
Australian Law Journal

GENERAL EDITOR

Mr Justice P W Young AO

PRODUCTION EDITOR

Cheryle King

ASSISTANT GENERAL EDITOR

Dr Paul Gerber

The mode of citation of this volume is

(2005) 79 ALJ [page]

The Australian Law Journal is a refereed journal.

Australian Law Journal Reports

PRODUCTION EDITOR

Carolyn May

CASE REPORTERS

Clare D'Arcy

Cathie Dickinson

Paul Govind

Lyndal Groves

Renu Prasad

The mode of citation of this volume is

79 ALJR [page]

THE AUSTRALIAN LAW JOURNAL

Volume 79, Number 4

April 2005

CURRENT ISSUES – Editor: Mr Justice P W Young AO

Barriers to justice.....	199
Medical profession unhappy with “expert evidence”	200
“Judge demands trial web blackout”	200
Advocates’ privilege.....	201
Retirement of Justice Bryan Beaumont AO	201
Australia Day Honours List.....	202
De-wigging in South Australia	202
Telling it as it is	202
Casenotes: Federal Court.....	203
History: Lord Mansfield	203

CONVEYANCING AND PROPERTY – Editor: Peter Butt

Is there a binding contract?.....	205
Leases: Some miscellaneous issues	207

FAMILY LAW – Editor: Anthony Dickey QC

Three matters on the Child Abduction Convention	209
---	-----

RECENT CASES – Editor: Mr Justice P W Young AO

“And” may mean “or”	212
New South Wales law applies in English court.....	212
Constitutional law: What is criminal process?.....	214
Corporations: Ultra vires – Who protected.....	214
Judges can’t tell the jury to find a person guilty	214
Unincorporated club: Liability in negligence	215
Restraint of trade: Employee’s covenant	215
Medical negligence: Damages for loss of a chance	216
More on book debts	217

ARTICLES

ENGLISH, EUROPEAN AND AUSTRALIAN LAW: CONVERGENCE OR DIVERGENCE?

Hon Justice Susan Kiefel

This article examines the growing influence of European law in the English courts, particularly in the area of administrative law, and in the standardisation of some areas of law. It inquires whether the Australian courts will look towards Europe in the future..... 220

MUST A PROSECUTOR BELIEVE THAT THE ACCUSED IS GUILTY? OR, WAS SIR FREDERICK JORDAN BEING RECALCITRANT?

D A Ipp

This article examines the difference between the condition that “the prosecutor must believe that the accused is probably guilty of the offence” (Jordan CJ in *Mitchell v John Heine & Son Ltd* (1938) 38 SR(NSW) 466) and a belief that “the probability of the accused’s guilt is such that upon general grounds of justice a charge against him is warranted” (Dixon J in *Sharp v Biggs* (1932) 48 CLR 81). 233

FAMILY LAW ACT, PT VIIIAA

David K L Raphael

This article sets out a mock pro forma advice on the ramifications of the amending family law legislation which came into force in December 2004 purporting to expand the Family Court’s jurisdiction over matrimonial property. 241

DO SHARES CONSTITUTE PROPERTY? RECONSIDERING A FUNDAMENTAL, YET UNRESOLVED, QUESTION

James McConvill

The author deals with a question that has challenged and troubled commercial law scholars for some time: do shares constitute property? The author explores some of the arguments that have been raised for why shares do not constitute property, but ultimately concludes that there are strong reasons – supported by prominent jurisprudential writing and judicial pronouncements – for why shares do indeed constitute property. 251

The Australian Law Journal Reports

HIGH COURT REPORTS – Staff of Lawbook Co

DECISIONS RECEIVED IN FEBRUARY/MARCH 2005

Ali v The Queen (<i>Criminal Law</i>) ([2005] HCA 8)	662
Amcor Ltd v Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union (<i>Industrial Law</i>) ([2005] HCA 10)	703
Employment and Workplace Relations, Minister for v Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union (<i>Industrial Law</i>) ([2005] HCA 10)	703
Employment and Workplace Relations, Minister for v Gribbles Radiology Pty Ltd (<i>Constitutional Law; Industrial Law</i>) ([2005] HCA 9)	679
Gribbles Radiology Pty Ltd v Health Services Union of Australia (<i>Constitutional Law; Industrial Law</i>) ([2005] HCA 9)	679
Griffith University v Tang (<i>Administrative Law</i>) ([2005] HCA 7)	627
NAFV and NAGW of 2002 v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (<i>Citizenship, Immigration and Emigration</i>) ([2005] HCA 6)	609
Swain v Waverley Municipal Council (<i>Appeal and New Trial; Local Government; Torts</i>) ([2005] HCA 4)	565
Vigolo v Bostin (<i>Succession</i>) ([2005] HCA 11)	731

Guidelines for Contributors

Submission and licence agreement instructions

All contributions to the journal are welcome and should be sent, with a signed licence agreement, to the Production Editor, *The Australian Law Journal*, Lawbook Co, PO Box 3502, Rozelle, NSW 2039 (mail), 100 Harris St, Pyrmont, NSW 2009 (courier) or by email to alj@thomson.com.au, for forwarding to the Editor. Licence agreements can be downloaded via the internet at http://www.lawbookco.com.au/authorsupport/d_authorJournals.asp. If you submit your contribution via email, please confirm that you have printed, signed and mailed the licence agreement to the attention of the Production Editor at the mailing address noted above.

Letters to the Editor

By submitting a letter to the editor of this journal for publication, you agree that Thomson Legal & Regulatory Limited, trading as Lawbook Co, may edit and has the right to, and may license third parties to, reproduce in electronic form and communicate the letter.

Manuscript

- Manuscript must be original, unpublished work that has not been submitted for publication elsewhere.
- Personal details (name, qualifications, position) for publication and a delivery address, email address and phone number must be included with the manuscript.
- Manuscript must be submitted electronically via email or on disk in Microsoft Word format.
- Manuscript should not exceed 10,000 words for articles or 1,500-2,000 words for section commentary or book reviews. An abstract of 100-150 words is to be submitted with article manuscripts.
- Proof pages will be sent to contributors. Authors are responsible for the accuracy of case names, citations and other references. Excessive changes to the text cannot be accommodated.
- Contributors of articles receive 25 free offprints of their article and a copy of the part in which the article is published. Other contributors receive a copy of the part to which they have contributed.
- This Journal complies with DEST Specification 4.3.4 for the peer review process. Each article is, prior to publication, reviewed in its entirety by a qualified expert who is independent of the author.

Style

1. Levels of headings should be clearly indicated (no more than four levels).

2. Cases:

- Case citation follows case name. Where a case is cited in the text, the citation should follow immediately rather than as a footnote. Give at least two and preferably all available citations, the first listed being the authorised reference.
- Australian citations should appear in the following order: authorised series; Lawbook Co./ATP series; other company series (ie CCH, Butterworths); media neutral citation.
- "At" references should only refer to the best available citation, eg: *Mabo v Queensland [No 2]* (1992) 175 CLR 1 at 34; 66 ALJR 408; 107 ALR 1.
- Where only a media neutral citation is available, "at" references should be to paragraph, eg: *YG v Minister for Community Services* [2002] NSWCA 247 at [19].
- For international cases best references only should be included.

3. Legislation should be cited as follows:

Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s 51AC. The full citation should be repeated in footnotes.

4. Books should be cited as follows:

Macken JJ, O'Grady P, Sappideen C and Warburton G, *The Law of Employment* (5th ed, Lawbook Co, 2002) p 55.

- In footnotes do not use ibid or op cit. The following style is preferred:
 - 4. Austin RP, "Constructive Trusts" in Finn PD (ed), *Essays in Equity* (Law Book Co, 1985).
 - 5. Austin, n 4, p 56.

5. Journals should be cited as follows:

- Odgers S, "Police Interrogation: A Decade of Legal Development" (1990) 14 Crim LJ 220.
- Wherever possible use official abbreviations not the full name for journal titles.
- In footnotes do not use ibid or op cit. The following style is preferred:
 - 6. Sheehy EA, Stubbs J and Tolmie J, "Defending Battered Women on Trial: The Battered Woman Syndrome and its Limitations" (1992) 16 Crim LJ 220.
 - 7. Sheehy et al, n 6 at 221.

6. Internet references should be cited as follows:

- Rickatson S, *The Law of Intellectual Property: Copyright, Designs and Confidential Information* (Lawbook Co, subscription service) at [16.340], <http://subscriber.lawbookco.com.au> viewed 25 June 2002. Underline the URL and include the date the document was viewed.

For further information visit the Lawbook Co website at <http://www.lawbookco.com.au> or contact the Production Editor.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

The *Australian Law Journal* comprises twelve parts a year.

Customer Service and sales inquiries:

Tel: 1300 304 195

Fax: 1300 304 196

Web: www.lawbookco.com.au

Email: LRA.Service@thomson.com

Advertising inquiries:

JENNIFER OSBURN

National Advertising Manager

Tel: 61 3 9205 0606

Fax: 61 3 9853 0342

Email: jennifer.osburn@thomson.com

Editorial inquiries:

Tel: 61 2 8587 7000

HEAD OFFICE

100 Harris Street PYRMONT NSW 2009

Tel: 61 2 8587 7000 Fax: 61 2 8587 7100

THOMSON



LAWBOOK CO.

© Thomson Legal & Regulatory Limited ABN 64 058 914 668 trading as Lawbook Co.

ISSN 0004-9611

Typeset by Lawbook Co., Pyrmont, NSW

Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW