such delay on general deterrence purpose of sentence.

R v Hassoun (2016) 24.101

Sentence — Guidelines for sentencing — Rationale — Driving offences — Driving occasioning death or grievous bodily harm — No unusually heinous behaviour involved — Acting without regard for public safety not an aggravating feature to be taken into account — Young offender — Factors relevant in sentencing — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 52A — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 21A(2).

KC v Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) 4.127

Sentence — Illegality — Imposition of sentence by Local Court on prison inmate whose sentence exceeded five years — Whether sentence valid — Consequential unsatisfactory situation — Ministerial notification of such consequence — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 58.

Taha v The Queen (2017) 25.102

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Sentence — Application of s 10(4) of the Mental Health (Criminal Procedure) Act 1990 (NSW) — Relevant considerations — Mental Health (Criminal Procedure) Act 1990 (NSW), s 10(4).

R v Chanthasaeng (2008) 7.158

Sentence — Non-parole period — Application for re-sentence — Requirements — Purpose of re-sentencing to carry out court's intention — Whether requirements for re-sentencing met — Exercise of court's discretion to re-sentence — Relevant factors — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 43.

R v Loutan (2013) 16.307

Sentence — Offence of indecent assault — Plea of guilty to lesser offence after negotiations with Crown — Whether full discount for plea should be given — Effect of ADHD medication on mental health of young offenders.

R v Little (2007) 6.308

Sentence — Offences committed while on parole — Specific aggravating factor in determination of sentence in appropriate cases — Commencement of prison sentence — To be backdated to time offender came into custody — Need to avoid effectively penalising offender twice for breach of parole — Parity of sentences — Relevance of sentences imposed on co-offender or for same offence by other courts with comparably limited sentencing jurisdiction — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 21A(2).

R v Lovoni 4.357

Sentence — Offences involving sexual activity — Width of expression “sexual activity” — Difficulty for sentencing law because of width of such expression.

R v Nguyen (2016) 24.50

Sentence — Offences relating to child pornography — Relevant factors — Need for strong general deterrence.

R v Ferguson 3.70

Sentence — Parole of prisoners — Fixing of non-parole period — Whether statutory standard non-parole period applicable to offence of supplying a quantity of a prohibited drug applies to offence of knowingly taking part in such supply — Drug Misuse and Trafficking Act 1985 (NSW), s 25(2) — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 54A, 54D.

R v Rollason (2007) 8.298

Sentence — Particular offences — Contraventions of s 112(2) of the Crimes Act 1900 (NSW) — Assessment of objective gravity of offences — Relevant principles — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 112(2).

R v Kostovski & Nikolovski (2010) 12.50

Sentence — Particular offences — Drug trafficking — Rule requiring full-time custodial sentence where no exceptional circumstances — Whether rule justified and justifiable — Demonstration of actual rehabilitation of offender — Consequence for sentencing — Young offenders — Whether rehabilitation dominant consideration in sentencing.

R v Na (2017) 25.367

Sentence — Particular offences — People smuggling — Statutory mandatory minimum sentence — Whether to be taken as sentencing starting point — Issues

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

of national security — Relevance to sentencing process — Migration Act 1958 (Cth), s 233C.

R v Pulendren (2010) 13.290

Sentence — Particular offences — Robbery — Bag snatching — Extent of criminality of such offence.

R v Barton (2010) 12.59

Sentence — Powers of court — Application to reopen proceedings — Persons able to make application — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 43.

Fewell v Director of Public Prosecutions (2010) 12.1

Sentence — Practice and procedure — Request to members of legal profession for assistance at sentencing hearings.

R v Elomar (2016) 23.225

Sentence — Practice and procedure — Tender of material on basis judge might view it — Whether appropriate — Tender of sample images and videos of child abuse material requiring over one hour of viewing time — Whether necessary or proper — Effect of viewing pornographic material involving children — Whether same effect from viewing in course of court proceedings.

R v Miao (2016) 23.89

Sentence — Practice and procedure — Victim impact statement — Purposes of — Victim's right to prepare — Abuse of right — Consequences — Responsibility for tender of such statement solely on prosecutor — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 26, 28 — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Regulation 2005 (NSW), rr 11(1), 11(6).

R v Dilan Shaba (2010) 11.203

Sentence — Relevant circumstances — Delay in sentencing hearing — Where prison inevitable — No expression by offender of remorse — Effect.

R v Batterham (2012) 15.23

Sentence — Relevant principles — Factors to be taken into account — Factor of hardship to others resulting from sentence — Not to be taken into account unless hardship is extreme — Supervision of offences — Courts permitted a more pro-active role.

R v Polyblank 2.176

Sentence — Sexual offences against children — Importance of general deterrence.

R v DS (2017) 25.208

Sentence — Sexual offences — Commission of multiple offences many years earlier — Factors to be taken into account — Role of general and specific deterrence — Relevant factors — Relevance of offender's good character before commission of first offence when commission of other later offences of similar nature — Passage of decades after commission of offences during which avoidance of justice and freedom from punishment — Relevance — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 19.

R v AJB (2017) 24.365

Sentence — Sexual offences — Factors to be taken into account — Discount for offender's conduct of trial — Relevance of strength of Crown case — Effect of

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

receipt of discount for plea of guilty — Relevant considerations — Whether life expectancy of offender relevant — Principle of proportionality — Application of principle — Prospect that resultant sentence equivalent to life sentence — Relevance.

R v Whitby (2010) 11.139

Sentence — Sexual offences — Indecent assault on adult — Availability of service of sentence by means of home detention — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 61I, 76.

R v Devlin (2015) 21.10

Sentence — Sexual offences — Indecent assault on male — Historic offences — Whether adoption of sentencing approach of former times for present imposition of sentence appropriate.

R v Pemble (2015) 21.76

Sentence — Sexual offences — Long delay between offence and conviction — Application of sentencing practices at time of offence — Flaw in such practices of no relevance.

R v Kennedy (2011) 14.7

Sentence — Stealing offences — Proceeds of thefts spent on gambling — Offender addicted to gambling — Whether addiction of itself will result in lesser sentence — Relevance of addiction to sentencing process — General deterrence — Extends to deterring persons with an addiction — Drug addiction — Relevant factors — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 156.

R v Koulouris (2007) 6.62

Sentence — Offences against Therapeutic Goods Act 1989 (Cth) — Relevant factors — General deterrence — Self-regulatory nature of statutory regime — Requirement of commercial self-control and overriding of profit-making obligations — Interests of particular creditors — Outweighed by public interest — Therapeutic Goods Act 1989 (Cth), s 42 — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), s 16A.

R v Comax-Pharma Pty Ltd (2008) 7.288

Sentence — Victim impact statement — Statutory restriction on contents of such statement — Statement exceeding such restriction — Admissibility — Prosecution's responsibility to ensure valid statement prepared — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 26.

R v Qin (No 2) (2008) 7.196

Sentence — Whether charge should be dismissed without a conviction being recorded — Statutory list of factors to be considered — Trivial nature of offence one factor — Factors disjunctive and non-exhaustive — Non-trivial offence — Effect — Imprisonment — Not appropriate where offender acted honestly but with an unreasonably mistaken belief — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 9, 10(1)(a), 10(3).

R v Jones (2008) 6.362

Sentencing — Maliciously inflicting grievous bodily harm — Failure of a person with parental responsibility to provide care — Vulnerability of victim — No aggravating element where encompassed in offence itself — Judicial sentencing statistics — Of little use in cases of child abuse — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 35(1)(b), 43A(2) — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3A, 5, 21A(2)(j), 21A(2)(k), 21A(2)(not 1), 22.

R v Cockburn 4.6

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

Sentencing — Offender already serving sentence for another offence — Requirement that sentence be cumulative — Unfortunate but necessary consequences of requirement.

R v Burrows 4.52

Sentencing — Relevant factors — Functions of a victim impact statement — Attempted robbery — Circumstance where attempt can qualify for standard non-parole period of imprisonment — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), Pt 4, Div 1A, Item 11.

R v Drew 5.198

Sexual offences — Offence of sexual intercourse without consent — Evidence of the accused's self-induced intoxication at time of commission of alleged offence — Such evidence not to be taken into account — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 428B, 428D.

R v Petersen (2008) 6.283

Special pleas — Autrefois acquit — Relevant principles — Facts and elements of two counts the same — Plea valid — Prior acquittal by jury following judge's direction — Sufficient to found plea — Statutory procedure referable to plea — Nature of plea not altered — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 90.

R v Vincent 1.11

Statutory mandated special hearing — Legislative purpose — Application for stay — Effect of — Grounds for application — Delay prejudicing defence of mental illness — Loss of ability to prove defence — Loss must be real likelihood — Mental Health (Criminal Procedure) Act 1990 (NSW), s 19.

R v Cunningham 1.101

Traffic offence — Exceed speed limit — Use of speed camera — Approved speed measuring device — Certificate as to reliability of device — Information recorded on photograph — Statutory evidentiary presumptions — Not maintainable if evidence to the contrary — Effect of such evidence on prosecution's ability to prove charge — Required strength of contrary evidence — Road Transport (Safety and Traffic Management) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 46, 47.

R v Baldock 3.328

Victim's Compensation — Victims Compensation Tribunal — Appeals to District Court — Whether the District Court has power to deal with an issue of costs of the original proceedings before the Tribunal — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 39.

Turner v VCFC (No 2) 4.28

Victims compensation — Victims Compensation Tribunal — Appeals to District Court on questions of law — Circumstances constituting question of law — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 39, Sch 2, cl 12(1).

Lynch v Victims Compensation Fund Corporation (2012) 14.42

Victims compensation — When available — Prior award to victim of workers compensation for injury — Whether claim for victims compensation thereby precluded — Victims Compensation and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 30(3)(a)(ii).

Saleh v Victims Compensation Fund Corporation (2012) 15.355

Victims compensation — When available — Victim's past criminal conduct — Prevention thereby of award of compensation — Requirement of reasonable,

CRIMINAL LAW — continued

temporal connection of such conduct with victim's injury — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 30(1)(a).

Lynch v Victims Compensation Fund Corporation (2012) 14.42

Witnesses — Competence and compellability — Children of tender years — Whether compellable to give evidence in trial of father — Relevant factors — Finding children not compellable to give evidence — Whether children thereby “unavailable” to give evidence — Tender of person's prior representation — Whether such evidence “given” by person — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 18, 65, Dictionary, Pt 2, cl 4, 4(1)(g).

R v B.O. (No 2) (2012) 15.317

CUSTOMS AND EXCISE

Customs offences — Importing prohibited imports — Mental element of offence — Accused's intention to import narcotic drugs must be proved — Customs Act 1901 (Cth), s 233B(1)(b) — Customs Code Act 1995 (Cth), s 5.6.

R v Ismail 1.89

DAMAGES

Actions for breach of contract — Measure of damages — Proof of loss — Onus of establishing assessable damages — Methods of satisfying onus — Reliable evidence of loss available — Consequence of failing to provide such evidence.

Macquarie Corporate Telecommunications Pty Ltd v Oakford Australia Pty Ltd 1.301

Application of s 151Z of Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW) — Right of contribution not created thereby — Amount of contribution only adjusted if contribution was recoverable — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW) s 151Z.

Cook v Aircare Moree Pty Ltd 5.142

Assessment — Action in negligence for personal injuries — Claim for future domestic services — Statutory threshold for claim for gratuitous provision of such services — Need for provision of such services in future — Gratuitous provision not to be assumed — Claim should be addressed without regard to statutory threshold — Insurance against loss of income — Relevance to assessment of damages — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 15.

Juric v Transformex Pty Ltd (2007) 6.224

Breach of contract — Remoteness of damages — Causation — Foreseeability of damage — Relevant principles.

ING Bank (Australia) Ltd v Australia City Finance Pty Ltd 2.336

Contract — Breach causing distress and inconvenience — Whether non-economic loss — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3, 16.

Patel v Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal (NSW) and Malaysian Airlines Australia (2010) 10.304

Contract — Breach — Measure of damages — Purchase of allegedly defective aircraft — Purchase in foreign currency — Appropriate exchange rate.

DAMAGES — continued

- Byers v Frith and Others (No 2) (2017)* 25.89
- Contract — Remoteness — Breach — Measure of damages — Contract to supply enjoyment and relaxation — Damages for pain and suffering — Whether damages for distress and disappointment resulting from breach additionally recoverable — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3, 16.
- Young v Insight Vacations Pty Ltd (2009)* 8.369
- Exemplary damages — May be awarded for fraudulent misrepresentation — Assessment — Relevant factors.
- BB Motor Sport Pty Ltd v Dibella* 1.118
- Exemplary damages — Party vicariously liable for assault by another party — Whether liable to pay exemplary damages.
- Kassem v ACN 075092232 Pty Ltd (in liq) (Formerly known as Australian Event Protection Pty Ltd) (2009)* 9.340
- Exemplary or punitive damages — Action in tort for damages for breach of duty to act in good faith — Workers compensation insurer's conduct towards its insured's worker — Circumstances when exemplary damages may be awarded.
- Garcia v CGU Workers Compensation Pty Ltd* 3.135
- General principles — Aggravated and exemplary damages — Reasons for such awards — Differences — Proper pleading of claim for exemplary damages.
- Makri v New South Wales (2015)* 20.276
- General principles — Damages at large — Exemplary damages — Action for assault against nightclub and its employee — Justification for damages at large — No award of exemplary damages against employee — Whether nightclub liable for such damages.
- Smith v Cheeky Monkeys Restaurant (2009)* 9.241
- General principles — Exemplary damages — Entitlement to — Police policy inconsistent with statutory legal requirements — Enunciation of policy in contumelious disregard of person's rights — Requirement of censure by award of exemplary damages.
- Smith v New South Wales (2016)* 22.148
- General principles — Statutory defence — Contribution of serious offence by person to that person's injury — Application of defence — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 51, 54.
- Rook v New South Wales (2014)* 19.329
- Injured worker proceeding against employer and occupier of work site — Assessment of damages — Part 5 of the Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW) — Applicable to deemed workers as well as to employees — Statutory formula to ascertain damages recoverable against person other than employer — Steps to be followed to give effect to and apply formula — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 151G, 151Z(2).
- Boric v Vujinovic* 4.336
- Measure of damages — Breach of statutory warranty — Cost of rectifying defective work due to breach — Whether recoverable as damages — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), s 18D.
- Abrahams v Degan (2009)* 10.99

DAMAGES — continued

Measure of damages — False imprisonment — Relevant factors — Extent of victim's loss of dignity, liberty and sense of personal security.

Moran v New South Wales (2017) **24.146**

Measure of damages — Personal injuries — Gratuitous services — Statutory limit to charges — Service provided for injured person's inability to carry out physical work — Not affected by statutory restriction — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 15.

Tillman v Kelso Australia Pty Ltd (2008) **8.48**

Measure of damages — Personal injuries — Loss of earning capacity — Measure of damages — Transport accident legislation — Medical Assessment Service's certificate — Relevance — Weight — Pre-existing injury — Effect on rate of discount for vicissitudes of life.

Baker v Smith Snack Food Company Ltd (2009) **8.236**

Measure of damages — Personal injuries — Statutory mechanism for calculating damages — Excluded where intentional act constituting "other sexual misconduct" — Scope of exclusion — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 3B(1)(a).

Lee v Fairbrother (2009) **9.164**

Measure of damages — Personal injuries — Transport accident legislation — Referral of medical dispute to Motor Accident Authority — Application to court for further referral — Jurisdiction of court — Scope of jurisdiction — Discretionary power of court to order further referral — Exercise of power — Necessary factor — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 62(1).

Bouveng v Bolton (2009) **8.248**

Measure of — Personal injuries — Motor vehicle accident — Statutory compensation — Claim for future economic loss — Diminished earning capacity — Greater income post-accident than pre-accident — Appropriate to assess damages for claim by way of buffer — Nil percentage adjustment — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 126.

Ilic v O'Connor **2.259**

Mitigation — Action in tort — Failure to mitigate — Landlord's claim in negligence for losses due to fire damage to leased premises — Repairs not undertaken due to lack of funds — Landlord's failure to insure premises — Whether failure to insure constituted failure to mitigate damage — Effect on claim for loss of rent for period after premises again lettable if repaired promptly.

Liang v Greene by her tutor the NSW Trustee Guardian (2013) **16.333**

Motor vehicle accident — Transport accident legislation — Statutory compensation — Medical and hospital expenses — Admission of liability by third party insurer — Consequent statutory obligation on insurer to pay for injured person's medical expenses — Whether obligation enforceable — Subsequent refusal of insurer to indemnify owner or driver of motor vehicle — Whether admission of liability affected — Scope of insurer's duty to make medical payments — Motor Accident Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 81, 83.

Carters v New South Wales (2009) **10.90**

Personal injuries — Costs of administration of affairs of plaintiff — Difference between "life expectancy" and probable survival of an injured plaintiff —

DAMAGES — continued

Relevance of provision of good care of plaintiff enabled by damages award — Circumstances where prospective life tables can be used to determine future fund management charges for plaintiff's verdict.

Peak v Dunleavy (No 2) (2008) 8.74

Personal injuries — Measure of damages — Interest on past wage loss in action by former employee against employer — Statutory restriction on award of interest — Scope of restriction — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151M.

Aldridge v Marr Contracting Pty Ltd (No 2) (2013) 18.220

Personal injuries — Measure of damages — Objections to claim for past out of pocket expenses — Consequences of non-identification of challenged expenses — Claim for damages for future care — Vicissitudes of normal aging process — Effect — Failure of parties to make submissions as to quantum of damages — Associated problems.

Murko v Greenfields Narellan Holdings and Another (2015) 21.27

Personal injuries — Pecuniary damage — Physiotherapy expenses — Whether recoverable — relevant factors.

Meimaropoulos v Cheum and Others (2014) 18.119

Tort — Exemplary and aggravated damages — Claim by offender in custody — Statutory limitation to claim for damages by such person — Whether limitation applied to claim for exemplary and aggravated damages — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3, 3B, 21, 26A, 26B, 26C.

Corby v New South Wales (2009) 8.381

Tort — Negligence — Measure of damages — Action against solicitor — Deductibility of specific benefits — Entitlement to future workers compensation payments — Percentage of risk of loss in notional common law action against employer — Reduction of damages for such risk — Deduction of workers compensation future entitlements to be made before reduction.

Sutton v Firth (No 2) (2009) 8.253

DEFAMATION

Action for — Identification of plaintiff — Action by person named in allegedly defamatory publication — Relevant principles as to identification.

Zoef v Nationwide News Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 21.149

Action for — Particulars — Practice of ordering verified particulars — Uncommon practice — Circumstances where such order unjustified.

Moses v New South Wales (No 2) (2009) 9.48

Action for — Pleadings — Pre-trial proceedings — Application for summary dismissal — No identification of publication by applicant in pleadings or particulars of claim — Dismissal of proceedings appropriate — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 13.4(1).

Wayne v The Owners Corporation SP64622 and Others (No 3) (2015) 21.97

Actions for — Defences — Absolute privilege — Scope of privilege in respect to potential witnesses.

DEFAMATION — continued

- Stanizzo v Sassu and Others* (2014) 18.282
- Actions for — Defences — Pleadings — Nuances or shades of meaning defence — Whether now available at common law — Allegation parliamentarian's overseas study trip dubious — Capacity of allegation to be defamatory.
- Fierravanti-Wells v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd (No 3)* (2011) 13.307
- Actions for — Defences — Statutory defence of triviality — Application — Relevant principles — Circumstance where defence cannot apply — Assessment of damages — Relevant principles — Determination of level of moral opprobrium likely to be felt over certain allegations — Fear of repetition of defamatory publication — Whether fear should be taken into account in award of damages where it has not become a reality — Aggravated compensatory damages — Whether such damages warranted — Relevant factors — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), ss 13, 46A.
- Hennessy v Lynch (No 3)* (2007) 6.247
- Actions for — Discovery and interrogatories — Applications for — Appropriate time for such applications — Restrictions on such applications — Identification of fishing expedition application.
- Stanizzo v Sassu and Others* (2014) 18.282
- Actions for — Interrogatories — Use of interrogatories in defamation proceedings — Order for administration of interrogatories — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 22.1.
- Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another (No 2)* (2015) 21.140
- Actions for — Pleadings — Application to strike out imputations — Allegation that communication of defamatory material to one person only — Whether sufficient — Repeated failures to follow court's orders over pleadings and particularisation of allegations — Effect — No mention of plaintiff in material allegedly defamatory — Whether action in defamation available — Test — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 60.
- Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 3)* (2013) 18.385
- Actions for — Pleadings — Defences — Qualified privilege — Separate defence to defence of justification — Requirement that it be specifically pleaded and particularised if relied on.
- Photi v Target Australia Pty Ltd (No 3)* (2008) 6.340
- Actions for — Pleadings — Imputations — Proceedings before trial — Whether alleged defamatory language merely vulgar — Capacity of "pernicious boofhead" to defame — Addition of descriptive words in pleading — Usefulness — Whether two pleaded imputations the same — Relevant test — Whether reference to Bible lessened defamatory capacity of pleaded imputations — Expression of defamatory material in sensational, tabloid style — Relevance to application to strike out application.
- Gaynor v Burns (No 2)* (2015) 21.286
- Actions for — Pleadings — Imputations — Requirement of precision — Greater degree of precision in written publication in comparison to evanescent and transient publications — Use of word "evil" — Whether sufficiently specific — Whether permissible where description of precise conduct of person allegedly defamed part of publication — Method of reading internet publications potential concern of courts.

DEFAMATION — continued

- Tabbaa v DailyMail.com Australia Pty Ltd (2015)* 21.189
- Actions for — Pleadings — Imputations — Use of the word “seedy” — Whether word ambiguous or of indeterminate meaning.
- Renshaw v Reed Business Information Pty Ltd (2013)* 16.38
- Actions for — Pleadings — Practice — Application for leave to amend statement of claim — Effect of amendment to negate statutory defence relied on by defendant — Exercise of court’s discretionary power to allow amendment — Negation of significant statutory defence relevant factor — Other relevant factors — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 26 — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 58(2)(b)(vii), 64(2).
- Ahmed v Nationwide News Pty Limited (2010)* 11.396
- Actions for — Pleadings — Statement of Claim — Amendment application — Relevant principles — Pleading of contextual imputations in defence — Adoption of such imputations by way of amendment to Statement of Claim — Unsettled state of law.
- Petty v Zhao (No 2) (2015)* 20.52
- Actions for — Pleadings — Statement of claim — Internet postings — Requirements for pleading of publication — Consequences of internet publications for members of community.
- Elliott v Tomkins (2014)* 18.242
- Actions for — Pleadings — Statement of claim — Practice and procedure — Late application for leave to amend by adding new causes of action against new parties as defendants — Collateral purpose of enabling application for leave to bring defamation claim against those parties — Whether application abuse of process — Determination of late amendment application in defamation actions — Relevant principles — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 65(2)(c).
- Hughes v ISPT Pty Ltd (No 3) (2010)* 12.63
- Actions for — Practice and procedure — Principle of proportionality — Lack of development at common law — Application under statute — Relevant factors — Effect — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56-62, 67.
- Ghosh v TCN Channel Nine Pty Ltd and Others (No 4) (2014)* 19.38
- Actions for — Practice — Application for default judgment — Appropriateness.
- Ghosh v Miller and Others (No 2) (2013)* 17.237
- Actions for — Practice — Application for leave to bring claim outside limitation period — Proper time to apply — Repetition on website of alleged defamatory matter in newspaper and on television — Whether limitation period for action for newspaper and television publications thereby extended — Availability of defamatory material on Internet — Necessity for downloading of material for publication of such material — Refusal of application — Relevant circumstances.
- Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 2) (2013)* 17.358
- Actions for — Practice — Application for transfer of proceedings from District Court to Supreme Court — Multiple actions over similar material in different courts — Courts’ response — Impact of electronic publication on legislation and case management principles.
- Tabbaa v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd (2015)* 20.393
- Actions for — Practice — Costs — Failure to comply with timetable for

DEFAMATION — continued

submissions — Consequences.

Renshaw v Reed Business Information Pty Ltd (2013) 16.38

Actions for — Practice — Electronic defamation — Complexities.

Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 2) (2013) 17.358

Actions for — Practice — Leave to discontinue proceedings — Application for such leave — Whether imposition of terms for such leave permissible — Statutory requirement for leave for commencement of further defamation proceedings — Scope of provision — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 23 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 12.1.

M v Public Guardian (2017) 25.398

Actions for — Practice — Pre-trial proceedings — Application for reinstatement of previously struck out defence of justification — Requirements for reinstatement — No provision of particulars of proposed defence — Status of unparticularised defence — Defendant's application for discovery prior to provision of particulars of defence of justification — Whether permissible — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 25.

Rothe v Scott (No 2) (2015) 21.82

Actions for — Statements amounting to defamation — Defamatory imputations — Meaning of “callous” — Imputations of “swindle” and “con” — Circumstances requiring pleading of such imputations in the alternative — Whether “ratbag” merely term of vulgar abuse — Difference between “ratbag” and “callous” — Whether reference in pleading to previously pleaded defamatory material defective — Relevant circumstances — Necessity for pleading of nature of any loss from defamatory publication — Publication by means of internet — Requirement of provision of particulars of downloading.

Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 20.42

Actions for — Trial — Whether evidence by plaintiff necessary.

Rothe v Scott (No 3) (2016) 23.54

Assessment of damages — Mitigation — Plea of bad reputation — Determination of plea — Relevant principles — Effect on person's reputation of his or her daily good or bad deeds — Previous or contemporaneous defamatory publications by others — Effect on assessment of damages — Relevant principles — Principle of isolation — Effect of application of principle — Effect if isolation not possible — Aggravated compensatory damages — Circumstances when award of such damages appropriate — Assessment — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 34 — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 46A.

Martin v Bruce (2007) 6.157

Costs — Indemnity costs — Party unreasonably failing to make settlement offer — “Walk-away” offer made at end of hearing — Such offer not to be considered — Whether such offer constituted true compromise — Statutory direction for court to have regard to conduct of parties in awarding costs — Scope of direction — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), ss 40(1), 40(2)(a).

Larach v Urriola (No 2) (2009) 9.81

Costs — Statutory rules on costs — Defendant's “walk away” offer of settlement of action for defamation and other causes of action — Weight to be attached to offer — Nature of settlement offer referred to in statute — Complaints over failure to discover in defamation proceedings — Possible

DEFAMATION — continued

explanations for failure — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 40.

Moses v State of New South Wales (No 4) (2010) 12.69

Damages — Assessment — Mitigation — Offer of apology — Effect of later defence of truth — Publication on social media — Relevance of grapevine effect — Spurious defence of truth — Effect.

Mickle v Farley (2013) 18.51

Defence of justification — Application to strike out proceedings as abuse of process — Relevant principles — Reliance only on tender of documentary evidence to assist defence — Rare to prevent plaintiff from proceeding to trial in such circumstances.

Foley v Radford 3.310

Defences — Absolute privilege — Action against State for alleged defamation — Claim that police officers defamed plaintiffs — Defence of qualified, but not absolute, privilege available to such claim.

Lassanah v New South Wales (2009) 8.343

Defences — Absolute privilege — Statutory and common law defence — Whether defence applicable to Guardianship Tribunal of New South Wales — Scope of common law defence — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 27 — Guardianship Act 1987 (NSW), s 74.

Vescio v Guardianship Tribunal of New South Wales (2009) 10.83

Defences — Holding defence — Whether necessity for such defence — Relevant circumstances.

Stanizzo v Sassu and Others (2014) 18.282

Defences — Jury trial — Offer of amends — Reasonableness of offer — Whether issue for judge or jury to decide — Self-publication issue — Whether determinable by judge or by jury — Legislative change to constitution of cause of action in defamation — Effect on relevance of imputations to issue of defamatory meaning — Role of jury in determination of defamatory meaning of imputations — Determination of issue of damages — Suggested legislative reform — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 18.

Hunt v Radio 2SM Pty Ltd (No 2) (2010) 10.240

Defences — Justification — Improper pleading — Request for particulars of defence — Refusal of request — Whether striking out defence appropriate.

Rothe v Scott (2015) 20.251

Defences — Offer of amends — Acceptance of offer only after its withdrawal — Whether defence still applicable — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 18(1)(b).

Zoef v Nationwide News Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 21.149

Defences — Offer of amends — Parties to be ordered to participate in mediation.

Hunt v Radio 2SM Pty Ltd (No 4) (2010) 10.333

Defences — Offer of amends — Whether determination of reasonableness of offer by judge or by jury — Proper time for determination of offer of amends defence — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), ss 18, 22.

Louise v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2015) 20.93

Defences — Privilege — Absolute privilege — Statutory defence for publication of complaint to New South Wales Medical Board — No such defence at

DEFAMATION — *continued*

common law — Common law defence of qualified privilege — Dismissal of cause of action for defamation — Effect on cause of action for injurious falsehood — Principles of coherence — Application — Whether statutory immunity impliedly repealed statutory action of misleading or deceptive conduct — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 27, Sch 1, cl 15 — Medical Practice Act 1987 (NSW), s 47 — Fair Trading Act 1987 (NSW), s 42.

Lucire v Parmegiani (2010) 10.364

Defences — Qualified privilege — Application — Damages — Assessment — Relevant principles — Modes of publication — Poster read by non-English speaking community — Likelihood of greater readership than a newspaper — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 22.

Huynh v Tang 2.321

Defences — Truth and public benefit — Standard of proof — Qualified privilege — Occasion of — Circumstances when defence available — Publication in newspaper and printed in non-English language and distributed to speakers of that language — Statutory defence of qualified privilege — Available where not all recipients have interest in receiving information containing defamatory material — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), ss 20, 22 — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 140.

Lee v Kim 1.174

Defendant making no submissions as to the imputations pleaded and their defamatory meaning — Imputation pleaded should be struck out only in a clear case — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 7A.

Foley v Radford 3.310

Limitation period — Application for leave to bring proceedings within additional two-year period — Such proceedings, with leave, only to be commenced by Statement of Claim — Statutory provision permitting defective originating process to constitute commencement of proceedings — Not relevant where no proper originating process filed at all — Exercise of discretion to extend limitation period — Effect of delay in defamation proceedings — Applicant's prior decision not to commence action — Such decision will weigh against favourable exercise of discretion — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 14B, 56A — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 4(3), 44(1), 53 — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 63(3) — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 1, r 4(1), Pt 5 r 6(1)(a).

Dehsabzi v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd (2007) 6.68

Parties — Defences — Comment — Whether necessary to join journalists employed by defendant television broadcaster — Poorly particularised defence — Strike out application — Such application granted only in clearest of circumstances — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 31(4)(b).

Rodgers v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd (No 2) (2008) 8.157

Parties — Who may sue — Corporations — Relevant principles — Challenges to imputations — General principles — Challenges to form and capacity of imputations pleaded by company — Relevant principles.

Australian Chinese Community Association of New South Wales Ltd v Pun and Others (2017) 24.251

Pleading — Legislative change as to what constitutes a cause of action in defamation — Consequent need for caution to be exercised in determining challenges to sufficiency of precision with which imputations are pleaded —

DEFAMATION — continued

Circumstances where some degree of specificity in such pleading required — Whether inconsistent imputations can be pleaded — Problems in defamation actions involving erroneous identification — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 8 — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 9(2) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56(1).

Holmes v TCN Channel Nine Ltd 4.394

Pleading — Objection to pleaded imputations — Imputations conveying both a condition and an act — Such imputations can differ in substance.

Moran v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2007) 6.10

Pleading of imputation — Imputation alleged to arise from word having graduations of meaning or different meanings — Circumstances where more precise pleading of all imputations from word not necessary — Means of avoiding ambiguity.

Clarke v Melbourne University Publishing Ltd 5.308

Pleading of imputation — Pleading exact words used by defendant — Language used includes word with more than one meaning — Plaintiff not obliged to nominate meaning — Current general usage of words, including slang expressions — Juries familiar with such words — No obligation to restate them in “legal English”.

Hertzberg v McLeod 4.71

Pleading of imputations — Pithy publication — Whether pleading exact words used in publication permissible — Whether publication holding plaintiff up to ridicule can be defamatory — Relevant principles — Whether imputation that “the plaintiff is ridiculous” should be struck out as being a rhetorical imputation.

O’Hara v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd 5.298

Pleading — Whether imputation containing actual words used can be pleaded — No rule against such practice — Circumstances when need to distil meaning different to language actually used lessened — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW).

Kutasi v Melbourne University Publishing Ltd (t/a Melbourne University Press) 4.56

Pleadings — Defences — Consent — Whether malice relevant to defence — Whether malice arising from mere pleading possible — Whether plaintiff’s sighting of defamatory matter and subsequent express consent for its publication necessary elements of defence — Involvement of contractual obligations not element of defence — Whether minority of plaintiff relevant to reliance of defence of consent — Principles relevant to defence of consent and its application.

Arman v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2017) 25.358

Pleadings — Imputations — Brevity of material — Not relevant to number of imputations pleaded if each capable of arising therefrom — Imputation of unfairness — Imprecision of “unfair” — Not important where conduct capable of conveying such imputation — Loose words used in promotional trailer for television program — Whether contained matter capable of conveying particular imputations — Wide degree of latitude required to be given as trailer designed to give hints to audience.

Rodgers v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd 5.190

Pleadings — Imputations — Requirement of precision — Use of “racial inferiority” — Whether ambiguous.

DEFAMATION — continued

- Carey v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2014)* 18.295
- Pleadings — Innuendo — Plea of true innuendo — Relevant principles.
- Freeburn v The Cake Decorators Association of NSW Inc and Others (No 2) (2014)* 19.232
- Pleadings — Statement of Claim — Website publication — Desirability of provision of date and place of downloading of publication, together with “relationship” of downloading persons.
- Cavric v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2015)* 20.193
- Pleadings — Striking out of imputation with leave to replead — Whether estoppel thereby raised — Proceedings involving plea of justification — Advisability of early retirement of jury for consideration of plaintiff’s imputations.
- Fierravanti-Wells v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd (No 3) (2011)* 13.307
- Practice and procedure — Application for jury trial — Court’s discretionary power to order trial without jury — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Whether Senate report a “record” — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), ss 21(1), 21(3).
- Fierravanti-Wells v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd (2010)* 11.83
- Practice and procedure — Application for jury trial — Jury requisition procedure — Failure to comply with procedure — Dismissal of application — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), ss 21(2)(a), 21(2)(b) — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 76A — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 29.2, Sch 1, Pt 3, cl 4.
- Bristow v Adams (2010)* 10.261
- Practice and procedure — Conduct of proceedings — Parties represented by experienced practitioners — Care required before court imposed its views on conduct of litigation.
- Creighton v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2010)* 11.271
- Practice and procedure — Discovery and interrogatories — Inadequacies and limitation of discovery process — Necessity of service of notice for retention of documentation — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 21.1, 21.3.
- Cavric v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2015)* 20.193
- Practice and procedure — Notice of Intention to Elect Trial by Jury — Application to strike out notice — Grounds for striking out notice — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 58(2).
- Allen v Lloyd-Jones (No 3) (2010)* 10.256
- Practice and procedure — Pre-trial proceedings — Application for discovery — Action by minor — Deferral of application — Whether order for exchange of witness statements appropriate — Relevant factors — Necessity for sensitivity of courts towards needs of vulnerable litigants such as children and youths.
- Mossmani v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2017)* 25.45
- Practice and procedure — Referral of proceeding to mediation — Benefits of mediation.
- Rothe v Scott (2015)* 20.251
- Practice — Defamation list — Concurrent holdings of such list by Supreme and

DEFAMATION — continued

District Courts — Requirement of consequential change of practitioners' conduct towards each other.

Carey v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2014) 18.295

Pre-trial proceedings — Application to join journalists to meet defence of comment — Expiry of limitation period — Success in such application difficult — Refusal of application — Relevant circumstances — Effect on freedom of speech if journalists made defendants where comment pleaded — Application refused.

Creighton v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2010) 11.271

Pre-trial proceedings — Imputations — Defences — Contextual truth — Plaintiffs' application for leave to plead back contextual imputations — Whether application abuse of process — Refusal of application because of abuse of process only in exceptional circumstances — Conflict of judicial opinion on interpretation of statute not exceptional circumstance — Whether Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW) supported refusal of application — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW) ss 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 26.

Creighton v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2010) 11.271

Pre-trial proceedings — Striking out defences — Relevant principles — Application for summary judgment where poorly drafted but sufficiently particularised defence.

Elliott v Tomkins (2014) 18.242

Pre-trial proceedings — Summary dismissal — Proportionality principle — Application of principle in defamation actions — Relevant factors.

Freeburn v The Cake Decorators Association of NSW Inc and Others (No 2) (2014) 19.232

Proceedings set down for hearing as a jury trial — Application to dispense with jury — Limited rights of appeal against jury verdict — No reason, without more, to dispense with jury — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 21 — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 126, 127.

Matthews v Banning (2008) 6.366

Publication — Identification — Plaintiffs not named in alleged defamatory publication — Means of proof of identification — Elements of tort — Defence of qualified privilege — Elements of defence.

Webster v Coles Myer Ltd (2009) 9.123

Relevant principles — Pleading cause of action in defamation — Relevant principles.

Keramaniakis v Wagstaff 3.1

Section 7A trial — Trial by jury — Directions to jury — Whether directions should include Skaf warning — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 7A.

Dehsabzi v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd (No 4) (2008) 8.175

Statement amounting to defamation — Statement that person was previously bankrupt — Imputation to be left to jury — Distinction between employer being unethical and employee lacking ethics for working for that employer — Comparison of person to Osama Bin Laden — Imputation arising therefrom — Degree of specificity required in pleading such imputation.

Hennessy v Lynch (No 2) 3.293

DEFAMATION — continued

Statements amounting to defamation — Imputations — Capacity of matters complained of to convey pleaded imputations — Whether test generous — Television broadcast — Use of “condone” — Whether ambiguous term.

Tabbaa v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd (2015) 20.393

Statements amounting to defamation — Imputations — Defamatory capacity of imputations — Determination — Relevant principles — Pleading of text of allegedly defamatory matter — Whether appropriate.

Cavric v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2015) 20.193

Trial — Discharge of jury — Application for — Relevant principles — Matter of last resort — Costs of application — Relevant principle.

Hunt v Radio 2SM Pty Ltd (No 4) (2010) 10.333

Trial — Practice — Election for jury — No payment of jury fee accompanying election for jury — Effect — Payment in open court unnecessary — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 21(2) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 29.2.

Palavi v Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Limited (2012) 14.32

DISTRICT COURT

Appeal from Children’s Court — Costs order — Such appeals within District Court’s statutory appellate jurisdiction — No costs order to be made by Children’s Court unless exceptional circumstances exist justifying such order — Solicitor’s client’s impecuniosity not such a circumstance — Matters which may constitute exceptional circumstances — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 88, 91(1).

Department of Community Services v SP 4.113

Appeal from Consumer Tenancy and Trader Tribunal — Appeal limited to question of law — Whether denial of natural justice a question of law — Jurisdiction of District Court to grant relief in nature of a prerogative writ — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 30, 35, 65, 67 — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 44.

Lazic v Pacey (2009) 9.24

Appeal from Local Court — Refusal by Local Court to grant annulment of conviction — Grounds of appeal — Appellant convicted in his absence — Failure to attend court because of confusion over hearing date — Whether “hindered by misadventure” — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 4, 8(2)(b), 11A, 14, 16A.

Boulghourgian v Ryde City Council (2008) 8.314

Appeal from Victims Compensation Tribunal — Appeal on question of law — Extent of court’s powers.

T v Victims Compensation Fund 3.31

Appeal to Court of Criminal Appeal — Appeal from interlocutory judgment — Application for issue of certificate — Relevant factors — Criminal Appeal Act 1912 (NSW), ss 5F(3AA), 5F(3AB).

R v Veitch (No 2) (2012) 15.152

Appeal to — Statutory appeals — Appeal limited to question with respect to

DISTRICT COURT — continued

matter of law — Finding related to fact finding process — Not matter of law — Finding made in exercise of discretion on procedural matter — Not matter of law — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 65, 67.

Strangas and Son Building Contractors Pty Ltd v Lim (2012) 14.222

Claim for account — No specific rule for taking an account — Court can still determine how account to be taken.

Hadfield v Commonwealth Bank of Australia 1.41

Hearing of criminal trial vacated on Crown's application — Court lacked power to order Crown to pay accused's costs thrown away by adjournment — Court had power to stay proceedings to prevent abuse of process — Power could be used to enable accused to be reimbursed for costs by Crown — Circumstances justifying exercise of power.

Hufnagl v Director of Public Prosecutions (Cth) 5.159

Jurisdiction — Amount — Additional jurisdiction where no objection taken to amount claimed exceeding court's jurisdictional limit — Methods of claiming amount sought — Claim for interest — Statutory restriction — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 18, 44, 51, 100.

Lucas v Tubrule Pty Ltd (No 2) (2010) 11.6

Jurisdiction — Amount — Claim under Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW) — Value of asset pool greater than District Court's jurisdictional limit — Property adjustment order sought less than such limit — Whether District Court empowered to hear claim — Need for law reform over monetary jurisdictional limits to such claims — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 51 — Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW), s 20.

Sammons v Eykelenkamp (2011) 12.206

Jurisdiction — Amount — Extended jurisdiction — Requirement for such jurisdiction to exist — Claim for amount in excess of monetary jurisdictional limit to be unambiguous — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 51(1).

Richards v Cornford (2009) 8.353

Jurisdiction and powers — Appeal to — From Children's Court — Children's Court's finding that child in need of care and protection — Whether finding appealable — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 71D, 72, 92.

GA v Director General, Department of Human Services and Others (2011) 12.324

Jurisdiction and powers — Application by former female partner of mother of artificially conceived child for order substituting her name as child's parent in place of name of child's biological father — Court's lack of jurisdiction to so order — Births, Deaths and Marriages Registration Act 1995 (NSW), Sch 3, Pt 4, cl 17(4).

LU v Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages and Another (No 2) (2013) 17.61

Jurisdiction and powers — Lack of power to appoint independent child representative — Practice — Application to alter child's birth certificate — Application unopposed — Whether need for submissions from independent child representative — Relevant circumstances — Method of hearing such submissions — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 66.

DISTRICT COURT — continued

- LU v Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages and Another*
(2013) 17.26
- Jurisdiction — Appeal against assessment of costs ordered to be paid by Local Court — District Court's lack of jurisdiction — Lack of jurisdiction to grant declaratory relief — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 46, 134.
- Legal Employment Consulting and Training Pty Ltd v Patterson*
(2009) 11.101
- Jurisdiction — Appeal against costs assessment under Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW) — Whether District Court empowered to hear such an appeal — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), ss 208L, 208M — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), ss 384, 385, 387, Pt 2 of Sch 9, cll 18, 22, 22A, 34 — Courts and Crimes Legislation Amendment Act 2008 (NSW), Sch 14.
- Nikolaidis v Chippindall (No 1) (2012)* 15.136
- Jurisdiction — Appeal from Children's Court's refusal to grant leave to appear — Whether appeal against such decision lies to District Court — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 91, 98.
- EL & WL v Director-General of the Department of Human Services*
(2010) 11.258
- Jurisdiction — Appeal from Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Want of procedural fairness — Court's jurisdiction to provide remedy — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), s 65.
- Killick v McPherson (2009)* 9.298
- Jurisdiction — Appeal from Local Court — Against conviction for offence under Dangerous Goods Act 1975 (NSW) — Appeal beyond District Court's jurisdiction — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 11 — Dangerous Goods Act 1975 (NSW), s 33 — Industrial Relations Act 1996 (NSW), ss 151A, 179, 188, 191, 197 — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 176.
- Botany Bay City Council v WorkCover Authority (NSW)* 4.178
- Jurisdiction — Appeals from Victims Compensation Tribunal — Extent of Court's powers — Court can deal with issue of costs of proceedings before Tribunal — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 39.
- Turner v VCFC (No 2)* 4.28
- Jurisdiction — Approval of settlement proposal — Proposed order for appointment of a financial management nature — Court lacked jurisdiction to make such order — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 77.
- Smith v NRMA Insurance Australia Ltd (2008)* 8.38
- Jurisdiction — Claim for misleading and deceptive conduct — Whether such action assignable to Common Law Division of Supreme Court in February 1998 — Whether assignment to Equity or Commercial Divisions appropriate — Relevant factors — Whether assignment to a Division exclusive of assignment to another Division — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 44(1)(a) — Supreme Court Rules 1970 (NSW), Pt 12, r 7, Pt 14, r 2.
- Xiang v Ward (2016)* 22.189
- Jurisdiction — Claim for recovery of overpaid rent subsidies — Proceedings in respect of decision of public body — Whether within Court's jurisdiction — Claim for recovery of unpaid occupation fee — Whether within Court's jurisdiction — Scope of Court's equitable jurisdiction — Action for recovery of

DISTRICT COURT — continued

subsidies pursuant to statutory right — Whether within such jurisdiction — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 44(1) — Supreme Court Act 1970 (NSW), ss 53(3C) — Housing Act 2001 (NSW), ss 6(1), 6(4), 6(5), 8(2) — Supreme Court Rules 1970 (NSW), Pt 12, r 6(1)(b), Sch H, Pt 2, para 1(a).

New South Wales Land and Housing Corporation v Quinn (2016) 22.66

Jurisdiction — Claim for unpaid superannuation — Whether jurisdiction over such claim in District Court.

Lavert Pty Ltd v Boyd (2013) 18.203

Jurisdiction — Costs — Application for indemnity costs order against unsuccessful parties' solicitor — Whether grant of such orders within court's jurisdiction — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56(4), 56(5).

Wallace and Another v GWH Build Pty Ltd; GWH Build Pty Ltd and Another v Wallace and Others (No 2) (2016) 23.44

Jurisdiction — Costs order — Interpretation of order — Whether "costs of proceedings" included costs of failed court ordered and conducted mediation — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 73.1.

Wieland v Newcastle City Council (2008) 6.277

Jurisdiction — Costs — Power to determine costs payable under Court of Appeal's order — No such jurisdiction — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 366 — Legal Profession Regulation 2005 (NSW), Pt 3.2, Div 11, reg 125.

Preston v Commissioner for Fair Trading (2012) 14.242

Jurisdiction — Equitable jurisdiction — Dispute over Court's jurisdiction as to equitable claim — No direct authority on issue — Power to remove proceedings to Supreme Court — Scope of power — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 134(1)(h) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 90, 144(2).

Owners Corporation Strata Plan 69470 v Owners Corporation Strata Plan 69948 (No 1) (2017) 25.213

Jurisdiction — Equitable jurisdiction — Distinction between equitable defence and equitable ground of defence — Law Reform (Law and Equity) Act 1972 (NSW), s 6.

Hennessey v Architectus Group Holdings Pty Ltd (2010) 10.200

Jurisdiction — Equitable jurisdiction — Need for legislative reform — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 4(1), 44(1), 134 — Supreme Court Act 1970 (NSW), s 53.

Owners Corporation SP 69106 v Impression Developer Pty Ltd (2015) 20.130

Jurisdiction — Equitable jurisdiction — Whether inclusive of determination of "Declaration of Right".

Hewit v Galletta (2017) 25.120

Jurisdiction — Ex officio indictment — Court's power to make appropriate orders to prevent abuse of process resulting from such indictments.

R v Ansari 4.1

Jurisdiction — Imposition of bond on juvenile offender by Children's Court — Breach of bond — Whether District Court's jurisdiction inclusive of consideration of breach of bond — Children (Criminal Proceedings) Act 1987 (NSW), s 33(1)(b) — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3, 94, 98.

DISTRICT COURT — continued

- R v Sharpley (2014)* 19.156
- Jurisdiction — Institution of prosecution for offence under Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW) — Application for order alleged offender appear to answer charge — Requirement for lodgement of statement of facts with application — Content of statement — Effect of inclusion in statement of arguments, conclusions and irrelevant allegations of fact — Jurisdiction of District Court to hear such prosecution proceedings — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 246 — Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW), s 8 — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 53, r 26.
- Inspector Brock v Empire Waste Pty Ltd (2013)* 16.170
- Jurisdiction — Matter previously before Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Dismissal of proceedings by Tribunal due to non-appearance of plaintiff at hearing — Scope of District Court's jurisdiction to hear matter — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 22, 23, 28.
- Khan v Mohammed (2013)* 18.16
- Jurisdiction — Parties — Proceedings by wife against husband and husband's brother — Proceedings for enforcement of deed — Whether proceedings matrimonial cause — Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), s 4(1).
- Patel v Patel and Others (2015)* 19.334
- Jurisdiction — Power to appoint tutor for plaintiff with cognitive impairment due to brain damage — Source of power — Benefits of exercise of power — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 3(1), 58.
- Gergis v Ware (2010)* 10.156
- Jurisdiction — Power to order specific performance — Monetary limit — General equitable jurisdiction — Excluded because of specific grant of jurisdiction — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 134(1).
- Paull v Williams* 1.36
- Jurisdiction — Pre-trial procedure — Claim under Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth) — Whether more appropriate for such claim, if brought in Supreme Court, to be assigned to Commercial Law Division — Relevant factors — If so, no jurisdiction in District Court to hear claim — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 44(1)(a).
- Mahommed v Unicomb and Others (2016)* 22.373
- Jurisdiction — Proceedings instituted by liquidator — Motion to have receiver conduct proceedings in company's name instead of liquidator — Whether District Court has power to so order — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 9, 44, 134(1)(h).
- Wallis Commercial Interiors Pty Ltd (in liq) v Truecash Pty Ltd (2008)* 7.243
- Jurisdiction — Statutory appeals — Appeal from Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Limited to appeal on question of law — No appeal on ground of denial by Tribunal of procedural fairness — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 65, 67.
- Field and Another v Dettman (2011)* 13.71
- Jurisdiction — Statutory jurisdiction to grant orders in the nature of certiorari and mandamus — Decision of Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Jurisdiction of District Court to grant such relief in respect to Tribunal's

DISTRICT COURT — continued

decisions — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), s 65 — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 44.

Yazbeck and Another v Abreu and Others (2010) 11.43

Jurisdiction — Statutory mandated special hearing — Abuse of process — Inherent/implied power to stay hearing or make other orders — Purpose of exercise of power — Mental Health (Criminal Procedure) Act 1990 (NSW), s 19.

R v Cunningham 1.101

Jurisdiction to hear appeal from Local Court against leniency of sentence — No conviction ordered for offences — Appeal by CEO of Customs — District Court lacked jurisdiction — Customs Act 1901 (Cth), s 248 — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 23.

CEO of Customs v Delacour 5.1

Jurisdiction — Under Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW) — Conditional on ability of administrator of Police Superannuation Fund to make decision under such legislation — Application to administrator for decision on payment of gratuity for operations — No lack of administrator's jurisdiction — Whether equivalent jurisdiction in District Court — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), ss 12D, 21, 57 — Compensation Court Repeal Act 2002 (NSW), s 7(5).

Perrin v SAS Trustee Corporation (2014) 19.193

Jurisdiction — Whether cause of action for damages for breach of Family Court order maintainable in District Court — Compensation order under Privacy Act 1988 (Cth) — Whether within District Court's jurisdiction — Privacy Act 1988 (Cth), s 25.

X v AB Commission and Others (2016) 22.260

Jury trial in defamation proceedings — Strain on court's resources — Supreme Court more suitable venue than District Court.

Hunt v Radio 2SM Pty Ltd (No 4) (2010) 10.333

Practice — Application to adjourn part-heard proceedings — Consequences of granting application — Exceptional circumstances alone should justify such adjournment.

Photi v Target Australia Pty Ltd (No 3) (2008) 6.340

Practice — Contempt — Statutory power to refer person allegedly in contempt of court to Supreme Court — Exercise of power — Relevant principles — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 203.

Mohareb v Palmer and Another (No 4) (2017) 25.60

Practice — Whether appeal against interlocutory decision of Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal should be consolidated with substantive proceedings transferred from Tribunal — Relevant factors.

Scaife v Coceanig (2011) 13.239

Statutory appeals — Appeal against refusal by Local Court to annul convictions — Previous application for annulment of convictions for same offences successful — No application for leave to apply for annulment of subsequent convictions — District Court lacked jurisdiction to hear appeal — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 4, 11A.

McKenzie v The Queen (2010) 10.275

DISTRICT COURT — continued

Statutory appeals — Appeal from Children's Court care order — Whether jurisdiction limited to final care order — Distinction between interim and interlocutory orders of Children's Court — Appeal to District Court from latter order — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 90, 91.

DC v Director General, Department of Family and Community Services and Others (2011) 13.303

Statutory appeals — Appeal from decision of Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal on interlocutory matter — Transfer of substantive proceedings from Tribunal to District Court — Such proceedings to continue in District Court as if instituted there — Whether District Court's jurisdiction to hear appeal thereby lost — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), s 23(1).

Scaife v Coceanig (2011) 13.239

Statutory appeals — Appeal from Local Court — Setting aside of magistrate's decision — Whether finding of error by magistrate necessary beforehand — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 18, 20.

Prodanovski v Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services (2017) 24.227

DUST DISEASES

Dust diseases legislation — Asbestos-related diseases — Rate of compensation — Dependent on time of occurrence of injury — Disease of gradual onset — Deemed time of occurrence — Dependent on nature of occupation to which contraction of disease due — Focus on habitual employment rather than actual processes involved in person's employment — Workers' Compensation (Dust Diseases) Act 1942 (NSW), s 8(3A).

Rooney and Others v Workers' Compensation Dust Diseases Board of NSW (2013) 17.171

Workers' Compensation Dust Diseases Board of New South Wales — Appeal from Board's decision to District Court — Whether Court's jurisdiction original — Scope of orders available on successful appeal — Whether judgment in debt available order against Board — Order of payment of pre-judgment interest by Board — Whether such order possible — Workers' Compensation (Dust Diseases) Act 1942 (NSW), s 81.

Rooney and Others v Workers' Compensation Dust Diseases Board of NSW (No 2) (2014) 18.234

EMPLOYMENT LAW

Contract of employment — Contractual term granting right to annual leave in accordance with legislation — Only State legislation in force when contract made — Such legislation ceased to be operative following Commonwealth Act coming into effect — Whether State Act ceased to be part of contract.

Mason v Citigroup Pty Ltd (2007) 6.203

Contract of service — Existence of — Relevant factors.

Richards v Cornford (2009) 8.353

EMPLOYMENT LAW — continued

Termination of employment — Action for wrongful dismissal — Circumstances justifying summary dismissal — Standard of proof of serious and wilful misconduct — Wilful misconduct — Elements — Condonation of conduct — Relevant circumstances — Whether damages reduced by employee's failure to mitigate loss.

Redman v Verticon Group Ltd (No 2) (2009) 9.6

EQUITY

Equitable charges and liens — Charge over costs ordered by court to be paid to successful party — Whether solicitor holds equitable charge for unpaid fees for acting for such party.

New South Wales v Hamod (2008) 8.152

Equitable remedies — Enforcement of rights — Predicated on equitable lease existing — Proceedings equivalent to making an order for specific performance — Rule in *Walsh v Lonsdale* — Application of rule.

Paull v Williams 1.36

Equitable remedies — Restitution — Recovery of money paid under mistake — Remedy not available where recipient entitled to payment on quantum merit basis.

Field and Another v Dettman (2011) 13.71

ESTOPPEL

Issue estoppel — Anshun estoppel — Application — Relevant factors — Previous proceedings not resolved by judgment — Factor against successful defence of Anshun estoppel — Forgone opportunity to litigate in earlier proceedings — Insufficient, per se, to justify application of Anshun estoppel in later proceedings.

J & K Richards Pty Ltd v Nick Frisina Constructions Pty Ltd (2007) 7.1

Issue estoppel — Identity of issues and parties — Scope of estoppel — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 4, 9A, 65, 66, 74, 151G, 151H, 151IA, 151J — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), ss 61, 65, 66, 74, 105, 314, 326, 350, 351, 352, 368.

Prasad v Health Support Services Pty Ltd (2012) 15.86

Issue estoppel — Identity of issues and parties — Whether State and police officer identical parties — Making of apprehended domestic violence order by Local Court — Whether finding of assault ground for or legally indispensable to such order — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 54 — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 16 — Law Reform (Vicarious Liability) Act 1983 (NSW), s 9B.

Dedula v New South Wales (2017) 25.50

Issue estoppel — Local Court — Judgment inter partes — Decision by Assessor in proceedings where no entitlement to cross-examination — Applicability of doctrine — Whether application of doctrine discretionary — Local Court Act 2007 (NSW), s 39.

ESTOPPEL — continued

- Charafeddine v Morgan (2013)* 16.46
- Issue estoppel — Matters of record — Consent judgment in terms of settlement of dispute “without admission of liability” — Effect of expression — Whether question of issue estoppel amenable of resolution on summary basis — Relevant factors.
- Amor-Smith v Ching (2016)* 22.277
- Issue estoppel — Matters precluding estoppel — Whether finding of estoppel possible from examination of court record alone.
- Smith v New South Wales (2016)* 22.148

EVIDENCE

- Admissibility — Admissions — Exclusion of record of interview — Contravention of rights of protected person in relation to being questioned by police — Scope of rights — Effect of contravention — Whether place of questioning relevant — Questioning of suspects during execution of search warrant — Questioning of suspects in presence of each other — Whether illegal or improper conduct — Whether contravention of protected person’s rights outweighed by value of evidence obtained through contravention — Crimes Act 1914 (Cth), ss 23C(2), 23G — Evidence Act 1995 (Cth), s 138.
- R v Camm (2008)* 7.100
- Admissibility — Admissions — Statutory exclusion from evidence — Circumstances when exclusion applies — No difference whether admissions made in response to directed questions or by way of spontaneous volunteering — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 281.
- R v Afele (2008)* 7.96
- Admissibility — Affidavit evidence — Use of affidavits — Improper practice — Deponent’s lack of personal knowledge of contents of affidavit.
- Marshall v Stacks/Goudkamp Pty Limited (2011)* 12.246
- Admissibility — CCTV footage — Accuracy — Weight to be given to such evidence — Reception of such evidence not to be challenged on ground of it being CCTV footage — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56.
- Alam v Rail Corporation New South Wales (2008)* 8.81
- Admissibility — Charge of armed robbery — Issue of identification — Whether results of facial mapping technique admissible evidence — Expert evidence — Factors relevant to admissibility — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 79, 137.
- R v Alrekabi* 4.292
- Admissibility — Charge of avoiding reporting of cash transactions — Proof required of accused’s knowledge of consequences of transacting cash deposits over \$10,000 — Evidence of 31 prior, uncharged similar transactions — Evidence relevant to state of accused’s knowledge — Discretion to exclude evidence as prejudicial — Discretion not exercised — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 55, 137.
- R v Lee* 2.360
- Admissibility — Charge of manslaughter — Admissions made to police — Not electronically recorded — No reasonable excuse for failure to do so — No

EVIDENCE — continued

questions asked — Admissions volunteered in anticipation of questions — Police made introductory statement as to why they wanted to speak with accused — Tantamount to asking what information the accused could give to them — Accused's utterances inadmissible if official questioning had commenced before they were made — Circumstances made introductory statement by police tantamount to questioning — Official questioning had commenced — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 281.

R v Gow 3.211

Admissibility — Criminal trial — Tender by Crown of Agreed Statement of Facts signed by co-accused containing hearsay evidence — Co-accused present in court but refused to take oath, give evidence or cooperate with prosecution or court — Co-accused thereby an unavailable witness — Document tendered on which co-accused sentenced — Ordinarily against his interests — Admissible, provided representations in it in fact recognised by co-accused — Such documents approached by courts with circumspection — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 65.

R v Tran 5.123

Admissibility — Discretion to exclude — Evidence of conduct consequent upon unlawful arrest — Predominance of prejudicial effect over probative value — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 138(1).

Bennett v The Queen (2015) 19.378

Admissibility — DNA profiling — Identification of article from which DNA sample taken — Circumstances when identification function of jury and not judge — Wisdom of returning article to owner before trial.

R v Green (2008) 8.65

Admissibility — Documents — Business records — Statutory provisions relating to admissibility — Documents prepared by third party for party — Whether part of business records of party — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 69.

Riley v Chubb Security Services Ltd (No 1) (2008) 7.35

Admissibility — Documents — Hearsay — Admissibility under Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) — Statutory requirement of notice of intention to adduce such evidence — No notice given — No explanation for such failure — Dispensation of notice requirement — Significance of omission of explanation — Whether consideration of other factors necessary — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 64, 67, 192.

Thornton v New South Wales (No 3) (2015) 21.176

Admissibility — Documents — Hospital notes — Whether such notes hospital records — Order for service of medical and other expert reports by set date — Service of hospital notes outside order's time limit — Whether hospital notes "expert's report" — Whether hospital report inclusive of hospital notes — Rule as to service of hospital reports — Whether breach of rule — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 31.18, 31.28.

Thornton v New South Wales (No 2) (2015) 21.173

Admissibility — Documents — Statutory inadmissibility of apology — Identification of apology — Relevant factors — Too narrow construction inappropriate — Whether apology severable from rest of document — Undertaking as to future conduct — Whether natural part of apology — Relevant factors — Characterisation of apology as hollow — Relevant factor — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 69.

EVIDENCE — continued

- Westfield Shopping Centre Management Company Pty Ltd v Rock Build Developments Pty Ltd (No 2) (2013)* 18.28
- Admissibility — Evidence improperly obtained — Admissibility governed by statute — Determination of what is improper — Governed by common law — Evidence of commission of offence — Obtained by operation against randomly selected persons by prosecuting agency — Exclusion of such improperly obtained evidence — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 138.
- Woolworths Ltd v Department of Health* 2.76
- Admissibility — Evidence obtained in contravention of Australian law — Statutory power to exclude such evidence — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (Cth), s 138.
- R v Bangura* 3.179
- Admissibility — Evidence obtained in contravention of regulation — Court's discretion to admit or exclude — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 138.
- R v Wallace (2014)* 21.1
- Admissibility — Evidence of conversations — Whether relevant — Circumstances when innocent conversation not irrelevant — Evidence of past bad conduct — Circumstances when such evidence relevant and admissible — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 55.
- R v Vera* 4.332
- Admissibility — Exclusion of otherwise admissible evidence — Relevance of reliability of evidence in assessment of probative value of such evidence — Need for re-examination of exclusion of reliability in determination of admissibility of expert evidence — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 135, 137.
- R v Vitale (2015)* 24.304
- Admissibility — Expert opinion — Medical reports — Failure to refer to Code of Conduct for experts — Effect — Exceptions to requirement of such reference — Claim in personal injury litigation for past and future domestic assistance — Method of provision of evidence for such claim.
- Murko v Greenfields Narellan Holdings and Another (2015)* 21.27
- Admissibility — Expert opinion — Relevance of reliability of such evidence — Necessary requirements for admissibility of such evidence — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 79.
- R v Vitale (2015)* 24.304
- Admissibility — Expert opinion — Service of expert's report out of time — Application for leave to adduce report into evidence — Requirement of existence of exceptional circumstances — Whether satisfaction of requirement — Relevant factors — Whether basis of grant of leave provision of assistance to court or provision of fair trial without compromise of interests of justice — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 31, rr 17, 28.
- Khan v Rathjen (No 2) (2016)* 22.210
- Admissibility — Hearsay — Admissibility under Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) — Statements in psychologist's report — Psychologist not a witness — Whether such report admissible for containing assertions of offender — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 59, 68, 81, 82.
- R v Staas (No 2) (2013)* 17.232

EVIDENCE — continued

Admissibility — Hearsay — Admissibility under the Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) — Previous representations — Contained in parts of medical reports — Reports not served — Whether non-service negated admissibility of representations where no medical opinion in parts of reports tendered — Doctor to doctor reports — Whether admissible as business records — Representations as to person's health — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 63, 66A, 69 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.28.

Fisher v Rotheraine (2009) 10.26

Admissibility — Hearsay — Complainant's oral evidence unavailable at trial — Whether complainant's signed written statement admissible — Whether statutory provisions applicable — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 65(2), 65(3)(b) — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 93, 94, 289.

R v Morton (2008) 7.120

Admissibility — Hearsay evidence of statements made by another person — Whether statements were admissions — Precondition that person making statement is a party or becomes a party — Alleged admission alone insufficient to satisfy precondition — No discretion to admit hearsay evidence — Statutory power to exercise discretion on terms inapplicable — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 192.

R v Doe 3.127

Admissibility — Hearsay evidence of statements made by another person — Whether statements were admissions — Precondition that statement must be adverse to that person's interest in proceedings — Person's statement of phone number which enabled police to arrest him — Such statement adverse to person's interest — Precondition that person making statement was or became party to proceedings — Alleged admission itself cannot identify such a person — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 59, 81.

R v Doe 5.96

Admissibility — Hearsay — Exceptions — Business records — Whether attachment of significance to evidence of business records admissible under statute — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 69.

*Owners Corporation Strata Plan 69470 v Owners Corporation
Strata Plan 69948 (No 2) (2017)* 25.262

Admissibility — Hearsay — Previous statement — Exceptions — Whether s 56 of Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW) applicable — Conditional application of s 64 of Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) — Lack of evidence as to satisfaction of conditions — Effect — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 64.

*Nicoll v Dobeson and Others; Nicoll v Workers Compensation
Nominal Insurer and Others (No 2) (2013)* 18.47

Admissibility — Hearsay — Statement by witness at police interview of accused's admissions — Video recording of interview — Whether statement second hand hearsay — Effect of statement being electronically recorded.

R v KJ (2009) 9.374

Admissibility — Hypnotically induced evidence — Guidelines for admission of such evidence — Application of guidelines — Mere act of undergoing hypnosis — Whether hypnotically induced evidence thereby produced — Statutory

EVIDENCE — continued

prohibition against admission of evidence on balance prejudicial to accused —
Nature and application of prohibition — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 137.

R v KSC (No 3) (2008) 7.234

Admissibility — Identity of accused charged with crime — Photographs —
Discretion to exclude — Prejudicial effect outweighing probative value —
Assessment of prejudicial effect — Role of creator of such effect not directly
relevant — Directions to jury — Prejudicial effect not thereby necessarily
negated — Application of s 115(5)(a) of the Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) —
Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 115(5)(a), 135, 137.

R v Bakir (2009) 8.220

Admissibility — Improperly obtained evidence — Determination of what is
improper — Relevant principles — Scope of application of principles —
Statutory power to exclude improperly or illegally obtained evidence —
Circumstances when power should be exercised — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW),
s 138.

R v Ibrahim 3.77

Admissibility — Mechanical records — Tape recordings — Transcripts of
recordings — Compilation by police officers — Ad hoc expert witnesses —
Court's overall discretion as to admission of such transcripts — Exercise of
discretion — Relevant factors — Questionability of admissibility of evidence of
ad hoc experts — Generation or reinforcement of expertise rather than bias from
length of time spent listening to recordings — Whether questionable proposition
— Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 79, 135, 137, 192(2).

R v Nguon and Ream (2014) 22.302

Admissibility — Mechanical records — Transcript of tape recording — Not
adopted by person whose representations were recorded — Whether transcript
admissible — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 87 Dictionary Pt 2, cl 6.

Riley v Chubb Security Services Ltd (No 1) (2008) 7.35

Admissibility — Motor vehicle accident proceedings — Whether statement of
reasons for certificates issued by MAS assessors admissible — Motor Accidents
compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 61(9) — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 79,
135.

Seary v White (No 2) (2008) 6.289

Admissibility — Objections — Items of evidence not part of Supplementary List
of Documents — Internet and social media records in control of third parties —
Whether discovery appropriate.

Louise v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2015) 20.98

Admissibility — Objections — Police search of person — No warrant for search
— Whether search lawful — Relevant principles and factors — Law
Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 21.

R v Wallace (2014) 21.1

Admissibility of alleged admissions made to police in record of interview —
Obligations of police if they wish to use what is said against the accused —
Whether admissions influenced by oppressive conduct — Relevant factors —
Distinction between police actions taken to produce admissible evidence and
action taken to advance investigation — Consequences of such different actions
— Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 84.

R v Campbell and Baka (No 1) 5.228

EVIDENCE — continued

Admissibility of video evidence alleged to be prejudicial to accused — Relevant factors — Overseas witnesses — Reception of evidence by video link — Relevant factors — Evidence (Audio and Audio Visual Links) Act 1998 (NSW), s 5B.

R v Kafovalu 3.22

Admissibility — Opinion evidence — Expert opinion — Medical opinion on dead person — Whether pathologists only experts capable of expressing medical opinion.

R v B.O. (2012) 15.303

Admissibility — Opinion evidence — Expert opinion — What constitutes — Expert's reliance on published research of others with expertise in different field — Circumstances when permissible — Whether expert opinion created danger of unfair prejudice — Opinion only relevant to credibility of witness — Opinion inadmissible — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) ss 102, 137.

R v KSC (2008) 7.200

Admissibility — Opinion evidence — Whether evidence matter of fact or opinion — Test — Expert evidence — Ad hoc expert opinion evidence — Whether admissible — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 76, 79.

R v Sterling; R v McCook (2014) 19.74

Admissibility — Picture identification evidence — Not admissible in general where person in police custody when photographs examined — Whether person in custody of prison authorities in police custody — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 115(5).

R v El Mostafa (2007) 6.305

Admissibility — Previous representations — Hearsay — Admissibility under Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) — Representor available for cross-examination — Whether offer to recall such witness condition of application of statutory provision — Whether material in representation admissible as to its truth — Admission of representation — Effect on weight to be given to representation — Whether limits on admission of previous representations made to doctors where representor available to give evidence — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 64, 67.

Thornton v New South Wales (2015) 21.169

Admissibility — Recording made by police of interview with witness — Inability of witness to give evidence because of psychiatric disturbance — Whether witness unavailable to give evidence — Whether admission of recording of interview unfairly prejudicial to party — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 4, 63, 64, 67, 135, 136.

Glohe v Simington (2016) 22.367

Admissibility — Report of Medical Assessment Service assessor — Expert report — Assessor not compellable witness — Declines to attend court for cross-examination — Report on critical issue — Probative value outweighed by unfair prejudice admission would cause — Tender of report rejected — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 135.

Layland v Foster 3.381

Admissibility — Surveillance film of defendant — Obligation to permit defendant to inspect film — Application to be excused from obligation —

EVIDENCE — continued

Relevant principles — Defendant's credit in issue — Appropriate orders — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 31.10(1), 31.10(2).

Azar v Kathirgamalingan (2011) 12.258

Admissibility — Unlawfully obtained evidence — Whether admissible — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 138.

R v Buddee (2016) 24.322

Admissibility — Video tapes — Requirement of pre-hearing disclosure of tape — Dual exceptions — Distinction between application of exceptions — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 31.10(1), 31.10(2).

Cockburn v The Trust Company Ltd and Another (2014) 18.239

Burden of proof — Credibility and weight — Party's failure to call witness — Jones v Dunkel inference — Circumstances justifying drawing inference — Conclusion that party deliberately withholding evidence — Circumstances justifying conclusion.

Zurich Australian Insurance Ltd v GP Marketing International Pty Ltd 2.276

Burden of proof — Defendant's failure to call witness — Inferences to be drawn — Not available where unnecessary for defendant to call evidence.

King v The Owners Corporation Strata Plan 2311 3.271

Burden of proof — Statutory provisos and exceptions — Proceedings for offences — Drug offence — Statutory provision reversing onus of proof of element of offence — Application of provision — Dependent on whether drug in possession of accused derivative of another drug — Scope of expression "derivative" — Commonwealth Criminal Code, s 308.2(3) — Poisons Standard, Pt 1.1, Sch 9.

R v Li (2017) 24.350

Documentary evidence — Lost document — Plaintiff unable to produce written agreement — Defendants' failure to produce copy agreement — No explanation offered — Effect of such failure.

Medfin Australia Pty Ltd v Rafter 4.272

Documentary evidence — Statutory provisions — Evidence for which s 128 certificate given — Access sought to court file containing such evidence — Effect of certificate — Access not prevented by certificate — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 128(7).

Villanueva v King (2008) 8.204

Expert evidence — Duty of expert in giving evidence — Proper role of expert in court proceedings.

Brown v Drummoyne Sports Club Ltd 5.98

Expert opinion — Medical reports — Failure to serve supplementary report — Identification of such report — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.34.

Stambolziowski v Nestorovic and Another (2014) 19.324

Facts excluded from proof — Client legal privilege — Waiver of privilege — Disclosure of substance of lawyer's advice — Disclosure made consistent only with obligations under Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW) — Not knowing and voluntary disclosure — Disclosure of that client had possible cause of action in

EVIDENCE — continued

specified areas of law — Disclosure of substance of advice — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 122(2), 122(2)(c) — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 347.

Suttram Pty Ltd v Michelin Australia Pty Ltd (No 4) (2008) 8.120

Facts excluded from proof — Client legal privilege — Waiver of privilege — Privileged document served pursuant to “Usual Order for Hearing in the Commercial List” of the District Court — Privilege not thereby lost or waived — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 122(2)(c).

OneSteel Trading Pty Ltd v Capital Steel & Pipe Pty Ltd (No 2) 4.390

Facts excluded from proof — Legal profession privilege — Professional confidence — Privilege may be overridden — Situations when this may occur — Meaning of “client” — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), s 198N.

Momibo Pty Ltd v Adam and Another (t/a Marsdens Law Group) 1.316

Facts excluded from proof — Legal professional privilege — Affidavit asserting privilege — Court has discretionary power to allow cross-examination of deponents — Power to be used only in appropriate circumstances.

Compton v Wilson 4.244

Facts excluded from proof — Legal professional privilege — Claim by insured against insurer for indemnity for monies paid out in settlement of litigation — Whether settlement reasonable — Insured’s reliance on legal advice to support reasonableness of settlement — Inconsistent with maintenance of claim for privilege — Privilege waived — Insured’s need to show no ulterior motive to settlement — Whether inconsistent with maintenance of privilege.

Compton v Wilson 4.244

Facts excluded from proof — Public interest privilege — Privilege claimed for documents under subpoena — Virtually identical factors to be considered for such claim as for the adducing of evidence — Minutes of Crime Commission of New South Wales — As a class, minutes did not relate to matters of state — Potential protection from production not available — Whether protection of privilege less readily granted in criminal cases than in civil cases — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 130(1), 130(4)(f) — New South Wales Crime Commission Act 1985 (NSW), ss 24, 25, 27, 30.

R v Dove 4.263

Facts excluded from proof — Transport accident legislation — Witnesses — Medical assessors — Not entitled to public interest immunity — Public interest privilege — Assessor’s certificate — Privilege does not apply.

Watkins v Power 1.356

General matters — Judicial notice — Practice of beach attendance especially in warmer weather — Whether popular recreational pastime of many Australians.

Hodgson v Sydney Water Corporation (2016) 24.72

Hearsay — Admissibility under Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) — Whether person “unavailable” to give evidence — Relevant factor — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), Dictionary, Pt 2.

R v Chambour; R v Khallouf (No 3) (2016) 23.254

Judicial notice — Unavailability of COPS to public or legal profession at large.

Nadere v New South Wales (2015) 21.267

Legal professional privilege — Documents produced under subpoena — Claim

EVIDENCE — continued

of privilege by person under subpoena or by party — Whether claim determined under Evidence Act 1995 (NSW) or under common law — Whether privilege claimable — Relevant principles — Whether waiver of privilege — Relevant principles.

North Shore Real Estate Pty Ltd v Real Estate Property Management Services Pty Ltd and Others (No 2) (2017) 24.291

Mechanical records — Intercept of telephone conversation — Proof of identity of speaker's voice — Whether witness in better position than jury to identify speaker's voice — Conversation in Punjabi — Witness spoke Punjabi — Relevance of evidence of witness.

R v Mahay; Khan, Rana (2010) 13.183

Mechanical records — Tape recordings — Private conversation not to be recorded — Exception to prohibition — Recording of conversation reasonably necessary to protect lawful interests of recording party to conversation — Circumstances constituting lawful interests — Listening Devices Act 1984 (NSW), s 5.

R v Riganias (2009) 9.235

Motor vehicle accident claim — Medical certificate — Admissibility — Statutory grounds to reject certificate — Whether grounds made out — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 61(4).

Nithiananthan v Davenport 3.384

Presumptions — Weight and sufficiency of evidence — Party's failure to call witness — Whether such failure affected credibility of party's case — Relevant factors — Driver leaving accident scene — Whether evidence of culpability — Relevant circumstances.

Bateman v The Nominal Defendant (2012) 15.239

Privilege — Legal professional privilege — Claim for litigation privilege over documents — Administrative processes as precondition for court proceedings — Whether court proceedings "anticipated" in such circumstances — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 119 — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 81, 92, 95.

Woods by his tutor Woods v Abdulrahman (2015) 20.304

Privilege — Legal professional privilege — Claim for privilege over expert's notes — Proof of purpose of creation of notes — Whether direct evidence of expert necessary — No preparation of draft or final report by expert — Relevance.

El Azzi v Maglis and Others (2017) 25.195

Privilege — Legal professional privilege — Waiver of privilege — Conflict between interest of client and solicitor — What constitutes appropriate conduct of solicitor in such circumstances.

Aldag v Eistis (2008) 7.253

Privilege — Legal professional privilege — Waiver of privilege — Discontinuance of police prosecution after receipt of legal advice on merits or otherwise of continuance of proceedings — Whether proof of waiver of privilege claim for advice — Entry of legal advice on COPS — Whether proof of waiver of privilege claim for advice.

Nadere v New South Wales (2015) 21.267

EVIDENCE — continued

Privilege — Privilege against self-incrimination — Grant of certificate in respect of claim — Circumstances when grant available — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 128.

Amor-Smith v Ching (2016) 22.277

Privilege — Professional confidence — Sexual assault communications privilege — Scope of privilege — Difficulties in application — Need for legislative reform — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 296, 299D.

R v Markarian (2012) 15.98

Proceedings for failure to comply with statutory obligations — Burden of proof — Proof of existence and identification of foreseeable hazards — Who bears onus of proof — Proof of elimination of such hazards or lack of alternative thereto — Who bears onus of proof.

Macey v Macquarie Generation (2007) 6.45

Proof of particular matters — Expert opinion — Relevance — Comparison of fingerprints — Whether lay comparison possible — Whether lay recognition by untrained eye possible.

R v Amatto (2011) 13.278

Proof of particular matters — Judicial notice — Applicable to proof that Australian population included significant numbers of Asians — Common knowledge — Proof not required — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 144.

H v New South Wales (2009) 9.255

Proof of particular matters — Judicial notice — Information from maps of New South Wales — Judicial notice of such information — Whether permissible — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 144(1).

Butt v Liebherr Australia Pty Ltd (2015) 19.346

Proof of particular matters — Matters not reasonably open to question — Statutory means of acquisition of knowledge of matters by judge — Meaning of “IP” in bench papers — Whether reference to court file available for determination of party’s knowledge of court order — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 144.

Rich v The Queen (2015) 20.153

Proof of particular matters — Statutory assistance — Application of statutory provision — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 144.

Safe Work (NSW) v Activate Fire Pty Ltd (2017) 24.267

Proof of particular matters — Terms of agreement — Disagreement of parties as to terms — No evidence of soundness of either party’s position or of arguability of either party’s case — Effect.

Unilever Australia Ltd v Rosella Foods Pty Ltd (2012) 15.185

Weight of evidence — Person making statements to psychiatrist gives no evidence — Reliability of statements — Caution required.

R v McMahon 3.398

Witnesses — Assessment of credit — Korean speaking witnesses — Cultural differences — Necessity for caution in assessing credibility.

Lee v Kim 1.174

Witnesses — Credit — Determination of matters of credit — Irrelevant factors.

EVIDENCE — continued

- Thornton v New South Wales (No 3) (2015)* 21.176
- Witnesses — Cross-examination — Request for recall of plaintiff for further cross-examination — Determination of request — Relevant factors.
- Stambolziowski v Nestorovic and Another (2014)* 19.324
- Witnesses — Lies told by witnesses — Inferences available.
- BB Motor Sport Pty Ltd v Dibella* 1.118
- Witnesses — Police — Record keeping — Expectations of courts — Basis for such expectations.
- Makri v New South Wales (2015)* 20.276
- Witnesses — Refreshing memory — Statutory provision — Application for leave for witness to refresh memory from document — Requirement document be found by witness to be accurate — Time at which such finding to be made — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 32(2)(b).
- R v DX (No 2) (2011)* 13.111

FAMILY LAW

- De facto relationships — Adjustment of property interests — Institution of proceedings for adjustment — Requirement for jurisdiction that either or both parties be then resident in NSW — Elements of residency — Plaintiff lived part of week in NSW and part of week in ACT — Whether person can have dual residency — Whether court had jurisdiction — Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW), s 15(1)(b).
- Dunstan v Rickwood (2006)* 6.6
- De facto relationships — Lesbian couple — Sperm donor — Donor's name entered on birth register as parent of child conceived by fertilisation procedure — Statutory presumptions — Rebuttable presumption donor child's parent — Application by lesbian partner of mother to be registered as parent — Irrebuttable presumption such person child's parent — Irrebuttable presumption donor not child's father — Whether donor's name required to be removed from birth register — Nature of court's jurisdiction to make removal order — Relevance of interests of child — Status of Children Act 1996 (NSW), ss 3, 11, 13, 14, 15, 17 — Births, Deaths and Marriages Registration Act 1995 (NSW), ss 18, 19, Sch 3, Pt 4, cl 17.
- AA v Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages and BB (2011)* 13.51
- Jurisdiction — Court's power to authorise Registrar to remove name of sperm donor as child's parent from child's birth registration — Exercise of power — Conditional on donor not being child's father by operation of law or otherwise — Court's finding that donor child's biological parent — Whether condition met — Status of Children Act 1996 (NSW), ss 11, 12, 14, 17.
- LU v Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages and Another (No 2) (2013)* 17.61

FISH AND FISHERIES

- Statutory regulation of fishing activities — Management of resources — Whether State legislation and regulation constitutionally valid — Fisheries

FISH AND FISHERIES — continued

Management Act 1994 (NSW) — Marine Estate Management Act 2014 (NSW)
— Fisheries Management (Abalone Share Management Plan) Regulation 2000 (NSW).

Lavender and Another v Department of Industry (NSW) (2017) 25.389

GIFTS

Elements of gift — Donative intentions — Methods of expression — Delivery
— Constructive delivery — Requirements for establishment of constructive
delivery.

Aboud v Aboud (2009) 9.180

GUARANTEE AND INDEMNITY

Actions against surety — Right to set up claim by cross-claim — Postponement
of right of set-off under guarantee — Statutory basis of right — Whether
contractual postponement of right still valid — Conveyancing Act 1919 (NSW),
s 111A.

Commonwealth Bank of Australia v James (2015) 20.59

HEALTH LAW

Legal proceedings by authorities — Offence of selling cigarettes to persons
under eighteen years — Employer's liability when employee offends — Defence
of due diligence — Relevant factors — Public Health Act 1991 (NSW), ss 59,
59A.

Woolworths Ltd v Department of Health 2.76

INCOME TAX

Collection and recovery — Notice of assessment — Conclusiveness of —
Tender of prima facie evidence as to amount of General Interest Charges —
Change to onus of proof — Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), s 177.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Liu (2012) 15.57

Collection and recovery of tax — Amounts due withheld by companies —
Recovery sought from directors of penalties equivalent in amount to withheld
tax — Service of director's penalty notices — Compliance with statutory
procedure for service of notices — Notices not received — Service still effective
— Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), ss 222AOB, 222AOC, 222AOE,
222AOF.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Wade 1.259

Collection and recovery — Proceedings for recovery — Onus of proof —
Statutory declaration of taxpayer in support of denial of liability — Required
contents of such declaration — Whether bare denial of liability sufficient
compliance with requirements — Taxation Administration Act 1953 (Cth),
Sch 1, s 268-90.

INCOME TAX — continued

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Norton Developments Pty Ltd
(2012) 14.375

Collection and recovery — Proceedings for recovery — Proceedings against company's director for company's unremitted taxes — Service of valid notice on director precondition to proceedings — Provision in notice of wrong date — Whether rectifying legislation applicable — Application of current legislation repealing prior Act under which notice given — Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), s 222AOE — Taxation Administration Act 1953 (Cth), s 269-25 — Tax Laws Amendment (Transfer of Provisions) Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 1, Pt 3, Div 5, items 64, 65 — Tax Laws Amendment (2011 Measures No 7) Act 2011 (Cth), Sch 7.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Zammitt (2012) 15.104

Collection and recovery — Proceedings for recovery — Running account balance deficit debt — Part of debt comprised of administrative overpayment — Recovery of general interest charge payable on debt — Whether notice required to be given before charge was recoverable — Taxation Administration Act 1953 (Cth), ss 8AAZA, 8AAZD, 8AAZF, 8AAZN(2).

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Smith (2008) 7.324

Recovery of penalty — Company failing to remit PAYG income tax deducted from employees' wages — Statutory liability of director for company's default — Statutory defence — Scope of defence — Meaning of "management of the company", "good reason" — Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), ss 222AOB(1), 222AOJ(2).

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Dick 3.244

INDUSTRIAL LAW

Annual leave — Whether entitlement to leave under State or Commonwealth legislation — Annual Holidays Act 1944 (NSW), ss 2, 53 — Workplace Relations Act 1996 (Cth), s 178, Pt 7, Div 4, Sch 8, Pt3, Div 1, cll 3, 34, 45, 46, 47 — Workplace Relations Amendment (Work Choices) Act 2005 (Cth), s 4, 16.

Mason v Citigroup Pty Ltd (2007) 6.203

Industrial awards — Redundancy provisions — Whether redundant employee offered acceptable alternative employment — Application of objective standard to assess acceptability of offered employment — Relevance of evidence of employee's subjective reaction to offer — Consequence of no acceptable alternative employment — Relevance of subsequent resignation of redundant employee.

Smith v Onesteel Limited and Another (2013) 16.143

Industrial safety — Duty to protect employees of contractors — Scope of duty — Relevance of incident causing injury to such employee — Relevance of foreseeability of risk to health or safety of worker — Whether duty limited to prevention of foreseeable risks of injury — Duty owed to persons engaged rather than employed — Application of statutory duty — Relevant principles — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW), ss 12A, 19, 32.

Safe Work (NSW) v Activate Fire Pty Ltd (2017) 24.267

Industrial safety — Offences — Breach of s 8(2) of Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW) — Plea of guilty — Dismissal of charge without

INDUSTRIAL LAW — continued

recording of conviction — When such result appropriate — Relevant factors — Offender's offer in respect of prosecutor's costs — Effect — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 10.

WorkCover Authority of New South Wales v Diona Pty Ltd (2014) 19.147

Industrial safety — Offences — Penalties — Imposition of fine — Relevant principles — Offender's capacity to pay — Relevant but not decisive factor — Other relevant factors.

Safe Work New South Wales v Waycon Bulk Pty Ltd (2015) 21.130

Industrial safety — Offences — Penalties — More than one party responsible for injury to worker — Application of parity principle — Relevant principles — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW), s 19.

SafeWork NSW v ProjectCorp Australia Pty Ltd (2017) 25.219

Industrial safety — Offences — Penalties — Onus on offender to furnish full information about financial circumstances — Failure to satisfy onus — Effect in relation to setting of penalty where own legal costs and those of prosecution payable by offender — Determination of proper penalty — Relevant factors.

McCarthy (WorkCover Authority of New South Wales) v Siva &

Jeya Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 22.197

Industrial safety — Offences — Penalties — Subjective deterrence of offender — Relevance of offender's liability for large amount of legal costs — Imposition of penalty on responsible safety-conscious enterprises — Determination of proper penalty — Relevant factors — Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW), s 8(2).

WorkCover Authority of New South Wales v Baiada Poultry Pty Ltd

(2015) 20.138

Industrial safety — Offences — Statutory duty on person conducting a business not to put other persons at risk from work done as part of the conduct of that business — Scope of such duty — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW), ss 19(1), 19(2).

SafeWork NSW v Rawson Homes Pty Ltd (2016) 24.20

Industrial safety — Offences — Validity of charge involving elements of two offences — Whether amendment possible — Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW), s 8(1), 8(2) — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 16, 17, 21.

Inspector Walsh v Built (NSW) Pty Ltd (2012) 19.206

Industrial safety — Offences — Whether trust amenable to prosecution under Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW) — Plea of guilty by trustee for offences — Trustee's suggestion another party responsible for offences — Effect on trustee's guilty plea — Trustee's lack of ability to pay fines — Right of indemnity from trust — Methods of enforcing compliance by trustee with legal obligations with respect to payment of fines — Ultimate payment of fines by beneficiaries under trust — Whether unjust.

Safe Work New South Wales v Waycon Bulk Pty Ltd (2015) 21.130

Industrial safety — Statutory duties of "controller" of premises — Identification of controller — Relevant factors — Duty to protect employees of contractors — Claim for failure to comply with statutory obligations — Such claim not claim for damages resulting from negligence — Statutory obligations did not impose strict liability — Appropriate standard of care to be applied — Civil Liability

INDUSTRIAL LAW — continued

Act 2002 (NSW), s 5A — Occupational Health and Safety Act 2000 (NSW), ss 8, 10 — Occupational Health and Safety Regulation 2001 (NSW), regs 34, 35, 36.

Macey v Macquarie Generation (2007) 6.45

INFANTS AND CHILDREN

Children's Court — Jurisdiction — Application for grant of restoration of children in care and subject to care orders — Grant conditional on court's satisfaction of existence of realistic possibility of restoration — Abuse of child by one or both parents — Failure by parents to accept and acknowledge such abuse — Further abuse therefore likely — Restoration impossible — Care proceedings — Nature of such proceedings — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), s 83(7)(b).

SS v Department of Human Services (NSW) (2010) 12.29

Crimes by children — Forensic procedures — Interrogation of children — Court's concern over practice endorsed by Department of Education — Bail application for child — Proceeding with process without inquiry as to child's literacy or attending parent's ability to read English.

R v MG (2016) 23.279

INFERIOR COURTS

Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Appeal from Adjudicator of strata scheme dispute — Appeal to District Court against Tribunal's decision — Whether limitation to appeal — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 52, 53, 56.

Owners of Strata Plan 21702 v Krimbogiannis and Others (2013) 16.190

Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Appeal to District Court — Limited to question with respect to matter of law — Whether matter for determination one of law or fact — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), ss 67(1), 67(8).

Vero Insurance Ltd v Owners of Strata Plan 69352 (2010) 10.264

Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Jurisdiction and powers — Consumer claim — Claim involving misleading conduct in relation to franchise agreement — Whether such claim no longer consumer claim — Claim not "arising under" industry code — Whether conferral of jurisdiction on Tribunal to hear matters concerning Franchising Code of Conduct — Consumer Claims Act 1998 (NSW), ss 3, 3A, 4, 7, 13 — Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Pt IVB, s 86(2).

Coverall NSW Pty Ltd v Chaw (2013) 16.31

Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Jurisdiction — Claim for breach of guarantee provided under Australian Consumer Law — Whether Tribunal's jurisdiction inclusive of such claim — Fair Trading Act 1987 (NSW), ss 28, 74(3).

Burton v Chad One Pty Ltd (2013) 18.38

Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Practice — Reasons for decision —

INFERIOR COURTS — continued

Requirements — Whether reasons need to be compelling or logical.

Pastrovic and Co Pty Ltd v Farrington (2011) 13.37

INSURANCE

Contract of — Breach by insurer — Cancellation of policy on basis outside statutory bases and failure to follow statutory cancellation procedure — Term of insurance policy concerning renewal of policy — Whether automatic renewal process — Relief under Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (NSW) — Scope of such relief — Whether inclusive of claim for damages — Reliance by insurer on statutory provision — Whether unconscionable conduct — Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (NSW), ss 15, 58, 60, 63 — Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 2, ss 20-22.

Haddad v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd (2014) 19.19

Contract of — Construction — Exclusion clause — Insurer not liable for loss due to insured's illegal act determined by final adjudication — Whether finding of corrupt conduct by Independent Commission Against Corruption within meaning of "final determination" in clause — Commission's finding that corrupt conduct "could" constitute criminal offence when no subsequent prosecution — Whether finding within meaning of "determination" in exclusion clause — Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988 (NSW), ss 8, 9(1), 13, 13(3A), 74, 74A, 74B.

Liberty Mutual Insurance Company v Zanotto (2011) 22.98

Contract of — Construction — Whether whole electricity distribution system within meaning of expression "all services to the buildings" — Whether expression merely inclusive of electrical connection from buildings to that system — Whether connection between that system and sewer pump station within meaning of expression — Reinstatement of system of benefit to uninsured buildings — Effect on insurer's obligation under policy.

Ningaloo Escape Pty Ltd v Holland Insurance Co Pty Ltd (2017) 25.310

Contract of insurance — Construction — Home building insurance — Liability under policy — Contingent on disappearance of owner-builder — Owner-builder living in Vanuatu — Whether claim under policy maintainable — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), ss 42A(2), 90(2), 99(3), 101 — Interpretation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 5(2), 12(1)(b) — Home Building Regulation 2004 (NSW), cl 52(3), 56.

Wesfarmers General Insurance Limited t/as Lumley Insurance v Nestel (2011) 14.13

Contract of insurance — Construction — Policy responded only to amounts the insured became liable to pay "as compensation for personal injury" — Whether subrogated claim for indemnity for settlement of claims for nervous shock and under Compensation to Relatives Act 1897 (NSW) following death of claimant's son within scope of policy.

JB Metal Roofing Pty Ltd v Garry Denson Metal Roofing Pty Ltd (2008) 8.183

Disability insurance — Arranged for members of superannuation fund — Policy in favour of fund's trustee — Claim by member for total and permanent incapacity benefit under policy — Insurer's duty of good faith — Member's

INSURANCE — continued

interest in insurer's compliance with duty — Insurer's rejection of claim — Whether insurer's decision valid — Relevant principles — Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (Cth), s 13.

Frith v Host-Plus Pty Ltd 4.161

Income protection policy — Benefits payable for insured's total disability — Circumstances when that can occur — Concept of "gainful occupation" — Concept excludes receipts from investments, lottery wins and realisation of capital assets — Share trading activities — Circumstances when such activities do not constitute an occupation — Involvement in a business — Circumstances when such involvement does not constitute a gainful occupation.

The Advanced Technology Group Pty Ltd v ING Life Ltd 3.189

Insurance contracts — Income protection policy — Injury to insured — Insurer's belief insured ceased to be totally disabled — Payments under policy ceased — Court determines insured was totally disabled — Whether cessation of payments constituted repudiation of policy — Distinction between repudiation of liability and repudiation of policy — Insurer's belief genuine and bona fide — Policy not repudiated — Attempt to prove that insurer's file demonstrates male fides — Whole file to be tendered — Doctrine of election — Relevant principles — Termination of contract for breach — Relevant principles.

Camilleri v Australian Casualty & Life 3.223

Insurance contracts — Non-disclosure — Answers to questions in proposal form — Question seeking details of past accidents, thefts, fires and claims — Question relates only to property of proposer — Question seeking details of prior convictions — Disclosure of offence under traffic legislation not required — Insurer's duty of good faith — Relevant principles.

Kadzielski v Dawes Motor Underwriting Group Pty Ltd 2.26

Insurance contracts — Non-disclosure — Duty to disclose matters known to be relevant to acceptance of risk — Answers given to questions in proposal form — Extent of answers dependent on questions posed — Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (Cth), s 21(1).

Kadzielski v Dawes Motor Underwriting Group Pty Ltd 2.26

Policies of insurance — Indemnity against loss of lessee's property — Construction of policy — Whether lessor has insurable interest — Relevant principles.

Competitive Business Solutions Pty Ltd v Kim 1.194

Policies of insurance — Public risk policy — Insured persons' wrongs — Without wording to contrary no indemnity provided under policy.

Competitive Business Solutions Pty Ltd v Kim 1.194

INTEREST

Award of damages — Pre-judgment interest — Applicable rate — Tort of false imprisonment — Whether rate of interest for such tort same as rate for claim for personal injuries.

Raad v New South Wales (No 2) (2017) 25.105

Award of in judgment — Defamation actions — Award of interest long standing and almost invariable practice — Applicable rate of interest — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 100.

INTEREST — continued

- Rothe v Scott (No 5) (2016)* 23.240
- Interest on costs — Whether proof of payment of costs or their fructification necessary — Order for costs — Whether statement of when payments made necessary — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 101.
- Rothe v Scott (No 5) (2016)* 23.240

INTERPRETATION

- Admissibility of extrinsic evidence — Parole evidence rule — Scope of rule.
- Kotzur v Modern Engineering and Construction Co Pty Ltd* 2.318

JUDGMENTS AND ORDERS

- Amending, varying and setting aside — Correction under slip rule — Whether permitting claim for interest within application of rule — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 36.16, 36.17.
- Barry and Another v Coshott and Another (2014)* 18.60
- Awarding, varying and setting aside — District Court order — For irregularity — Available procedures — Grounds of procedural unfairness and denial of natural justice — Best raised by way of application for prerogative relief — Review by District Court unavailable — Appeal to Supreme Court only avenue for review of decision — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 127 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 36.15, 36.16.
- Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd v Mahaffy (No 2) (2012)* 15.365
- Classification — Final or interlocutory — Decision on a separate issue — Effect of — Creation of issue estoppel.
- Baker-Morrison v New South Wales (2010)* 10.176
- Classification — Interim orders — Freezing order — Whether such order appropriate — Relevant principles — Provision of personal financial information of party — Whether such provision obligation of party — Refusal of grant of freezing order — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 25.11, 25.15.
- Daftar v Al-Khamisy (2014)* 20.7
- Effect of — Refusal to make costs order — Not “order for costs” — No appeal from — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 3.
- Appeal of Waller (2007)* 8.1
- Interlocutory judgment or order given or made in criminal proceedings — Effect of — In new trial following discontinuance of trial where order made — Whether order binding on trial judge in new trial — Scope of “order” — Inclusive of pre-trial decisions and orders on admissibility of evidence — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 130A.
- R v B.O. (2012)* 15.303
- Setting aside — For irregularity — Default judgment — Failure to plead material facts in Statement of Claim — Whether irregularity — Relevant factor — Prospect of summary judgment application following setting aside of default

JUDGMENTS AND ORDERS — continued

judgment and filing of Defence — Relevance to application to set aside judgment — Attitude of appellate courts to need for pleading material facts in Statement of Claim in detail — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.15.

Bendigo and Adelaide Bank Ltd v Borg and Another (2016) 23.75

Statement of reasons for decision — Publication of — Application for suppression order — Relevant principles — Court Suppression and Non-Publication Orders Act 2010 (NSW).

Kostov v Zhang; Kostov v Fairfax Media Publications Pty Ltd (No 2) (2017) 24.140

JURY

Defamation trial — Directions to jury — Whether Skaf warning should be given — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 7A.

Dehsabzi v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd (No 4) (2008) 8.175

Dispensing with — Defamation action — Limited rights of appeal from jury verdict — By itself, not a ground to proceed without a jury after proceedings set down for hearing as a jury trial — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 126, 127 — Defamation Act 2005 (NSW), s 21.

Matthews v Banning (2008) 6.366

LANDLORD AND TENANT

Leases — Rent — Recovery — Premises occupied by persons other than tenant to landlord's knowledge — Service of notices of rent increase — Service required to be at premises occupied by tenant — Whether tenant deemed to occupy premises — Residential Tenancies Act 1987 (NSW), ss 3, 130(1).

Chambers v Vaisman (2008) 7.282

Termination of tenancy — Legislation protecting tenants — Requirement of justification for termination order “in the circumstances of the case” — Lessee's loss of payment for lease — Payment of money two decades ago — Whether relevant “circumstance of the case” — Retirement Villages Act 1999 (NSW), s 134.

Boele v Rinbac Pty Ltd (2014) 18.309

Termination of tenancy — Rights of lessor — Rights apart from covenant in lease — Statutory procedure for exercise of right to re-enter — Whether procedure applicable to exclusion of common law — Conveyancing Act 1919 (NSW), s 129.

Remedial Building Services Australia Pty Limited v Pony (NSW) Pty Ltd and Another (No 2) (2013) 17.107

Termination of tenancy — Statutory power of Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal to make termination order — Exercise of power conditional on specified finding — Whether making of order mandatory once condition met — Relevance of tenant's financial hardship — Relevance of tenant's receipt of disability pension — Relevance of tenant's participation in court ordered

LANDLORD AND TENANT — continued

rehabilitation programme — Residential Tenancies Act 2010 (NSW), ss 82, 85, 87, 91(1)(a), 91(2), 91(3), 91(5), 152(1).

New South Wales Land and Housing Corporation v Cain (2013) 16.319

LEGAL PRACTITIONERS

Barrister's unpaid fees — Agreement with instructing solicitor to defer payment until clients' property sold — Payment of fees plus interest to be from proceeds of sale — Payment to be secured by mortgage — Property sold — Fees not paid — Recovery proceedings — Proper characterisation of proceedings — No longer action to recover fees but action for breach of contract — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), s 192.

Cameron v Dennis 3.392

Barrister's unpaid fees — Statutory requirement that invoices be signed — Unsigned amended invoices accompanied by signed letters — Sufficient compliance with requirement — Requirement that invoices contain certain particulars — Identification of particulars — Requirement not applicable where recipient is aware of matters to be particularised — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), ss 192, 194 — Legal Profession Regulation 1994 (NSW), cl 22A(1)(g), (h).

Cameron v Dennis 3.392

Barristers — Recovery of unpaid fees from client — Effect of Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW) — Fee disclosure statement — Circumstances for foundation of recovery action — Costs agreement — Formation of agreement — Circumstances where acceptance by client of barrister's offer, by way of fee disclosure statement, can be implied — Obligations of barrister to enable proceedings to recover fees to be maintained — Bill of costs — Statutory requirements — Determination of which of two statutory regimes apply — Relevant test — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), ss 173, 175, 176, 182, 184, 185, 192, 193, 194, 195 — Legal Profession Regulation 1994 (NSW), cl 22A — Legal Profession Regulation 2002 (NSW) cl 45, Sch 5, cl 15.

Cameron v Ofria (2007) 6.13

Barristers — Solicitors — Duties — Whether obligation of lawyers for one party to litigation to provide advice to lawyers for another party.

EDT Global Pty Ltd and Another v Entire Building Solutions Pty

Ltd and Another (2017) 24.157

Costs — Equitable charge for outstanding costs over costs awarded to party — Notification of equitable right given to party ordered to pay costs — Effect.

New South Wales v Hamod (2008) 8.152

Costs order — Against solicitor for unsuccessful parties — Liability for personal conduct as well as conduct of partner, associate or employee — Liability of solicitor at common law — Relevant principles — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), s 198M.

Momibo Pty Ltd v Adam and Another (t/a Marsdens Law Group) 1.316

Costs order — Against solicitor for unsuccessful parties — Statutory power to make order — Exercise of power — Conditions to be satisfied first — Interpretation of conditions — Obligation on practitioner to hold belief in claim having reasonable prospects of success — Obligation ongoing whenever legal

LEGAL PRACTITIONERS — continued

services provided — Belief to be based on material, not evidence — Meaning of “reasonable belief”, “reasonably arguable view of the law”, “reasonable prospects of damages being recovered”, “proper basis” — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), ss 198J, 198M.

Momibo Pty Ltd v Adam and Another (t/a Marsdens Law Group) 1.316

Duties and liabilities — To client — Advising client — Proper oral advice given — Advice not confirmed in writing — Whether such omission necessarily indicated breach of solicitor’s duty to take reasonable care — Client’s refusal to take solicitor’s advice in civil proceedings — Whether solicitor then bound to cease to act for client.

Takla v Nasr (2011) 13.258

Solicitor and client — Duties and liabilities to client — Negligence — Extent of duty of care — Solicitor taking over matter from another solicitor — Duty to review file and previous instructions.

Cox v Sloan 2.202

Solicitor and client — Liability for costs — Remuneration — “No win/no fee” retainer — Settlement of client’s action — Settlement amount inclusive of costs — Whether settlement a “win” — Solicitor’s entitlement to recover fees in excess of settlement amount.

Brady v Bale Boshev Solicitors (2009) 10.284

Solicitor and client — Liability of solicitor to client — Advocate’s immunity — Scope of immunity — Whether immunity from suit or from particular causes of action.

Liascos v Walmsley (2015) 20.336

Solicitor and client — Remuneration — Recognised tendency to underestimate costs of proceedings.

Abed v New South Wales and Others (2013) 17.219

Solicitor — Duties and liabilities of solicitor — Liability for costs — Conducting legal proceedings lacking reasonable prospects of success — Instituting action for professional negligence without evidence of damage and causation — Solicitor liable for costs of party sued — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 348.

Marshall v Stacks/Goudkamp Pty Limited (2011) 12.246

Solicitors — Costs — Recovery — Institution of proceedings for recovery of costs without prior compliance with statutory disclosure requirement — Proceedings not then maintainable — Whether consequent dismissal or stay of proceedings appropriate — Effect of stay of proceedings — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 317(2).

O’Connor trading as Thomson Rich O’Connor v Sole and Another (2015) 21.295

Solicitors — Duties — Statutory duty to court — Whether breach of such duty — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56(3).

El Azzi v Maglis and Others (2017) 25.195

Solicitors — Duties — Whether conduct in breach of professional and statutory obligations — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56.

Josa Constructions Pty Ltd v Amarino Pty Ltd (2016) 24.1

LEGAL PRACTITIONERS — continued

- Solicitors — Liability for costs — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 99(1).
Wallace and Another v GWH Build Pty Ltd; GWH Build Pty Ltd and Another v Wallace and Others (No 2) (2016) **23.44**
- Solicitors — Misconduct and discipline — Referral by court of solicitor's conduct to Law Society of New South Wales — Grounds.
In Re a Solicitor to the Law Society of NSW; EL v DE and Another (2015) **20.119**

LIMITATION OF ACTIONS

- Application for extension of time — Discretion to grant leave — Requirement for full and satisfactory explanation for delay to be given — Relevant principles — Consideration of prejudice to be caused if leave granted — Relevant principles — Dismissal of application — Second application — Important fresh evidence — Second application not an abuse of process — Motor Accidents Act 1988 (NSW), s 52(4).
Barth v Ron Crete Pumping and Spraying **2.231**
- Application for extension of time — Public transport accident — Claim for damages — Statutory requirement that damages be assessed pursuant to Motor Accidents Compensation Act — Requirement does not convert claim to cause of action under that Act — Application to be determined under Limitation Act — Transport Administration Act 1998 (NSW), s 121 — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 50A(1), 50A(3), 50C — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3, 109, 132.
Antonini v State Rail Authority (No 1) **4.25**
- Application of statute — Defamation actions — Extension of limitation period — Requirement for commencement of action within one year of publication of matter complained of — Such publication not known about within that period — Whether satisfaction of requirement reasonable — Principles relevant to grant of extension — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A.
Jacobs v Levitt (2016) **23.178**
- Application of statute — Extension of period — Defamation action for downloadable publications — Artificiality of applications for extension of time — Need for legislative reform — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A.
Otto v Gold Coast Publications Pty Ltd (2017) **25.127**
- Application of statute — Limitation period — Extension of limitation period for defamation action — Application for — Test of whether not reasonable for institution of proceedings within limitation period — Satisfaction of test where no knowledge of alleged defamatory publication — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A.
Nicolson v Florida (2016) **24.42**
- Application of statute — Limitation period — Tort — Claim for personal injuries statute-barred — Claim for exemplary and aggravated damages — Whether such claim one for personal injuries — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 18A.
Radford v New South Wales (2009) **10.34**

LIMITATION OF ACTIONS — continued

Application of statute — Limitation period — When time begins to run — Tort — Action for personal injury — Discoverability of whether injury caused by defendant's fault — Person's ability to form conclusion without expert's assistance — Date of discoverability — Not postponable — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 50C(1)(a), 50D(1)(b).

Bet (aka Biviano) v UTS Haberfield Club Ltd (2008) 7.173

Application of statute — Particular causes of action — Defamation — Application for extension of limitation period — Relevant principle — Irrelevant factors — Use of “non-litigious processes” — Whether sufficient basis for extension — Alternative options to application for extension — Effect of electronic publication on test for extension of limitation period — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 14B, 56A.

York v Morgan and Another (2015) 20.341

Application of statute — Particular persons — Persons entitled to bring action against government department — Extension of period — Statutory requirements — Onus of proof — Meaning of “full and satisfactory” explanation for non-compliance — Whether requirements met — Relevant factors — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 26BA, 26BD(3)(a).

Dawson v New South Wales (2012) 14.103

Application of statute — Statutory power of court to extend limitation period — Application of power — Relevant principles — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A.

Otto v Gold Coast Publications Pty Ltd (2017) 25.127

Application of statute — Statutory requirements — Whether focus of provision on occurrence allegedly causing injury or on cause of action — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 50A.

Richardson v Mirvac Constructions Pty Ltd and Others (2012) 15.221

Application of statute — When time begins to run — Discoverability of seriousness of injury — Involved some understanding of law — Knowledge of person's solicitor not knowledge of person — Assessment of work capacity — Whether part of assessment of seriousness of injury — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 50C, 50D.

Rawle v Southstate Industrial Supplies Pty Ltd (2008) 7.134

Application of statute — When time begins to run — Tort — Action for personal injury — Three year limitation period — Nature of such period — Discoverability of whether injury caused by defendant's fault — Causation limited to particular defendant who is being sued — Requirement that person has “taken all reasonable steps to ascertain the fact” that defendant's fault caused injury — Whether consulting solicitor satisfied requirement — Solicitor's lack of progress — Appropriate responses — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 50C, 50D(1)(b), 50D(2).

Cunningham v Independent Unit Management Pty Ltd (2008) 7.347

Application of statute — When time begins to run — Tort — Professional negligence — Tax agent — Failure to declare all client's income — Failure to claim superannuation tax concessions — Economic damage — Time of accrual of damage not dependent on discovery or discoverability of loss — Knowledge of right to sue — Not essential ingredient of cause of action — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 14(1)(b).

LIMITATION OF ACTIONS — continued

- Christie v Purves* 3.85
- Application of statute — Whether applicable to costs assessment — Utility of continuance of costs assessment for statute-barred debt.
- O'Connor trading as Thomson Rich O'Connor v Sole and Another* (2015) 21.295
- Defamation — Extension of limitation period — Statutory requirements — Application — Relevant factors — Whether extension available once action commenced and limitation period expired — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 14B, 56A.
- Rodgers v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd (No 2) (2008)* 8.157
- Extension of period — By leave of court — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors for extension of limitation period for defamation action — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 14B(3), 56A.
- Grech v Illawarra Newspaper Holdings Pty Ltd t/as Illawarra Mercury* 2.169
- Extension of time — Exercise of discretion by court — Principles — Applicant need not show complete absence of prejudice if extension granted — Extent of applicant's obligation to explain delay — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 60G.
- Davies v New South Wales* 2.51
- Limitation period — Extension of period — Costs assessment — Appeal against — Application for extension of time to appeal — Relevant factors — Relative importance — Procedural history of application — Relevance — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 51.10.
- Chilvers v Snowdon (2012)* 14.147
- Limitation period — Extension of period — Personal injury cases — Motor vehicle collision — Circumstances where no relevant delay — Proof of full and satisfactory explanation for delay in commencing proceedings — Circumstances where no necessity for plaintiff to recount and annotate facts relevant to explain delay — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 109.
- Vu v Nominal Defendant & NRMA Insurance Ltd (2010)* 12.8
- Limitation period for actions over injury or death — Extension of post discoverability period — Requirement of knowledge of causal relationship between defendant's conduct and injury — Level of knowledge required — Knowledge that defendant at fault — Extent of knowledge required — Manner of acquiring such knowledge — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW) s 50C, 50D(1)(b).
- Wright v Country Waste Systems Pty Ltd (2007)* 6.136
- Limitation period — Particular causes of action — When time begins to run — Action against insurer of deregistered company — Commencement of limitation period upon deregistration — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), s 601AG.
- Johnstone v Broad Group Holdings Pty Ltd (2011)* 13.222
- Particular causes of action — Defamation — Extension of period — Application for — Relevant principles — Delay in instituting proceedings so as to make enquiries — Effect — Unawareness of limitation period — Significance — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A(2).
- Calabro v Zappia (2010)* 11.12
- Personal injury cases — Extension of limitation period — Court's discretion to extend period — Principles on which discretion exercised — Knowledge of

LIMITATION OF ACTIONS — *continued*

material facts — Conflicting legal advice as to likely outcome of action — Satisfactory explanation for delay — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 60C, 60E.

Stringer v Rio Tinto Pty Ltd 1.150

Possible action for unjust enrichment — Statute barred after six years — Cause of action being statute barred does not alone permit another cause of action to arise — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 14(1)(a).

Coshott v Lenin 4.13

Postponement of the bar — Confirmation — Acknowledgements — Whether more than one confirmation possible — Content of confirmation — Making of confirmation by delivery of agreed written acknowledgement — Methods of delivery — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 14(1)(a), 54.

Svenson v Doherty (2014) 18.299

Proceedings for personal injuries — Determination of when cause of action discoverable — Time at which reasonable person ought to have known injury sufficiently serious to justify bringing action — Relevant factors — Question not whether circumstances existed which would have entitled person to bring action — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 50D(1)(c).

Toppin v Coles Myer Ltd (2007) 6.41

Proceedings for personal injuries — Whether proceedings statute barred — Determination of when cause of action discoverable — Time at which reasonable person ought to have known whose fault caused the injuries and whether injuries sufficiently serious to justify bringing an action — Degree of knowledge required — Onus of proof of limitation provisions — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 50C, 50D(1)(b), 50D(1)(c).

Baker-Morrison v New South Wales (2008) 7.186

Statutes of limitation — Extension of period — Application for — By leave of court — Exercise of discretion — Relevant principles — Concept of presumptive prejudice — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D.

McLawrence v Ashton Coal Operations Pty Ltd (2016) 23.281

Statutes of limitation — Limitation period — Particular causes of action — Action for breach of statutory warranty — Proceedings to be instituted within seven years of completion of building work — Relevant test to determine when work completed — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), s 18E.

Abrahams v Degan (2009) 10.99

Statutes of limitation — Recovery from council of monetary contribution — Limitation period — Applicable if monetary contribution was a tax — Statutory construction — Relevant principles — Recovery of Imposts Act 1963 (NSW), ss 1A, 2, 5 — Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW), s 94.

Wrights Road Pty Ltd v Baulkham Hills Shire Council 3.171

Statutes of limitation — Torts — Limitation period — Application for extension — Potential action against lawyer responsible for failure to bring proceedings within limitation period — Weight to be given to such potential action — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 60C, 60E.

Mikronis v Adams 1.369

Suspension of limitation period — Where person with cause of action a “person under a disability” — If person disabled, examination of relationship between disability and failure to bring proceedings with limitation period unnecessary —

LIMITATION OF ACTIONS — continued

Person in detention — Whether full-time custody renders person “incapacitated” — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 50F — Felons (Civil Proceedings) Act 1981 (NSW), s 4.

Brilley v Presidential Security Services of Australia Pty Ltd (2007) 6.112

Suspension of limitation period — Where person with cause of action is an “incapacitated person” — Person in detention — Difficulties in communicating with such person — Factor of significance in determining incapacity — Personal injury cases — Extension of limitation period — Court’s discretion to extend period — Relevant factors — Effect of Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW) — Effect of Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW) — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), ss 50F, 60C, 60E.

Wheeler v Police Service (NSW) 1.283

LIQUOR

Licensing — Licensed premises — Offences — Alleged failure by licensee to comply with condition of licence — Whether contravening act caused by licensee — Relevant principles — Licensee’s responsibility for act of servant or agent — Scope of responsibility — Liquor Act 2007 (NSW), ss 11(2), 91, 149 — Liquor Regulation 2008 (NSW), cl 53ZC.

Mader v The Queen (2017) 25.37

LOCAL COURT

Jurisdiction — Claim for amount in excess of such jurisdiction — Abandonment of excess — Non-utilisation of prescribed method of abandonment — Whether hearing still possible — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 23(1), 23(2) — Local Court Act 2007 (NSW), s 30.

Dueeasy Pty Ltd and Another v Devlin and Another (2014) 20.13

Jurisdiction — Practice — Application for apprehended personal violence order — Dismissal of application pursuant to Pt 4.4 of Local Court Rules 2009 (NSW) and r 13 of Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW) — Whether permissible — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), ss 19, 86(2).

Ferris v Atherton (2014) 19.221

LOCAL GOVERNMENT

Destruction of noxious plants — Recovery of expenses — Local council entering into contract to control noxious weeds — No necessity to first call for tenders to carry out such work — Local Government Act 1993 (NSW), s 55 — Noxious Weeds Act 1993 (NSW), ss 20, 26.

Cooma-Monaro Shire Council v Tonkin 2.266

Legal proceedings — Torts — Negligence — Statutory power to declare dog dangerous — Whether duty of care to individuals thereby created — Statutory limitation of liability — Power properly characterised as expression of regulation — Whether exercise of power enforceable by person — Civil

LOCAL GOVERNMENT — continued

Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 44(1) — Supreme Court Act 1970 (NSW), s 65 — Companion Animals Act 1998 (NSW), s 34.

Kuehne v Warren Shire Council (2011) 12.212

Payment by developer to council of monetary contribution as a condition of development consent — Action to recover part of payment from council — Limitation period — Applicable if monetary contribution a tax — Relevant principles — Meaning of “fee, charge or other impost” — Limitation period not applicable — Recovery of Imposts Act 1963 (NSW), ss 1A, 2, 5 — Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW), s 94.

Wrights Road Pty Ltd v Baulkham Hills Shire Council 3.171

Torts — Negligence — Nuisance — Failure to maintain culvert — Liability of council as roads authority — Whether carrying out road work special statutory power — Statutory limitation on council’s liability — Scope of “carry out road work” — Onus of proof of exception to council’s protection from liability — Statutory immunity for council’s allocation of resources — Scope of immunity — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 42, 43A, 45 — Roads Act 1993 (NSW), ss 71, 138.

Mansfield v The Great Lakes Shire Council (2015) 19.281

MEDICINE

Medical practitioners — Nurses — Liability for negligence — Defences — Acceptance of treatment by peer professional opinion — Elements of defence — Conflicting medical opinions — Lack of cross-examination — Consequent problem — Differentiation between conflicting medical opinions — Relevant factor — Peer professional opinion — Whether sound or rational — Relevant factors — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50.

Gould v South Western Sydney Local Health District (2017) 25.12

MONEY COUNTS

Quantum meruit claim — Essentials of action.

RCM Constructions Pty Ltd v S & Y Painting and Decoration Pty Ltd (2008) 8.112

MORTGAGES

Sale under power — Mode of exercise of power — Duty of mortgagee exercising power — Elements of duty — Time at which duty arises — Extent of duty — Breach of duty — Standard of proof required to establish breach of duty.

Hadfield v Commonwealth Bank of Australia 1.41

NEGLIGENCE

Accident due to use of motor cycle — Ridden by fellow employee of plaintiff — Cycle unregistered and uninsured — Proceedings for damages for personal

NEGLIGENCE — continued

injuries — Application of transport accident legislation — Procedural preconditions — Procedures not carried out — Proceedings invalid — Irrelevant that claim could be otherwise characterised — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 70, 72, 92, 108, 109.

Atkins v Henwood 2.225

Actions for — Defences — Statutory defence of plaintiff's intoxication — Application of defence — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50.

Langendoen v Coolangatta Estate Pty Ltd (2012) 15.342

Actions for — Defences — Whether damage due to materialisation of obvious risk of dangerous recreational activity — Methods of assessing if activity "dangerous" — Whether risk of flying in light aircraft "obvious" — Relevant factors — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5F, 5G, 5J, 5K, 5L.

Campbell v Hay (2013) 16.74

Causation — Fall on railway station steps — Plaintiff's ankle broken — Plaintiff later sexually assaulted and beaten — Plaintiff's immobility due to fall largely prevented her from avoiding this later harm — Whether psychological harm from assault and beating caused by or foreseeable consequence of defendant's negligence — Statutory elements of causation — Relevant principles — Damages for non-economic loss to include plaintiff's psychological harm — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW) s 5D.

Chu v State Rail Authority of New South Wales 4.233

Contributory negligence — Motor vehicle accident — Skateboard rider's participation in "skitching" — Failure of rider to wear protective helmet — Whether finding of contributory negligence mandatory — Whether such finding available at common law — Whether negation of contributory negligence by adult car driver's negligence — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 138(2)(d).

Schoupp v Verryt (2014) 18.163

Contributory negligence — Statutory test of liability — Identification of applicable principles — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5C, 5R(1).

Li Fu v Owners of Strata Plan 75626 (2012) 14.246

Damages — Contributory negligence of plaintiff — Relevant circumstances.

Kalolane Pty Ltd v Hungry Jack's Pty Ltd (2015) 20.168

Damages — Future economic loss — Measure of — Person's arrest and imprisonment after accident — Proper approach to assessment of future earning capacity.

Kemble v Gate Gourmet Services Pty Ltd (2012) 14.161

Damages — Personal injuries — Defences — Intoxication — Circumstances when liability for negligence negated by injured person's intoxication — Entry into bathroom — Low level of intoxication insufficient to negate such liability — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50.

Davies v George Thomas Hotels Pty Ltd (2010) 10.351

Defences — Obvious risk — Scope of such risk — Transport accident legislation — Whether injury caused by defect in a vehicle — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5F.

Richards v Cornford (2009) 8.353

NEGLIGENCE — continued

Defences — Resources based defence — Student injured at school — School's operational welfare policy mechanisms and procedures in place — No additional staff, material or monetary resources required to address risk — Defence not relevant — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 42.

H v New South Wales (2009) 9.255

Duty of care — Club patron going home from club premises — Injured by fall into hole in public open space used by other patrons and members of the public — Club did not own, control or occupy area — No duty of care on club.

Mansfield v Nelson Bay Bowling & Recreation Club 4.81

Duty of care — Company's accountant's office used as company's registered office — Statutory demand and winding up summons served on registered office — Duty to notify company of receipt of statutory demand — Duty satisfied if document forwarded to company by pre-paid ordinary mail — Duty to ensure summons brought to company's notice — Duty not satisfied if nothing else done by accountant regarding summons than forwarding it to the company by pre-paid ordinary mail — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5O — Corporations Act 2001 (Cth), s 142.

HP & CJ Sweeney Pty Ltd v CA Hill & Associates Pty Ltd 3.299

Duty of care — Contract with third party made by company — Company owes duty of care to third party — Director carries out all of company's obligations under contract — Director also owes duty of care to third party.

The Owners Corporation Strata Scheme 40022 v Tyrrells Building Consultancy Pty Ltd 3.50

Duty of care — Head contractor — Duty owed by head contractor to employees or other contractors at building site — Concurrent duty with duty owed by other contractors to their employees — Worker's fall through unfenced opening in concrete slab — Application of *res ipsa loquitur* principle — Statutory reduction of damages — Whether applicable where although worker entitled to sue employer at common law, no damages would be recoverable — No reduction in damages payable by person other than employer if no damages recoverable from employer — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z.

Leite v Tarabay 5.283

Duty of care — Injury to participant in "Work for the Dole" scheme — Injury at work site supervised by entity providing and organising labour for scheme — Extent of duty of care.

Thomson v Twin Towns Employment Enterprises Ltd (2008) 7.328

Duty of care — Injury to users of highway — Criminal conduct of third parties causing death of driver — Circumstances where road authority liable — Special relationships — Road authority and road users — Scope of duty of care of road authority — Statutory prohibition against challenging allocation of public authority's financial resources — Extent of prohibition — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 42(b).

Refrigerated Roadways Pty Ltd v Roads and Traffic Authority of NSW (2008) 7.45

Duty of care — Injury to users of trains — Mistakes made by person attempting to board train — Ignoring warnings train's doors were about to close — No higher or non-delegable duty thereby cast on train service provider.

Alam v Rail Corporation New South Wales (2008) 8.81

NEGLIGENCE — continued

Duty of care — Investigations of Department of Community Services — Whether duty of care can be imposed on Department over its conduct — Relevant principles — Department's broad-based statutory discretions would conflict and be inconsistent with imposition of general duty of care.

SY and TY by their next friend Y v New South Wales (2008) 6.317

Duty of care — Large scale building site — Builder also occupier, developer and project manager — Knowledge that area on site was potentially dangerous — Obligation to inform all workers on site who could be expected to be exposed to such danger.

Boric v Vujinovic 4.336

Duty of care — Licensee of hotel — Scope of duty to patrons — Breach of council issued licence — Relevance — Attack by one patron on another patron — Licensee's lack of knowledge of risk — Not definitive of breach of duty if due to inadequate staffing — Whether duty of care delegable — Extent of delegation — Effect on licensee's liability to patrons — Inadequate provision of security — Breach of duty of care — Injury closely following breach — Prima facie causal connection between breach and injury.

Perkins v Redmond Company Pty Ltd 5.21

Duty of care — Medical practitioner — Surgeon — Statutory defence of conduct accepted as competent by peer professional opinion — Defence not applicable if peer professional opinion irrational — Determination if such opinion irrational — Relevant test — Elective surgical treatment — Primary consideration of such treatment — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5O.

Hope v Hunter and New England Area Health Service (2009) 10.63

Duty of care — Occupier's liability — Independent contractor injured at building site — Extent of occupier's duty of care.

Juric v Transformex Pty Ltd (2007) 6.224

Duty of care — Occupiers liability — Criminal assault on club patron by robber during robbery on club's premises — General principle that occupier then has no duty of care to injured person — Exceptions to general principle — Circumstances when exceptions may exist — Breach of duty — Failure by occupier to undertake reasonably available measures — Whether necessary for risk of injury to be eliminated, or to be significantly reduced, for breach to occur through such failure.

Brown v Drummoyne Sports Club Ltd 5.98

Duty of care — Occupier's liability — Scope of such liability — Risk of slipping — Whether "obvious risk" — Consequence of classification of risk as obvious — Whether risk "inherent" — Relevant factors — Walking dog along beach in company of friend — Whether recreational activity — Whether negation of duty of care thereby — Relevant factors — Scope of "public authority" — Whether statutory defences thereby applicable — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5D, 5E, 5F, 5H, 5I, 5J, 5K, 5M, 5R, 5S, 42, 43A — Sydney Water Act 1994 (NSW), ss 3, 5, 21, 37.

Hodgson v Sydney Water Corporation (2016) 24.72

Duty of care of driver of motor vehicle — Relevant principles.

Sheldrick v Beveridge 4.281

Duty of care owed by ambulance officers to patients — Scope of duty — Refusal of patient to participate in examination by ambulance officer — Duty of care

NEGLIGENCE — continued

may thereby be negated — Knowledge of ambulance officer that patient had head injury — Standard of care then required.

Neal v Ambulance Service of New South Wales 5.210

Duty of care — Particular cases — Mariner's duty to other users of sea — Extent of duty — Defences — Whether defences of voluntary assumption of risk and contributory negligence applicable to rescuer — Relevant factors.

Blackney v Clark (2013) 17.36

Duty of care — Particular cases — Roads authority — Statutory defence — Whether "public road" inclusive of car park — Relevant factors — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 45(1) — Roads Act 1993 (NSW), s 249(1).

Cavric v Willoughby City Council (2014) 18.265

Duty of care — Particular cases — Supply to worker by occupier of premises of trolleys known by occupier to be defective — Dismissal of worker's complaints about equipment — Lack of maintenance for equipment — Negligent conduct of very high order.

Kemble v Gate Gourmet Services Pty Ltd (2012) 14.161

Duty of care — Particular relationships — Innkeeper's liability — Motel operator wrongfully locking guest out of premises — No alternative means of access provided — Guest injured taking obvious risk to gain entry to motel — Whether motel operator owed guest duty of care to prevent guest taking such risk — Statutory negation of duty to warn against obvious risk — Duty to prevent harm from obvious risk not thereby ended — Whether guest voluntarily assumed risk of being injured — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5H.

Tillman v Kelso Australia Pty Ltd (2008) 8.48

Duty of care — Particular relationships — Landlord and member of tenant's household — Extent of duty — Defective or dangerous facilities in premises — Identification of such facilities — No duty of care in relation to unsuitable rather than defective or dangerous facilities in premises.

Vasilikopoulos v New South Wales Department of Housing (2009) 9.54

Duty of care — Particular relationships — Liability of operator of licensed premises for security guard working at premises — Whether same duty of care as such operator's duty of care towards patrons at premises — Removal from premises of disorderly person — Provision of instructions to security guard on avoidance of involvement with such removal — Whether part of operator's duty to security guard.

Nicoll v Dobeson and Others; Nicoll v Workers Compensation

Nominal Insurer and Others (No 3) (2014) 18.339

Duty of care — Particular relationships — Police officer and member of public — Police officer and witness — Currently no duty of care owed by police officer — Grooming or inappropriate behaviour by police officer towards witness — Whether such conduct actionable otherwise than by proceedings in negligence.

Auditore v New South Wales (2017) 25.346

Duty of care — Particular relationships — Slip and fall event involving female shopper in shopping mall — Shopper in advanced stage of pregnancy — Relevance.

Murko v Greenfields Narellan Holdings and Another (2015) 21.27

Duty of care — Police officer questioning person in public — Circumstances

NEGLIGENCE — continued

when duty of care can arise — Parameters of duty.

Welsh v New South Wales 4.90

Duty of care — Special relationships and duties — Hospitals — Defences — Statutory exemption from liability for discharge from hospital — Whether transport arrangements for patient part of discharge — Standard of care for professionals — Application of statutory test — Statutory immunity of doctor in mental hospital — Scope of immunity — Distinction between incorrect and negligent conduct — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5O — Mental Health Act 1990 (NSW), ss 35(3), 43A, 294.

Simon and Another; McKenna v Hunter & New England Local

Health District (2012) 14.60

Duty of care — Special relationships and duties — Occupiers — Supermarket — Reasonable system of cleaning and inspection to avoid slippings by customers — Aisle containing liquid items — Reasonable minimum frequency of inspections and cleanings.

Alat v Franklins Pty Ltd (2012) 15.203

Duty of care — Special relationships and duty — School teacher and pupil — Entry into sexual relationship — Breach of duty of care — Whether seduction “sexual misconduct” — School’s vicarious liability — Sexual relationship outside scope of teacher’s employment — Criminal acts of pupil — Whether award of damages to pupil precluded — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3B, 54.

Withyman v State of NSW and Another (2010) 11.169

Duty of care — Special relationships — Prison inmate — Statutory requirement for provision of written notice of incident giving rise to claim within six months after incident — Determination of what constituted such incident — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 26BA, 26BD, Sch 1, cl 35.

Petit v New South Wales and Another (2012) 14.358

Duty of care — Special relationships — Vintage aircraft owner and guest on flight — Scope of duty — Use of common sense by person disembarking from aircraft — Whether duty of care negated — Obvious risk — Negation of duty to warn — Effect on other aspects of duty of care — Alighting from stationary vintage aircraft after flight — Whether dangerous recreational activity — Civil Liability Act 2002NSW, ss 5F, 5H, 5K, 5L.

Neate v Fox (2012) 13.319

Duty of care — Tenant of unit injured on common property of unit complex — Liability of lessor/owner and developer of complex — Appropriate standard of care to users of common property — Circumstances when provision of single step in common passageway can constitute negligence — Whether architect who designed such passageway but not lighting or tile colours owed duty of care to its users — Lessor’s contractual duty of care to tenant of unit — Appropriate standard of care — Relevant principles — Whether duty extends to common property in unit complex.

Cartwright v Villamoss Pty Ltd 5.64

Duty of care — Volunteer injured whilst helping to plant trees at site controlled by defendant — Relevant principles — Breach of duty of care.

Greenwood v Richmond Riparian Management Landcare Inc 5.254

Economic loss — By negligent act — Tax agent — Failure to declare all client’s

NEGLIGENCE — continued

income — Failure to claim superannuation tax concessions — Time of accrual of damage — Relevant principles — Accrual not dependent on discovery or discoverability of negligent acts — Duties of tax agent and tax agent's client.

Christie v Purves 3.85

Elements of tort — Loss or damage — Ascertainment of when loss occurred — Money lent on basis of valuer's alleged excessive valuation of property — Loan secured by mortgage — Default under mortgage — Whether loss occurred upon default or when mortgagee's sale of property realised a shortfall.

Key Nominees Pty Ltd v Ace Insurance Ltd (2008) 6.357

Essentials of cause of action — Breach of duty of care — Relevance of breach of Australian Standards.

Normoyle (t/as Liverpool Auto Sales) v Ducin Pty Ltd (2005) 19.98

Essentials of cause of action — Breach of duty of care — Spillage of liquid in aisle of supermarket — Consequent injury to shopper — Reliance of supermarket on "clean as you go" cleaning system — Lack of evidence on effectiveness of system — System not reasonable — Whether adopted system of inspection reasonable — Whether breach of supermarket's duty of care.

Prasad v Woolworths Ltd (2017) 24.356

Essentials of cause of action — Breach of duty of care — Standard of care — Public authority — Social utility of activity causing harm — Death threat to, and stabbing of, school boy by fellow student at school — Statutory requirement, if relevant, to consider victim's actions if no negligence — Not relevant where student injured at school — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5D(3).

H v New South Wales (2009) 9.255

Essentials of cause of action — Causation — Indirect cause of damage — Direct cause of damage otherwise may not exist — Liability can exist for indirect cause of damage.

Refrigerated Roadways Pty Ltd v Roads and Traffic Authority of NSW (2008) 7.45

Essentials of cause of action — Duty of care — Motor vehicle accidents — Particular relationships — Driver and passenger — Driver's intoxication known to passengers — Passengers not wearing seat belts — Some passengers not in passenger seats — Driver unlicensed to knowledge of one passenger — Whether driver owed duty of care to any passenger — Effect of relevant statutory provisions — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 138, 141.

Green v The Nominal Defendant (2012) 14.128

Essentials of cause of action — Duty of care — Occupier's liability — Extent of liability — Relevant factors — Causation — Application of "common sense" test.

Kalolane Pty Ltd v Hungry Jack's Pty Ltd (2015) 20.168

Essentials of cause of action — Duty of care — Security guard at shopping centre — Relevant duty after notification of spillage in common area of shopping centre — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5C, 5D, 5R.

Lightfoot and Another v Tamworth Shoppingworld Pty Ltd and Another (2016) 22.73

Essentials of cause of action — Standard of care — Acts requiring special skills — Helicopter pilot — Legislative requirements — Effect of breach of such

NEGLIGENCE — continued

requirements — Defence of breach due to “unavoidable cause” — Scope of such defence — Defence of conduct being competent professional practice according to peer professional opinion — Scope of such defence — Civil Aviation Act 1988 (Cth), s 30 — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50 — Civil Aviation Regulations 1988 (Cth), regs 140, 157.

AV8 Air Charter Pty Ltd v Sydney Helicopters Pty Ltd (2012) 15.259

Fatal accidents legislation — Assessment of damages — Relevant principles — Measure of damages — Statutory limitation of damages for economic loss — Time of application of limitation — Superannuation benefits — Exclusion from statutory limitation — Accelerated financial benefit from death of family member — Effect where such benefit is negative — Loss of domestic assistance — Loss recoverable even if services not replaced — Widow’s prospects of remarriage — Discount of damages — Discount questionable — Compensation to Relatives Act 1897 (NSW), ss 3, 4 — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 125.

Pascoe v Kaplantzi 2.6

Liability of owners corporation — Duty of care — Relevant principles — Statutory requirements in relation to common property — Scope of requirements — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 62.

King v The Owners Corporation Strata Plan 2311 3.271

Occupiers liability — Duty of care — Spillage on common area of shopping centre — Injury to person entering premises — Period of time between notification of spillage and arrival of cleaner — Relevant duty.

Lightfoot and Another v Tamworth Shoppingworld Pty Ltd and

Another (2016) 22.73

Occupier’s liability — Duty of care — Injuries to person in car park premises — Slip by person on wet painted kerb — Painting of surface of kerb — Whether proof thereby that surface insufficiently slip resistant — Failure to use non-slip paint on kerb — Whether breach of duty of care.

Johnston v Rooty Hill RSL Club Pty Ltd (No 2) (2014) 19.250

Particular relationships — Solicitor and client — Duty of care — Extent of duty — Solicitor taking over matter from another solicitor — Duty to review — Extent of duty — Nervous shock claim — Obligation on client to advise solicitor of disabilities on which claim could be based — Extent of obligation.

Cox v Sloan 2.202

Plaintiff’s claim against his solicitor and barrister — Defendants’ intended reliance on advocates’ immunity — Nature, scope and availability of immunity — Whether immunity can be raised where claim involves issues that had not been finalised in previous litigation — Whether immunity can be raised where client challenging payment of fees to counsel — Whether immunity can be relied on by barrister who takes on role of expert witness.

Fowler v La Fontaine 5.373

Proof of — Personal injury claims — Evidence — Failure of defendant to produce material in answer to subpoena — Information peculiarly within defendant’s knowledge — Consequence.

Kemble v Gate Gourmet Services Pty Ltd (2012) 14.161

Proof of — Res ipsa loquitur principle — Surgical sponge left inside patient — Divided function and responsibility involved in surgical procedure —

NEGLIGENCE — continued

Establishment of surgeon's negligence — Whether principle applicable.

O'Hagan v Sakker (2011) 12.329

Road accident cases — Causation — “Agony of the moment” principle — Application of principle.

Bateman v The Nominal Defendant (2012) 15.239

Road accident cases — Causation — Whether accident blameless — Relevant principles — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 7A, 7E(1), 7E(2).

Hossain v Mirdha (2015) 20.348

Road accident cases — Damages — Claim for statutory powers of court — Scope of powers — Whether inclusive of power of court to order injured claimant's attendance at medical examination for purpose of assessment of that person's eligibility for participation in lifetime care scheme — Relevance of current lack of power to make such order — Relevance of consequent increase in potential damages to such person if not participant in such scheme — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 86.

Adilzada v The Nominal Defendant (2016) 22.54

Road accident cases — Transport accident legislation — Prescribed method of service of document — Whether prescription mandatory or facultative — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 222.

Kalazich v Yang (2012) 16.116

Road accident cases — Transport accident legislation — Service by insurer of negligent driver of notice requiring injured person to commence proceedings — Content of notice — Effectiveness of notice containing erroneous and misleading information — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 110.

Kalazich v Yang (2012) 16.116

Road accident cases — Transport accident legislation — Statutory compensation — Meaning of “injury” — Whether necessary for fault to be contemporaneous with usage of vehicle — Whether usage of motor vehicle could give rise to continuing tort — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 3.

Vu v Nominal Defendant & NRMA Insurance Ltd (2010) 12.8

PENALTY

What constitutes a penalty — General principles — Payment of charges — Payment not contingent on breach of contract — Whether charges properly characterised as penalty.

Cosco Container Lines Co Ltd and Another v Unity Int'l Cargo Pty Ltd (2012) 15.1

What constitutes a penalty — Whether clause in lease agreement providing for acceleration of payments a penalty — Relevant principles.

Medfin Australia Pty Ltd v Rafter 4.272

PERSONAL PROPERTY

Choses in action — Assignment of debt — Statutory requirements — Written notice of assignment to debtor — Assignee provided means to infer assignment — Insufficient compliance with statute — Conveyancing Act 1919 (NSW), s 12.

Close Finance (CL) Ltd v Kountouris 2.331

POLICE

Methods of investigation — Methods likely to lead to illegality to be discouraged.

R v Ibrahim 3.77

Misconduct and discipline — Disclosure of material acquired in conduct of investigation — Whether non-admissibility of documents precluded inspection — Police Act 1990 (NSW), s 170(1) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56, 57, 58.

Wilson v New South Wales (2008) 7.181

Offences by and against police — Powers and duties — Arrest — Use of reasonable force — Excessive use of force by police — Such conduct negated finding police acted in execution of their duty — Escalating level of violence by police — Circumstances where such conduct within concept of “reasonable force” — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 231.

R v Murray (2008) 7.353

Police force — Conditions of service — Entitlements on discharge — Superannuation allowance — Certification by Police Superannuation Advisory Committee as to nature of constable’s infirmity — Whether Commissioner of Police able to challenge committee’s certificate — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), ss 10B(3)(a), 21.

Grose v Commissioner of Police (No 2) (2013) 16.136

Police force — Conditions of service — Superannuation allowance — “Hurt on duty” pension — Application for — Statutory requirement of notification of claim for superannuation allowance within prescribed time — Commissioner of Police not decision-maker as to whether requirement complied with — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), s 10B(2)(a).

Page v Commissioner of Police (2012) 15.7

Police force — Conditions of service — Superannuation allowance — Whether duty on police force to inform police officer of right to claim superannuation allowance — Circumstances when no such duty.

Swift v SAS Trustee Corporation (2009) 9.213

Powers and duties — Arrest — Scope of power to arrest.

R v Buddee (2016) 24.322

Powers and duties — Arrest — Whether arrest in breach of statutory duties — Relevant circumstances — Whether police policy consistent with statutory legal requirements for justification of arrest — Statutory alternative to arrest — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), ss 99(3), 201(1)(b), 201(1)(c) — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 89.

POLICE — continued

- Smith v New South Wales (2016)* 22.148
- Powers and duties — Arrest — Whether arrest without warrant lawful — Relevant statutory factors — Whether arrest “necessary” — Relevant test — Relevance of statutory mission statement — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 99(3) — Police Act 1990 (NSW), s 6.
- Travers v New South Wales (2016)* 24.56
- Powers and duties — Displaying accused for media — Impropriety of.
- R v Schiff (2010)* 12.166
- Powers and duties — Powers under Road Transport Act 2013 (NSW) — Whether part of statutory criminal investigation powers — Whether Act authorisation for random crime stop — Provision of negative reading by driver after administration of random breath test — Whether subsequent further detention or interrogation of occupants or search of vehicle permissible — Scope of Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW).
- R v Buddee (2016)* 24.322
- Powers and duties — Scope of duties — Protection of person lying on ground from interference by others — Protection of other police assisting that person — Part of execution of duty of police.
- Jolly v R (2009)* 9.225
- Proceedings against — Negligence — Duty of care — Principle of operational immunity — Exception to immunity principle where bystander victim of act of police officer — Whether exception applicable — Relevant circumstances — Whether principle applicable to intentional torts by police.
- McMaster v New South Wales (2013)* 17.250
- Statutory power to detain and then release intoxicated person into care of responsible person — Whether hospital was a “responsible person” — Intoxicated Persons Act 1979 (NSW), ss 5(1)(d), 5(3).
- Neal v Ambulance Service of New South Wales* 5.210
- Whether injury to policeman occurred in course of duty — Circumstances when duty ended — Employment substantial contributory factor to injury — Vehicle involved in course of such employment — Whether ownership of vehicle material — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), ss 12D, 21 — Police Act 1990 (NSW), s 6 — Worker Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 9A.
- Lavin v Commissioner of Police (2007)* 6.127

PRACTICE

- Abuse of process — Dismissal of proceedings as — Grounds for — Proceedings for defamation over document surreptitiously taken from opposing camp — Ground to strike out proceedings.
- Calabro v Zappia (2010)* 11.12
- Abuse of process — Dismissal of proceedings as — Grounds for — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 13.4.1.
- A v Department of Family and Community Services and Others (2015)* 20.353
- Action for defamation — Application to amend Statement of Claim — Whether

PRACTICE — continued

amendment futile or untenable — No binding authority to establish amendment bad at law — Inappropriate therefore to resolve question of law adversely to party seeking amendment — Purpose of amended pleading to avoid forensic difficulty — Pleading otherwise permissible — Such purpose irrelevant.

Keramaniakis v Wagstaff 3.1

Adjournment — Costs of — Whether consideration of costs dependent on opposing party's application for such costs.

Vumbaca v Sultana (2012) 15.375

Adjournment — Discretionary considerations — Unavailability of counsel of choice exceptional reason — Mere assertion of matter arising from Constitution — Not ground for adjournment — Reopening of case — Application for — Grounds — Reasons for failing to adduce evidence — Other relevant factors — Potential prejudice of reopening case — Transfer of proceedings from one court to another — Relevance of delay and costs.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Liu (2012) 15.57

Adjournment — Refusal — Application for adjournment on day of hearing of proceedings in District Court's Defamation List — Relevant considerations — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56-62.

Australian Chinese Community Association of New South Wales Ltd v Pun and Others (2017) 24.251

Admissions — Direction of entry of judgment — Application for — Court's discretion — Not to be exercised where prospect of injustice — Admissions not to be considered in isolation — Admissions alone not an estoppel — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 15, r 3.

BHP Steel Ltd v Whitehouse 1.167

Admissions — Formal admissions — Notice to Admit Facts — Non-admission of facts subsequently proven in proceedings — Indemnity cost consequences where Notice not re-pleading of whole case and evidence available for admission or disputation of facts in Notice — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.8.

Randall v New South Wales (2014) 18.100

Amendment — Refusal — Discretion — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Undue prejudice to other party — Scope of prejudice — Whether costs order curative of prejudice.

Page v Commissioner of Police (2012) 15.7

Amendment — Statement of claim — Amendment for abandonment of claim in excess of court's jurisdictional limit — Grant of leave to amend — Prospects.

Dueeasy Pty Ltd and Another v Devlin and Another (2014) 20.13

Amendment — Statutory power to permit document to be amended — Scope of power — Statutory power to substitute new cause of action for existing one — Scope of power — Rules of court — Statutory power to dispense with rules — Scope of power — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 14, 64, 65.

Rodgers v Nine Network Australia Pty Ltd (No 2) (2008) 8.157

Appeal against decision of Victims Compensation Tribunal — Appeal out of time — Application for leave to appeal — Relevant factors — Victims Support and Rehabilitation Act 1996 (NSW), s 39.

James v Victims Compensation Fund 3.66

PRACTICE — continued

Appeal to District Court against decision of Local Court — Appeal brought within time — Notice of appeal against severity of sentence — Application to amend Notice to Appeal to appeal against conviction as well — Statutory power to allow amendment — Exercise of power — Relevant factors — Forms on Attorney-General's website — Defects in forms — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 11, 14, 20, 62(2).

R v Holten 4.187

Appearance — Powers of court — Action for recovery of liquidated claim — Non-appearance of defendant — Court's power to proceed to judgment without proceeding to trial — Whether conditional on proof of defendant's notification of hearing — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 29.7.

Gunns Finance Pty Ltd (recs and mgrs apptd) (in liq) v

Marks-Isaacs (2015) 23.95

Application for leave to cross-examine own witness — Second such application — Statutory discretionary power to grant such leave — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (Cth), s 38.

R v Hufnagl (No 2) (2008) 7.207

Breach of statutory procedure by plaintiff — Action therefore not presently maintainable — Defendant raising breach in defence — Required to plead such defence — Purpose and effect of District Court Practice Note No 2 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 14.14(2)(b).

Varneba Pty Ltd v Simpson 4.182

Case management system — Breaches of case management orders — Consequences of permitting significant breaches — Costs orders for breaches — Effect.

Battalgia v Berman 1.143

Case management system — History and effectiveness — Need to provide efficient system — Need for court's insistence on compliance with Practice Note 33 and relevant Rules — Factor of unfairness to each party and to all other litigants before the court.

Battalgia v Berman 1.143

Change of venue — Application for — Relevant principles — Principles may be out of date — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 8 r 8.2, Pt 29 r 29.3.

Boland v Dillon 4.63

Children's Court — Procedural fairness — Duty to observe — Refusal to permit party to cross-examine witnesses — Possibility of different outcome had cross-examination been allowed — Breach of procedural fairness — Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 (NSW), s 93.

SM v Department of Community Services (2009) 8.190

Claim for damages for personal injuries — Adjudgment application — New medical report — Evidence provided for first time of detailed costing of future medical expenses — Constitutes "significant evidence" obliging court to refer action for further assessment — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 111.

Trang Ma v Ta To Ho 1.312

Commencement of proceedings — Costs — Verdict below \$40,000 — Whether

PRACTICE — continued

commencement and continuation in District Court appropriate — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.35.

McGlen-McLeod v Galloway (No 2) (2012) 13.359

Commencement of proceedings — Parties — Issue whether plaintiff legally incompetent — Appointment by court of expert to inquire into and report on issue — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.46(1).

Xardia v Commissioner of Taxation and Commissioner of NSW Police; Xardia v Department of Defence (2016) 22.192

Commencement of proceedings — Parties — Joinder of — Application for — Proceedings against party no longer in existence — Status of proceedings — Whether nullity — Efficacy of order for joinder of existing legal entity — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 63 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 6.1A.

Sesa v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (2015) 20.134

Commencement of proceedings — Parties — Proceedings instituted against nonexistent parties — Whether proceedings null and void ab initio.

Taylor v Centennial Newstan Pty Ltd (2008) 7.40

Costs — Departing from general rule — Order for costs on indemnity basis — Conduct of parties — Abuse of process — Proceedings brought for a collateral purpose — Achievement of purpose not a relevant factor — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 148.

Stevens v Sullivan 1.138

Costs — Entitlement — Party seeking costs not successful on all issues — Relevant factors — Indemnity costs — Circumstances justifying order.

Andrews v New South Wales 1.230

Costs — Indemnity costs order — Relevant principles — Losing party's assessment that its case was hopeless — Sufficient basis for order — Non-party costs order — Need for losing party to be nominee of non-party — Not a requirement for order — Failure to notify non-party that order will be sought — Effect — Interest on costs — Circumstances when appropriate to order — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 85(4).

Timothy O'Brien Pty Ltd v Mistral Vision Pty Ltd 2.86

Costs — Offer of compromise — Alleged ambiguity — Resolution — Relevant factors.

Abbott v Klein (No 3) (2015) 20.199

Costs — Orders for costs — Order for immediate assessment of costs — When order appropriate — Relevant principles — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 58 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.7.

Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 3) (2013) 18.385

Costs — Security for costs — Applicant recipient of contractual indemnity for costs of proceedings — Whether security for costs necessary.

S & R Richards Pty Ltd v Valley Patios & Decks Pty Ltd and Another (2016) 21.365

Costs — Security for costs — Lengthy period of time before final hearing — Appropriate quantum of security for costs order — Appropriateness of staged payments of such order.

PRACTICE — continued

- S & R Richards Pty Ltd v Valley Patios & Decks Pty Ltd and Another (2016)* 21.365
- Costs — Statutory limit on recoverability — Application of legislation — Question of law — Jurisdiction to decide — Determinable by court and not costs assessor — Action for malicious prosecution — Statutory limit not applicable — Legal Profession Act 1987 (NSW), Div 5B.
- Andrews v New South Wales* 1.230
- Course of evidence — Re-opening case — Hearing concluded — Judgment reserved — Leave to re-open case — Relevant factors.
- Angel v Woolworths Ltd* 1.271
- Court's power to reject medical certificate as to degree of permanent impairment caused by a motor vehicle accident — Motion to have court exercise power — Brought well before trial of action for damages — Appropriate procedure — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 61(4).
- Towell v Schuettrumpe* 4.41
- Criminal charges — Permanent stay of proceedings — Application for — Exceptional nature of relief sought — Whether prosecution was an abuse of process — Circumstances did not warrant granting of stay.
- R v Amoedo* 4.305
- Criminal proceedings — Hearing in presence of accused — Accused taken ill just before delivery of jury verdict — Whether verdict should be delivered — Relevant factors.
- R v Leonard (No 2) (2008)* 7.278
- Criminal trial — Sixth trial after five discontinued trials — Prosecution's proposed tender of audio recording of complainant's evidence in previous trials — No such evidence given in trial immediately preceding new trial — No impediment to proposed tender — Required written notice of proposed tender given to accused — Wrong provision referred to in notice — No prescribed form of notice in regulation — Misdescription did not vitiate legality of notice — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 306L.
- R v G* 4.328
- Cross-claims — Motions — Application for severance of cross-claim from primary proceedings — Application for separate hearing of cross-claim — Relevant factors — Requirement of examination of factual matrix rather than merely pleadings — Court's power to remove party — Scope of power — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 2.1, 6.22, 6.29.
- Reece Pty Ltd v Jones & Jones Master Plumbers Pty Ltd (2012)* 15.28
- Defamation actions — Late application to amend imputations pleaded — Brought just prior to jury trial to determine what imputations, if any, were conveyed by defendant — Such applications commonplace — Should be granted where defendant not prejudiced — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 7A.
- Hertzberg v McLeod* 4.71
- Defamation actions — Proceedings over publications in several Australian states including New South Wales — New South Wales cause of action statute barred — Whether procedure under s 7A of the Defamation Act 1974 (NSW) should still apply — Nature of that provision — Scope of its application — Case management rules applied to proceedings in New South Wales except in

PRACTICE — continued

compelling circumstances — Whether inability to bring cause of action in New South Wales a compelling circumstance — Defamation Act 1974 (NSW), s 7A.

Dehsabzi v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd (No 2) (2008) 6.388

Defamation proceedings — Hearing — Application for hearing at same time of three proceedings by one person against separate parties — Relevant considerations — Effect on all parties and on court of refusal of order — Whether grant of order cause of forensic disadvantage to party — Relevant considerations — Requirement by public of adoption of commonsense solutions by court to keep legal costs low and to use public resources sensibly — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 28.5.

Boikov v Dailymail.com Australia Pty Ltd and Others (2016) 23.112

Default judgment — Setting aside — Whether proof of arguable case always necessary — Relevant factors — Relevant court rules — Application of rules — Whether obtainment of default judgment in good faith — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 36.15, 36.16.

Josa Constructions Pty Ltd v Amarino Pty Ltd (2016) 24.1

Directions — Judicial registrar's "Notice to Practitioners" — Whether applicable to litigation over intentional torts.

Makri v New South Wales (2015) 20.276

Directions — Power to give — Exercise of power — Relevant circumstances — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 57(1)(b), 58(a)(iii), 59, 61(2).

Ghosh v Miller and Others (No 3) (2015) 20.246

Disability — Disabled plaintiff — Court's approval of proposed settlement of proceedings — Settlement monies proposed to be paid out to attorneys under power and enduring guardians appointed by plaintiff — Jurisdiction of District Court to make such order — Exercise of jurisdiction — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 76, 77 — Guardianship Act 1987 (NSW), ss 6, 6J.

Smith v NRMA Insurance Australia Ltd (2008) 8.38

Discovery and inspection of documents — Grounds for resisting — Whether non-admissibility of documents precluded inspection — Legitimate forensic purpose required to gain discovery — Circumstances constituting such purpose — Police Act 1990 (NSW), s 170(1) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56, 57, 58.

Wilson v New South Wales (2008) 7.181

Discovery and inspection of documents — Production of documents — Notice to produce to court — Whether wording of Notice objectionable — Relevant principles — Determination of relevance of documents required for production — Use of contents of affidavits — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 34.

North Shore Real Estate Pty Ltd v Real Estate Property

Management Services Pty Ltd (2017) 24.238

Discovery and service of documents — Grounds for resisting — Service of contents of radio interview — Propriety of insistence on discovery by party in receipt of contents — Tender of document in court under subpoena — Whether discovery of such document necessary — Reality of electronically stored information — Whether revision of court rules necessary — Civil Procedure Act

PRACTICE — continued

2005 (NSW), s 56 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 21.6, 31.10.

Louise v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2015) 20.98

Discovery — Discovery of documents by plaintiffs after consent orders for discovery made — Subsequent issue of Notices to Produce documents by defendants — Whether abuse of process — Proper practice if further documents sought for inspection following discovery.

EDT Global Pty Ltd and Another v Entire Building Solutions Pty Ltd and Another (2017) 24.157

Discovery — Personal injury claims — Unavailability of discovery — Recommendation of reconsideration of such lack of discovery procedure.

Murko v Greenfields Narellan Holdings and Another (2015) 21.27

Dismissal — Abuse of process — Claim for breach of Fair Trading Act 1987 (NSW) — Whether abuse of process — Relevant factors — Application for default judgment where no entitlement thereto — Whether relevant to application for dismissal of claim for abuse of court's process — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 13.4, 14.28.

Mahommed v Unicomb and Others (2016) 22.373

District Court — Costs — Plaintiff's Offer of Compromise — Application for costs on a solicitor/client basis — Requirement that formal particulars of claim be provided at time offer made — In general such particulars are those under Pt 9, r 27 that will be relied on — No such particulars provided — No entitlement to costs order sought — Bullock order — Relevant principles — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 19A, r 2(2).

Grbac v Shellharbour City Council 2.1

District Court — Stay of proceedings — Application for — Related proceedings already instituted in another jurisdiction — Delay in hearing of those proceedings — Relevant factors — Conditional stay granted — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 156.

American Express International Inc v Beck 1.277

Estimate of hearing time — Need to ensure estimate is accurate and that hearing does not exceed estimate — Public interest considerations in litigation proceeding in timely manner.

Greenwood v Richmond Riparian Management Landcare Inc 5.254

Evidence — Belief of provision of dishonest evidence by party or witness — Available remedies — Referral by court of witness or party to Department of Public Prosecutions — Frequency of occurrence — Frequency of subsequent action upon referral.

Amor-Smith v Ching (2016) 22.277

Evidence — Expert opinion — Professional negligence claim — Required contents of expert report — Necessity for each particular of breach of duty and damages to be supported — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.36(1).

Molnar v Kumar (2012) 14.212

Evidence — Expert opinion — Requirement of provision by expert of curriculum vitae and that person's experience — Scope of requirement.

Barrett v Lets Go Adventures Pty Ltd (2016) 23.329

PRACTICE — continued

Evidence — Taking of — Application for presentation of evidence of witnesses by audio-visual link, telephone or other electronic means — Determination of application — General principle — Relevant factors — Resistance to application where plaintiff one of witnesses — Evidence (Audio and Audio Visual Links) Act 1998 (NSW), s 5B — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 63 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.3.

Rothe v Scott (No 3) (2016) 23.54

Evidence — Taking of — Post on website — Determination of questions concerning such post — Need for expert evidence — Difficulties of proof of electronically stored information — Lack of statutory provisions about means of such proof — Increasingly difficult problem in future.

Mohareb v Palmer and Another (No 3) (2016) 22.41

Extension of time for service of Statement of Claim — Limitation period for cause of action expired after Statement of Claim filed — Whether proceedings invalidated — Appropriate approach to exercise of court's discretion to extend time — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 63 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW) rr 1.12, 6.2(4)(b)(i), 10.20(2)(a), 12.11(c).

Judd v Warwick (2007) 6.151

Hearing — Adjournment — Discretionary considerations — Absence of party sued — Notification of that party one week before hearing date — Whether that party relevantly “absent” — No order by court for service of notification of hearing date on such party — Whether such order necessary — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 66 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 29.7.

Facer v Wolfe (2013) 17.391

Hearing — Evidence — Taking of — Presentation of evidence by party with her face other than eyes covered — Whether permissible — Relevant factors.

Elzahed and Others v Commonwealth and Another (2016) 23.199

Hearing — Leave application — Application by plaintiff to reopen case following conclusion of closing submissions of defendant — Determination of application — Relevant principle — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56.

Corrigan v Coles Supermarkets Australia Ltd (2017) 24.385

Hearing — Non-appearance by defendant following notification of hearing date — Continuance of hearing — Appropriateness — Position of judge where defendant not present at hearing — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 17.7.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Shelton (2017) 25.112

Hearing — Parties — Use of written submissions — Benefit of standardisation of such practice.

Petty v Zhao (No 2) (2015) 20.52

Hearing — Place of — Application for change of venue — Anticipated lengthy hearing in Wollongong involving expert witnesses resident in Sydney — Availability now of electronic court facilities — Personal attendance in court of expert witnesses no longer necessary — Use of concurrent evidence procedure — Consequential reduction in hearing time — Need for embracement by courts and practitioners of technological methods of preparation of proceedings and

PRACTICE — continued

presentation of evidence — Relevance of comparative times of hearing in existing or proposed venues — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56-62 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 8.2(1).

Fraser v Health Care Corporation Pty Ltd (2016) 21.368

Hearing — Use of authorised law reports — Provision of such reports to Court rather than provision of unreported judgments — Benefits of use of authorised reports.

Hobbs v Fairall and Another (2016) 22.327

Interim preservation — Application for freezing order against party's funds — Requirement of "good arguable case" by applicant — Satisfaction of requirement — Relevant principles — Nature and scope of freezing orders — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 25.14.

S1 by her tutor S2 v T (2013) 18.21

Interim preservation — Motions — Application for payment from fund for costs of litigating current proceedings — Relevant principles — Prospect of applicant's bankruptcy — Relevance.

Abed v New South Wales and Others (2013) 17.219

Interrogatories — Grounds for resisting — Determining whether interrogatories justifiable — Proper approach — Relevance of quantity and form of interrogatories — Striking out of interrogatories — Relevant principles — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56.

Ivers v New South Wales (2010) 10.164

Judgments and orders — Amending, varying and setting aside — Orders made in absence of party — Ability of court to exercise power to vary or set aside such orders of own motion — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.16(2)(b).

Remedial Building Services Australia Pty Limited v Pony (NSW)

Pty Ltd and Another (No 2) (2013) 17.107

Judgments and orders — Amending, varying and setting aside — Relevant circumstances — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.16(3B).

Ortlipp v Employers Mutual NSW Ltd as agent for the Workers

Compensation Nominal Insurer (No 4) (2014) 19.140

Judgments and orders — Amendment of reasons for delivered decision — Consumer Trader and Tenancy Tribunal — Statutory jurisdiction to amend reasons for decision after decision delivered — Scope of jurisdiction — Whether tribunal had power to make new and substantive findings to those set out in reasons for decision — Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal Act 2001 (NSW), s 50.

Ung v Ng (2009) 8.389

Judgments and orders — Application to amend — Action against two defendants — Separate liabilities — One joint judgment rather than two separate judgments entered — Potential flaw if bankruptcy proceedings took place — Entry of separate judgments against each defendant involved no exercise of discretion — Jurisdiction to amend — Scope of jurisdiction — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.17.

Lucas and Another v Montgomery and Another (2008) 7.295

Judgments and orders — Default judgment — Application for such judgment on

PRACTICE — continued

first or second return date — Inappropriateness of such practice in defamation proceedings.

Gomez v Olsen (2014) 19.152

Judgments and orders — Default judgment — Default in filing of defence — Application to set aside judgment — Whether fairly arguable defence — Assertion of inability to ascertain if goods delivered — Insufficient for raising of prima facie defence.

Ringwood & Ply Pty Ltd v Conform Australia Pty Ltd (2014) 20.1

Judgments and orders — Enforcement — Non-publication order of parties' names — Whether determination of existence and elements of tort of breach of privacy appropriate in application for summary dismissal.

X v AB Commission and Others (2016) 22.260

Judgments and orders — Judgment for want of evidence — Whether procedure applicable for one of several causes of action in proceedings — Relevant factors — Whether grant of such judgment mandatory — Relevance of plaintiff's credit — Need to take plaintiff's evidence at its highest — Limitations — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 29.9, 29.10.

Wessell v New South Wales (2017) 25.334

Judgments and orders — Reasons for judgment — General obligation to set out submissions of parties — Circumstances when appropriate not to do so.

Rothe v Scott (No 5) (2016) 23.240

Judgments and orders — Setting aside — Application — Source of power — Power exercisable where irregularity of process — Alleged error in correctness of decision and not irregularity of process — Power exercisable where court under misapprehension — Whether existence of such misapprehension — Relevant factors — Breach by applicant of statutory obligations — Effect — Lacuna in applicant's evidence — Effect — Forensic advantage to applicant — Effect — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56(1), 56(2), 98 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 42, rr 36.15, 36.16.

Abbott v Klein (No 3) (2015) 20.199

Judgments and orders — Setting aside — Application — Whether orders made in good faith — Application not to be used simply to revisit orders made — Whether orders made in absence of party — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 36.15(1), 36.16(2)(b).

Kostov v Zhang; Kostov v Fairfax Media Publications Pty Ltd (No 2) (2017) 24.140

Judgments and orders — Setting aside — Court's jurisdiction — Whether enlivenment of jurisdiction where professional negligence by party's counsel or judicial error — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.15(1).

Ghosh v TCN Channel Nine Pty Ltd and Others (No 2); Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 5) (2014) 19.94

Judgments and orders — Statutory requirement for just, quick and fair resolution of litigation — Effect on delivery of judgments — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW).

Strangas and Son Building Contractors Pty Ltd v Lim (2012) 14.222

Judgments or orders — Interlocutory orders — Medical examinations — Application for imposition of certain limitations on such examinations —

PRACTICE — continued

Whether jurisdiction for such imposition — Examinee's responses — Effects — Order for support person for examinee — Whether order appropriate — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 23.4, 23.5, 23.9.

Parker v The Council of Barker College and Another (2015) 21.87

Jurisdiction — Cause of action arising in New South Wales — Claim pursuant to Travel Agents Act 1986 (NSW) — Claim arises not through act or omission of travel agent but through compensation being paid — Amendment to jurisdictional provision — Amendment retrospective — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 47(1).

King and Others v Kehl 1.95

Jurisdiction — Jurisdiction of District Court — Appointment of tutor for plaintiff with cognitive impairment due to brain damage — Statutory definition of legal incapacity — Whether definition exclusive — Court's lack of "parens patriae" jurisdiction — Source of power to make appointment — Benefits of order — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 3(1), 58.

Gergis v Ware (2010) 10.156

Jurisdiction — Medical examinations — Whether existence of procedure for ordering plaintiff to attend medical examination for purpose of obtaining evidence for an application for inclusion in scheme under Motor Accidents (Lifetime Care and Support) Act 2006 (NSW) — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 23.4.

Adilzada v The Nominal Defendant (2016) 22.54

Jurisdiction — Statutory power in respect of non-publication orders — Exercise of power — Relevant factors — Court Suppression and Non-Publication Orders Act 2010 (NSW), s 8(1)(e).

Ghosh v TCN Channel Nine Pty Ltd and Others (No 2); Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 5) (2014) 19.94

Jurisdiction — Stay of proceedings — Exercise of jurisdiction — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 23.9.

Parker v The Council of Barker College and Another (2015) 21.87

Leave to commence proceedings — Application for — Relevant factors — Potential defendant — No right of appearance — Felons (Civil Proceedings) Act 1981 (NSW), s 4.

Wheeler v Police Service (NSW) 1.283

Mediation — Power to order when appropriate — Free mediation services of District Court — Repeat requests for procedure — Burden on court.

Freeburn v The Cake Decorators Association of NSW Inc and Others (No 2) (2014) 19.232

Medical examinations — Discretionary power of court to order plaintiff to undergo such examinations — Refusal to exercise power — Relevant principles — Whether nerve conduction test or neuropsychological testing medical examination or medical procedure — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 23.4 — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 86(1).

Brewster v El-Sayed (2013) 17.115

Medical examinations — Purpose of examination to test veracity of examinee — Application for court order for party to attend such examination — Power to

PRACTICE — continued

order medical examination not to be used for such examination — Whether evidence of results of such testing inadmissible — Certification of medical specialists for workers compensation purposes — Relevance to proceedings under the Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW) — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), ss 102, 103 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 23, Div 1.

Vincent v SAS Trustee Corporation (2016) **22.106**

Medical report — Admissibility — In possession of one party although not served by other party — Rule in relation to procedure for admission of expert reports — Express service required — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 35.17, 35.18(1)(c).

Layland v Foster **3.381**

Order for judgment — Deemed admission of liability — Evidence of waiver of statutory procedural requirement — Admission of liability of defendant — Precludes reliance on plaintiff's breach of procedural requirement — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 11, rr 1(1), 1(2).

Boardman v Brighton Und Refern Plaster Pty Ltd **2.254**

Orders — Non-publication orders — No difference in application in civil and criminal proceedings — Circumstances when appropriate to make order for party's legal representatives or for potential witnesses — Futility in making of order — Relevance — Exercise of discretionary power to make order — Application for dismissal or permanent stay of plaintiff's proceedings — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 72 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 12.7.

"A" by his tutor "S" v State of New South Wales (2011) **13.113**

Originating process — Contents — Need for redrafting of "How to respond" notification.

Gomez v Olsen (2014) **19.152**

Parties — Application by felon for leave to institute proceedings against company for alleged defamation — Refusal of application — Company's application for costs — Whether company's classification as "party" appropriate — Relevant factors — Whether costs order in favour of putative defendant proper.

Farrow v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (No 2) (2017) **24.177**

Parties — Joinder — Application by defendant to join director of a corporate party in liquidation — Order sought that director pay costs awarded to successful defendant against company — Statutory jurisdiction to make order — Circumstances when appropriate to make order — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 98 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.3(2)(c).

Augment Communications Pty Ltd (in liq) v Sedgwick (2008) **8.126**

Parties — Joinder of — Application for — Court's discretionary power to order joinder — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 6.24(1).

New South Wales v Hamod (2008) **8.152**

Parties — Joinder of party — Application for — Essential requirement of service of proposed pleading against such party prior to hearing of application — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56.

PRACTICE — continued

- Sydney Anglican Schools Corporation t/as Roseville College v Mears and Another* (2015) 21.313
- Parties — Joinder of party — Dispute between owner of motor vehicle and third party insurer — Statutory procedure to allow insurer to be joined as third party to proceedings between injured person and owner — Jurisdiction to impose condition on joinder — Motor Accident Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 79, 83.
- Carters v New South Wales* (2009) 10.90
- Parties — Representation — Application by plaintiff's solicitors for leave to file Notice of Ceasing to Act — Discretionary considerations — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 7.29.
- Cha v Oh (No 13)* (2009) 9.67
- Parties — Representation — By unqualified persons — Court's lack of power in respect of grant of permission to representative of accused person by other than Australian legal practitioners — Whether representation by McKenzie friend permissible — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 28, 36.
- Klewer v The Queen* (2016) 23.104
- Parties — Representation by vexatious litigant — Whether application for such leave permissible — Vexatious Proceedings Act 2008 (NSW), ss 4, 5(1)(d), 5(2), 13(1).
- Klewer v The Queen* (2016) 23.104
- Parties — Representation — Self-represented litigant — Assistance by court to such litigant — Degree of assistance.
- Ghosh v Ninemsn Pty Ltd and Others (No 2)* (2013) 17.358
- Parties — Representation — Self-represented party — Entitlement to assistance by court — Extent of such assistance.
- Mohareb v Palmer* (2015) 23.1
- Parties — Separate representation — Appointment by third party insurer of motor vehicle of separate legal representation for two defendants in proceedings brought against each defendant by the other as plaintiff — Whether any right to exclude or limit insurer's right to do so — Consequence of exercise of such alleged right — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 77, 78, 79, 88, 119.
- Casey v Hart* (2016) 24.203
- Party's wish to defend proceedings as to damages only — Lack of procedure to file defence putting plaintiff on notice as to case on damages defendant seeks to raise.
- Martin v Bruce* (2007) 6.157
- Pleading of inconsistent alternative contracts with different defendants — Admission of claim against one defendant by all defendants sued — No admission that such defendant owed money — Plaintiff can pursue claim against all defendants until judgment.
- Blackmore Design Group Pty Ltd v Mudge* 4.30
- Pleadings — Admissions — Whether pleading amount claimed "inaccurate" comprised defence — Court's discretionary power to give judgment following admissions by defendant — Exercise of power — Relevant principles — Civil

PRACTICE — continued

Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56-62 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 17.7.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Shelton (2017) 25.112

Pleadings — Contents — Sufficiency — Whether Amended Statement of Claim embarrassing and vexatious — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 14.7, 14.8.

Managed Growth Solutions Pty Limited v L H Williams Pty Limited (2012) 14.237

Pleadings — Defence — Striking out parts of defence — Relevant principles — Whether plea of estoppel preferable — Need or perceived need to obtain further evidence — Whether causative of prejudice and delay — Relevant circumstances.

Rook v New South Wales (2014) 19.329

Pleadings — Defence — Striking out — Relevant grounds — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 12.7, 13.4, 14.28, 29.7.

Benn v Weber Bros Circus and Logistics Pty Ltd (2017) 25.188

Pleadings — Defences — Failure to plead reliance on issue raised by s 50 of Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW) — Defence provided by section — Statutory requirement to plead — Medical reports concerning issue disallowed — Grant of leave to raise defence inappropriate — Whether reports relevant and admissible — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 14.14.

MD v Sydney South West Area Health Service (2009) 8.232

Pleadings — Defences — Striking out — Circumstances when such remedy not appropriate.

Hennessey v Architectus Group Holdings Pty Ltd (2010) 10.200

Pleadings — Filing — Payment of filing fee with subsequently dishonoured cheque — Effect — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 4.10(5).

Time for Monkeys Enterprises Pty Ltd v Southern Cross Austereo Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 19.402

Pleadings — Matter likely to take party by surprise — Obligation to give notice — Obligation applicable to pure matter of law — Whether “flagging” equal to pleading — Pro bono lawyers — No separate set of standards for such lawyers.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Liu (2012) 15.57

Pleadings — Matter likely to take party by surprise — Whether unacceptable ambush — Relevant factors — Pleading material facts — Reliance on statutory provision — Whether reference to provision necessary — Relevant circumstances.

Foley & Bear Pty Ltd v Boral Ltd (2015) 21.13

Pleadings — No reasonable cause of action disclosed — Amendment cannot cure defect — Statement of Claim may be struck out — More appropriate to strike out proceedings — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 9, r 17, Pt 11A, r 3.

Van Luin v KLM Airlines (trading as KLM Royal Dutch Airlines) 1.25

Pleadings — Particularity — Tort of conspiracy — Requirement of full and detailed pleading and particularisation — Pleading in general terms insufficient — Whether deficiency in pleadings curable by evidence.

PRACTICE — continued

- Scicluna v Royal Motor Yacht Club Port Hacking and Others*
(2014) 18.316
- Pleadings — Statutory limitation to instituting claim for damages against employer — Procedural condition precedent imposed — Inapplicable in certain situations — Plaintiff need not plead such matters unless defendant pleads statutory limitation — Relevant pleading practice — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 9, rr 7 and 9.
- Hu v Northern Sydney Area Health Service* 1.19
- Powers — Rules of court — Power to dispense with rules — Scope of power — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 14.
- Kemble v Gate Gourmet Services Pty Ltd (No 2) (2012)* 14.340
- Powers — To receive further evidence — Application to rely on affidavit served out of time set by court's directions — Application made and affidavit served during course of hearing — Application of statutory case management provisions — Proper approach — Applicant's case enlarged by affidavit — Balance to be struck between competing needs of parties — Relevant factors — Failure to comply with court's Rules — Effect on application — Difference between "trial by ambush" and "trial tactics" — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 60, 61, 66.
- Canturi Corporation Pty Ltd v Gagner Pty Ltd (2008)* 8.17
- Preliminary discovery — Discretionary matters — Whether proposed action within definition of "civil dispute" — Potential for adverse publicity by disclosure of documents — Limited potential for such publicity — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 3(1), 18A — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 5.3, 5.4.
- Bain v Bambit and Australian Health Practitioner Regulation*
Agency (2012) 15.41
- Preliminary discovery — Requirement for court's satisfaction as to specified matters — Relevant principles — Claim for "Declaration of Right" — No such cause of action — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 5.3.
- Hewitt v Galletta (2017)* 25.120
- Procedure under various Acts — Felons (Civil Proceedings) Act 1981 (NSW) — Application by felon for leave to institute defamation action — Exercise of court's discretionary power to grant such leave — Relevant principles — Means of redress for false accusations available to felons apart from actions for defamation — Concept of proportionality of costs — Application of concept to defamation action by felon — Grant of leave to defendant to appear on application — Relevant practice — Need for information about charge against and sentence of felon — Felons (Civil Proceedings) Act 1981 (NSW), ss 4, 7 — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 60.
- Farrow v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2017)* 24.163
- Procedure under various Acts — Scope and exercise of powers of court — Proceedings for apprehended violence order — Not criminal proceedings — Defendant's fitness to plead not relevant — Defendant's cognitive impairment — Propriety of making order sought — Relevant circumstances — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), ss 14, 16, 17, 30, 35, 76, 77.
- Farthing v Phipps (2010)* 12.158

PRACTICE — continued

Production of documents — Criminal proceedings — Release of exhibited documents to Crown for forwarding to Commissioner of Police — Crown's undertaking to produce documents if required — Destruction of documents pursuant to practice or protocol of Commissioner — Court's lack of knowledge of such practice or protocol — Release of documents to Crown matter of concern in light of Commissioner's practice or protocol — Reason for concern — Suggestion for alternative to release of documents to Crown — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 23.

R v RK (2017) 24.353

Referee's report — Whether court should adopt report — Relevant principles — Report challenged on point not considered by referee because not raised in reference — Not in interests of justice to permit such practice.

Blackmore Design Group Pty Ltd v Mudge 4.30

Reference by court — Powers of court — Power to adopt, reject or vary — Exercise of power — Relevant principles — Exercise of discretion to adopt report — Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 20.24.

Childs and Another v Bassett (t/as Bassett Built Constructions)
(2016) 23.294

Reference by court — Reference to appropriate investigating authority — Relevant circumstances — Nature of referral — Basis of such referral — Scope of referral — Need for greater legislative clarity concerning nature of referral procedures.

Mohareb v Palmer and Another (No 4) (2017) 25.60

Reference by court to Referee — District Court's power to review Referee's report — Relevant principles — Ground for report's rejection — Argument on ground not put to Referee — Inappropriate to consider ground — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 28B, r 12.

Peter Breese and Associates Pty Ltd v CCI Holdings Ltd 1.187

Separate determination of questions — When appropriate — Relevant factors — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 28.2, 28.4.

Cape Byron Power I Pty Ltd v Tenova SEMF Pty Ltd (2015) 23.13

Service — Confirmation of service — By appearance in court.

Rich v The Queen (2015) 20.153

Service — Experts' reports — Service by facsimile transmission of report containing material colour photographs — Photographs not properly reproduced — Whether service adequate — Grant of leave for admission of expert report not served in compliance with court's order — Leave granted if exceptional circumstances — Relevant factors — Time of year at which service of report ordered to occur — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.28.

Jelic v Bader (No 2) (2010) 11.1

Service — Service out of jurisdiction — Substituted service — Service by email and Facebook — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 10.14.

Mothership Music Pty Ltd v Ayre and Another (2012) 14.118

Service — Statement of claim — Extension of time for service — Relevant principles — Application for discharge of order for extension of time —

PRACTICE — continued

Relevant factors — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 12.11(1)(b), 12.11(1)(e).

Alex v Australian Broadcasting Corporation and Another (2015) **20.179**

Service — Time for service of expert report — Extension of time — Application for — Whether proof of exceptional circumstances — Exercise of discretion to grant extension of time — Relevant matters — Absence of satisfactory explanation for delay in service of report — Amelioration of effect of absence — Purpose of rule allowing for late service — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.28.

Byers v Frith and Others (2016) **23.159**

Statement of claim — Striking out — Ground of lack of compliance with pleading rules — Extreme step — Preferable course — Cost consequences — Whether order for indemnity costs assessable forthwith appropriate — Relevant circumstances.

Elliott v Tomkins (No 2) (2014) **18.257**

Statutory mandated special hearing — Application for stay — Procedure to adopt in relation to Attorney-General — Mental Health (Criminal Procedure) Act 1990 (NSW), s 19.

R v Cunningham **1.101**

Statutory procedure to convert certificate of adjudication into judgment debt — Statutory entitlement to commence proceedings to set aside judgment — Such proceedings may be commenced by notice of motion — Meaning of “commences proceedings to have the judgment set aside” — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 5, 24, 25 — District Court Rules 1973 (NSW), Pt 31, r 12A.

Parisi Homes Pty Ltd v Plus 55 Village Management Pty Ltd **3.43**

Stay of proceedings — Civil proceedings — Appeal against refusal of grant of legal aid — Statutory stay of proceedings for which aid sought unless “special circumstances” — Whether special circumstances — Relevant factors — Legal Aid Commission Act 1979 (NSW), s 57 — Practice Note DC (Civil) No 5.

A v Department of Family and Community Services and Others (No 2) (2015) **20.358**

Stay of proceedings — Civil proceedings — Concurrent criminal proceedings — Persons charged not parties to civil proceedings — Whether stay appropriate — Relevant principles.

McMaster v New South Wales (2012) **14.367**

Stay of proceedings — Civil proceedings — Statutory entitlement to stay of proceedings of judgment creditor following successful adjudication proceedings in a building dispute — Whether statutory entitlement applicable — Relevant factors — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), ss 25(1), 25(4), 32.

Render Design (Australia) Pty Ltd v Sky Stand Plastering Pty Ltd (2014) **20.220**

Stay of proceedings — Costs — Non-payment by plaintiff of costs of preliminary discovery proceedings — Whether ground for stay of later action against person to whom costs payable — Whether such costs interlocutory costs — Impecuniosity of plaintiff — Effect — Exercise of power to order stay — Relevant factors — Lack of relevant rule — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW),

PRACTICE — continued

- s 5 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pts 5, 12, rr 5.3, 42.7.
- Fatima v Mount Pritchard & Community Club Limited (2011)* 12.199
- Stay of proceedings — Effect on application for transfer of cross-claim from Local Court to District Court — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 140(2).
- Dueeasy Pty Ltd and Another v Devlin and Another (2014)* 20.13
- Stay of proceedings — In interests of justice — Dispute over oral contractual terms — Whether place where work under contract to be undertaken then determinative — Whether another court having jurisdiction more appropriate to determine matter than court where proceedings were commenced — Relevant factors — Relevance of costs of proceedings in another court — Relevance of size of claim — Whether statutory requirement that only one court appropriate — Discretionary determination as to stay — Whether court where proceedings commenced of relevance — Relevance of encouragement by court of cheap, quick and just disposal of proceedings — Relevance of costs of stay and recommencement of proceedings in comparison to amount in issue — Relevance of measures available to court to lessen need for giving of evidence by witness in person — Service and Execution of Process Act 1992 (Cth), ss 20(3), 20(4) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 56 — Constitution, s 109.
- Wicomm Pty Ltd v CJ-Milne Solutions Pty Ltd (2015)* 23.5
- Stay of proceedings — Pending application for judicial review — Relevant factors.
- Wende and Others v Horwath (NSW) Pty Ltd (No 4) (2015)* 20.334
- Stay of proceedings — Powers of court to grant of stay on terms — Whether provision of security of costs necessary term — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 128, 156.
- Dowedeit v Nominal Defendant (No 2) (2015)* 23.19
- Subpoenas — Application to set aside — Viewing of subpoenaed documents not in best interests of party who issued subpoena — Whether ground for application — Statutory inadmissibility of subpoenaed material — Whether primary consideration for setting subpoena aside — Relevant principles for determining whether appropriate to set aside subpoena — Police Act 1990 (NSW), ss 170, 192.
- Strickland v New South Wales (2016)* 21.375
- Subpoenas — Non-compliance — Documents in possession of party whose solicitors knew of subpoena — *Allen v Tobias* presumption available to be drawn against party — Extent of available inference.
- Alam v Rail Corporation New South Wales (2008)* 8.81
- Subpoenas — Objection to production of documents — Issue of subpoena by self-represented party — Breach of court rules — Whether fatal — Relevant factors — Premature issue of subpoena — Effect — Performance of surgery by court on subpoena — Whether appropriate — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 3.7.
- Mohareb v Palmer (2015)* 23.1
- Subpoenas — Objection to production of documents — Whether legitimate forensic purpose in requiring production of documents — Appropriate test — Relevance of other possible purposes — Whether documents might not become evidence — Irrelevant factor.
- Suttram Pty Ltd v Michelin Australia Pty Ltd (No 4) (2008)* 8.120

PRACTICE — continued

Subpoenas — Requirement of leave to issue — Issue of subpoenas to produce documents recording protected confidence — Issue without necessary leave — Whether disregard of irregularity proper — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), ss 298, 299D.

R v Russell (2013) 17.17

Subpoenas — Requirement of leave to issue — Issue without leave of subpoenas to produce documents allegedly subject to sexual assault communications privilege — Whether issue of subpoenas invalid or merely irregular — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 298.

R v Guerrero (2014) 20.315

Subpoenas — Subpoena ad testificandum — Issue of subpoena by Director of Public Prosecutions — Form of subpoena — Whether Supreme Court form in criminal proceedings available in District Court — Whether use of such form mandatory in District Court — Relevant issue in respect of form of subpoena — Entitlement of Director of Public Prosecutions to issue subpoena in criminal cases in District Court — Service of subpoena — Scope of service by post — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 171(5), 171D — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 222(2) — Supreme Court Rules 1970 (NSW), Form 74AC — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 53, r 20(2)(e).

R v Chambour; R v Khallouf (No 3) (2016) 23.254

Subpoenas — Subpoena duces tecum — Failure to comply with subpoena — Specific statutory power of court in response to non-compliance — Exercise of power — Limits to such exercise — Grounds for non-compliance — Effect of modern electronic record-keeping — Robust approach by courts to fact-finding — When exercisable — Lack of production of subpoenaed documents due to omission or commission — Whether such reasons relevant in relation to imposition of remedial orders — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 68 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 33.

Hibbert v Nationwide News Pty Ltd and Others (No 3) (2016) 23.265

Subpoenas — Subpoena to witness to give evidence — Failure to comply with subpoena — Application for warrant to issue against witness — Pre-conditions for issue of warrant — Whether pre-conditions met — Standard of proof applicable — Refusal to issue warrant — Relevant factors — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 194(1)(b).

Photi v Target Australia Pty Ltd (No 2) (2007) 6.122

Subpoenas — Witnesses — Costs of compliance with subpoena — Application to court for payment of opportunity costing of professional time of expert medical witness — Standing of applicant — Whether such expenses part of costs of party to proceedings — Proper identification of such expenses — Relevance of witness's ability to reschedule patients and operations — Statement by professional bodies as to quantum of expenses of witness attending court pursuant to subpoena — Whether such statement binding — Reliance on such statement without evidence of actual loss — Whether permissible — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 3(1), 98 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 33.11.

George v Biggs and Another (No 2) (2015) 20.65

Summary dismissal — Principles applicable — Application for — When inappropriate — Factual dispute — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 13.4, 14.28.

PRACTICE — continued

- Lucire v Parmegiani (2010)* 10.364
- Summary dismissal — Principles applicable — Matters not subject of evidence — Making of assumptions in applicant's favour about such matters — Whether appropriate in summary dismissal application — Determination of whether breach of duty not to cause person mental harm — Whether appropriate in summary dismissal application — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 32.
- X v AB Commission and Others (2016)* 22.260
- Summary stay or dismissal — Principles applicable — Continued failure to provide particulars — Poorly pleaded claims for economic loss — Effect — Sustained and significant misuse of court resources — Effect — Whether exception for self-represented litigants — Safeguarding of fairness of trial process — Requirement of vigilance from courts — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), rr 12.7, 13.4.
- Ghosh v TCN Channel Nine Pty Ltd and Others (No 4) (2014)* 19.38
- Time — Extension of — Application for leave to rely on expert's report served out of time — Requirement of proof of exceptional circumstances warranting extension — Whether circumstances exceptional — Relevant factors — Identification of real cause of delay in service of report — Solicitor's lack of candour — Effect on court's exercise of its discretion to grant leave.
- El Azzi v Maglis and Others (2017)* 25.195
- Trial — Application for change of venue — Proceedings over valuation of land — Whether view necessary — Relevant factors.
- Genworth Financial Mortgage Insurance Pty Ltd v Herriots (Cairns) Pty Ltd (2015)* 20.263
- Trial — Without jury — Provision of reasons for decisions by judges — Whether this alone sufficient for trial without jury — Complexity of facts — Whether justification for judge alone trial — Crime of public violence — Relevance to determination of proper mode of trial — Whether mode of trial by judge alone or by jury — Relevant factors — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), ss 132, 132A.
- R v Chambour; R v Khallouf (No 2) (2016)* 23.247
- Withdrawal of admissions — Application for leave — Relevant factors — Relevance of costs arising if leave granted and ability of applicant to meet such costs — Method of making application.
- QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd v Larentzakis* 2.72

PRECEDENTS

- State Supreme Court — Judgment at first instance — Whether binding on District Court.
- Benton v QBE Workers Compensation (NSW) Ltd (2013)* 16.355

PRIMARY INDUSTRY

- Agriculture — Vermin and weeds — Destruction of noxious plants — Statutory obligation on occupier — Extent of obligation — Power of local council to issue

PRIMARY INDUSTRY — continued

weed control notice on occupier after inspection of occupier's land — No necessity to inspect all of land — Inspected area must be sufficiently large enough to permit council to be satisfied occupier has failed to comply with statutory obligation — No necessity for more than one inspection — Council engaging a contractor to control noxious weeds where occupier has failed to comply with notice — No necessity for council to first call for tenders — Noxious Weeds Act 1993 (NSW), ss 12, 18, 19, 20, 26 — Local Government Act 1993 (NSW), s 55.

Cooma-Monaro Shire Council v Tonkin 2.266

PRINCIPAL AND AGENT

Real estate agents — Remuneration — Recovery of — Statutory requirements — Requirements not followed — Effect of breach only procedural — Claim for remuneration postponed until procedure followed — Necessity for breach to be pleaded — Property, Stock and Business Agents Act 2002 (NSW), s 36 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 14.14(2)(b).

Varneba Pty Ltd v Simpson 4.182

PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW

Jurisdiction — Extraterritorial operation of legislation — Whether provisional apprehended violence order issued in New South Wales operative in Queensland — Relevant factors.

Smith v New South Wales (2016) 22.148

Service out of jurisdiction — Stay of proceedings — Appropriateness of forum — Relevant factors — Service and Execution of Process Act 1992 (Cth), ss 20(3), 20(4)(b), 20(4)(f).

Genworth Financial Mortgage Insurance Pty Ltd v Herriots (Cairns) Pty Ltd (2015) 20.263

Torts — Defamation — Cause of action arising outside jurisdiction — Availability of absolute privilege defence if Australian law applicable — No mechanism available in District Court for determination of foreign law — Whether District Court forum conveniens — Relevant factors — Whether principle of proportionality applicable — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), ss 9, 44(1)(a), 47 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 6.43.

Park v Lee and Another (2016) 22.250

RESTITUTION

Principle of unjust enrichment — Purely an explanatory concept — Not of itself a cause of action.

Coshott v Lenin 4.13

SALE OF GOODS

Conditions and warranties — Remedies for breach of contract — Liability of manufacturer of goods — One-off assembly of goods by person — Whether

SALE OF GOODS — continued

such person within meaning of “manufacturer” — Australian Consumer Law (Cth), s 7(1)(a).

Byers v Frith and Others (No 2) (2017) 25.89

Fas contracts — Attributes — Liability of seller for goods supplied overseas under fas contract — Deterioration of goods when removed from shipping containers — No evidence condition of goods attributable to manufacture or delivery to departure port — Claim for breach of warranties and conditions under Sale of Goods Act 1923 (NSW) and negligence — Evidentiary burden on buyer to counter possible causes for deterioration during voyage and after arrival at port of delivery to succeed in claim — Sale of Goods Act 1923 (NSW), ss 18, 19.

Norco Co-operative v Russell 5.4

Formation of contract of sale — Whether sufficient consensus can be implied from parties’ conduct — Admissibility of evidence of post-contractual conduct — Whether such evidence admissible as to meaning of contract — Shipment of goods on “earliest possible date July 2002” — Whether term too uncertain to be enforceable — Application of doctrines of election, waiver, acquiescence, estoppel, approbation/retroaction and unconscionability — Requirement of substantial detriment to be shown by party relying on doctrines — Breach of contract by seller of goods — Whether buyer can receive further goods from seller — Doctrine of frustration — Relevant principles.

OneSteel Trading Pty Ltd v Capital Steel & Pipe Pty Ltd (No 3) 5.322

Transfer of title by non-owner — Deception of owner by non-owner — Effect — Owner’s consent to transfer — Obtained through fraud — Effect — Estoppel of owner — Duty of care to buyer — Owner’s conduct assessed in light of situation as known to owner and buyer — Receipt of goods in good faith — Circumstances constituting lack of good faith — Meaning of “consent” — Sale of Goods Act 1923 (NSW), ss 26, 27, 28(2).

Vassallo v Haddad Import & Export Pty Ltd 2.123

SET-OFF, COUNTER-CLAIM AND CROSS-ACTION

Set-off — Equitable set-off — Availability — Principles — What may be set-off.

Unilever Australia Ltd v Rosella Foods Pty Ltd (2012) 15.185

STATUTES

Construction — Particular statutes — Operation and effect — *Workers Compensation Act 1987* (NSW) — Whether provisions applicable to injury received overseas in course of employment — Statutory definition of “coal miner” — Scope of definition — *Workers Compensation Act 1987* (NSW), ss 150A, Sch 6, Pt 18, cl 3(4) — *Coal Mines Regulation Act 1982* (NSW).

Baggs v Waratah Engineering Pty Ltd (2012) 15.323

Construction — Particular statutes — Particular words and phrases — “Take” — *Fisheries Management Act 1994* (NSW), ss 4, 18, 35(1) — *Fisheries Management (General) Regulation 2010* (NSW), cl 18 — *Fisheries Management (Lobster Share Management Plan) Regulation 2000* (NSW), cl 22.

STATUTES — continued

- Prodanovski v Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services (2017)* 24.227
- Construction — Particular words and phrases — Whether court's orders part of court's proceedings — Statutory prohibition against publication of account of Family Court proceedings — Scope of "account" — Whether breach of court's notation concerning approval of form of publication within scope of statutory prohibition — Whether breach of prohibition productive of cause of action for damages — Exemption for publication of technical nature — Scope of exemption — Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), s 121.
- X v AB Commission and Others (2016)* 22.260
- Construction — Regulations — Whether regulation mandatory — Purpose or purposes of regulation — Drug Misuse and Trafficking Regulations 2011 (NSW), reg 10.
- R v Wallace (2014)* 21.1
- Construction — Retrospective operation — Extrinsic matters — Letter from government department — Use of — Retirement Villages Act 1999 (NSW), ss 11, 104.
- Henry Kendall Bayside Pty Ltd v Hobein (2008)* 8.207
- Construction — Rules of construction — Particular words and phrases — "Building action" — Whether inclusive of action for breach of indemnity in respect of loss from insurance of building works — Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW), ss 109ZI, 109ZK(1) — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), s 92 — Interpretation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 33, 34.
- Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v Dinov (2016)* 23.357
- Construction — Statutory obligations of controller of premises — Requirement to ensure safe access to workplace — Extent of obligation — Requirement to ensure floors designed to be safe — Extent of obligation — Whether civil right of action for breach — Occupational Health and Safety Regulation 2001 (NSW), cl 39(a), 39(e).
- Irwin v Salvation Army (NSW) Property Trust (2007)* 6.178
- Enforcement of statutory rights — Power line brought down by aircraft giving electric shock to linesman although not striking him — Action brought pursuant to Damage by Aircraft Act 1999 (Cth) — Application of statute — Whether statute covered the field — Assessment of damages as if action in negligence — Action however not a tort — Defence of contributory negligence not available — Statutory right to apportionment not applicable to such action — Damage by Aircraft Act 1999 (Cth), ss 10, 11 — Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1946 (NSW), s 5(1) — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5A.
- Cook v Aircare Moree Pty Ltd* 5.142
- Interpretation — Consideration of extrinsic matters — Relevant principles — Interpretation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 33, 34.
- Miles v SAS Trustee Corporation (2016)* 22.223
- Interpretation — Presumptions as to legislative intent — Not to alter common law — Statutory power of authorised officer to request evidence of entitlement to concession card — Type of evidence required — Statutory power of police officer to request person to disclose his or her identity where reasonable grounds for officer's belief that person able to assist investigation of alleged indictable offence — Whether suspicion reasonable — Relevant principle — Relevant

STATUTES — continued

factors — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3, 11, 12, 13, 19 — Passenger Transport Act 1990 (NSW), s 3(1) — Passenger Transport Regulation 2007 (NSW), regs 69, 77A, 77C, 77E.

Le v New South Wales (2017) 24.180

Interpretation — Retrospective operation — Amending Act — Substantive rights affected — Presumption against retrospective operation — Presumption not displaced — Amendment commenced after application lodged for superannuation allowance — Amendment restricted power to backdate grant of allowance — Application of amendment — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), s 9A(4).

Swift v SAS Trustee Corporation (2009) 9.213

Operation and effect — Retrospective effect — Effect on existing rights — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Act 2014 (NSW) — Application to costs appeals — Whether retrospective — Legal Profession Uniform Law (NSW), Sch 4, cll 1-5 — Legal Profession Uniform Law Application Regulation 2015 (NSW), reg 59.

Ferella and Others v Stomo (2017) 24.215

STRATA TITLES

Management and control — Actions by owners corporation — Claim for equitable contribution by one owners corporation against another owners corporation where both within one building — Whether doctrine applicable — Jurisdiction of court in respect of such claim — Strata Schemes (Freehold Development) Act 1973 (NSW), s 28W — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), ss 138, 139.

Owners Corporation Strata Plan 69470 v Owners Corporation Strata Plan 69948 (No 2) (2017) 25.262

Management and control — Allocation of unit entitlements — Statutory power of Consumer, Trader and Tenancy Tribunal to vary allocation — Ground of unreasonableness of original allocation — Relevant factors — Sequence of consideration of factors — Significance of respective values of lots — Failure of Tribunal to consider whether other relevant factors existed or not — Effect — Current identity and relationship of lot owners — Relevance — Control of owners corporation through unit allocation — Whether relevant — Difficulty of having unit allocation varied — Basis for difficulty — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 183.

Sahade v Owners Corporation SP 62022 and Others (2013) 16.292

Management and control — Owners corporation — Prohibition against taking legal action without general meeting authorisation — Scope of prohibition — Exemption — Scope of exemption — Breach of prohibition — Effect — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 80D — Strata Schemes Management Regulation 2010 (NSW), reg 15.

Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261

Owners corporation — Actions by — Institution of legal action — Statutory requirement of approval of such action by resolution of general meeting — Abuse of process if institution of legal action in contravention of requirement — Subsequent ratification of such institution of proceedings by resolution of

STRATA TITLES — continued

general meeting — Effect — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 80D.

Owners SP No 62327 v Brodyn Pty Ltd t/as Time Cost & Quality
(2015) **20.84**

Owners corporation — Claim for insurance for defects to common property — Certificates of insurance issued to individual lot owners — Whether one or multiple insurance policies — Whether one or multiple excesses — Home Building Act 1989 (NSW), ss 3, 92, 96(2A), 99, 102(3), 102(6) — Home Building Regulation 1997 (NSW), regs 5, 46 — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 5.

Vero Insurance Ltd v Owners of Strata Plan 69352 (2010) **10.264**

Owners corporation — Powers and duties — Duty to properly maintain and repair common property — Scope of duty — Exercisable only if repair and maintenance required — Application by owners corporation to replace part of common property — Existing part installed without authorisation — Relevance — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 62.

Owners of Strata Plan 21702 v Krimbogiannis and Others (2013) **16.190**

Owners corporation — Powers and duties — Maintenance and repair of common property — Extent of duty — Occupier's duty of care — Strata Schemes Management Act 1996 (NSW), s 62.

King v The Owners Corporation Strata Plan 2311 **3.271**

Retirement villages — By-laws — Validity — Community Management Statement by-laws — Effective as statutory contract — Relevant principle of interpretation — Determination of whether by-laws in best interests of lot owners — Proper approach — Relevant factors — Community Land Management Act 1989 (NSW), ss 3, 13, 75B, 80.

Nulama Village Pty Ltd v Rannard (2010) **10.220**

SUPERANNUATION AND PENSIONS

Police pension — Application for increase in quantum of pension — Necessity for proof of change in circumstances — Precondition for benefit that disability consequence of having been hurt on duty — Relevance of any supervening non-pensionable incapacity — Assessment of incapacity through earnings — Move by applicant to geographic area where labour market limited — Whether relevant consideration for assessment — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), s 10(1A).

Miles v SAS Trustee Corporation (2016) **22.223**

Superannuation funds — Police pension — Application for increase in hurt on duty superannuation allowance — Possible ability of recipient to perform some tasks — Whether recipient nonetheless totally incapacitated — Relevant principle — Police Regulation (Superannuation) Act 1906 (NSW), s 10(1A).

Moss v SAS Trustee Corporation (No 2) (2016) **23.162**

TORTS

Action for breach of duty to act in good faith — Action for damages available to a worker against the workers compensation insurer of the worker's employer —

TORTS — continued

Content of duty — Circumstances when duty breached — Damages can include punitive damages — Workers compensation legislation — Imposition of other legal duties on insurer.

Garcia v CGU Workers Compensation Pty Ltd 3.135

Actions for damages on case — General principles — Hazardous product — Whether common usage rendered such product non-hazardous — Damage to crops — Whether caused by aerial spraying of herbicide — Such spraying not natural use of land — Responsibility for carrying out of spraying.

Barclay and Another v Bootle and Others (2012) 14.287

Conversion — Chattels — Worms — Worms are chattels and not wild or a crop — Party knowing it possesses plaintiff's chattels — No need to also prove party consented to possession — Damages — Measure of — Method of calculating damages.

Hadfield v Commonwealth Bank of Australia 1.41

Conversion — Circumstances constituting acts of conversion — Remedies — Damages — Assessment of damages — Costs of attempt to regain possession of goods — Part of damages — Joint and concurrent tortfeasors — Application for contribution — Full indemnity by tortfeasor that obtained benefit from conversion — Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1946 (NSW), s 5.

Vassallo v Haddad Import & Export Pty Ltd 2.123

Conversion — Remedies — Damages — Measure of damages — Loss of possession of property with variable market value — Value at time of conversion — Not a strict rule — Circumstance where a plaintiff can elect to claim value at different time.

Johnston v Christmas and Others (trading as Henry Davis York) 1.1

Deceit — Builder misled by owner's false representations — Damages where work completed — Damages included monies outlaid as well as lost profit.

Killick v McPherson (2009) 9.298

Joint and several tortfeasors — Apportionment of liability — Claim by one tortfeasor against one of two other tortfeasors — Whether determination of claim on consideration of responsibilities of those two tortfeasors only or on consideration of all three tortfeasors' responsibilities — Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1946 (NSW), s 5(2).

Budich v Knightly Holdings Pty Ltd and Others (2013) 16.154

Joint or several tortfeasors — Apportionment of liability — Statutory defence — Application of defence when alleged concurrent wrongdoers not parties — Application of defence when notice of alleged wrongdoers not given to plaintiff — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 35, 35A.

Pastrovic and Co Pty Ltd v Farrington (2011) 13.37

Joint or several tortfeasors — Contribution — Applicability to costs — Whether order for contribution available where party sued for breach of contract liable in tort — Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1946 (NSW), s 5(1)(c).

Awad v ISPT Pty Ltd and Others (No 3) (2015) 21.272

Malicious prosecution — Exclusion from Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW) — Scope of exclusion — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 3B(1), 11.

Andrews v New South Wales 1.230

TORTS — continued

Negligence — Defences — Contributory negligence — Statutory compensation scheme for motor vehicle accidents — Plaintiff's failure to wear sash part of seat belt while lap part was worn — Finding of contributory negligence required — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 138(2)(c).

Tamerji v Gavin 5.134

Negligence — Defences — Statutory defence arising from plaintiff's intoxication — Limited exceptions to defence — Harshness of legislation — Call for amendment — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50.

Russell v Edwards 2.108

Negligence — Duty of care — Recreational activity — Activity remains recreational although a business or employment for some — Trail ride on a horse — Significant risk of physical harm not involved thereby — No dangerous recreational activity — Risk warning over recreational activity's risk — Duty of care thereby negated — Warning must be to those proposing to engage in activity — Representation that all care and precautions taken — Effect — Meaning of "recreational activity", "significant risk of harm", "risk warning", "obvious risk" — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5F, 5K, 5L, 5M.

Mikronis v Adams 1.369

Negligence — Standard of care — Valuers of residential property — Relevant principles — Meaning of "manufactured home estate".

Rap Pty Ltd v Watkins Tapsell 1.245

Particular torts — Assault and battery — Claim against police — No accompanying claim for unlawful arrest — Significance.

Makri v New South Wales (2015) 20.276

Particular torts — Assault — Statutory defences — Plaintiff engaged in criminal conduct materially contributing to injuries — Defence negated if defendant's conduct constituted offence — Scope of negation — Not applicable to vicariously liable defendant — Plea of self-defence — Applicable to vicariously liable defendant — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 52(1), 54(1), 54(2).

Kassem v ACN 075092232 Pty Ltd (in liq) (Formerly known as Australian Event Protection Pty Ltd) (2009) 9.340

Particular torts — Defamation and false imprisonment — General principles — Whether claims for such torts available to intellectually disabled person — Wrongful arrest and false imprisonment — Elements of such torts.

Lassanah v State of New South Wales (No 3) (2010) 11.320

Particular torts — False imprisonment — Action for — Defences — Ex turpi causa non oritur actio — Whether applicable — Relevant principle — Whether statutory defence akin to ex turpi causa defence applicable — Relevant factor — Statutory power of arrest — Scope — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 4 — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), ss 99(2), 99(3), 189(1)(b), 201.

Rook v New South Wales (No 3) (2015) 21.204

Particular torts — False imprisonment — Causation — Wrongful detention of person by police — Liability of person creating motivating force behind such detention.

Webster v Coles Myer Ltd (2009) 9.123

TORTS — continued

Particular torts — False imprisonment — Following unlawful arrest — Whether reasonable grounds for suspicion by arresting police officer that arrest “necessary” to bring person arrested before court — Relevant factors — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), ss 99(3), 99(3)(a).

Moran v New South Wales (2017) **24.146**

Particular torts — False imprisonment — Lawfulness of person’s arrest — Whether arrest necessary to prevent harassment of or interference with witness — No requirement for arrest in good faith — Meaning of “necessary” — Whether obtaining interim apprehended personal violence order equivalent alternative to arrest — Grant of bail — Whether arrest of person requirement of grant of bail — Relevant circumstances — Holding of person lawfully in custody for excessive period — Whether commission of tort of false imprisonment for period in excess of reasonable period — Consequences of breach of bail conditions and breach of interim apprehended personal violence order — Statutory powers for grant of bail — Differences in such powers — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 99(3)(d) — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), ss 1, 19, 25, 26, 27 — Bail Act 1978 (NSW), ss 7, 15, 17, 18.

Tilse v New South Wales (2013) **17.177**

Particular torts — False imprisonment — Whether arrest by police necessary precondition for grant of bail — Possible existence of defence of consent to arrest — Whether proper basis for consent — Bail Act 1978 (NSW), ss 15, 18.

Carey v New South Wales (2013) **17.146**

Particular torts — General principles — Action for breach of confidence — Court order for suppression of identity of party to litigation — Potential for revelation of party’s identity through availability of public search — Whether loss of duty of confidence thereby.

X v AB Commission and Others (2016) **22.260**

Particular torts — Malicious prosecution — Elements of such tort — Relevance of dismissed charges against plaintiff.

Rook v New South Wales (2014) **19.329**

Particular torts — Malicious prosecution — Requirement of prosecution’s initiation or maintenance — Whether evidence of maintenance of prosecution with no evidence of its initiation sufficient — Requirement of lack of reasonable and probable cause for prosecution — Subjective and objective components — Only proof of one component necessary for proof of this element of tort — Identification of improper purpose in bringing prosecution — Whether necessary — Differences between police account of events and that of person charged by police — Whether such difference alone evidence of malice.

Wessell v New South Wales (2017) **25.334**

Particular torts — Malicious prosecution — Scope of action — Whether available for wrongful and malicious institution of civil proceedings.

Kinghorn v HKAC Asset Management Services (AFFL) Pty Ltd (2010) **11.192**

Particular torts — Procuring breach of contract — Commission of such tort by company — Whether director of company liable for such tort.

Scicluna v Royal Motor Yacht Club Port Hacking and Others (2014) **18.316**

TORTS — continued

Particular torts — Trespass — Public right of passage along public road — Right of passage inclusive of right to stop on road — Whether service of process on Sunday night illegal — Existence of tort of privacy — Whether person's privacy invaded — Relevant circumstances — Roads Act 1993 (NSW), s 5.

Maynes and Another v Casey and Another (2010) 13.83

Proposed action against witness in respect of evidence given and withheld in prior court proceedings — Whether such action lies.

Potkonyak v Powell (2007) 6.101

Transport accident legislation — Statutory compensation — Scope of — Action res quod servitium amisit — Action excluded by statutory scheme — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 142.

Scuttle Clothing Pty Ltd v Freylinder 3.266

TRADE AND COMMERCE

Consumer protection — Misleading and deceptive conduct — Representations made in course of litigation — Whether representations made in trade or commerce — Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), ss 4, 52.

Augment Communications Pty Ltd (in liq) v Sedgwick (2008) 8.126

Consumer protection — Misleading or deceptive conduct — Claim for damages — Handing over vehicle registration certificate known to be false — Claim made out — Fair Trading Act 1987 (NSW), s 42.

BB Motor Sport Pty Ltd v Dibella 1.118

Consumer transactions — Consumer protection — Misleading and deceptive conduct — Material contribution to consumer's loss — Effect of consumer's own want of reasonable care on own behalf — Effect of Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (NSW) — Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s 82 — Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), Sch 2, s 236(1).

Haddad v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd (No 2) (2014) 19.314

Consumer transactions — Motor dealers — Sale by dealer of second-hand car — Exclusion of statutory warranties — Form 8 notice to purchaser of car — Effect — Whether conflict with Australian Consumer Law — Whether contravention of guarantee under Law — Relevant factors — Relevance of price — Motor Dealers Act 1974 (NSW), ss 24, 27, 28 — Australian Consumer Law, ss 54, 63 — Motor Dealers Regulation 2010 (NSW), cl 28.

Burton v Chad One Pty Ltd (2013) 18.38

TRADE PRACTICES

Consumer protection — Conditions and warranties — Warranties in respect of supply of services to consumer — Warranty of fitness for purpose for materials supplied with services — Whether materials include bathroom — Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s 74.

Davies v George Thomas Hotels Pty Ltd (2010) 10.351

Consumer protection — Misleading or deceptive conduct — Complaint to Medical Board by doctor — Whether conduct "in trade or commerce" — Fair Trading Act 1987 (NSW), s 42.

TRADE PRACTICES — continued

- Lucire v Parmegiani (2010)* 10.364
- Consumer protection — Supply of services to consumer — Breach of warranties — Statutory defences — Response thereto of reliance on “good Samaritan” statutory provisions — Effect of classification of injured person as good Samaritan — Risk of injury not inherent in diving activity but due to actions of diving company — Whether certain statutory defences to action for breach of warranty thereby inapplicable — Waiver of contractual duty of care in contract for recreational activities — Scope of waiver — Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth), ss 3, 60, 61, 64 — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), ss 5B, 5C, 5D, 5G, 5H, 5I, 5K, 5L, 5M, 5N, 5R, 5S, 56, 57, 58 — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z.
- Barrett v Lets Go Adventures Pty Ltd (2016)* 23.329
- Misleading and deceptive conduct — Whether conduct “in trade or commerce” — Circumstances where representation about employee not “in trade or commerce” — Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s 52.
- Paddison v Downer EDI Engineering Power Pty Ltd (2010)* 11.48

TRAFFIC LAW

- Insurer’s request for information — Whether reasonable — Relevant factor — Insurer’s subsequent notice requesting commencement of proceedings by claimant — Whether waiver of compliance with request for information — Non-compliance with such request then reasonable excuse — Request itself then unreasonable — Application of legal professional privilege to requested information — Request for information over claimant’s contention — Whether proper request for information — Failure to provide information — Reasonable excuse for failure — Proof of excuse on claimant — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 85.
- Kane v Australian Associated Motor Insurance Ltd (2013)* 18.1
- Licensing of drivers — Disqualification — Appeal against sentence — Grant of stay of execution of disqualification period — Licence voluntarily surrendered — Disqualification period reduced on appeal — Commencement date of reduced disqualification period unchanged — Distinction between length of period of disqualification and setting of date when such period to commence — Court’s ability and statutory power to take account of voluntary surrender of licence by driver — Stay of execution irrelevant to appeal court’s setting of disqualification period — Disqualification of person from holding driver licence — Statutory effect — Permanent cancellation of licence — Meaning of “permanent” — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), ss 63, 68(1A) — Road Transport (General) Act 2005 (NSW), ss 189(1), 189(6).
- Fewel v Director of Public Prosecutions (2010)* 12.1
- Licensing of drivers — Suspension of licence — Traffic offences — Person driving in New South Wales whilst licence suspended — Licence suspended under Northern Territory legislation for fine default — Deemed to be unlicensed driver under Territory legislation — Whether such person committed offences under New South Wales legislation — Road Transport (Driver Licensing) Act 1998 (NSW), ss 25, 25A(2)(a), 25A(9) — Road Transport (Driver Licensing) Regulation 2008 (NSW), cl 99 — Traffic Act (NT), ss 29A, 32.
- Iovino v R (2009)* 9.323

TRAFFIC LAW — continued

Motor accident legislation — Action for damages against Nominal Defendant — Precondition that due inquiry and search made for motor vehicle involved in accident — Appropriate time for determination of that question — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 34.

Philp v Nominal Defendant (2017) 25.379

Motor accident legislation — Action for damages — Claim provisions — Claim outside time limit — Whether full and satisfactory explanation for delay — Test of reasonable person in position of claimant — Scope of test — Application of test — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 66, 72, 73.

Kane v Australian Associated Motor Insurance Ltd (2013) 18.1

Motor accident legislation — Action for damages — Late claim — Leave to continue proceedings — Whether full and satisfactory explanation for delay — Assessment of explanation — Proper approach — Whether need for material in support of explanation — Relevant factor — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 66, 72, 73, 109.

Philp v Nominal Defendant (2017) 25.379

Motor accident legislation — Action for damages — Late commencement of action after lodgement of claim outside time limit — Whether full and satisfactory explanation for delay — Whether hope, desire or wish provided reasonable ground for delay — Whether obligation on court to ascertain real explanation for delay — Relevant circumstances — Whether reliance on medical advice satisfactory explanation for delay — Concession by defendant's insurer over explanation for delay — Extent of concession — Whether solicitor's inaction full and satisfactory explanation for delayed commencement of proceedings — Relevant factors — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 66(2), 72, 73, 109.

Taha v Kunarsegaran (2016) 23.314

Motor accident legislation — Action for damages — Non-economic loss — Assessment of permanent impairment — Application for referral for further assessment — Grant of application in court's discretion — Nature of discretion — Exercise of discretion — Need for good ground — Relevance of objects of statute — Other potential matters of relevance — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 5(1)(b), 61, 62(1)(a), 62(1)(b).

Davis v Kent (2016) 24.28

Motor accident legislation — Blameless motor accident — Effect of finding of contributory negligence by injured person — Whether involvement of horse and motor car within description of "motor accident" — Relevant principles — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3, 3A, 5, 7A, 7B, 7C, 7D, 7E, 7F.

Hobbs v Fairall and Another (2016) 22.327

Motor accident legislation — Claim for damages — Institution of proceedings outside limitation period — Application for leave for such institution — Requirement of provision of evidence of likelihood of award of damages not less than prescribed amount if claim successful — Whether requirement satisfied — Relevant principles — Whether determination in keeping with usual judicial process — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 109(3)(b).

Al-Ebadi v Guo (2017) 25.1

Motor accident legislation — Claim for damages — Late claims — Application

TRAFFIC LAW — continued

for extension of time limit — Relevance of contributory negligence — Statutory requirement for provision of full and satisfactory explanation for delay — Whether satisfaction of requirement — Relevant principles — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 109.

Amor-Smith v Ching (2016) 22.277

Motor accident legislation — Claim for damages — Late claims — Application to extend time for commencement of proceedings — Requirement of provision by applicant of full and satisfactory explanation for delay — Applicant's reasonable belief that accident faultless — Consequent delay in institution of proceedings — Whether satisfaction of requirement — Whether reasonable person instinctively litigious — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 66(2), 73, 109.

Baker v Baker (2017) 24.388

Motor accident legislation — Claim for damages — Statutory compensation — Limitation period pertaining to referral of claim to Motor Accidents Authority for exemption from assessment — Time at which certificate of exemption issued — Whether extension of limitation period causative of actual prejudice — Relevant factors — Whether full and satisfactory explanation given for delay — Relevant circumstances — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 72, 73, 109.

Agyeman-Badu v Nominal Defendant (2012) 14.195

Motor accident legislation — Motor vehicle accidents — Blameless accident — Application of legislation — Elements of blameless accident definition — Whether blameless accident provisions applicable to driver in single vehicle accident — Driver's act or omission not causative of accident — Application of blameless accident provisions — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3, 3A, 7A, 7E.

Connaughton v Pacific Rail Engineering Pty Ltd (2015) 20.107

Motor accident legislation — Statutory compensation — Assessment of non-economic loss — Level of whole person impairment — Application for further referral for medical assessment — Relevant principles — Relevant factors — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 62.

Mamae v McCulloch Bulk Haulage Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 21.195

Motor accident legislation — Statutory compensation — Leave to commence proceedings out of time — Inappropriate approach by respondent to application for such leave — Monetary threshold to be met for leave to be granted — Determination of whether threshold met — Relevant issue — Grant of leave — Availability of proceedings against applicant's former solicitors — Whether such availability disentitling factor to grant of leave — Indemnity costs — Whether circumstances exceptional — Relevant factors — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 109, 153.

Ruiz-Diaz v Aroyan (2009) 9.378

Motor accident legislation — Statutory compensation — Leave to commence proceedings out of time — Provision of satisfactory explanation for delay — Belief of claimant — Failure to seek legal advice over correctness of belief of an entitlement other than to workers compensation — Whether such failure reasonable explanation for delay — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 66(2), 73, 109.

Lollback v New South Wales (2014) 18.226

TRAFFIC LAW — continued

Motor accidents legislation — Action for damages — Claim made outside time limits — Leave to commence proceedings out of time — Requirement for provision of full and satisfactory explanation for delay — Assessment of explanation — Proper approach to assessment — Prohibition on solicitors' advertisements about provision of services for personal injury claims — Effect — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 72(1), 73(1), 73(4), 109(1).

Gudelj v Tihic (2012) **14.270**

Motor accidents legislation — Action for damages — Statutory procedures — Compliance with procedures pre-condition for commencement of proceedings for recovery of damages — Whether procedures applicable to bringing of claim pursuant to right of subrogation — Safety, Rehabilitation and Compensation Act 1988 (Cth), ss 50, 51 — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 72, 74, 108.

Angus v Jones (2013) **16.94**

Motor accidents legislation — Risks injured — "Injury" in use or operation of vehicle — "Injury" caused by defect in vehicle — Defective winch bar — Not integral part of vehicle — Not defect in vehicle — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 3, definition "injury".

Knott v Finemores Pty Ltd and SGIO Insurance Ltd **1.161**

Motor accidents legislation — Risks injured — "Injury" in use or operation of vehicle — "Injury" caused by the "driving" of vehicle — Vehicle stationary with engine running — Driver's seat being adjusted — Part of act of driving — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 3.

Matten v Matten and Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd **1.170**

Offence of driving while under the influence of cannabis — Legislation permitting accused to be arrested by police and taken to hospital for tests — Pre-condition that sobriety assessment be made — Conscious process of assessment required — Making observations not a sobriety assessment — Road Transport (Safety and Traffic Management) Act 1999 (NSW), ss 12, 25, 26, 27.

Baulman v The Queen (2007) **6.1**

Offences — Alcohol offences — Breath test — Conduct of test in carpark of driver's residence — Whether test legal — Road Transport (Safety and Traffic Management) Act 1999 (NSW), s 17.

Rook v New South Wales (No 3) (2015) **21.204**

Offences — Application of Australian Road Rules — Exclusion of emergency vehicle where driver taking reasonable care — Whether vehicle "emergency vehicle" — Relevant test — Offence of negligent driving occasioning death — Degree of negligence required to prove offence — Whether breach of road rule necessary requirement — Focus of charge accused's manner of driving — Whether actions of other road users relevant — Determination of causation of person's death — Relevant principle — Finding of negligence — Effect on application of exclusion of Road Rules in respect of emergency vehicle — Australia Road Rules (Cth), r 306.

R v Wells (2016) **23.121**

Offences — Camera recorded offence of exceeding speed limit — Deemed liability of registered owner unless such person not driver then and supplied details, if known or reasonably ascertainable, of "person in charge" of vehicle at

TRAFFIC LAW — continued

time offence occurred — Whether company could be a “person in charge” — Road Transport (General) Act 2005 (NSW), s 179.

Appeal of Hallacq (2008) 7.15

Offences — Driving at excessive speed — Evidence — Tender of certificate as to speed of vehicle — Admissibility of certificate — Whether description of certifier in certificate in compliance with statutory requirement — Road Transport Act 2013 (NSW), ss 135, 136, 137.

Rossi v The Queen (2016) 23.71

Offences — Exceeding speed limit — Elements of offence — No requirement on Crown to prove exact amount by which speed limited exceeded — Australian Road Rules, r 20 — Road Transport (Safety and Traffic Management) (Road Rules) Regulation 1999 (NSW), cl 154.

Re Devos 3.238

Offences — Exercise of dispositive power — Licensing of drivers — Disqualification — Effect of exercise of dispositive power on purported disqualification order — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 10 — Road Transport (Driver Licensing) Act 1998 (NSW), s 25A.

Chan v R (2009) 9.336

Offences — Failure to give particulars — Collision between two vehicles — Whether option available to driver to provide particulars either to police or driver of other vehicle — Road Rules, 287(2), 287(3).

R v Chan (2011) 14.192

Offences — Penalties — Disqualification period — Longer period if prior conviction — Two offences occurring at different times — Convictions imposed at one hearing — No evidence over whether conviction imposed first for earlier offence — No statutory deeming provision that convictions in accordance with chronology of offences — No basis to set longer period of disqualification — Offences attracting longer disqualification period — Identification of such offences — Road Transport (Driver Licensing) Act 1998 (NSW), s 25A.

Appeal of Wheeler (2008) 7.271

Statutory compensation in respect of motor vehicle accidents — Assessment of claim for compensation — Medical Certificate — Admissibility — Duty of author to act judicially — Extent of duty — Whether duty satisfied — Permanent Impairment Guidelines — Application — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 61(4).

Nithiananthan v Davenport 3.384

Statutory compensation in respect of motor vehicle accidents — Assessment of claim for compensation — Subsequent court proceedings over claim — Emergence of new information — Statutory requirements if information significant — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 111.

Holder v McDonnell 2.357

Statutory compensation scheme for motor vehicle accidents — Assessment of claim for compensation — Medical certificate — Court’s power to reject certificate for procedural unfairness where admission would cause substantial injustice — Motion to have court exercise power brought well before trial — Appropriate practice — Assessor’s task in issuing certificate — Scope of task — Whether court’s refusal to reject certificate creates an issue estoppel —

TRAFFIC LAW — continued

Substantial injustice requirement — Effect — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 58, 60, 61, 62, 63, 131, 132, 133.

Towell v Schuetrumpe 4.41

Statutory compensation scheme for motor vehicle accidents — Claim for damages — Limitation period in which to bring claim — CARS assessment — Claim assessed to be out-of-time — Application to court for leave to commence proceedings out-of-time — Statutory requirement to obtain assessor's certificate prior to commencing court proceedings — No such certificate obtained — Court's jurisdiction excluded — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 73, 96, 108.

Dempsey v Jardsevski 3.117

Transport accident legislation — Claim for damages — Application by defendant for re-assessment of plaintiff's degree of permanent impairment — Court's discretionary power to order re-assessment — Not exercisable at instigation of defendant — Plaintiff's establishment of degree of permanent impairment exceeding statutory threshold — Save for exceptional circumstances plaintiff thereby entitled to award for non-economic loss — Exercise of discretion to order re-assessment — Relevant factors — Applicant electing not to reveal existence of surveillance film of plaintiff — Factor against exercise of discretion — Court's power to refer matter for assessment of degree of impairment — Power negated by issue of certificate — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW) ss 62(1)(b), 131, 132(2) — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), ss 56, 58.

Searry v White (No 3) (2008) 6.324

Transport accident legislation — Claim for damages — Assessment by medical assessor of injured person's degree of permanent impairment — Court's power to substitute its own assessment — Assessment medical, not legal — Circumstances when court not able to stand in shoes of medical assessor — Circumstances where not appropriate to do so — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 61, 131, 133.

Ragen v The Nominal Defendant (No 1) 4.212

Transport accident legislation — Claim for damages — Claim as dependant under Compensation to Relatives Act 1987 (NSW) — Not claim for damages — Late claims — Permissible if claimant provides full and satisfactory explanation for delay in making claim — Details of person's idleness can be full explanation though not a satisfactory one — Claimant relying on conduct and advice of retained solicitors — Whether this can constitute satisfactory explanation — Relevant principles and factors — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 3, 66(2), 72(1), 73.

Butler v Greenaway 4.143

Transport accident legislation — Claim for damages — Issue of Permanent Impairment Certification — Effect — Application by plaintiff for re-assessment of permanent impairment — Court's discretionary power to order re-assessment — Exercise of discretion — Relevant factors — Need for justice overrides case management, court efficiency and lateness of application — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 60(1), 61(4), 61(8), 62(1)(b).

Ragen v The Nominal Defendant (No 2) 4.227

Transport accident legislation — Claim provisions — Assessment of damages — Examination of claimant by medical assessor — Assessor not entitled to

TRAFFIC LAW — continued

public interest immunity — Material considered by assessor — Not protected by public interest privilege — Subpoena issued to obtain such material — Issued pursuant to a legitimate forensic purpose — Assessor's certificate — Effects of such certificates — Court's statutory power to reject such certificates — Ambiguous power — Clause in Medical Assessment Guidelines — Effect — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 61(4).

Watkins v Power 1.356

TRESPASS

Actions for — Trespass to land — Defences — Leave and licence — Entry pursuant to implied consent — Entrant unaware consent withdrawn — No trespass committed.

Maynes and Another v Casey and Another (2010) 13.83

Trespass to land — Right to relief — Possession — Defences — Common law and statutory right to entry of police — Whether applicable — Relevant circumstances — Entry due to convenience — Whether defence — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 9.

Shannon v New South Wales (2015) 20.144

TRUSTS

Resulting trust — De facto married relationship — Property purchased in name of one party — Loans obtained to purchase property on undertaking by other party to repay loans — Acquisition thereby of beneficial interest in property — Determination of beneficial interests — Expenditure on property — No common intention that such expenditure altered beneficial interests — Effect of expenditure.

Daniels v Purcell 2.61

VEHICLES AND TRAFFIC

Motor vehicle accidents — Statutory requirement to give notice of claim — Accidents occurring before 1st January, 1996 — No requirement that notice be given in a prescribed form — Motor Accidents Act 1988 (NSW), s 43A.

Barth v Ron Crete Pumping and Spraying 2.231

WATER, WATER SUPPLY AND WATER COURSES

Drainage — Powers of local council — Prospect of statutory defences to action for nuisance against council — Whether special statutory powers inclusive of carrying out stormwater drainage work — Whether damage from water flow synonymous with damage from flooding — Council's failure to consider effect of concentration and enlargement of flow of water without authority onto adjoining property — Whether such failure unreasonable — Whether such act done in good faith — Lack of evidence of such consideration by council —

WATER, WATER SUPPLY AND WATER COURSES — continued

Effect — Local Government Act 1993 (NSW), ss 59A, 634, 733 — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 43A — Local Government Act 1919 (NSW), s 582A.

O'Brien v Pittwater Council (2016) 22.14

Drainage — Rights of riparian owners — Whether drainage depression natural water course — Relevant principles — Easement holder's rights — Whether inclusive of right to direct water onto another's property — Statutory abolition of riparian rights — Scope of abolition — Water Management Act 2000 (NSW), s 393.

O'Brien v Pittwater Council (2016) 22.14

WORDS AND PHRASES

"A court".

R v Petrovski (2008) 7.140

"A police officer of the police force investigating the commission of the offence".

R v El Mostafa (2007) 6.305

"Absent".

Facer v Wolfe (2013) 17.391

"Accident".

Hanna v Singapore Airlines Ltd (2007) 6.214

Paterson v Air Link Pty Ltd (2008) 7.373

"Accidental slip or omission".

Lucas and Another v Montgomery and Another (2008) 7.295

"Accompanied".

Palavi v Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Limited (2012) 14.32

"Account of any proceedings" — Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), s 121(1).

X v AB Commission and Others (2016) 22.260

"Act of indecency".

R v Moss (2013) 17.197

"Admitted in the proceedings" — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), s 318(1)(d).

Bright v New South Wales (No 2) (2017) 25.250

"Advantage".

R v He; R v Li (2010) 11.149

"Advantage" — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 86(1).

R v X (2011) 22.94

"Against good faith" — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.15.

Josa Constructions Pty Ltd v Amarino Pty Ltd (2016) 24.1

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “All due diligence” — “Knowledge”.
Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer v Brasnovic (2013) 17.75
- “Allowed”.
Afarin v Excelior Pty Ltd (2013) 16.279
- “Amount claimed”.
Lucas v Tubrule Pty Ltd (No 2) (2010) 11.6
- “Amounts which may be charged”.
Portale v Law Society of New South Wales (No 1) (2010) 10.194
- “Apology”.
*Westfield Shopping Centre Management Company Pty Ltd v Rock
 Build Developments Pty Ltd (No 2) (2013)* 18.28
- “Apprehension”.
Leota v The Queen 5.173
- “Arrangement”.
DJE Building Services Pty Ltd v Insurance Australia Ltd (2011) 13.30
- “As compensation for personal injury”.
*JB Metal Roofing Pty Ltd v Garry Denson Metal Roofing Pty Ltd
 (2008)* 8.183
- “Assembles goods” — Australian Consumer Law (Cth), s 7(1)(a).
Byers v Frith and Others (No 2) (2017) 25.89
- “Attack”.
Meimaropoulos v Cheum and Others (2014) 18.119
- “Bill”.
*Legal Employment Consulting and Training Pty Ltd v Patterson
 (2009)* 11.101
- “Building action” — Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW),
 s 109ZL.
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v Dinov (2016) 23.357
- “Callous”.
*Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another
 (2015)* 20.42
- “Care order”.
*DC v Director General, Department of Family and Community
 Services and Others (2011)* 13.303
- “Carriage service”.
Hale v The Queen (2011) 13.1
- “Carrier”.
Yeomans v Carbridge Pty Ltd (No 2) (2012) 14.81

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Carry out road work”.
Mansfield v The Great Lakes Shire Council (2015) 19.281
- “Cause to be promoted or publicised” — Liquor Regulation 2008 (NSW), cl 53ZC.
Mader v The Queen (2017) 25.37
- “Caused by”.
Penfold v Betteridge and Another (2011) 13.168
- “Chasing”.
Meimaropoulos v Cheum and Others (2014) 18.119
- “Claim”.
Angus v Jones (2013) 16.94
- “Coal miner”.
Baggs v Waratah Engineering Pty Ltd (2012) 15.323
- “Commencement of a trial in the proceedings”.
R v Roberts (2013) 16.288
- “Compel”.
R v B.O. (No 2) (2012) 15.317
- “Completion”.
Abrahams v Degan (2009) 10.99
- “Con”.
Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 20.42
- “Conduct”.
R v Le (No 3) (2009) 10.184
R v Prigge (2009) 10.58
- “Contained”.
R v Ritson; R v Stacey (2010) 11.88
- “Conviction”.
Appeal of VPS (2007) 8.197
- “Costs” — Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act 2001 (NSW), s 70.
Sidgreaves v The Queen (2017) 24.360
- “Costs of the proceedings”.
Wieland v Newcastle City Council (2008) 6.277
- “Counsellor” — Criminal Procedure Act 1986 (NSW), s 296(5).
R v Guerrero (2014) 20.315
- “Crown”.
Porter v Workcover Authority of New South Wales (2011) 13.23

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Dangerous recreational activity”.
Neate v Fox (2012) 13.319
- “Derivative” — Poisons Standard, Pt 1.1.
R v Li (2017) 24.350
- “Detains”.
Kyriakopoulos v Victims Compensation Fund (2007) 6.314
- “Determine”.
Liberty Mutual Insurance Company v Zanotto (2011) 22.98
- “Disappearance”.
Wesfarmers General Insurance Limited t/as Lumley Insurance v Nestel (2011) 14.13
- “Discharge from hospital”.
Simon and Another; McKenna v Hunter & New England Local Health District (2012) 14.60
- “Discipline”.
Soutar v Commissioner of Police 3.351
- “Disclosure”.
R v Ritson; R v Stacey (2010) 11.88
- “Disembarkation”.
Yeomans v Carbridge Pty Ltd (2011) 14.1
- “Document”.
R v Staas (No 2) (2013) 17.232
- “Domestic violence”.
TR v Director-General, Department of Family and Community Services and Others (2013) 17.338
- “Embarking”.
Hanna v Singapore Airlines Ltd (2007) 6.214
- “Employed in or about a mine”.
Butt v Liebherr Australia Pty Ltd (2015) 19.346
- “Engaged” — “Caused to be engaged” — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW), s 19(1).
Safe Work (NSW) v Activate Fire Pty Ltd (2017) 24.267
- “Equitable ground of defence”.
Hennessey v Architectus Group Holdings Pty Ltd (2010) 10.200
- “Evidence” — Passenger Transport Regulation 2007 (NSW), reg 77C.
Le v New South Wales (2017) 24.180
- “Evidence to the contrary is adduced”.
R v Baldock 3.328

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

“Evil”.

Tabbaa v DailyMail.com Australia Pty Ltd (2015) 21.189

“Exceptional circumstances”.

Department of Community Services v SM and MM (2008) 6.384

Department of Community Services v SP 4.113

Jelic v Bader (No 2) (2010) 11.1

XX v Nationwide News Pty Ltd (2010) 11.123

“Exceptional circumstances” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 31, r 28(4)(a).

Khan v Rathjen (No 2) (2016) 22.210

“Exclusive of costs”.

Kemble v Gate Gourmet Services Pty Ltd (No 2) (2012) 14.340

Smart Distribution Services Pty Ltd v General Wholesale Pty Ltd (No 3) (2010) 11.38

“Expert’s report” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.18.

Thornton v New South Wales (No 2) (2015) 21.173

“Fault of the defendant”.

Wright v Country Waste Systems Pty Ltd (2007) 6.136

“Final adjudication”.

Liberty Mutual Insurance Company v Zanotto (2011) 22.98

“For any injury to”.

Anthony v Australian Native Landscapes Pty Ltd (2008) 7.212

“For the work concerned”.

Village Life Ltd v Hanne (2008) 8.179

“Fresh step”.

Barry and Another v Coshott and Another (2014) 18.60

“Frivolous” — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 99A.

Christopher v Fowler (2017) 24.363

“Full and satisfactory”.

Dawson v New South Wales (2012) 14.103

“Full and satisfactory explanation” — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 73(7), 109(3)(a).

Baker v Baker (2017) 24.388

“Furious driving” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 53.

Aslan v R (2015) 21.101

“Gainful occupation”.

The Advanced Technology Group Pty Ltd v ING Life Ltd 3.189

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Giving of evidence”.
R v B.O. (No 2) (2012) 15.317
- “Good arguable case”.
S1 by her tutor S2 v T (2013) 18.21
- “Harm”.
R v Veitch (2013) 16.181
- “Hearing dog”.
Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261
- “Hindered”.
Willis v The Queen (2014) 20.104
- “Hindered by misadventure”.
Rukavina v Director of Public Prosecutions (2008) 7.309
- “Hindered by misadventure or other cause”.
Boulghourgian v Ryde City Council (2008) 8.314
- “Home” — Road Transport (Safety and Traffic Management) Act 1999 (NSW), s 17(d).
Rook v New South Wales (No 3) (2015) 21.204
- “Hospital report” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 31.18.
Thornton v New South Wales (No 2) (2015) 21.173
- “In a sexual context”.
Annetts v Director of Public Prosecutions (2008) 9.1
- “In an exceptional case”.
Ruiz-Diaz v Aroyan (2009) 9.378
- “In relation to a claim for work injury damages”.
Ortlipp v Employers Mutual NSW Ltd as agent for the Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (No 2) (2014) 19.216
- “In the absence of a party” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.16(2)(b).
Kostov v Zhang; Kostov v Fairfax Media Publications Pty Ltd (No 2) (2017) 24.140
- “In the circumstances of the case”.
Boele v Rinbac Pty Ltd (2014) 18.309
- “In the interests of justice”.
R v GSR (No 1) (2011) 12.186
R v Markou (2011) 12.263
- “In trade or commerce”.
Augment Communications Pty Ltd (in liq) v Sedgwick (2008) 8.126

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- Lucire v Parmegiani* (2010) 10.364
- Paddison v Downer EDI Engineering Power Pty Ltd* (2010) 11.48
- “Incapacitated person”.
- Brilley v Presidential Security Services of Australia Pty Ltd* (2007) 6.112
- “Incident giving rise to the claim”.
- Petit v New South Wales and Another* (2012) 14.358
- “Increasing”.
- Yellow Ant Pty Ltd v Computer Frameworks Pty Ltd* (2008) 8.102
- “Inherent risk” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5I.
- Hodgson v Sydney Water Corporation* (2016) 24.72
- “Injury”.
- Page v Commissioner of Police* (2012) 15.7
- Vu v Nominal Defendant & NRMA Insurance Ltd* (2010) 12.8
- “Injury” — “definition of”.
- Matten v Matten and Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd* 1.170
- “Interim payment”.
- Harris v Sydney Local Health District (No 2)* (2014) 18.91
- “Irrational”.
- Hope v Hunter and New England Area Health Service* (2009) 10.63
- “Irrational opinion” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5O.
- Gould v South Western Sydney Local Health District* (2017) 25.12
- “Irregularity” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 36.15.
- Bendigo and Adelaide Bank Ltd v Borg and Another* (2016) 23.75
- “Knowledge”.
- WorkCover Authority of New South Wales v Tucker and Another*
(2012) 16.208
- “Lacking in substance”.
- The Owners Strata Plan No 58146 v Faeghi* (2012) 14.38
- “Lawfully on the property”.
- Penfold v Betteridge and Another* (2011) 13.168
- “Liable to pay”.
- Aboriginal Health & Medical Research Council v Coast Golf and
Recreational Club Ltd* (2012) 14.384
- “Likely to be awarded” — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW),
s 109(3)(b).
- Al-Ebadi v Guo* (2017) 25.1

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Loss”.
R v Wills: Application by Woolworths Ltd (2013) 16.4
- “Made an acknowledgement”.
Svenson v Doherty (2014) 18.299
- “Maintain” — Legal Profession Act 2004 (NSW), s 317(2).
O’Connor trading as Thomson Rich O’Connor v Sole and Another (2015) 21.295
- “Materials”.
Davies v George Thomas Hotels Pty Ltd (2010) 10.351
- “Matters”.
Andrews v Ardler and Another (2013) 16.339
- “Medical examination”.
Brewster v El-Sayed (2013) 17.115
- “Medical procedure”.
Brewster v El-Sayed (2013) 17.115
- “Misadventure”.
R v Parker (2012) 16.1
- “Motor accident” — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 3.
Hobbs v Fairall and Another (2016) 22.327
- “Nature and conditions of employment”.
Feltham v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (2013) 17.121
- “Necessary”.
Tilse v New South Wales (2013) 17.177
- “Necessary” — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 99(3).
Travers v New South Wales (2016) 24.56
- “Necessary” — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 99(3)(a).
Moran v New South Wales (2017) 24.146
- “No order as to costs”.
Egan v Woy Woy & District Rugby League Football Club Ltd (2014) 20.209
- “No win/no fee”.
Brady v Bale Boshev Solicitors (2009) 10.284
- “Not available to give evidence” — “Against the interests” — “Recognised”.
R v Tran 5.123
- “Not available to give evidence” — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), s 63.
Glohe v Simington (2016) 22.367

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Not reasonable” — Limitation Act 1969 (NSW), s 56A.
Nicolson v Florida (2016) 24.42
- “Obvious risk”.
Richards v Cornford (2009) 8.353
- “Obvious risk” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5H.
Hodgson v Sydney Water Corporation (2016) 24.72
- “Occupation”.
Rooney and Others v Workers’ Compensation Dust Diseases Board of NSW (2013) 17.171
- “Occupies”.
Chambers v Vaisman (2008) 7.282
- “Offence” — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 99(3).
Smith v New South Wales (2016) 22.148
- “Offensive” — “Harassing”.
R v Monis; R v Droudis (2011) 12.266
- “Oppressive conduct”.
R v Campbell and Baka (No 1) 5.228
- “Order”.
R v B.O. (2012) 15.303
- “Order for costs made against a person”.
Appeal of Waller (2007) 8.1
- “Other arrangement” — Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act 1999 (NSW), s 4(1).
SMLXL Projects Pty Ltd v RIIS Retail A/S (2017) 25.157
- “Other exceptional circumstances”.
Andrews v Ardler and Another (2013) 16.339
- “Other persons” — Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW), s 19(2).
SafeWork NSW v Rawson Homes Pty Ltd (2016) 24.20
- “Other sexual misconduct”.
Lee v Fairbrother (2009) 9.164
- “Outcome of the proceedings”.
Village Life Ltd v Hanne (2008) 8.179
- “Part of proceedings” — Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), s 121(1).
X v AB Commission and Others (2016) 22.260
- “Payment”.
Who Ya Gonna Call Bark Busters Pty Ltd v Brooke (2013) 16.366

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Peer” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50.
Gould v South Western Sydney Local Health District (2017) 25.12
- “Performance appraisal”.
Soutar v Commissioner of Police 3.351
- “Person” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 50.
Gould v South Western Sydney Local Health District (2017) 25.12
- “Person in charge of the vehicle”.
Appeal of Hallacq (2008) 7.15
- “Place of destination”.
Fattouh v Gulf Air Company GSC 5.234
- “Preserved notional term”.
Mason v Citigroup Pty Ltd (2007) 6.203
- “Proceedings for damages in respect of the injury concerned” — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D.
Bright v New South Wales (No 2) (2017) 25.250
- “Provocation”.
Kuehne v Warren Shire Council (2011) 12.212
- “Public road”.
Cavric v Willoughby City Council (2014) 18.265
- “Publication of a technical character” — Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), s 121(9)(e)(ii).
X v AB Commission and Others (2016) 22.260
- “Publicly available publication”.
R v Ritson; R v Stacey (2010) 11.88
- “Question with respect to a matter of law”.
Boele v Rinbac Pty Ltd (2014) 18.309
Grace v Pepe and Another (2014) 19.260
- “Ratbag”.
Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 20.42
- “Realistic possibility of restoration”.
SS v Department of Human Services (NSW) (2010) 12.29
- “Reasonable”.
Kane v Australian Associated Motor Insurance Ltd (2013) 18.1
- “Reasonable inquiries” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 5.3.
Hewit v Galletta (2017) 25.120

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

“Records”.

Fierravanti-Wells v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd (2010) 11.83

“Records of a business”.

Riley v Chubb Security Services Ltd (No 1) (2008) 7.35

“Recreational activity” — Civil Liability Act 2002 (NSW), s 5K.

Hodgson v Sydney Water Corporation (2016) 24.72

“Regulation”.

Kuehne v Warren Shire Council (2011) 12.212

“Renew” — “Replace” — “Properly maintain”.

Owners of Strata Plan 21702 v Krimbogiannis and Others (2013) 16.190

“Resident”.

Dunstan v Rickwood (2006) 6.6

“Responsible person”.

Neal v Ambulance Service of New South Wales 5.210

“Running account”.

Modern Master Pty Ltd (in liq) v Canon Australia Pty Ltd (2007) 6.82

“Seeking legal advice”.

Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261

“Sending it by post” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), Pt 53, r 20(2)(e).

R v Chambour; R v Khallouf (No 3) (2016) 23.254

“Sent by pre-paid post”.

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Zammitt (2012) 15.104

“Serious incompetence” — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 99(1).

De Costi Seafoods (Franchises) Pty Ltd and Others v Wachtenheim and Others (No 6) (2016) 24.111

“Serious misconduct” — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 99(1).

De Costi Seafoods (Franchises) Pty Ltd and Others v Wachtenheim and Others (No 6) (2016) 24.111

“Serious neglect” — Civil Procedure Act 2005 (NSW), s 99(1).

De Costi Seafoods (Franchises) Pty Ltd and Others v Wachtenheim and Others (No 6) (2016) 24.111

“Sexual intercourse so alleged”.

R v Scorrige (2009) 9.196

“Sexual misconduct”.

Withyman v State of NSW and Another (2010) 11.169

WORDS AND PHRASES — *continued*

- “Special circumstances” — Legal Aid Commission Act 1979 (NSW), s 57.
A v Department of Family and Community Services and Others (No 2) (2015) 20.358
- “Special reasons in the interests of justice”.
R v Day (No 1) (2009) 10.1
- “Special reasons, in the interests of justice”.
R v Kurdi (2009) 10.115
- “State industrial law”.
Mason v Citigroup Pty Ltd (2007) 6.203
- “Subject matter of the proceeding” — Service and Execution of Process Act 1992 (Cth), s 20(4)(b).
Genworth Financial Mortgage Insurance Pty Ltd v Herriots (Cairns) Pty Ltd (2015) 20.263
- “Such a time”.
R v DX (No 2) (2011) 13.111
- “Such force as is reasonably necessary”.
R v Murray (2008) 7.353
- “Supplementary report”.
Stamboljovski v Nestorovic and Another (2014) 19.324
- “Supplied”.
R v Taleb (2012) 16.130
- “Suspects on reasonable grounds” — Law Enforcement (Powers and Responsibilities) Act 2002 (NSW), s 11(1).
Le v New South Wales (2017) 24.180
- “Swindle”.
Crespin and Another v Channel Seven Sydney Pty Ltd and Another (2015) 20.42
- “Taking”.
Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261
- “Taking action”.
R v Parker (2012) 16.1
- “Taking legal action”.
Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261
- “The applicant may be entitled to make a claim for relief” — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 5.3.
Hewit v Galletta (2017) 25.120

WORDS AND PHRASES — *continued*

- “The appropriate court” — Service and Execution of Process Act 1992 (Cth), s 20(3).
Genworth Financial Mortgage Insurance Pty Ltd v Herriots (Cairns) Pty Ltd (2015) 20.263
- “The appropriate court” — Service and Execution of Process Act 1992 (Cth), s 20(3).
Wicomm Pty Ltd v CJ-Milne Solutions Pty Ltd (2015) 23.5
- “The court concerned”.
Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Gillon 4.267
- “The nature of the application”.
TR v Director-General, Department of Family and Community Services and Others (2013) 17.338
- “Thing”.
Barclay and Another v Bootle and Others (2012) 14.287
- “Transcript”.
R v Staas (No 2) (2013) 17.232
- “Treats”.
R v Firebrace (No 3) (2014) 19.226
- “Uavoidable cause”.
AV8 Air Charter Pty Ltd v Sydney Helicopters Pty Ltd (2012) 15.259
- “Unavailability of persons” — Evidence Act 1995 (NSW), Dictionary, Pt 2.
R v Chambour; R v Khallouf (No 3) (2016) 23.254
- “Unavailable”.
R v B.O. (No 2) (2012) 15.317
- “Under circumstances creating a liability” — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z(1)(d).
New South Wales (NSW Police) v Wenham and Another (2016) 22.60
- “Unreasonable”.
Andrews v Ardler and Another (2013) 16.339
- “Used as a hearing dog”.
Owners of Strata Plan 56117 v Drexler (2013) 16.261
- “Using” — Summary Offences Act 1988 (NSW), s 4(2).
Lim v The Queen (2017) 25.253
- “Vehicle” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 53.
Aslan v R (2015) 21.101
- “Vermin”.
Kuehne v Warren Shire Council (2011) 12.212

WORDS AND PHRASES — continued

- “Vexatious” — Crimes (Domestic and Personal Violence) Act 2007 (NSW), s 99A.
Christopher v Fowler (2017) 24.363
- “Vulnerable” — Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act 1999 (NSW), s 21A(2)(l).
R v Longworth (2016) 23.26
- “Wanton driving” — Crimes Act 1900 (NSW), s 53.
Aslan v R (2015) 21.101
- “With no further action”.
Barry and Another v Coshott and Another (2014) 18.60
- “Withdrawal”.
Khan v Mohammed (2013) 18.16
- “Work”.
Commissioner of Police v Hoffman (2014) 18.320

WORKERS COMPENSATION

- Alternative rights — Action against tortfeasor other than employer — Statutory limitation of damages — Applicable where worker entitled to sue employer though no damages would be recovered — Tortfeasor then entitled to no reduction in damages recoverable by worker — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z.
Leite v Tarabay 5.283
- Alternative rights against employer — Damages at common law — Effect of receipt of compensation on right to damages — Employer’s failure to plead defence of election — Whether amendment possible — Relevant principles — Effect of delay in commencement of proceedings for damages — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151DA — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), s 318(1).
Ortlipp v Employers Mutual NSW Ltd as agent for the Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (2014) 19.126
- Alternative rights against employer — Damages at common law — Limitation of time for action — Requirement for leave for out of time actions — Whether commencement of proceedings for damages out of time without leave possible — Grant of leave — Relevant principles — Refusal of leave — Relevant factors — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D(2).
Ortlipp v Employers Mutual NSW Ltd as agent for the Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (2014) 19.126
- Alternative rights — Against employer — Effect of claim on right to damages — Election — By coal miner to pursue permanent loss compensation instead of common law damages — Statutory prohibition to later claim for common law damages — Whether later proceedings in District Court prevented by prior proceedings for permanent loss compensation in District Court Coal Miners’ Workers Compensation List — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151A(3)(b) (repealed but still applicable to coal miners) — District Court Act 1973 (NSW), s 142I.

WORKERS COMPENSATION — continued

- Taylor v Centennial Newstan Pty Ltd (2008)* 7.40
- Alternative rights against employer for damages at common law — Limitation of time for action — Application for extension of such time — Cause of delay reliance on wrong advice of solicitor — Whether such reliance satisfactory excuse for delay — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D(2).
- Fleming v New South Wales (2015)* 20.289
- Alternative rights against employer for damages — Right to proceed for damages — Limitation of time for instituting action for damages — Procedural requirement of six months notice of proposed action — Employer can waive requirement — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151C.
- Boardman v Brighton Und Refern Plaster Pty Ltd* 2.254
- Alternative rights — Against employer — Institution of proceedings for damages — Statutory limitation — Procedural condition precedent imposed — Proceedings instituted in breach of condition — Court has no discretion to refuse to dismiss proceedings — Meaning of “liability” — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151C(1), (2).
- Hu v Northern Sydney Area Health Service* 1.19
- Alternative rights — Against employer — Institution of proceedings for damages — Statutory time restriction on commencement of such proceedings — Proceedings brought in breach of restriction — Effect — Further proceedings instituted in compliance with time restriction but in breach of amending legislation — Amendment not applicable to proceedings instituted in a court before amendment commenced — Previous proceedings not a nullity but not within exemption — Amendment applied to the further proceedings — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151C(1), Sch 6 Pt 18C cl 19 — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), ss 280A, 313, 315, 318A.
- Tai v Spectrum Employment Services Cooperative Ltd* 4.201
- Alternative rights against employer — Limitation of time for action — Application for extension of time — Tender of applicant’s affidavit in support of application — Whether tender of evidence “in the proceedings” — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), s 318(1)(d).
- Bright v New South Wales (No 2) (2017)* 25.250
- Alternative rights — Against employer — Limitation of time for action — Application for leave to extend time to bring action — No allowance of time to elapse where applicant ignorant of right to take action — Requirement of explanation for delay — Requirement met where no entitlement to commence proceedings — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D(2).
- Afarin v Excelior Pty Ltd (2013)* 16.279
- Alternative rights — Against employer — Practice and procedure — Failure by employer to obtain reports prior to lodging pre-filing defence — Application for leave to rely on reports obtained after such lodgement — Failure of employer not to be encouraged by grant of leave — Practice of parties not obtaining evidence — Practice not excusable — Whether substantial prejudice to employer by refusal of leave — Relevant factors — Power to grant leave discretionary — Refusal to exercise power — Relevant factors — Workplace Injury Management and Workers Compensation Act 1998 (NSW), ss 315, 316, 317, 318.

WORKERS COMPENSATION — continued

- Burke v ABL Group Pty Ltd (t/as Authentic Bricklaying (NSW))*
 (2013) 17.241
- Alternative rights — Against third party — Recovery of damages from third party — Repayment of compensation — Compensation paid exceeds damages recovered — No restriction on repayment of compensation save for damages awarded for future economic loss — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 151Z(i)(b), 151Z(4).
- Allianz Workers Compensation Ltd v Evans* 1.154
- Alternative rights — Against third party — Repayment by third party of compensation paid by employer — Recovery of damages by worker against third party — Damages inclusive of amounts for loss of future earnings or earning capacity and future expenses — Entitlement of worker to recover such damages — Statutory provision regarding such amounts — Application of provision — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z.
- Abdulle v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd (2009)* 9.204
- Alternative rights — Alternative rights against employer — Application for leave for institution of claim — Dismissal of application — Costs — Whether such application ancillary to proceedings — Workplace Injury Management Act 1998 (NSW), ss 346(3), 346(4) — Workers Compensation Regulation 2010 (NSW), regs 102, 106, 108 — Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005 (NSW), r 42.1.
- Ortlipp v Employers Mutual NSW Ltd as agent for the Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (No 2) (2014)* 19.216
- Alternative rights — Alternative rights against employer for damages at common law — Limitation of time for action — Commencement of proceedings within three years of required permanent impairment but nine years after date of injury — Whether leave to commence action required — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 151D, 151H.
- Benton v QBE Workers Compensation (NSW) Ltd (2013)* 16.355
- Alternative rights — Alternative rights against third parties — Statutory right of indemnity of employer against tortfeasor liable to worker — Claim by employer's insurer for interest on compensation payments to worker — Whether tortfeasor "liable to pay" damages when proceedings alleging such liability settled without admissions — Whether court rate of interest appropriate for monies outlayed in commercial dispute — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z(1)(d).
- Aboriginal Health & Medical Research Council v Coast Golf and Recreational Club Ltd (2012)* 14.384
- Alternative rights — Damages at common law — Limitation of time for action — Commencement of limitation period — Whether commencement from date of injury or accrual of cause of action — Leave to extend limitation period — Application for — Whether failure to act or errors of judgement of applicant's lawyer reason for extension — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151D.
- Feltham v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (2013)* 17.121
- Alternative rights — Repayment of compensation paid by employer — Worker deemed employed by Crown — Successful damages claim brought against Crown — Statutory requirement to repay compensation from damages — Whether common law liability "in a person other than the employer" —

WORKERS COMPENSATION — continued

Capacity of “Crown” to be different persons — Persons employed by two emanations of Crown — No entitlement to double compensation — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z — Workers Compensation (Bush Fire, Emergency and Rescue Services) Act 1987 (NSW), s 32(2) — Crown Proceedings Act 1988 (NSW), s 3, 5.

Porter v Workcover Authority of New South Wales (2011) 13.23

Compensable injuries — Experience of symptoms whilst at work — Medical advice symptoms indicative of hernia — Reasonable medical advice recommending operative treatment — No evidence of hernia on operation — Whether entitlement for compensation for closed period up to return to work and for treatment expenses — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 60, Sch 6, Pt 18.

Villiami v Endeavour Coal Pty Ltd (2016) 24.13

Determination of claim — Costs — Limitation on quantum of costs — Application — Workers Compensation Regulation 2010 (NSW), Sch 7.

Ortlipp v Employers Mutual NSW Ltd as agent for the Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (No 4) (2014) 19.140

Dust diseases legislation — Persons entitled — Dependants — Widow in receipt of aged pension — Whether still wholly dependent for support on husband — Partial dependency — Calculation of appropriate lump sum compensation — Relevant principles — Workers’ Compensation (Dust Diseases) Act 1942 (NSW), ss 8(9), 8(2B), 8(1).

Cunha v Workers Compensation (Dust Diseases) Authority (2016) 23.201

Indemnity — By third party legally liable for injury — Motor vehicle accident — Alleged unidentified owner or driver of motor vehicle at fault — Liability of Nominal Defendant dependent on inability to establish identity of such owner or driver after due enquiry and search — Whether obligation of due enquiry and search fell on employer seeking indemnity — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z(1)(d) — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), s 34(1).

Hunter New England Area Health Service v Nominal Defendant (2008) 6.348

Indemnity — Indemnity by third party legally liable for injury — Restriction of indemnity to wrongdoers — Whether “wrongdoer” inclusive of person sued under blameless accident provisions of Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW) — Deeming of liability provision under such legislation — Scope of provision — Whether applicable to right of indemnity — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z(1)(d) — Motor Accidents Compensation Act 1999 (NSW), ss 7A, 7B(1), Ch 1, Pt 1.2.

New South Wales (NSW Police) v Wenham and Another (2016) 22.60

Indemnity — Liability of insurer — Liability for damages independently of Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW) — Injury at work to trainee — Deemed statutory workers compensation policy — Claim by trainee’s mother for damages for nervous shock — Whether employer indemnified against such claim under deemed policy — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 151P, 155, 158 — Workers Compensation Regulation 2003 (NSW), Sch 1, Form 3, cl 3(b).

Anthony v Australian Native Landscapes Pty Ltd (2008) 7.212

Institution of proceedings for damages — Employee injured in motor vehicle

WORKERS COMPENSATION — continued

accident — Accident in New South Wales — Injured employee employed by Queensland employer — Whether such employer obliged to take out insurance under New South Wales workers compensation legislation — Test of whether employee's claim sufficiently connected to New South Wales — Relevant factors — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 155 — Workers Compensation and Rehabilitation Act 2003 (Qld), s 10(2).

Sneil v Cockram and WorkCover Queensland (2007) 6.195

Insurance — Statutory scheme — Obligation to obtain insurance policy — Recovery of unpaid premiums — Uninsured liability fund — Payment of compensation by fund — Proceedings to recover as a debt unpaid premiums and payment of compensation by fund — Corporate employer in liquidation — Statutory liability of directors for company's debts — Defence that directors lacked knowledge of company's contravention — Whether "knowledge" actual or constructive — Types of constructive knowledge — Whether applicable — Relevant factors — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 145, 145A, 155, 156B — Interpretation Act 1987 (NSW), s 34(1)(b)(i).

WorkCover Authority of New South Wales v Tucker and Another (2012) 16.208

Insurance — Uninsured liability scheme — Statutory right of indemnity for workers compensation payments — Company's failure to obtain insurance — Company's failure to indemnify — Consequent liability of company director to indemnify — Director's defences — Whether exercise by director of due diligence — Relevant factors — Director's knowledge of company's failure to obtain insurance — Whether knowledge actual or constructive — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 145, 145A, 153.

Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer v Brasnovic (2013) 17.75

Payment of compensation — Psychological injury — Statutory exclusion of compensation in specified circumstances — Whether injury caused by reasonable action by employer with respect to discipline or performance appraisal — Proof of existence of such circumstances on employer — Meaning of "discipline" — Meaning of "performance appraisal" — Employer's action constituting discipline or performance appraisal having other aspects or purposes — Exclusion still applies — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 11A.

Soutar v Commissioner of Police 3.351

Persons entitled — Daily or periodic journey — Coal miners — Whether person "employed in or about a mine" — Entitlement of such person to compensation for receipt of injury whilst on periodic journey to mine — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), Sch 6, Pt 18, s 10.

Butt v Liebherr Australia Pty Ltd (2015) 19.346

Proceedings for compensation — Jurisdiction — Claim for cost of management of fund comprised by award of compensation — Whether jurisdiction to hear such claim — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), ss 149, 151G(1).

Luke v Workers Compensation Nominal Insurer (2010) 10.170

Proceedings for compensation — Practice and procedure — Sufficiency of claim for compensation for receipt of injury whilst on periodic journey to work — Required particulars of journey.

Butt v Liebherr Australia Pty Ltd (2015) 19.346

Statutory right of indemnity to employer against tortfeasor liable to worker — Recovery of interest on compensation paid to worker — Appropriate rate of

WORKERS COMPENSATION — continued

interest — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z(1)(d).

*Refrigerated Roadways Pty Ltd v Roads and Traffic Authority of
NSW (2008)* 7.45

Worker injured in journey accident — Damages recovered by worker from
tortfeasor through consent judgement — No court decision as to contributory
negligence defence — Claim by employer for refund of all workers
compensation paid — Whether repayment should be reduced to the extent of
worker's contributory negligence where no court finding on issue — Res
judicata defence — Relevant principles — Whether consent judgement can be
judgement in rem — Workers Compensation Act 1987 (NSW), s 151Z(1)(b) —
Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1965 (NSW), ss 9(2), 10(2).

Goodman Fielder Ltd v Hickson 4.98