

---

# Australian Law Journal

GENERAL EDITOR

Acting Justice Peter W Young AO

THOMSON REUTERS EDITOR

Cheryle King

ASSISTANT GENERAL EDITORS

Angelina Gomez

*Lawyer, Perth,  
Western Australia*

Sienna Merope

*Research Director to the  
Chief Justice of NSW*

The mode of citation of this volume is

**(2013) 87 ALJ [page]**

*The Australian Law Journal is a refereed journal.*

## Australian Law Journal Reports

PRODUCTION EDITOR

Carolyn May

CASE REPORTERS

John Carroll

Sarah-Jane Greenaway

Colleen Tognetti

The mode of citation of this volume is:

**87 ALJR [page]**

---

# THE AUSTRALIAN LAW JOURNAL

Volume 87, Number 6

June 2013

## **CURRENT ISSUES – Editor: Acting Justice Peter W Young AO**

Judicial bullying .....	371
Judgment writing: Revisited .....	372
One man’s rights .....	372
Complaints against adjudicators .....	372
Harassment and the law .....	373

## **CONVEYANCING AND PROPERTY – Editor: Peter Butt**

Co-owner’s claim for occupation fee .....	374
Mortgagor arrested (on mortgagee’s application) for removing fixtures from property .....	376
When does a purchaser suffer loss? .....	376
Penalties and mortgage interest rates .....	376
Letter from a reader .....	377

## **RECENT CASES – Editor: Acting Justice Peter W Young AO**

Corporations: Offences – Agreement between ASIC and offender as to civil penalty – Attitude of the court .....	379
Wills: Validity of clause limiting beneficiary’s entitlements while she remains married to X .....	379
Serving documents by post: When served .....	380
Is legal advice from accountants privileged? .....	380
Mortgages: Unconscionable conduct of lender – Consequences .....	381
Co-ownership of land: Partition or sale? .....	382

## **ARTICLES**

### **DO THE LAW LORDS BIND LOWER COURTS?**

**Oliver Jones**

This article examines whether decisions of the Privy Council and the House of Lords, given before the abolition of appeals to the Privy Council from Australia, are, in the absence of High Court authority, binding on all trial and intermediate appellate courts. Most, but not all, Australian authority has held that trial and intermediate appellate courts are no longer bound by any decision of the Privy Council or the House of Lords. Elsewhere in the common law world, pre-abolition decisions remain binding on every court except one of final appeal. The author argues that the latter approach should be embraced in Australia. .... 383

---

BUILDING MANAGEMENT STATEMENTS AND STRATA MANAGEMENT  
STATEMENTS: UNHOLY MIXING OF CONTRACT AND PROPERTY

**Cathy Sherry**

Large-scale developments are increasingly subdivided between separate “stratum” owners who share common facilities. The rights and responsibilities of owners are regulated by a registered building management statement (BMS) or strata management statement (SMS). While BMSs and SMSs are negotiated by initial owners and stakeholders, they are not contracts. They are registered Torrens instruments, binding on all subsequent owners, and should be interpreted with reference to property law. Property law has always been reluctant to enforce agreements of predecessors in title, because they can be economically and socially stultifying. While we need mechanisms to ensure the upkeep of buildings, this does not change the fact that initial owners can make agreements that are suboptimal, or become so through the passage of time. Principles of property law have traditionally allowed courts to safeguard the utility of land and courts should continue to perform this role within the BMS and SMS statutory framework. .... 393

CIVIL PENALTIES AND PROCEDURAL PROTECTIONS

**Matthew Lees**

Uncertainty surrounding the procedural protections that apply in civil penalty proceedings creates real difficulties for practitioners and litigants. To understand better the reasons for this uncertainty, this article traces the history of civil penalties in England, Australia, the United States and the European Union. Particular attention is given to the parallel civil and criminal prohibitions under the Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth) (relating to cartel conduct) and under the Corporations Act 2001 (Cth) (relating to directors’ duties) and the strategic regulation theory that purportedly underpins both sets of prohibitions. It is argued that the modern rise of civil penalties calls for corresponding developments in the procedural protections that apply in civil penalty proceedings, and that the rationale for parallel civil and criminal prohibitions is questionable. .... 404

CONTRACT, CONFIDENCE, AND THE FIDUCIARY RELATIONSHIP

**Lee Aitken**

A party relying on a detailed contract will often seek further to support its case by attempting to impose some fiduciary obligation on the counterparty. The courts for sound practical, and theoretical reasons, resist this attempt. What are the parameters for such an imposition, particularly where the fiduciary obligation is said to arise from the contractual relationship’s “particular” facts, rather than some pre-existing fiduciary category? Similarly, when does a duty of confidence arise “from the circumstances” rather than an employer-employee, or other category? What happens if that duty is inadvertently breached? May the recipient, say, of mistakenly disclosed confidential documents, use them? All these controversial topics have been examined in recent high authority, discussed in this article. .... 425

---

# The Australian Law Journal Reports

## HIGH COURT REPORTS – Staff of Thomson Reuters

### DECISIONS RECEIVED IN APRIL/MAY 2013

Aristocrat Technologies Australia Pty Ltd v Allam ( <i>Evidence</i> ) ([2013] HCA 21) .....	668
Aristocrat Technologies Australia Pty Ltd v Global Gaming Supplies Pty Ltd ( <i>Evidence</i> ) ([2013] HCA 21) .....	668
Beck v Weinstock ( <i>Corporations</i> ) ([2013] HCA 15) .....	570
Beckett v New South Wales ( <i>Criminal Law; Torts</i> ) ([2013] HCA 17) .....	602
Gajjar v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship ( <i>Administrative Law; Citizenship and Migration</i> ) ([2013] HCA 13) .....	549
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v Li ( <i>Administrative Law; Migration</i> ) ([2013] HCA 18) .....	618
Plaintiff S3/2013 v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship ( <i>Citizenship and Migration; High Court of Australia</i> ) ([2013] HCA 22) .....	676
Public Prosecutions (Cth), Director of v Keating ( <i>Criminal Law; Social Welfare; Statutes</i> ) ([2013] HCA 20) .....	657
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Unit Trend Services Pty Ltd ( <i>Interpretation; Taxes and Duties</i> ) ([2013] HCA 16) .....	588
Wallace v Kam ( <i>Professions and Trades; Torts</i> ) ([2013] HCA 19) .....	648
Weinstock v Beck ( <i>Corporations</i> ) ([2013] HCA 14) .....	554

# Submission requirements

All contributions to the journal are welcome and should be emailed to the Production Editor, *Australian Law Journal*, at [LTA.alj@thomsonreuters.com](mailto:LTA.alj@thomsonreuters.com) for forwarding to the Editor.

## Licences

- It is a condition of publication in the journal that contributors complete a licence agreement. Licence agreements can be downloaded at [http://www.thomsonreuters.com.au/support/as\\_contributors.asp](http://www.thomsonreuters.com.au/support/as_contributors.asp) and emailed with the submission or mailed separately to the Production Editor, *Australian Law Journal*, Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited, PO Box 3502, Rozelle, NSW 2039.

## Letters to the Editor

- By submitting a letter to the Editor of this journal for publication, you agree that Thomson Reuters, trading as Lawbook Co, may edit and has the right to, and may license third parties to, reproduce in electronic form and communicate the letter.

## Manuscript

- Manuscript must be original, unpublished work that has not been submitted or accepted for publication elsewhere, including for online publication.
- Personal details (name, qualifications, position) for publication and a delivery address, email address and phone number must be included with the manuscript on a separate page.
- Manuscript must be submitted electronically via email in Microsoft Word format.
- Manuscript should not exceed 10,000 words for articles or 1,500 words for section commentary or book reviews.
- An abstract of 100-150 words must be included at the head of articles.
- Authors are responsible for the accuracy of case names, citations and other references. Proof pages will be emailed to contributors but excessive changes cannot be accommodated.
- **Graphics** (diagrams and graphs) to be grayscale; in .jpeg format; no more than 12 cm in width; within a box; of high resolution (at least 300 dpi); font is to be Times New Roman, no more than 10pt. The heading for a graphic should be placed outside the box.

## Peer review

- This journal complies with the Higher Education Research Data Collection (HERDC) Specifications for peer review. Each article is, prior to acceptance, reviewed in its entirety by a suitably qualified expert who is independent of the author.

## Style

1. **Levels of headings** must be clearly indicated (no more than four levels).
2. **Unpointed style** is to be used – there are no full stops after any abbreviation or contraction.
3. **Cases:**
  - Where a case is cited in the text, the citation follows immediately after the case name, not as a footnote.
  - Authorised reports must be cited where published, and one other reference can be used in addition.
  - For “at” references use media-neutral paragraph numbers within square brackets whenever available.
  - For international cases best references only should be used.
4. **Legislation** is cited as follows:
  - *Trade Practices Act 1974* (Cth), s 51AC (including in full within footnotes).
5. **Books** are cited as follows:
  - Ross D, *Ross on Crime* (3rd ed, Lawbook Co, Sydney, 2006) pp 100-101.
  - In footnotes do not use *ibid* or *op cit*. Repeat author surname and add footnote reference to first mention.
    - <sup>1</sup> Hayton D, “Unique Rules for the Unique Institution, The Trust” in Degeling S and Edelman J (eds), *Equity in Commercial Law* (Lawbook Co, Sydney, 2005) p 284.
    - <sup>2</sup> Hayton, n 1, p 286.
6. **Journals** are cited as follows:
  - Kirby M, “The Urgent Need for Forensic Excellence” (2008) 32 *Crim LJ* 205.
  - In footnotes do not use *ibid* or *op cit*. Repeat author surname and add footnote reference to first mention.
    - <sup>3</sup> Trindade R and Smith R, “Modernising Australian Merger Analysis” (2007) 35 *ABLR* 358.
    - <sup>4</sup> Trindade and Smith, n 3 at 358-359.
  - Wherever possible use official journal title abbreviations.
7. **Internet references** are cited as follows:
  - Ricketson S, *The Law of Intellectual Property: Copyright, Designs and Confidential Information* (Lawbook Co, subscription service) at [16.340], <http://www.thomsonreuters.com.au/default.asp> viewed 25 June 2007. Underline the URL and include the date the document was viewed.

## SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

The *Australian Law Journal* comprises 12 parts a year.

The Journal is available for subscription via paper and/or online. An online subscription can include access to archived volumes of the Journal dating back to 1927 and has the following benefits: content is fully searchable; PDF versions are provided for convenience; users can subscribe to an RSS feed to be instantly informed of updates.

**For further information on how to subscribe:**

Visit [www.thomsonreuters.com.au](http://www.thomsonreuters.com.au)  
Tel: 1300 304 195  
Email: [LTA.Service@thomsonreuters.com](mailto:LTA.Service@thomsonreuters.com)

**Advertising inquiries:**

Contact Helen Sykes on (02) 8587 7462 or email [helen.sykes@thomsonreuters.com](mailto:helen.sykes@thomsonreuters.com)

**Editorial inquiries:** Tel: (02) 8587 7000

**Customer service and sales inquiries:**

Tel: 1300 304 195 Fax: 1300 304 196  
Web: [www.thomsonreuters.com.au](http://www.thomsonreuters.com.au)  
Email: [LTA.Service@thomsonreuters.com](mailto:LTA.Service@thomsonreuters.com)

**HEAD OFFICE**

100 Harris Street PYRMONT NSW 2009  
Tel: (02) 8587 7000 Fax: (02) 8587 7100



**THOMSON REUTERS**

© 2013 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited ABN 64 058 914 668

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0004-9611

Typeset by Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited, Pyrmont, NSW

Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW