

# AUSTRALIAN BUSINESS LAW REVIEW

Volume 32, Number 4

August 2004

EDITORIAL ..... 237

## ARTICLES

### **Prosecuting corporations and officers for industrial manslaughter – recent Australian developments – *Karen Wheelwright***

There have been concerns for some time about whether breaches of duty that cause a worker's death are appropriately dealt with under occupational health and safety legislation, or whether criminal prosecution is warranted in those cases involving recklessness or gross negligence. Defaulting employers are rarely prosecuted under existing criminal laws and there are serious doctrinal barriers to finding a corporation guilty of mens rea offences.

The Australian Capital Territory leads the way in Australia with the recent introduction of new criminal offences of industrial manslaughter for corporations and their senior officers. These laws rely on concepts of corporate liability based on organisational responsibility and corporate culture in the model *Criminal Code Act 1995* (Cth), thus avoiding the limitations of the identification doctrine. Other active Australian jurisdictions, whilst initially open to the notion of industrial manslaughter laws, have preferred to make changes to existing OHS laws to deal with the problem of workplace fatalities.

Whilst it has its limitations, and applies only in Australia's smallest jurisdiction, the Australian Capital Territory legislation reflects a commitment to treating workplace deaths with the seriousness they deserve, and making it easier to prosecute corporations whose operations are conducted recklessly or with gross negligence. .... 239

### **Garcia – surely it's *not* just about sex! – *Murray Brown***

This article compares conflicting approaches taken by the Australian Capital Territory Court of Appeal and the Victorian Court of Appeal on the scope of the *Garcia* principle with that adopted by the House of Lords in relation to the analogous *O'Brien* principle. It argues that the approach of the House of Lords on this question is preferable, both as a matter of law and of policy, to that taken by either Court of Appeal. It suggests that, notwithstanding these decisions, the *Garcia* principle may yet be held to apply wherever the relationship between surety and debtor is non-commercial. .... 254

**When obligations collide – striking the balance between occupational health and safety and disability discrimination responsibilities – *Kelly Godfrey***

Balancing an employer's competing occupational health and safety and discrimination responsibilities can be a difficult and at times, uncertain task. Workplace policies and procedures may place more emphasis on compliance with one obligation, to the detriment of the other. The high incidence of disability discrimination in employment highlights the importance of this issue and timely consideration of these competing obligations. With the present definitions of "disability" being sufficiently broad to encompass those employees with either a pre-existing medical condition or work related injury, employers must be extremely careful when making decisions which affect these workers, should they be accused of discriminatory conduct. This article examines the scope of an employer's competing obligations, the range of defences and exemptions available, as well as emerging issues. Strategies for compliance are also discussed, as part of this difficult endeavour to strike the correct balance between these important, yet competing interests. .... 269

**COMPANY LAW AND SECURITIES**

**The CLERP9 Act** ..... 290

**RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICES**

**Competition health care markets: Some recent developments** ..... 294

**The Dawson amendments** ..... 304

**BOOK REVIEW**

***The Law of Misleading and Deceptive Conduct* (2nd ed) by Colin Lockhart** ..... 307

# Guidelines for Contributors

## Submission and licence agreement instructions

All contributions to the journal are welcome and should be sent, with a signed licence agreement, to the Production Editor, *Australian Business Law Review*, Lawbook Co., PO Box 3502, Rozelle, NSW 2039 (mail), 100 Harris St, Pyrmont, NSW 2009 (courier) or by email to [abl@thomson.com.au](mailto:abl@thomson.com.au), for forwarding to the Editor. Licence agreements can be downloaded via the internet at [http://www.lawbookco.com.au/authorsupport/d\\_authorJournals.asp](http://www.lawbookco.com.au/authorsupport/d_authorJournals.asp). If you submit your contribution via email, please confirm that you have printed, signed and mailed the licence agreement to the attention of the Production Editor at the mailing address noted above.

## Letters to the Editor

By submitting a letter to the editor of this journal for publication, you agree that Thomson Legal & Regulatory Limited, trading as Lawbook Co., may edit and has the right to, and may license third parties to, reproduce in electronic form and communicate the letter.

## Manuscript

- Manuscript must be original, unpublished work that has not been submitted for publication elsewhere.
- Personal details (name, qualifications, position) for publication and a delivery address, email address and phone number must be included with the manuscript.
- Manuscript must be submitted electronically via email or on disk in Microsoft Word format.
- Manuscript should not exceed 10,000 words for articles or 1,500-2,000 words for section commentary or book reviews. An abstract of 100-150 words is to be submitted with article manuscripts.
- Proof pages will be sent to contributors. Authors are responsible for the accuracy of case names, citations and other references. Excessive changes to the text cannot be accommodated.
- Contributors of articles receive 25 free offprints of their article and a copy of the part in which the article is published. Other contributors receive a copy of the part to which they have contributed.
- All material published in this journal is refereed. Every manuscript submitted to the journal is subject to review by at least one independent, expert referee.

## Style

### 1. Levels of headings should be clearly indicated (no more than four levels).

### 2. Cases:

- Case citation follows case name. Where a case is cited in the text, the citation should follow immediately rather than as a footnote. Give at least two and preferably all available citations, the first listed being the authorised reference.
- Australian citations should appear in the following order: authorised series; Lawbook Co./ATP series; other company series (ie CCH, Butterworths); media neutral citation.
- “At” references should only refer to the best available citation, eg: *Mabo v Queensland [No 2]* (1992) 175 CLR 1 at 34; 66 ALJR 408; 107 ALR 1.
- Where only a media neutral citation is available, “at” references should be to paragraph, eg: *YG v Minister for Community Services* [2002] NSWCA 247 at [19].
- For international cases best references only should be included.

### 3. Legislation should be cited as follows:

*Trade Practices Act 1974* (Cth), s 51AC. The full citation should be repeated in footnotes.

### 4. Books should be cited as follows:

Macken JJ, O’Grady P, Sappideen C and Warburton G, *The Law of Employment* (5th ed, Lawbook Co., 2002) p 55.

- In footnotes do not use *ibid* or *op cit*. The following style is preferred:

4. Austin RP, “Constructive Trusts” in Finn PD (ed), *Essays in Equity* (Law Book Co, 1985).

5. Austin, n 4, p 56.

### 5. Journals should be cited as follows:

Odgers S, “Police Interrogation: A Decade of Legal Development” (1990) 14 Crim LJ 220.

Wherever possible use official abbreviations not the full name for journal titles.

- In footnotes do not use *ibid* or *op cit*. The following style is preferred:

6. Sheehy EA, Stubbs J and Tolmie J, “Defending Battered Women on Trial: The Battered Woman Syndrome and its Limitations” (1992) 16 Crim LJ 220.

7. Sheehy et al, n 6 at 221.

### 6. Internet references should be cited as follows:

Ricketson S, *The Law of Intellectual Property: Copyright, Designs and Confidential Information* (Lawbook Co., subscription service) at [16.340], <http://subscriber.lawbookco.com.au> viewed 25 June 2002. Underline the URL and include the date the document was viewed.

For further information visit the Lawbook Co. website at <http://www.lawbookco.com.au> or contact the Production Editor.

## SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

The *Australian Business Law Review* comprises six parts a year.

Customer Service and sales inquiries:

**Tel: 1800 650 522**

**Fax: 61 2 8587 7200**

**Web:** [www.lawbookco.com.au](http://www.lawbookco.com.au)

**Email:** [service@thomson.com.au](mailto:service@thomson.com.au)

Editorial inquiries:

**Tel: (02) 8587 7000**

### HEAD OFFICE

100 Harris Street PYRMONT NSW 2009

Tel: (02) 8587 7000 Fax: (02) 8587 7100



© Thomson Legal & Regulatory Limited ABN 64 058 914 668 trading as Lawbook Co.

ISSN 0310-1053

Typeset by Lawbook Co., Pyrmont, NSW  
Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW